

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
BID EVALUATION FORM
(FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department:	<u>Public Utilities</u>	CIP Number:	<u>690236-100054</u>
Division:	<u>Water</u>	Project Name:	<u>Ferris Rd. Area WL Imp's</u>
		Funding Source:	<u>Water Bonds</u>
		Bid Opening Date:	<u>4/9/14</u>
Lowest, Best, Most Responsive, Responsible Bid Tab Amount:	<u>\$2,247,996.30</u>	Engineer's Estimate:	<u>\$2,204,062.30</u>

	Vendor Name:	Danbert	Shelly & Sands	Underground Utilities	John Eramo
	Bid Tab Amount:	\$2,247,996.30	\$2,320,223.18	\$2,334,727.89	\$2,377,287.00
FACTORS					
<u>(Pgs. 6-7) & Form 1 (Pg. 12) - Contract Compliance</u>	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
<u>Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages</u>	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0
<u>Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws &</u>					
	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):		no		
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	no	no
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no	no	yes
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	no	no
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no	no	no	no
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers' Compensation EMR (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	-1
<u>Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:</u>					
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov)	no	yes	yes	no
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan	yes	yes	yes	yes
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
	Negative Factors:	0	-1	-1	0
<u>Form 5 - Debarment</u>					
	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0
<u>Form 6 - Local Workforce</u>					
	1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	100.0%	52.0%	4.0%	82.0%
	Negative Factors:				
<u>Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs</u>					
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	ER: 100%	ER: 100%	ER: 100%	ER: 80% - EE: 20%
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	ER: 100%	ER: 100%	ER: 100%	ER: 100%
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0
<u>Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs</u>					
	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	no
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	-1
<u>Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED</u>					
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
<u>Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED</u>					
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	(blank)	yes	yes	"TBD"
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	'none required'	yes	yes	yes
<u>Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control</u>					
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	yes	see comment	see comment	see comment
<u>Form 12 - Availability</u>					
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes

	Vendor Name:	Danbert	Shelly & Sands	Underground Utilities	John Eramo
	Bid Tab Amount:	\$2,247,996.30	\$2,320,223.18	\$2,334,727.89	\$2,377,287.00
Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates					
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)	no	yes	(blank)	no
	License and/or Certificate No:	City license # not listed	no City license # listed	SW00005	SW00004
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0
	Lowest Bid Dollar of non-environmental preferred bidder	\$2,320,223.18			
	Percent Over Low Bid:	-3.1%	0.00%	0.63%	2.46%
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('L.e., within 10% of low bid)	yes	yes	yes	yes
Pg. 30 - Environmental Preference					
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	yes	no	no	no
	Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferable bidder (%)	-3.11%	0.00%	0.63%	2.46%
	Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferable bidder (\$)	(\$72,226.88)	\$0.00	\$14,504.71	\$57,063.82
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid.	no; already the lowest bidder	no	no	no
	If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified?				
Pgs. 31-34 - Statements and Affidavits					
	Statement 1: Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	"is not"	yes	yes
	Statement 2: Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Statement 3: Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Affidavit Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0
Pg. 43 - Addenda Acknsmt.					
	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Proposal (Pg. 44) - Proposal Signature					
	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0
Pg. 68 - Proposal Bond					
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0
	Grand Total Negative Factors:	0	-1	-1	-2
	Division's Recommendation:	Danbert, Inc.			
Additional Evaluation Questions for Non-Responsive Proposals per Section 102.08, not covered above in RED.					
1)	Has the bidder submitted more than one proposal under the same name/subsidiary? (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
2)	Are the bid prices material unbalanced? (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
3)	Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not provided in the bid documents? (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
4)	Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all material respects, and does not contain irregularities or deviations? (Y/N)	yes	no	yes	yes
5)	Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to accept or reject an award? (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
6)	Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract item listed? (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
7)	Did the bidder fail to submit a lump sum price where required? (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
	Negative Factors:	0	-1	0	0

Department: Division:				
Lowest, Best, Most Responsive, Responsible Bid Tab Amount:				
	Vendor Name:	Elite Excavating	Cols. Asphalt Paving	Conie
	Bid Tab Amount:	\$2,628,193.70	\$2,649,771.52	\$2,911,700.00
FACTORS				
(Pgs. 6-7) & Form 1 (Pg. 12) - Contract Compliance	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	???: can't read one of the sub's names	yes
Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0	-1
Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws &				
	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):			
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	(blank)
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no	(blank)
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	(blank)
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no	no	(blank)
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)	no	no	(blank)
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers' Compensation EMR (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:				
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov)	yes	no	no
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan	yes	yes	yes
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no
	Negative Factors:	-1	0	0
Form 5 - Debarment				
	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
Form 6 - Local Workforce				
	1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	0.0%	75.0%	47.0%
	Negative Factors:			
Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs				
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	see comment	ER: 100%	ER: 100%
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	ER: 4%-EE: up to 15%	ER: 100%	see comment
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs				
	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	yes	yes	no
	Negative Factors:	0	0	-1
Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED				
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	yes	not listed	yes
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED				
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control				
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	see comments	see comment	see comment
Form 12 - Availability				
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes

	Vendor Name:	Elite Excavating	Cols. Asphalt Paving	Conie
	Bid Tab Amount:	\$2,628,193.70	\$2,649,771.52	\$2,911,700.00
Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates				
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)	yes	not listed	no
	License and/or Certificate No:	SW0088, G4169	City license # not listed	SW0035
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
Lowest Bid Dollar of non-environmental preferred bidder				
	Percent Over Low Bid:	13.27%	14.20%	25.49%
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('L.e., within 10% of low bid)	no	no	no
Pg. 30 - Environmental Preference				
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	yes	no	yes
	Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferable bidder (%)	13.27%	14.20%	25.49%
	Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferable bidder (\$)	\$307,970.52	\$329,548.34	\$591,476.82
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid.	no	no	no
	If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified?			
Pgs. 31-34 - Statements and Affidavits				
	Statement 1: Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	initialed but not dated	yes
	Statement 2: Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	initialed but not dated	yes
	Statement 3: Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	initialed but not dated	yes
	Affidavit Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	yes	initialed but not dated	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
Pg. 43 - Addenda Acknlsmt.				
	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)	N/A	N/A	N/A
Proposal (Pg. 44) - Proposal Signature				
	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
Pg. 68 - Proposal Bond				
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
	Grand Total Negative Factors:	-1	0	-2
	Division's Recommendation:			
Additional Evaluation Questions for Non-Responsive Proposals per Section				
1)	Has the bidder submitted more than one proposal under the same name/subsidiary? (Y/N)	no	no	no
2)	Are the bid prices material unbalanced? (Y/N)	no	no	no
3)	Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not provided in the bid documents? (Y/N)	no	no	no
4)	Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all material respects, and does not contain irregularities or deviations? (Y/N)	yes	no	no
5)	Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to accept or reject an award? (Y/N)	no	no	
6)	Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract item listed? (Y/N)	no	no	
7)	Did the bidder fail to submit a lump sum price where required? (Y/N)	no	no	
	Negative Factors:	0	-1	-1