Max Budder is complaint with city taxes on payroll and net profits yes	CITY OF COLUMBUS BID EVALUATION FORM (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)										
Company Comp											
Non-local Low Hold of Openings 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.50 1.1274.945.											
Section Part		DIVISION.	(i owerd) water								
Non-Local Lore field of Opening III S 1,28,20,000				Bid Opening Date:							
Company Comp				Engineer's Estimate:	\$14,25	5,000					
Page 1, No.		Non-Local Low Bid at Opening:	\$ 13,882,050.00								
Company Comp			Dugan & Mevers			PAF & Associates					
Company Comp		Original Bid Amount:									
March Marc		Local Company?	yes	no	yes	no					
March Marc		FACTORS									
M. Bill is responsive to the complete with duty takes on payorid and responsive year. When the complete with duty takes on payorid and responsive year. M. Bill desir is contraintly debarred from doing business with any gord, agency. M. Bill desir is contraintly debarred from doing business with any gord, agency. M. Bill desir is contraintly debarred from doing business with any gord, agency. M. Bill desir is contraintly debarred from doing business with any gord, agency. M. Bill desir is contraintly debarred from doing business with any gord, agency. M. Bill desir is contraintly debarred from doing business with any gord, agency. M. Bill desir is contraintly debarred from doing business with any gord, agency. M. Bill desir is contraintly debarred from doing business with any gord, agency. M. Bill desir is agency of the contraint of th											
Modes Solider will make financial statements available upon request yes		Bid is responsive	yes	yes	yes	no					
Med. Shorter is provided a contract from doing business with any gort, apertory yes											
Moder has requisite increases yes ye											
Medical Part Provided a control complainane (no. or plagication for one yes yes yes yes yes no											
Title 11-Creditable Factors (seek) was antwert after. 1% credit											
C-1 Bodder is eligible for local underlice oracid Seder is eligible for local underlice oracid No. Yes Yes		Proceed to Tier II?	yes	yes	yes	no					
C-1 Bodder is eligible for local underlice oracid Seder is eligible for local underlice oracid No. Yes Yes		Tier II Conditable Forton (and use annual since 40/ analis)									
C-2 Blader is eligible for pally training contractor credit	C-1		Vas	no	VQC						
C3 Bladder is eligible for quality training contractor credit part of the contract of the cont			,								
Sedient is eligible for health insurance credit 75% for salary, 50% for profit sharing, 15% for salary, 50% for profit sharing, 15% for profit sha											
Sign First Sign			yes								
Season a eligible for reinferment or persion plan credit **Sof retirement or persion plan provided by company **Sof retirement or persion plan provided by company **Sof retirement or persion plan provided by company **Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$120,000 in total) **Dollar Value of Credits **Soft		0/ - ()									
Sign of referement or pension plan provided by company To all Credits (samnot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$120,000 in total) Total Credits (samnot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$120,000 in total) Bild Total: Sign of Referement of pension plan provided by company Total Credits (samnot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$120,000 in total) Bild Total: Sign of Referement of Pension plan provided by company Per formation of the Sign of S	C E										
3% for profit sharing, 15% yearly profit, 3% for 401(8)	C-5	Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit	Yes		yes						
C8 Blidder geligible for environmental preference Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$120,000 in total) Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$120,000 in total) Bid Total: Low Bid Total: Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits Percent Over Low Bid: Percent Ov			3% for profit sharing, 15%								
Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$120,000 in total) Dollar Value of Credits S12,664,945.00 \$13,000,00 \$100,000 NA Bid Total: S12,664,945.00 S13,000,00 S13,070,000 NA Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits Frencent Over Low Bid: Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (1.e., within 10% of low bid after credits) Frencent Over Low Bid: Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (1.e., within 10% of low bid after credits) Frencent Over Low Bid: Guodo N. S12,664,945.00 S13,070,000 S13,077,000.00 NA French Low Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits Frencent Over Low Bid: Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (1.e., within 10% of low bid after credits) Frencent Over Low Bid: Guodo N. S12,664,945.00 S13,077,000.00 S13,077,000.00 NA FVALUE French Low Low Low Bid (1.e., within 10% of low bid after credits) French Low			for 401(k) match	match	100.00%						
Dollar Value of Credits Bid Total: St.2664,045.80 St.2664,045.80 Percent Over Low Bid: Produced to Tier III' Produced to Tier III' Produced to Tier III' Produced to Tier III' Received to Tier III' R	C-6	Bidder is eligible for environmental preference	no	no	no						
Dollar Value of Credits Bid Total: St.2664,045.80 St.2664,045.80 Percent Over Low Bid: Produced to Tier III' Produced to Tier III' Produced to Tier III' Produced to Tier III' Received to Tier III' R		Total Cradita (cannot avaced \$20,000 per factor or \$120,000 in total)	2 00%	4.000/	E 00%	NA.					
Bid Total: \$12,644,945.80 \$13,802,050.00 \$13,907,000.00 NA											
Percent Over Low Bid: Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (*Le, within 10% of low bid after credits) Proceed to Tier III? Ter III. History Experience Factors Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal state and state plan and supporting Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal state plan and supporting Bidder has a record of limit of "Senious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years Bidder has a record of limit of "Senious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years Bidder has a record of the process of th						NA					
Percent Over Low Bid: Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (*Le, within 10% of low bid after credits) Proceed to Tier III? Ter III. History Experience Factors Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal state and state plan and supporting Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal state plan and supporting Bidder has a record of limit of "Senious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years Bidder has a record of limit of "Senious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years Bidder has a record of the process of th											
Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (1.e., within 10% of low bid after credits) Proceed to Tie III? Ter III - History Experience Factors didder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs Bidder has a record of columbation and the past 3 years no no no Bidder has a record of admis against performance bonds no no no Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, no no no Bidder has a record within the past 3 years, or violations with the following: A Fair Labor Standards Act Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, or violations with the following: A Fair Labor Standards Act Bidder has a record within the past 3 years, or violations with the following: Bidder has a record within the past 3 years, or violations with the following: Bidder has a record within the past 3 years, or violations with the following: Bidder has a record or within the past 3 years, or violations within the past 3 years or no				0.0700/	40.0040/	(0/411151					
Proceed to Tise III? Ter III - History Experience Factors Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds Didder has a record of claims against performance bonds Didder has a record of claims against performance bonds Didder has a record of claims against performance bonds Didder has a record of claims against performance bonds Didder has a record of claims against performance bonds Didder has a record of claims against performance bonds Didder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 Didder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 Didder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following: Didder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following: Didder has a record of "willfulf or Seroius" Osha violations within the past 3 years, of violations within the past 3 years of 0 no											
Tier III - History Experience Factors											
He1 action programs no no no lidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local no no no no lidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local no			•	•							
HE-1 action programs Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds Didder has paid fluidated damages in the past 3 years Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc. Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 Bidder has a record of, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following: Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following: B. Prevailing Wage Laws D. Worker's Compensation Laws D. Worker's Compensation Laws D. Worker's Compensation Laws Didder has a record of willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 Bidder has a record of willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 Bidder has a record of willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 Bidder has a record of willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 Bidder has a record of willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 Bidder has a record of willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 Bidder has a record of willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 Bidder has a record of willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 Bidder has a record of willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Bidder has a r											
HE-32 affirmative action programs HE-32 affirmative action programs HE-33 lidider has a record of claims against performance bonds HE-38 lidider has padel (diuded damages in the past 3 years No no no HE-41 lidider has padel (diuded damages in the past 3 years Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, HE-56 etc. No no no No HE-67 lider has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 No no no No HE-77 lider has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following: No	UE₋1		no	no							
##E-2 all dirth reast a record of claims against performance bonds			110	110							
HE-5 Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years	HE-2		no	no							
HE-5 etc. HE-6 years HE-6 years HE-7 Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 HE-7 Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following: A. Fair Labor Standards Act B. Prevailing Wage Laws C. Uhemployment Compensation Laws C. Uhemployment Compensation Laws D. Worker's Compensation EMR D. Wes D. Worker's Compensation EMR D. Worker's D. Worker's Compensation EMR D. Worker's D. Work											
HE-5 Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 no no no HE-6 years no no no no HE-7 Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:	HE-4		no	no							
Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 no no ME-7 Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following: no no A. Fair Labor Standards Act no no C. Unemployment Compensation Laws no no D. Worker's Compensation Laws Bidder has a record of Wilfluf or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 Bidder has a record of Wilfluf or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 Bidder has a record of Wilfluf or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 Bidder has a nedguate health and safety plan and supporting Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting Wes HE-10 Bidder pastifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR HE-10 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years no no HE-11 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years no no HE-11 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years no no Total Negative History and Experience Factors: 0 1-1 0 0 (A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited) Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input) Proceed to Tier IV? yes yes proceed to Tier IV? Tevesource Factors (yes answers desirable) Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s). Bidder has adequate to qualified safety personnel proposed for this project yes yes yes Protect of the sufficient experience to ensure completed to yes yes project Division's Recommendation: Division's Recommendation: Division's Recommendation: Division's Recommendation:	HF-5		no	no							
HE-F. Sidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following: A. Fair Labor Standards Act B. Prevailing Wage Laws C. Unemployment Compensation Laws D. Worker's Compensation Laws no no no no Bidder has a record of "wilful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 Bidder has a record of "wilful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 HE-8 years (OSHA.gov) HE-10 Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years no no no HE-11 Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR yes no HE-11 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years no no no HE-12 The results of Bidder's references are questionable Total Negative History and Experience Factors: 0	IIL J		110	110							
A. Fair Labor Standards Act B. Prevailing Wage Laws C. Unemployment Compensation Laws D. Worker's Compensation Laws D. Worker's Compensation Laws Didder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 Didder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 Didder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 Didder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 Dider has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 Dider has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 Dider has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Dider has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Dider has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Dider has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Dider has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Dider has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Dider has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Dider has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Dider has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Dider has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Dider has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Dider has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Dider has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Dider has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Dider has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Dider has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Dider has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Dider has a record of EPA violations within the past 3 Dider has a record of EPA violations within the past 3 Dider has a record of EPA violations within the past 3 Dider has a record of EPA violations within the past 3 Dider has a record of EPA violations within the past 3 Dider has a record of EPA violations within the past 3 Dider has a record of EPA violations within the past 3 Dider	HE-6		no	no							
A. Fair Labor Standards Act B. Prevailing Wage Laws C. Unemployment Compensation Laws D. Worker's Compensation Laws D. Worker's Compensation Laws Didder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 Didder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 Didder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 Didder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 Dider has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 Dider has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 Dider has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Dider has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Dider has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Dider has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Dider has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Dider has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Dider has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Dider has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Dider has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Dider has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Dider has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Dider has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Dider has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Dider has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Dider has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Dider has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Dider has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years Dider has a record of EPA violations within the past 3 Dider has a record of EPA violations within the past 3 Dider has a record of EPA violations within the past 3 Dider has a record of EPA violations within the past 3 Dider has a record of EPA violations within the past 3 Dider has a record of EPA violations within the past 3 Dider has a record of EPA violations within the past 3 Dider		Political constraints of the con									
B. Prevailing Wage Laws	HE-7										
C. Unemployment Compensation Laws D. Worker's Compensation Laws no no no Bidder has a record of "wilful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 no no no Bidder has a necord of "wilful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 no no no Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation WE-10 Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation WE-11 Bidder has a necord of EPA violations within the last 3 years NE-10 Bidder so a negret so no		B. Prevailing Wage Laws									
D. Worker's Compensation Laws Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 HE-8 years (OSHA-gov) Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting HE-9 documentation HE-10 Bidder nas a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years HE-10 Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR HE-11 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years No HE-11 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years No Total Negative History and Experience Factors: O -11 O O A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited) Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input) Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input) Proceed to Tier IV? Proceed to Tier IV: Resource Factors (ves answers desirable) Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined ### Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined ### Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment) ### Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of yes Pes Pigled of the sufficient experience to ensure completion of yes Pes Pigled of the sufficient experience to complete this project ### Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project yes ### Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project yes ### Pigle All Number of "Yes" Answers ### Division's Recommendation: **DUGAN & MEYERS CONSTRUCTION**											
HE-8 years (OSHA.gov)		D. Worker's Compensation Laws									
Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation yes yes yes HE-10 Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR yes no HE-11 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years no no HE-12 The results of Bidder's references are questionable no no Total Negative History and Experience Factors: 0 -1 0 0 (A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited) Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input) yes yes yes no no Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable) Note: Tier IV a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s): Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project yes yes yes Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of yes yes yes Bidder's management has sufficient experience to emsure complete this project yes yes yes Bidder's management has sufficient experience to complete this project yes yes yes Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project yes yes yes Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project yes yes yes yes Total Number of "Yes" Answers Division's Recommendation: Division's Recommendation: Bidder has MEYERS CONSTRUCTION]										
HE-90 documentation	HE-8		no	no							
HE-10 Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR yes no	HE-9		VAS	ves							
HE-11 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years no no no hEF-12 The results of Bidder's references are questionable no	HE-10	Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR									
Total Negative History and Experience Factors: (A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited) Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input) Proceed to Tier IV? Proceed to Tier IV? Proceed to Tier IV: Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s). Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment) Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of yes picet Project R-1 Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project yes yes Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project yes yes Total Number of "Yes" Answers Division's Recommendation: DUGAN & MEYERS CONSTRUCTION			no	no							
(A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited) Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input) Proceed to Tier IV? Iter IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable) Iter IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable) Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s). Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project yes yes Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project yes yes R-2 project yes yes R-3 Bidder workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project yes yes Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project yes yes Total Number of "Yes" Answers Division's Recommendation: DUGAN & MEYERS CONSTRUCTION	HE-12										
merited) Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input) Proceed to Tier IV? Iter IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable) Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s). Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment) Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of peech good and the project peech good and project peech good and the project peech good and			0	-1	0	0					
Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input) Proceed to Tier IV? Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable) Note: Tier IV retails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s): Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment) Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of yes picet Project R-2 project R-3 Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project Project R-4 Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project Project Project R-5 Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project Pro											
Ter IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable) Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).			yes	yes							
Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s): Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment)		Proceed to Tier IV?			no	no					
Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s): Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment)		Tire IV. December Feeters (see assured to include									
through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s). Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment) Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of yes yes P-2 project R-3 Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project yes yes Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project yes yes P-3 Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project yes yes P-4 Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project yes yes P-5 Division's Recommendation: DUGAN & MEYERS CONSTRUCTION	Note:		hich the hid was solicited.	The field of eligible bidders w	vill be determined						
Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment) R-1 (e.g., equipment) Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of yes yes R-2 project R-3 Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project R-4 Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project R-5 Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project Total Number of "Yes" Answers Division's Recommendation: DUGAN & MEYERS CONSTRUCTION	through	application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders	resource factors will be con	nducted, following which, the	City will select a contractor	(s).					
Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of yes yes yes project yes		Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project		, , , , , ,							
R-2 project yes yes R-3 Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project yes yes R-4 Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project yes yes R-5 Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project yes yes Total Number of "Yes" Answers 5 5 0 0 DUGAN & MEYERS CONSTRUCTION	R-1		yes	yes							
R-3 Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project yes yes R-4 Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project yes yes R-5 Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project yes yes Total Number of "Yes" Answers Division's Recommendation: DUGAN & MEYERS CONSTRUCTION	D_2										
R-4 Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project yes yes R-5 Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project yes yes Total Number of "Yes" Answers 5 5 0 0 0 Division's Recommendation: DUGAN & MEYERS CONSTRUCTION											
R-5 Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project yes yes Total Number of "Yes" Answers 5 5 5 0 0 0 0 Division's Recommendation: DUGAN & MEYERS CONSTRUCTION DUGAN & MEYERS CONSTRUCTION		and the project	ycs	ycs							
Total Number of "Yes" Answers 5 5 0 0 Division's Recommendation: DUGAN & MEYERS CONSTRUCTION											
Division's Recommendation: DUGAN & MEYERS CONSTRUCTION	R-5				_						
						0					
O INSTITUTE AND PROPOSED AND A STATE OF THE COLUMN TWO IN THE COLUMN TO THE COLUMN TWO IN THE COLUMN T	**3 hid		DUG	AND TENS CONSTRUC	TION						
	o mgi										

		CITY OF COLUMBUS BID EVALUATION FORM							
		CONTRACTS OVER \$20,0	00)						
	Department: Division:	Public Utilities Sewerage and Drainage		CIP Number: Project Name: Funding Source:	610744 Parkside Road Storm Storm Sewer	Bond Fund			
	Low Bid at Opening: Non-Local Low Bid at Opening:	\$ 554,187.00 \$ 883,207.20		Bid Opening Date: Engineer's Estimate: \$	08/31/2	1,998,675.00			
				COMPANY NAME					
				\$ 677,561.40 \$			\$ 671,967.00		
	Local Company?	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
	FACTORS Tier I - Mandatory Factors								
M-1	Bid is responsive	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-2 M-3	Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	yes yes	yes yes	yes ves	yes ves	yes ves	yes yes	yes yes	yes yes
M-4	Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
M-5	Bidder has requisite licenses Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-6	Proceed to Tier II?	ves yes	yes yes	ves yes	yes yes	yes yes	ves yes	ves yes	yes yes
	Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)	•	•	•	•	• • •	•	•	
C-1	Bidder is eliqible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)	yes	yes	yes	yes	no	yes	yes	yes
C-2	Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
C-3 C-4	Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit	yes ves	yes	yes	no ves	no ves	yes yes	yes ves	ves
C-4	% of insurance provided by company	100.00%	100.00%	100.00%	60.00%	75.00%	100.00%	100.00%	100.00%
C-5	Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
C-6	% of retirement or pension plan provided by company Bidder is eligible for environmental preference	3.00% no	100.00% ves	100.00% no	100.00% ves	50.00% no	100.00%	100.00%	100.00%
0-0	Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$120,000 in total)	5.00%	10.00%	5.00%	9.00%	3.00%	5.00%	5.00%	5.00%
	Dollar Value of Credits Bid Total:	31,000 523,187.45	51,000 620.967.45	31,000 646,561,85	45,458 824,522.88	16,626 866,581,59	31,000	31,000 640,967,45	31,000
	Bid I otal:	523,187.45	620,967.45	646,561.85	824,522.88	866,581.59	640,967.45	640,967.45	640,967.45
		\$ 523,187.45							
	Percent Over Low Bid: Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)	0.000% yes	18.689% no	23.581% no	57.596% no	65.635% no	22.512% no	22.512% no	22.512% no
	Proceed to Tier III?	yes	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
	Tier III - History Experience Factors								
HE-1	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs	no							
HE-2	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs	no							
HE-3 HE-4	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years	no no							
HE-5	Prinicipals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.	no							
	Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years	no							
HE-/	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following: A. Fair Labor Standards Act	no							
	B. Prevailing Wage Laws	no							
1	C. Unemployment Compensation Laws D. Worker's Compensation Laws	no no							
	Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years	no							
	Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR	yes							
	Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	yes							
	The results of Bidder's references are questionable	no							
1	Total Negative History and Experience Factors: A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
	Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)	yes							
	Proceed to Tier IV?	yes	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
	Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)								
	Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The								
throug R-1	h application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be condu Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment)	cted, following which, the Ci ves	ty will select a contractor (s).						
R-2	Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project	yes							
R-3 R-4	Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project	yes yes							
R-5	Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project	yes yes							
	Total Number of "Yes" Answers	5	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
	Division's Recommendation:		Storts Ecavation, Inc.						