

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
 BID EVALUATION FORM
 (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: _____
 Division: _____

Project: _____
 Funding Source: _____
 Bid Opening Date: _____
 Engineer's Estimate: _____

Low Bid at Opening: _____
 Non-Local Low Bid at Opening: _____

COMPANY NAME

Original Bid Amount: _____
 Local Company? yes yes

FACTORS

Tier I - Mandatory Factors

M-1 Bid is responsive	yes	yes
M-2 Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits	yes	yes
M-3 Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	yes	yes
M-4 Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency	no	no
M-5 Bidder has requisite licenses	yes	yes
M-6 Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one	yes	yes
Proceed to Tier II?	yes	yes

Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)

C-1 Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)	yes	yes
C-2 Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit	yes	yes
C-3 Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit	yes	yes
C-4 Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit	yes	yes
<i>% of insurance provided by company</i>	100.00%	80.00%
C-5 Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit	yes	yes
<i>% of retirement or pension plan provided by company</i>	100.00%	100.00%
Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$100,000 in total)	5.00%	5.00%
Dollar Value of Credits	-	-
Bid Total:	0.00	0.00

Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits

\$ -

Percent Over Low Bid:	#DIV/0!	#DIV/0!
Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)	#DIV/0!	#DIV/0!
Proceed to Tier III?	#DIV/0!	#DIV/0!

Tier III - History Experience Factors

HE-1 Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs	no	no
HE-2 Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs	no	no
HE-3 Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds	no	no
HE-4 Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years	no	no
HE-5 Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.	no	no
HE-6 Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years	no	no
HE-7 Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:	no	no
A. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no
B. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no
C. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no
D. Worker's Compensation Laws	no	no
HE-8 Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years	yes	no
HE-9 Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation	yes	yes
HE-10 Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR	no	yes
HE-11 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	no	yes
HE12 The results of Bidder's references are questionable	no	no
Total Negative History and Experience Factors:	-2	-1
A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited		
Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)		
Proceed to Tier IV?	yes	yes

Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)

Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).

R-1 Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment)	yes*	yes
R-2 Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project	yes	yes
R-3 Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project	yes	yes
R-4 Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project	yes	yes
R-5 Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project	yes	yes
Total Number of "Yes" Answers	5	5

* Did Not Provide A Detail List of Equipment

Division's Recommendation: _____

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
 BID EVALUATION FORM
 (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: Public Utilities
 Division: Power and Water

Project: Livingston Ave Booster Station
 Funding Source: _____
 Bid Opening Date: 1-Nov-06
 Engineer's Estimate: \$ 890,000.00

Low Bid at Opening: \$ 1,371,700.00
 Non-Local Low Bid at Opening: _____

	<u>The Righter Co.</u>	<u>Central OH. Building</u>
Original Bid Amount: \$	<u>1,371,700.00</u>	\$ <u>1,486,562.00</u>
Local Company?	<u>yes</u>	<u>yes</u>

COMPANY NAME

FACTORS

Tier I - Mandatory Factors

M-1 Bid is responsive	<u>yes</u>	<u>yes</u>
M-2 Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits	<u>yes</u>	<u>yes</u>
M-3 Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	<u>yes</u>	<u>yes</u>
M-4 Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency	<u>no</u>	<u>no</u>
M-5 Bidder has requisite licenses	<u>yes</u>	<u>yes</u>
M-6 Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one	<u>yes</u>	<u>no</u> Two subcontractors did not have contract compliance numbers.
Proceed to Tier II?	<u>yes</u>	<u>no</u>

Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)

C-1 Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)	<u>yes</u>
C-2 Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit	<u>yes</u>
C-3 Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit	<u>no</u>
C-4 Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit	<u>yes</u>
% of insurance provided by company	<u>100.00%</u>
C-5 Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit	<u>yes</u>
% of retirement or pension plan provided by company	<u>100.00%</u>
Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$100,000 in total)	<u>4.00%</u>
Dollar Value of Credits	<u>41,151</u>
Bid Total:	<u>1,330,549.00</u>

Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits

\$ 1,330,549.00

Percent Over Low Bid:

0.000%

Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)

yes

Proceed to Tier III?

yes

Tier III - History Experience Factors

HE-1 Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs	<u>no</u>
HE-2 Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs	<u>no</u>
HE-3 Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds	<u>no</u>
HE-4 Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years	<u>no</u>
HE-5 Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.	<u>no</u>
HE-6 Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years	<u>no</u>
HE-7 Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:	<u>no</u>
A. Fair Labor Standards Act	<u>no</u>
B. Prevailing Wage Laws	<u>no</u>
C. Unemployment Compensation Laws	<u>no</u>
D. Worker's Compensation Laws	<u>no</u>
HE-8 Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years	<u>no</u>
HE-9 Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation	<u>yes</u>
HE-10 Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR	<u>yes</u>
HE-11 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	<u>no</u>
HE-12 The results of Bidder's references are questionable	<u>no</u>

Total Negative History and Experience Factors:

0

A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited

Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)

yes

Proceed to Tier IV?

yes

Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)

Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).

R1 Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment)	<u>yes</u>
R2 Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project	<u>yes</u>
R3 Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project	<u>yes</u>
R4 Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project	<u>yes</u>
R5 Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project	<u>yes</u>
Total Number of "Yes" Answers	<u>5</u>

Division's Recommendation: The Righter Co., Inc.