

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
BID EVALUATION FORM
(FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department:	Public Utilities				
Division:	Water			Project:	Upground Reservoir #1
				Funding Source:	Voted 1996 bond fund
				Bid Opening Date:	20-Nov-02
Low Bid at Opening:	\$ 4,990,800.00				
Non-Local Low Bid at Opening:	\$ 5,025,350.00				
		COMPANY NAME			
		Company 1	Company 2	Company 3	Company 4
Original Bid Amount:	\$ 5,150,025.00	\$ 5,750,900.00	\$ 5,025,350.00	\$ 4,990,800.00	\$ 5,454,650.00
Local Company?	yes	yes	no	yes	no
FACTORS					
Tier I - Mandatory Factors (must have yes for all for bid to qualify)					
M-1	Bid is responsive	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-2	Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-3	Bidder has requisite licenses	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-4	Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-5	Bidder not currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-6	Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Proceed to Tier II?	yes	yes	yes	yes
Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)					
C-1	Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)	yes	yes	no	yes
C-2	Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit	yes	yes	no	no
C-3	Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit	yes	yes	no	yes
C-4	Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit	yes	yes	yes	yes
C-5	Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$100,000 in total)	5.00%	5.00%	2.00%	4.00%
	Dollar Value of Credits	100,000	100,000	40,000	80,000
	Bid Total:	\$ 5,050,025.00	\$ 5,650,900.00	\$ 4,985,350.00	\$ 4,910,800.00
	Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits	\$ 4,910,800.00			
	Percent Over Low Bid:	2.835%	15.071%	1.518%	0.000%
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (i.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)	yes	no	yes	yes
	Proceed to Tier III?	yes	no	yes	yes
Tier III - History Experience Factors (each yes answer gives 1 point debit)					
HE-1	Bidder has not demonstrated a good faith effort to comply with the requirements of the City of Columbus' Equal Business Opportunity Program	no		no	yes
HE-2	Bidder has not complied with federal, state and local affirmative action programs	no		no	yes
HE-3	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds	yes		no	yes
HE-4	Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past five years	yes		no	yes
HE-5	Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.	no		no	yes
HE-6	Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 5 years	no		no	no
HE-7	Bidder has a record, within the past 5 years, of violations with the following:				
	A. Fair Labor Standards Act	yes		no	no
	B. Prevailing Wage Laws	no		no	no
	C. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no		no	no
	D. Worker's Compensation Laws	yes		no	no
HE-8	Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years	no		no	no
HE-9	Bidder lacks an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation	yes		no	no
HE-10	Bidder's OSHA Experience Modification Rating (EMR) is greater than 1.0	yes		no	no
HE-11	Bidder has a record of violations with environmental regulations	no		no	yes
HE-12	The results of Bidder's references are questionable	yes		no	yes
	Total Negative History and Experience Factors:	-7	0	0	-4
	A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited				
	Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome?	yes	no	no	yes
	Proceed to Tier IV?	yes	no	no	yes
Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answer desirable)					
Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).					
R1	Bidder has sufficient resources to reasonably complete this project	yes			yes
R2	Bidder's management resources have sufficient experience	yes			no
R3	Bidder's workforce resources have sufficient experience	yes			yes
R4	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project	yes			no
R5	Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project	yes			yes
	Total Number of "Yes" Answers	5	0	0	5
	Division's Recommendation:	Company 4			

CITY OF COLUMBUS BID EVALUATION FORM (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)					
Department:	Public Utilities			Project:	Big Walnut San Trunk Sewer Ext CIP033.6F1
Division:	Sewers & Drains			Funding Source:	OWPCLF - EPA
				Bid Opening Date:	1-Nov-06
Low Bid at Opening:	\$ 23,897,500.00			KMM&J JOINT VENTURE	
Non-Local Low Bid at Opening:	\$ 23,897,500.00				
COMPANY NAME					
	Kassouf Company	Murray Hill Const Co	Mole Constructors	Jay Dee Contract, Inc.	
Original Bid Amount:	JV Partner	JV Partner	JV Partner	JV Partner	
LOCAL COMPANY?:	No	No	No	No	
THIS SPREADSHEET REFLECTS KMM&J JOINT VENTURE CONTRACTORS					
FACTORS					
Tier I - Mandatory Factors (must have yes for all for bid to qualify)					
M-1	Bid is responsive	YES	Yes	YES	YES
M-2	Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits	YES	Yes	YES	Yes
M-3	Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	YES	Yes	YES	YES
M-4	Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency	No	No	YES	No
M-5	Bidder has requisite licenses	YES	Yes	YES	Yes
M-6	Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one	YES	Yes	YES	Yes
	Proceed to Tier II?	YES	Yes	YES	YES
Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)					
C-1	Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)	NO	No	No	No
C-2	Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit	YES	YES	YES	Yes
C-3	Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit	YES	YES	YES	Yes
C-4	Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit	YES	YES	YES	Yes
	<i>% of insurance provided by company</i>	100.00%	100.00%	100.00%	95.00%
C-5	Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit	YES	YES	YES	Yes
	<i>% of retirement or pension plan provided by company</i>	0.00%	100.00%	0.00%	50.00%
	Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$100,000 in total)	4.00%	4.00%	4.00%	4.00%
	Dollar Value of Credits	80,000	80,000	80,000	80,000
	Bid Total:	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
	Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits	\$ -			
	Percent Over Low Bid:	0.000%	0.000%	0.000%	0.000%
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)	0.00%	0.00%	0.00%	0.00%
	Proceed to Tier III?	0	0	0	no
Tier III - History Experience Factors (each yes answer gives 1 point debit)					
HE-1	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs	no	no	No	No
HE-2	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs	no	no	No	No
HE-3	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds	no	no	No	No
HE-4	Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past three years	no	no	No	No
HE-5	Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.	no	no	No	No
HE-6	Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years	no	no	No	No
HE-7	Bidder has a record, within the past3 years, of violations with the following:			No	No
	A. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	No	No
	B. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no	No	No
	C. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	No	No
	D. Worker's Compensation Laws	no	no	No	No
HE-8	Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years	no	no	No	No
HE-9	Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation	YES	yes	yes	Yes
HE-10	Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR	YES	yes	yes	Yes
HE-11	Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	no	no	No	No
HE12	The results of Bidder's references are questionable	no	no	No	No
	Total Negative History and Experience Factors:	-2	-2	-2	-2
	A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited				
	Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)				
	Proceed to Tier IV?	YES	yes	yes	Yes
Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answer desirable)					
Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).					
R1	Bidder has sufficient resources to reasonably complete this project	YES	yes	yes	yes
R2	Bidder's management resources have sufficient experience	YES	yes	yes	yes
R3	Bidder's workforce resources have sufficient experience	YES	yes	yes	yes
R4	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project	YES	yes	yes	yes
R5	Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project	YES	yes	yes	yes
	Total Number of "Yes" Answers	5	5	5	5
Division's Recommendation:					