PROJECT:	North District West Tank 2022 Painting Improvements	Bid Date:	January 26, 2022

Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:	Clearcreek
Section:	Distribution	Initial Apparent Low Bid :	\$ 2,005,858.78

	Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	690477-100017 CT No. 2360	COMPANY NAME					
Project Manager:	Phil Schmidt, PE	American Sun.	Clearcreek	D & M			
Engineer's Estimate:	\$1,750,300.00	Initial Bid Amount					
		\$2,112,521.25	\$2,005,858.78	\$3,688,061.50			
		-5.05%	83.86%	-100.00%			

PART IA:	Responsiveness Criteria, General Provisions (329.20)	INPUT "YES" F	INPUT "YES" FOR POSITIVE RESPONSE OR "NO" FOR NEGATIVE RESPONSE (all "yes" answers needed for responsive bid)					
а	The bidder is pre-qualified responsible or prequalified provisionally responsible at time of bid due date. (329.20)(c)	YES	NO	NO				
b	The bid contains the full name of every person or company interested in the same and such other relevant information as the city agency deems appropriate. (329.20)(g) FORM B1	YES	NA	NA				
С	The bidder submitted , with bid, an affidavit stating: (1) That as of the date of bid submission, there have been no changes in the information disclosed in its application for responsibility prequalification; or (2) That changes in the information disclosed in the bidder's application for responsibility prequalification have been reported to director of finance and management or designee and that the bidder is still prequalified responsible or provisionally responsible. (329.20)(d) FORM B9	YES	NA	NA				
d	There is no evidence of collusion among the bidders. (329.20)(e)	YES	NA	NA				
	BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	NON-RESPONSIVE	NON-RESPONSIVE				

PROJECT:	North District West Tank 2022 Painting Improvements	Bid Date:	January 26, 2022

Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:	Clearcreek
Section:	Distribution	Initial Apparent Low Bid :	\$ 2,005,858.78

		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		690477-100017 CT No. 2360	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project M	anager:	Phil Schmidt, PE	American Sun.	Clearcreek	D & M			
Engineer'	s Estimate:	\$1,750,300.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
			\$2,112,521.25	\$2,005,858.78	\$3,688,061.50			
PART IB: R	Responsiveness Cri	iteria, Subcontractors (329.20)	INPUT "YES" F	OR POSITIVE RESPONS	E OR "NO" FOR NEGAT	IVE RESPONSE (all "yes	" answers needed for i	responsive bid)
а		ed a list of subcontractors with bid or indicated subcontracting opportunities. (329.20)(h)(1)	YES					
b	are licensed constr	re listed, Bidder indicated which subcontractors uction trade subcontractors. (329.20)(h)(2) FORM trade subcontractors are listed, enter "NA")	NA					
С	qualified responsible	bcontractors are listed, the bidder proposed pre- le or provisionally responsible licensed trade 29.20)(h) (If no licensed trade subcontractors are	NA					
d	work under which the	re listed, the bidder listed the division/section of he sub is performing. (329.20)(h)(5) (If no licensed rs are listed, enter "NA") FORM B6	NA					
e	subcontractor per o	re listed and the bidder listed more than one division/section of work, did the bidder explain why is listed for the division/section of work? to licensed trade subcontractors are listed, enter	NA					
f	trade subcontractor responsible. (329.2	affidavit, that its proposed licensed construction rs are pre-qualified responsible or provisionally (0)(h)(3) Form B9 (If no licensed trade re listed, enter "NA")	NA					
g		subcontractors who were currently suspended or y. (329.20)(h)(4) (see links on Tab 5)	NA					
		BID IS:	RESPONSIVE					

PROJECT:	North District West Tank 2022 Painting Improvements	Bid Date:	January 26, 2022

Department/Division: Public Utilities / Water	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:	Clearcreek
Section: Distribution	Initial Apparent Low Bid :	\$ 2,005,858.78

		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		690477-100017 CT No. 2360	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project M	anager:	Phil Schmidt, PE	American Sun.	Clearcreek	D & M			
Engineer'	s Estimate:	\$1,750,300.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
			\$2,112,521.25	\$2,005,858.78	\$3,688,061.50			
PART IC: F	Responsiveness Cr	iteria, Bid Specific (329.23)	INPUT "YES" F	OR POSITIVE RESPONS	E OR "NO" FOR NEGAT	IVE RESPONSE (all "yes	" answers needed for r	esponsive bid)
а	referenced code se	omit more than one bid for same work. (See ection for full text.) (329.23)(f)(1)(a)	YES					
b	PAGE, page 2	ged addenda. (329.23)(f)(1)(e) BID SIGNATURE	YES					
С		with technical pre-qualification ification requirements where applicable.	YES					
d	The bid contains invitation for bid. (3	no conditions or qualifications not provided in the 329.23)(f)(1)(d)	YES					
е	Bidder added no p (329.23)(f)(1)(f)	provisions reserving right to accept or reject award.	YES					
f	Bidder submitted B3	a bid guarantee. (329.23)(f)(1)(i) FORM B2, FORM	YES					
g	Bidder did not sul FORM B2, FORM	bmit an irregular bid guarantee. (329.23)(f)(1)(i) B3	YES					
h	Bid prices are mate	erially balanced. (329.23)(f)(1)(b) FORM B4	YES					
i		egularities or deviations from the bid that affect bid $f(1)(j)$ and $(329.23)(f)(1)(e)$	YES					
j		a unit price for each contract item listed, if required. FORM B4 (If a unit price is not an option, enter	YES					
k		a lump sum price if required . (329.23)(f)(1)(h) o sum is not an option, enter "NA")	YES					
I		ied with section 329.20(h) regarding 29.23)(f)(1)(k) FORM B6	NA					
m		ain alterations, ommissions, errors, such that it ne bid documents. (329.23)(f)(1)(j)	YES					
n	Bid responds to b (329.23)(f)(1)(e)	id documents in all material respects.	YES					

PROJECT:	North District West Tank	2022 Painting Improvements Bid Date:			January 26, 2022
Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Initial Apparer	nt Low Bidder:		Clearcreek
Section:	Distribution	Initial Appare	ent Low Bid :	\$	2,005,858.78

		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		690477-100017 CT No. 2360	COMPANY NAME					
Project M	anager:	Phil Schmidt, PE	American Sun.	Clearcreek	D & M			
Engineer'	's Estimate:	\$1,750,300.00	Initial Bid Amount					
			\$2,112,521.25	\$2,005,858.78	\$3,688,061.50			
o	Bid is complete. (3	329.23)(f)(1)(e)	YES					
		BID IS:	RESPONSIVE					

Version: 2/22/2017							
PROJEC	OJECT: North District West Tank 2022 Painting Improvements			Bid	Date:	January 26, 2022	
Department/Divis	ion: Public Utilities / Water		Initial Appare		Clearcreek		
Section:	Distribution		Initial Appar	ent Low Bid :		\$	2,005,858.78
	Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	690477-100017 CT No. 2360	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	Phil Schmidt, PE	American Sun.	Clearcreek	D & M			
Engineer's Estima	ate: \$1,750,300.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		\$2,112,521.25	\$2,005,858.78	\$3,688,061.50			
The "Eva	reness Criteria, Contract Compliance sluated Low Bidder" has an active contract compliance at the time of bid.	A "no" answer in Pa	rt IE will not necessaril		ponsive. Bidder must hexecution.	ave a valid contract co	ompliance no. prior to
	Bid Responsivness, Waiver Considerations:	Bid Responsive, Continue to Part II	Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office				
	Proceed to Part II?	YES	NO	NO			
	LOWEST RESPONSIVE BID, TAB I		<u> </u>	Manually Enter Amou	unt		
	LOWEST RESPONSIVE BIDDER, TAB I			Manually Enter Inforr	mation		

TAB II: Assessing Responsibility

PROJECT:	North District West Tank	2022 Painting Improvements	Bid Date:	Janua	ary 26, 2022
Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Responsive Low E	\$	-	
Section:	Distribution	Responsive Low Bid (from Tab I):		\$	-

CIP No.	690477-100017 CT No. 2360	COMPANY NAME					
Project Manager:	Phil Schmidt, PE	American Sun.	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Engineer's Estimate:	\$ 1,750,300.00	Initial Bid Amount					
		\$ 2,112,521.25	0	0	0	0	0

PART IIA:	329.23 (2) Responsibility Criteria	INPUT "	YES" FOR POSITIVE RES	PONSE OR "NO" FOR N	EGATIVE RESPONSE (1	point for each "yes", 0 f	or "no")
а	Based on bid amount (as compared to other bids) no further documentation needed (i.e., bid statistically comparable to others). FORM B3- Bid Price and Amount	YES					
b	The bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and appropriate SPECIALIZED EQUIPMENT for the project. FORM B6, Experience, Comptency & Resources	YES					
С	The bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and appropriate HUMAN RESOURCES for the project. FORM B6, Experience, Comptency & Resources	YES					
d	The bidder has actively engaged in the construction industry. FORM B6, Experience, Comptency & Resources	YES					
е	The bidder has experience in the area of construction service for which the bid has been submitted. FORM B6, Experience, Comptency & Resources	YES					
f	The bidder has a successful record of complying with and meeting completion deadlines. FORM B7	YES					
g	The bidder has a successful record of controlling costs on similar construction projects. FORM B7	YES					
h	The bidder has no (substantial) uncompleted work that would hinder the success of the project. FORM B8	YES					
	Responsibility Score:	8	0	0	0	0	0
	Continue to TAB 3?	YES					

Manually Enter Information

TAB III. Assessing Local Bidder

Department/Division: Public Utilities / Water Evaluated Low Bilder (from Tabs I and III): \$ Section: Distribution Svaluated Low Bilder (from Tabs I and III): \$ CIP No. 690477-100017 CT No. 2360 COMPANY NAME COMPA		Assessing Lot								
Section: Distribution Evaluated Low Bid (from Fabs I and III): S	PROJECT: North District West Tank 2022 Paint			22 Painting In	Improvements Bid Date:			January 26, 2022		
PART IIIB: Same		ent/Division:								
step 2 Percentage difference of bid from apparent NON-LOCAL, LOW BID. #DIV/0! NA	Project M Engineer PART III: 3. To look up PART IIIA:	's Estimate: 29.(01)(u) and 329.21 if a bidder is local, us	Phil Schmidt, PE \$ 1,750,300. 2 Local Bidder IS BID LOCAL? See the Office of Construction Prequalification DW BID IN PART II IS LOCAL STOP. data in Steps 6 & 7 and continue OW BID IN PART II IS NOT LOCAL, COI	OO \$ shis list local Skip stee TAB I	NO sted at Discrete at the state of the st	NA Bid Amount NA	NA Bid Amount NA	NA Bid Amount	NA Bid Amount	COMPANY NAME NA Bid Amount NA
step 2 Percentage difference of bid from apparent NON-LOCAL, LOW BID. #DIV/0! NA NA NA step 3 Is amount in prior step WITHIN ONE PERCENT (1%) OF THE LOW BID? #DIV/0! NA NA NA step 4 If step 3 is "yes", SEE PROCEDURES ON SHAREPOINT SITE. DID AGENCY FOLLOW PROCEDURES FOR BIDDER RELATING TO CITY CODE SECTIONS 329:212 (INDICATE IF NA)? TOTAL SHORT STEP STORE ST	Darf IIIR			,						
step 3 BID? If step 3 is "yes", SEE PROCEDURES ON SHAREPOINT SITE. DID AGENCY FOLLOW PROCEDURES FOR BIDDER RELATING TO OITY CODE SECTIONS 329.212 (INDICATE IF NA)? Step 5 INPUT NEW BID AMOUNT FOR BIDDER, IF APPLICABLE, OR ZERO (\$0)		Percentage difference	e of bid from apparent NON-LOCAL, LOW BID		#DIV/0!	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
step 4 DID AGENCY FOLLOW PROCEDURES FOR BIDDER RELATING TO CITY CODE SECTIONS 329.212 (INDICATE IF NA)? step 5 INPUT NEW BID AMOUNT FOR BIDDER, IF APPLICABLE, OR ZERO (\$0) Part IIIC: step 6 REVISED LOW BID AMOUNT, TAB IIIB: Manually Enter Amount	step 3		p WITHIN ONE PERCENT (1%) OF THE LOW		#DIV/0!	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Step 5 (\$0) Part IIIC: Step 6 REVISED LOW BID AMOUNT, TAB IIIB: Manually Enter Amount	step 4	DID AGENCY FOLL	OW PROCEDURES FOR BIDDER RELATING	то						
step 6 REVISED LOW BID AMOUNT, TAB IIIB: Manually Enter Amount	step 5		OUNT FOR BIDDER, IF APPLICABLE, OR ZE	RO						
	Part IIIC:					<u> </u>				
	step 6	REVISED LOW E	BID AMOUNT, TAB IIIB:				Manually Enter Amoun	t		
step 7 REVISED LOW BIDDER, TAB IIIB: Manually Enter Information	step 7	REVISED LOW E	BIDDER, TAB IIIB:				Manually Enter Informa	ation		

TAB IV. Calculating Environmental Preference

PI	ROJECT:	North	District West Tank 202	22 Painting Improvements		Bid I	Date:	January 26, 2022	
Departme	ent/Division:	Public Utilities /	Water		Evaluated Low Bidder	(from Tabs I, II and III):			0
Section:		Distribution			Evaluated Low Bid (f	rom Tabs I, II and III) :		\$	-
CIP No.		690477-100017	CT No. 2260	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project M	lanager:	Phil Schmidt, PE	CT NO. 2300	American Sun.	NA	NA	NA	NA NA	NA
	's Estimate:	\$	1,750,300.00	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount
.			,,	\$ 2,112,521.25	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
PART IV: 3	329.(17) Environment	al Preference							
Арр	arent Low Bid:	\$	-	Apparent Low Bidder:	\$	-			
PART IV: 3	329.(17) Environment	al Preference							T
step 1		ed low bidder submit "enviror pparent low bidder. For all of	nmentally preferable" bid? Answer ther bidder's, input "NA"	YES					
step 2	Excluding apparent bid?	low bidder, did bidder sub	mit "environmentally preferable"	NA					
step 3	bid, then the apparer in Steps 4-6, comple	nt/evaluated low bidder is lead te Step 7, and proceed to Tab	d an environmentally preferable d bidder for Tab 4. Ignore the data 5. t an environmentally preferable						
	bid, proceed to Steps		t an environmentally preferable						
step 4	Calculate environme		it is up to five percent (5%) of the ,000 per bid.	#DIV/0!	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
step 5	Preference amount f applied).	or each eligible bid (if 0, then	no environmental preference was	#DIV/0!	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
step 6		ronmental preference, excepase, both claiming EP cancels		#DIV/0!	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
step 7	Low Bid Amount		Low Bidder:						

Manually Enter Amount

Manually Enter Information

TAB V. Miscellaneous

Apparent Low Bidder/Bid:	0	\$ -			
Project:	North District West Tank 2022 Painting Improvements				

Other "responsible" requirements 329.23(f)(2)(e)

With respect to a bidder whose bid is determined to be 10% or more below that of the next lowest bidder, [do they have] supplemental details regarding the bid and/or historical information regarding performance and costs on similar contracts to demonstrate the bidder's ability to complete the contract at the price specified.

Bidders	American Sun.	Clearcreek	D & M	0	0	0
Bid	\$ 2,112,521.25	\$ 2,005,858.78	\$ 3,688,061.50	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Percent Difference btwn Bid						
and Next Highest Bid	-5.05%	83.86%	-100.00%			

Is any bidder 10% or more below the next bidder?

If yes, does the lower bidder's TAB 2 evaluation have 'yes' answers for questions c, d, g, and h?

If yes, low bidder is "responsible" under this provision.

YES YES

Bid Gurantee Requirements

Below are the required documents for each bid guarantee type allowed.

Is the guarantee greater than or equal to 10% of the bid?

Did the bidder submit all of the required documents based upon the guarentee submitted?

YES YES

Bid Bond Bond on City's bond form Surety power of attorney

Most recent surety financial statement

Current Ohio Dept. of Insurance Certificate of Compliance

Certified/Cashier's Check

Drawn on a solvant bank

N/A

NO

N/A

Contract Compliance

Foreign/Non-Ohio Corp

Are all subcontractors contract compliant? Required before the contract can be executed. Is the corporation foreign or the individual or partnership a non-resident of the State of Ohio?

If there are not any subcontractors, choose N/A.

Letter of Credit

LOC on City's LOC form

If yes, then did they file with the Secretary of State a power of attorney designating them or their agent or the Secretary of State, as agent, for the purpose of accepting service of summons, in any action in law or equity,

or both, brought in the State of Ohio

This is required before the contract is awarded. "Awarded" means before the Director accepts/approves the bid

http://www.sos.state.oh.us/

Award recommendation: After evaluation of the bids, I recommend the following contractor be awarded the contract for:

North District West Tank 2022 Painting Improvements Project Name:

Recommended Bidder: American Suncraft Co. \$ 2,112,521.25 Contract Amount:

Evaluator's Name: M. Smith **Evaluation Completion Date:** 1/31/2022

Additional Information for Departments:

State of Ohio - Ohio Auditor

This is the link to the State of Ohio Auditor's web site to check for "findings for recovery"

https://ohioauditor.gov/findings.html

Proiect:	North District West Tank 2022 Painting	Improvements	
Apparent Low Bidder/Bid:	0	\$	

Federal - System for Award Management

This is the link to the Federal System for Awards Management site to check for "findings for recovery"

https://www.sam.gov/portal/SAM/#1

City of Columbus

Contact the Purchasing Office if you have a question about the City's list of debarred vendors.

State of Ohio Debarment

This is the link to multiple state agencies that lists debarred companies.

http://ofcc.ohio.gov/Resources/Debarments.aspx

OSHA

This is the link to the US Department of Labor's website for OSHA violations

https://www.osha.gov

City of Columbus Office of Prequalifications

Pre-Qualification Office email: prequalification@columbus.gov

Pre-Qualification Office phone no: 645-0359

TAB VII: Notes

Overall bid questions:

(IC-c): 1. Are there any technical requirements / specifications required? If so,

does the lowest bidder meet them?

American Suncraft Co.

(Tab 4): Environmental Preference

Bidder marked "No" but included Environment Policy Statement with misc. documents at end of bid. Marked "Yes".

(IIA-a): Statistically Comparable:

Bidder is 21% higher than E.E. and but within 5% of lowest bidder. Marked "Yes".

(IIA-f & g): Meet costs/deadlines?

s: met

Costs: 0 of 3 met; projects had CO's; marked "Yes" as we have successfully contracted with American Suncraft in the past.

Clearcreek Coatings:

NON-RESPONSIVE; not prequalified. Per Bianca: "Clearcreek Coatings status expired 2.20.21 and submitted an application to be prequalified on 1.13.22."

D & M Painting:

NON-RESPONSIVE; not prequalified. Per Bianca: "D & M Painting status expired 5.1.21 and submitted an application to be prequalified on 1.21.22."

PM's responses:

Yes- after reviewing their bid, American Suncraft meets the coating contractor qualifications detailed in the technical specifications:

1. Contractor shall be regularly engaged in work requiring application of coating and lining systems, which must comply with AWWA, Ohio EPA, NSF and UL requirements and guidelines.

YES

2. Contractor and jobsite foreman shall each have a minimum of five years of experience in surface preparation, mixing and application of high performance industrial coatings and linings, meeting NACE and SSPC requirements and guidelines. The Contractor shall submit evidence of experience with their bid.

YES

3. Contractor shall submit a list of at least five (5) painting projects completed in the past 5 years. These projects must involve the application of plural component coatings to municipal utilities or industrial storage tanks in excess of one (1) million gallons, and project information shall include the names of responsible officials, engineers, architects or coating consultants involved with the project and the approximate contract price.

YES