

CITY OF COLUMBUS BID EVALUATION FORM				
Department: <u>Public Utilities</u>		CIP Number: <u>690428-100004</u>		
Division: <u>Water</u>		Project Name: <u>DRWP Treatment Capacity Increase - Recarbonation & Ozonation</u>		
Lowest Bidder: <u>\$37,551,525.00</u>		Funding Source: <u>Water Works Enlargement Voted Bond</u>		
		Bid Opening Date: <u>5/29/13</u>		
		Engineer's Estimate: <u>\$47,150,000.00</u>		
Bid Tab Amount:		<u>Kokosing</u>	<u>Shook Walbridge JV</u>	<u>Walsh</u>
		<u>\$37,551,525.00</u>	<u>\$39,070,480.65</u>	<u>\$40,319,915.40</u>
			<u>Adams Robinson</u>	<u>\$40,452,400.00</u>
FACTORS				
<u>(Section 00 43 00 Pgs. 2-3) & Form 1 - Contract Compliance</u>	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	<u>see comment</u>	<u>yes</u>	<u>no</u>
<u>Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages</u>	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	<u>no</u>	<u>no</u>	<u>no</u>
Negative Factors:		0	0	-1
Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations:				
Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):				
1. Fair Labor Standards Act		<u>no</u>	<u>no</u>	<u>no</u>
2. Prevailing Wage Laws		<u>no</u>	<u>no</u>	<u>no</u>
3. Unemployment Compensation Laws		<u>no</u>	<u>no</u>	<u>no</u>
4. Workers' Compensation Laws		<u>no</u>	<u>no</u>	<u>no</u>
5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)		<u>no</u>	<u>no</u>	<u>no</u>
6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N)		<u>yes</u>	<u>see comment</u>	<u>yes</u>
7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)		<u>yes</u>	<u>yes</u>	<u>yes</u>
Negative Factors:		0	0	0
Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:				
1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N)		<u>yes</u>	<u>yes</u>	<u>yes</u>
2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)			<u>yes</u>	<u>yes</u>
3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan		<u>yes</u>	<u>yes</u>	<u>yes</u>
4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3		<u>yes</u>	<u>yes</u>	<u>yes</u>
5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)		<u>no</u>	<u>no</u>	<u>no</u>
Negative Factors:		-1	-1	-1
Form 5 - Debarment				
1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)		<u>no</u>	<u>no</u>	<u>no</u>
Negative Factors:		0	0	0
Form 6 - Local Workforce				
1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties		<u>12.8%</u>	<u>60.0%</u>	<u>60.0%</u>
			<u>50.0%</u>	
Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs				
1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)		<u>yes</u>	<u>yes</u>	<u>yes</u>
2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:		<u>ER: 100%</u>	<u>see comment</u>	<u>85% / 15%</u>
3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)		<u>yes</u>	<u>yes</u>	<u>yes</u>
4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:		<u>ER: 100%</u>	<u>see comment</u>	<u>4% / up to fed'l max</u>
Negative Factors:		0	0	0

		Kokosing	Shook Walbridge JV	Walsh	Adams Robinson
Bid Tab Amount:		\$37,551,525.00	\$39,070,480.65	\$40,319,915.40	\$40,452,400.00
Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	no
Negative Factors:		0	0	0	-1
Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED					
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project	yes	yes	yes	yes
Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED					
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	see comment	yes	yes	yes
Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control					
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar contracts	see comment	see comment	see comment	see comments
Form 12 - Availability					
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates					
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	see comment	yes	yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing	yes	see comment	no	yes
	License and/or Certificate No:	City license # not listed	see comment	SW0293, G6621	SW0329
Negative Factors:		0	0	0	0
Lowest Bid Dollar Amount		\$37,551,525.00			
Percent Over Low Bid:		0%	4%	7%	8%
Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid)		yes	yes	yes	yes
00 43 00 (Pg. 23) - Environmental Preference					
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	yes	no	yes	yes
	Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	NA	4.04%	7.37%	7.73%
	Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	NA	\$1,518,955.65	\$2,768,390.40	\$2,900,875.00
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.	no; lowest bidder; doesn't apply	no	no	no
00 43 00 (Pgs. 24-27) - Statements and Affidavits					
Statement 1:	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
Statement 2:	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
Statement 3:	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
Affidavit	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized	yes	yes	yes	yes
Negative Factors:		0	0	0	0
00 42 00 (Pg. 14) - Addenda Acknlgmt.					
	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
00 42 00 (Pg. 15) - Proposal Signature					
	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
Negative Factors:		0	0	0	0
00 43 00 (Pg. 28) - Proposal Bond					
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate	yes	yes	yes	yes
Negative Factors:		0	0	0	0
Grand Total Negative Factors:		-1	-1	-2	-2
Division's Recommendation:		KOKOSING CONSTRUCTION COMPANY, INC.			