

CITY OF COLUMBUS, OHIO			
BID EVALUATION FORM			
(FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)			
<b>Department:</b>	<u>Public Utilities</u>	<b>CIP Number:</b>	<u>690477-1000</u>
<b>Division:</b>	<u>Water</u>	<b>Project Name:</b>	<u>Morse Rd. S. &amp; Ulry Rd</u>
		<b>Funding Source:</b>	<u>Water</u>
		<b>Bid Opening Date:</b>	<u>2/15</u>
<b>Lowest, Best, Most Responsive, Responsible Bid Tab Amount:</b>	<u>\$959,200.00</u>	<b>Engineer's Estimate</b>	<u>\$1,237.</u>
<b>Vendor Name:</b>	<u>Tecorp</u>	<u>UCL, Inc.</u>	<u>D &amp; M Painting</u>
<b>(INTENDED) Bid Tab Amount:</b>	<u>\$959,200.00</u>	<u>\$995,500.00</u>	<u>\$998,976.00</u>

<b>FACTORS</b>			
<u>(Pgs. 6-7) &amp; Form 1 (Pg. 12) - Contract Compliance</u>	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	yes
<u>Form 2 - Claims &amp; Liquidated Damages</u>	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no	no
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<u>Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws &amp; Regulations:</u>			
	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):		
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no	no
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs	no	no
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EM	yes	yes
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	yes	yes
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<u>Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:</u>			
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov)	no	yes
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSH	yes	yes
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	yes	yes
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	yes	yes
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	no	no
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>-1</b>
<u>Form 5 - Debarment</u>			
	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years	no	no
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<u>Form 6 - Local Workforce</u>			
	1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	50.0%	50.0%
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>		0.0%
<u>Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs</u>			
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes	yes
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	ER: 100%	ER: 100%
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	yes	yes
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	ER: 100%	ER: 100%
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<u>Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs</u>			
	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	yes	yes
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>-1</b>
<u>Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED</u>			
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes
<u>Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED</u>			
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes
<u>Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control</u>			
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction	see comment	yes
<u>Form 12 - Availability</u>			
			see comment

Vendor Name:		Tecorp	UCL, Inc.	D & M Painting
<b>(INTENDED) Bid Tab Amount:</b>		\$959,200.00	\$995,500.00	\$998,976.00
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
<b>Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates</b>				
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing require	no	no	no
	<b>License and/or Certificate No:</b>	no City license #	no City license #	no City license #
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	0	0	0
	<b>Lowest Bid Dollar of non-environmental preferred bidder</b>	\$959,200.00		
	<b>Percent Over Low Bid:</b>	0.0%	3.8%	4.1%
	<b>Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid)</b>	yes	yes	yes
<b>Pg. 30 - Environmental Preference</b>				
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	no	no	no
	Difference versus lowest <b>non-environmental preferrable</b> bidder (%)	0.00%	3.78%	4.15%
	Difference versus lowest <b>non-environmental preferrable</b> bidder (\$)	\$0.00	\$36,300.00	\$39,776.00
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest <b>non-environmentally preferred</b> bid.	no	no	no
	If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified?	n/a		
<b>Pgs. 31-34 - Statements and Affidavits</b>				
<b>Statement 1:</b>	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes; but not dated
<b>Statement 2:</b>	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes; but not dated
<b>Statement 3:</b>	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes; but not dated
<b>Affidavit</b>	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized	yes	yes	yes
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	0	0	0
<b>Pg. 40 - Addenda Acknlgmt.</b>	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)	N/A	N/A	N/A
<b>Proposal (Pg. 41) - Proposal Signature</b>	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	0	0	0
<b>Pg. 42-43 - Proposal Bond</b>				
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Coverage (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	0	0	0
	<b>Grand Total Negative Factors:</b>	0	-1	-2
	<b>Division's Recommendation:</b>	Tecorp, Inc.		

**Additional Evaluation Questions for Non-Responsive Proposals per Section 102.08, not covered above in RED.**

1)	Has the bidder submitted more than one proposal under the same name/subsidiary? (Y/N)	no	no	no
2)	Are the bid prices material unbalanced? (Y/N)	no	no	no
3)	Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not provided in the bid documents? (Y/N)	no	no	no
4)	Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all material respects, and does not contain irregularities or deviations? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
5)	Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to accept or reject an award? (Y/N)	no	no	no
6)	Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract item listed? (Y/N)	no	no	no
7)	Did the bidder fail to submit a lump sum price where required? (Y/N)	no	no	no
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	0	0	0

Department: 06 & 10007  
 Division: Interior Tank Painting  
Bonds  
)/14

Lowest, Best, Most Responsive, Responsible Bid Tab Amount: 500.00

Vendor Name: Kountoupes Ptng. Horizon Bros.  
 (INTENDED) Bid Tab Amount: \$1,514,700.00 \$1,755,607.70

<b>FACTORS</b>		
<u>(Pgs. 6-7) &amp; Form 1 (Pg. 12) - Contract Compliance</u>	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes ???
<u>Form 2 - Claims &amp; Liquidated Damages</u>	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no no
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0 0</b>
<u>Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws &amp; Regulations</u>		
	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:	
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	no no
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	no no
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no no
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no no
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs	no no
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EM	yes yes
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	yes yes
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0 0</b>
<u>Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:</u>		
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov)	no yes
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA	yes yes
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	yes yes
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	yes yes
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	no no
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0 -1</b>
<u>Form 5 - Debarment</u>	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years	no no
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0 0</b>
<u>Form 6 - Local Workforce</u>	1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	0.0% "N/A"
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	
<u>Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs</u>		
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes no
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	50% - 50%
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	yes no
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	60% - 40%
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0 -2</b>
<u>Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs</u>	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	no no
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>-1 -1</b>
<u>Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED</u>		
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	yes yes
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes (blank)
<u>Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED</u>		
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	yes yes
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes (blank)
<u>Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control</u>		
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction	see comment see comment
<u>Form 12 - Availability</u>		

Vendor Name:		Kountoupes Ptng.	Horizon Bros.
<b>(INTENDED) Bid Tab Amount:</b>		\$1,514,700.00	\$1,755,607.70
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes	yes
<b>Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates</b>			
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing require	no	no
	License and/or Certificate No:	no City license #	no City license #
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Lowest Bid Dollar of non-environmental preferred bidder</b>			
	<b>Percent Over Low Bid:</b>	<b>57.9%</b>	<b>83.0%</b>
	<b>Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid)</b>	<b>no</b>	<b>no</b>
<b>Pg. 30 - Environmental Preference</b>			
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	no	no
	Difference versus lowest <b>non-environmental preferrable</b> bidder (%)	<b>57.91%</b>	<b>83.03%</b>
	Difference versus lowest <b>non-environmental preferrable</b> bidder (\$)	<b>\$555,500.00</b>	<b>\$796,407.70</b>
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest <b>non-environmentally preferred</b> bid.	no	no
	If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified?		
<b>Pgs. 31-34 - Statements and Affidavits</b>			
<b>Statement 1:</b>	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	yes
<b>Statement 2:</b>	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	yes
<b>Statement 3:</b>	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	yes
<b>Affidavit</b>	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized	yes	yes
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Pg. 40 - Addenda Acknlgmt.</b>	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)	N/A	N/A
<b>Proposal (Pg. 41) - Proposal Signature</b>	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes	yes
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Pg. 42-43 - Proposal Bond</b>			
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Coverage (Y/N)	yes	yes
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
	<b>Grand Total Negative Factors:</b>	<b>-1</b>	<b>-4</b>
	<b>Division's Recommendation:</b>		
<b>Additional Evaluation Questions for Non-Responsive Proposals per Section 153.02</b>			
<b>1)</b>	<b>Has the bidder submitted more than one proposal under the same name/subsidiary? (Y/N)</b>	no	no
<b>2)</b>	<b>Are the bid prices material unbalanced? (Y/N)</b>	no	yes
<b>3)</b>	<b>Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not provided in the bid documents? (Y/N)</b>	no	no
<b>4)</b>	<b>Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all material respects, and does not contain irregularities or deviations? (Y/N)</b>	yes	yes
<b>5)</b>	<b>Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to accept or reject an award? (Y/N)</b>	no	no
<b>6)</b>	<b>Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract item listed? (Y/N)</b>	no	no
<b>7)</b>	<b>Did the bidder fail to submit a lump sum price where required? (Y/N)</b>	no	no
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>