

**CITY OF COLUMBIAS
BID EVALUATION FORM
(FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: **Public Utilities**
 Division: **Power & Water**
 CIP Number: **Not Applicable**
 Project Name: **Power Line Clearance Services**
 Funding Source: **Power 606764, 606772 - Water 603601**
 Bid Opening Date: **12/1/10**
 Engineer's Estimate: **\$311,900.00**

Low Bid at Opening: **\$ 333,616.28**
 Non-Local Low Bid at Opening: **\$ 333,616.28**
 Original Bid Amount: **\$ 522,200.00**
 Local Company: **Applurath Tree Expert Co**

FACTORS

Tier I - Mandatory Factors

M-1 Bid is responsive **Yes**

M-2 Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits **Yes**

M-3 Bidder will make financial statements available upon request **Yes**

M-4 Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any gov't agency **No**

M-5 Bidder has requisite licenses **Yes**

M-6 Bidder has provided a contract compliance no. or application for one **Yes**
 Proceed to Tier II?

Tier II - Creditable Factors (C1-C5 each yes answer gives 1% credit)

C-1 Bidder is eligible for local credit - (based on lowest non-local bid) **No**

C-2 Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit **Yes**

C-3 Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit **No**

C-4 Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit **Yes**

C-5 % of insurance provided by company **70.00%**
 Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit **Yes**
 % of retirement or pension plan provided by company **3.00%**

C-6 Bidder is eligible for environmental preference **No**
 Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$120,000 in total) **3.00%**
 Dollar Value of Credits **\$ 10,065.49**
 Bid Total: **\$ 323,510.79**
 Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits **\$ 323,510.79**
 Percent Over Low Bid: **0.0060%**
 Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (i.e., within 5% of low bid after credits) **Yes**
 Proceed to Tier III?

Tier III - History Experience Factors

HE-1 Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs **No**

HE-2 Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs **No**

HE-3 Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds **No**

HE-4 Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years **No**

HE-5 Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc. **No**

HE-6 Bidder has been debarred from doing business with gov't agency(s) in past 3 years **No**

HE-7 Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:

- A. Fair Labor Standards Act **Yes**
 - B. Prevailing Wage Laws **No**
 - C. Unemployment Compensation Laws **No**
 - D. Worker's Compensation Laws **No**
 - HE-8 Bidder has a record of "willful or serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (OSHA.gov) **No**
 - HE-9 Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation **Yes**
 - HE-10 Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR **No**
 - HE-11 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years **No**
 - HE-12 The results of Bidder's references are questionable **-2**
- Total Negative History and Experience Factors: **-2**
 A negative score in Tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited
 Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input) **Yes**
 Proceed to Tier IV?

Tier IV - Resource Factors (Yes answers desirable)

Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).

R-1 Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment) **Yes**

R-2 Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project **Yes**

R-3 Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project **Yes**

R-4 Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project **Yes**

R-5 Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project **Yes**

Total Number of Yes Answers **5**

Division's Recommendation:

Applurath Tree Expert Co.