

## Steege, Jerry K.

---

**From:** Kelsey, Mark  
**Sent:** Thursday, October 21, 2010 4:03 PM  
**To:** Cofield, Alex A.  
**Cc:** Mackey, David B.; Ortman, Donald R. (Richard); Austin, Patti A.; Bauman, Max A; Beaver, Michael E.; Beck, David H. (Transportation); Beckman, Amber M.; Bell, Timothy A.; Blackford, Megan D.; Bowman, Randall; Figley, Russ U.; Giffin, Benjamin M.; Lewis, William A.; McGuinness, Rory O.; Poindexter, Kaelyn C.; Roberts, Doug; Robinson, Valuise E.; Rundio, Ted; Steege, Jerry K.; Stephens, Thomas H.; Tilton, Rick C.; Yates, Frederick J.; Zahran, Hassan Y.  
**Subject:** RE: RECOMMENDATION: BRIDGE REHABILITATION – GENERAL ENGINEERING DESIGN SERVICE

I approve the committee's recommendation of R. W. Armstrong for this contract

---

**From:** Cofield, Alex A.  
**Sent:** Thursday, October 21, 2010 3:47 PM  
**To:** Kelsey, Mark  
**Cc:** Mackey, David B.; Ortman, Donald R. (Richard); Austin, Patti A.; Bauman, Max A; Beaver, Michael E.; Beck, David H. (Transportation); Beckman, Amber M.; Bell, Timothy A.; Blackford, Megan D.; Bowman, Randall; Cofield, Alex A.; Figley, Russ U.; Giffin, Benjamin M.; Lewis, William A.; McGuinness, Rory O.; Poindexter, Kaelyn C.; Roberts, Doug; Robinson, Valuise E.; Rundio, Ted; Steege, Jerry K.; Stephens, Thomas H.; Tilton, Rick C.; Yates, Frederick J.; Zahran, Hassan Y.  
**Subject:** RECOMMENDATION: BRIDGE REHABILITATION – GENERAL ENGINEERING DESIGN SERVICE

**To:** Mark Kelsey, Director, Department of Public Service

**From:** Alex Cofield, Capital Fiscal Manager

**Date:** October 21, 2010

**Subject:** RFP – BRIDGE REHABILITATION – GENERAL ENGINEERING DESIGN SERVICE

**Cc:** Evaluation Committee

The Department of Public Service solicited Requests for Proposals for BRIDGE REHABILITATION – GENERAL ENGINEERING DESIGN SERVICE.

**Project Overview:** The intent of this contract is to provide the Department of Public Service with continuing, contractual access to additional resources that are necessary to perform various professional engineering, survey and technical expertise for the department to complete its capital and operating budget commitments for the bridge program.

The project was advertised on the Vendor Services web site from August 25, 2010, to September 27, 2010. The City received ten (10) responses. All proposals were deemed minimally compliant and were fully evaluated when the Evaluation Committee met on October 20, 2010.

The responding firms were:

CONSULTANT Sub-consultant	CCCN	EXP. DATE	ACTIVE Y/N	% MAJ. % OTH.	BUSINESS ENTERPRISE STATUS	PERCENT OF WORK
RW Armstrong	651062227	9/21/11	Y	0.00% MAJ 100.00% OTH	PHC	82.00%

Testec, Inc.	311504947	5/27/11	Y		MBE	10.00%
AEC, Inc.	311612308	6/17/12	Y		FBE	5.00%
Lawhon & Associates, Inc.	311153141	2/24/12	Y		FBE	3.00%
<b>Resource International, Inc.</b>	<b>310669793</b>	<b>6/30/12</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>0.00% MAJ 100.00% OTH</b>	<b>FBE</b>	<b>85.00%</b>
Dynotec, Inc	311319961	5/13/11	Y		MBE	15.00%
<b>Columbus Engineering Consultants</b>	<b>310716498</b>	<b>4/19/12</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>10.00% MAJ 90.00% OTH</b>	<b>MBE</b>	<b>65.00%</b>
W. E. Stilson Consulting	311702689	9/27/12	Y		MAJ	10.00%
DLZ Ohio	311268980	3/10/11	Y		MBE	5.00%
Advanced Engineering Consultants	311612308	6/17/12	Y		FBE	10.00%
ASC Group, Inc.	311167506	10/15/11	Y		FBE	5.00%
CTL Engineering, Inc.	310680767	6/17/12	Y		MBE	5.00%
<b>Strand Associates, Inc.</b>	<b>391020418</b>	<b>11/13/11</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>85.00% MAJ 15.00% OTH</b>	<b>MAJ</b>	<b>70.00%</b>
BBC&M Engineering, Inc.	311166709	9/30/11	Y		MAJ	15.00%
Dynotec, Inc	311319961	5/13/11	Y		MBE	15.00%
<b>Jones Stuckey, LTD., Inc.</b>	<b>310723296</b>	<b>1/21/11</b>	<b>Y</b>		<b>MAJ</b>	<b>No Breakdown by % of work</b>
Advanced Engineering Consultants	311612308	6/17/12	Y		MAJ	
CTL Engineering Inc.	310680767	6/17/12	Y		MBE	
W. E. Stilson Consulting	311702689	9/27/12	Y		MAJ	

<b>EMH&amp;T</b>	<b>310685594</b>	<b>9/21/11</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>94.00% MAJ 6.00% OTH</b>	<b>MAJ</b>	<b>94.00%</b>
CTL Engineering, Inc.	310680767	6/17/12	Y		MBE	6.00%
<b>DLZ Ohio</b>	<b>311268980</b>	<b>3/10/11</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>0.00% MAJ 100.00% OTH</b>	<b>MBE</b>	<b>84.00%</b>
Ribway Engineering Group	311406579	12/3/10	Y		MBE	15.00%
Policyworks LLC	300193496	7/31/12	Y		MBE	1.00%
<b>American Structurepoint, Inc.</b>	<b>351127317</b>	<b>11/23/11</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>80.00% MAJ 20.00% OTH</b>	<b>MAJ</b>	<b>80.00%</b>
Dynotec, Inc	311319961	5/13/11	Y		MBE	15.00%
CTL Engineering, Inc.	310680767	6/17/12	Y		MBE	5.00%
<b>CT Consultants</b>	<b>340792089</b>	<b>6/25/12</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>85.00% MAJ 15.00% OTH</b>	<b>MAJ</b>	<b>75.00%</b>
BBC&M Eng. Inc.	311166709	9/30/11	Y		MAJ	10.00%
XYZ Survey Service	043846618	8/31/12	Y		MBE	10.00%
ASC Group	311167506	10/15/11	Y		FBE	5.00%
<b>McCormick Taylor</b>	<b>231683759</b>	<b>Did not complete application</b>		<b>80.00% MAJ 20.00% OTH</b>	<b>MAJ</b>	<b>80.00%</b>
Resource International Inc.	310669793	6/30/12	Y		FBE	20.00%

This RFP Evaluation Committee included three (3) voting members from the Department of Public Service – Megan Blackford, Hassan Zahran, and Patti Austin – a representative from EBOCO was invited to attend, but declined, and Max Bauman.

The Evaluation Committee used a 100 point scale and scored the firms as follows:

R.W. Armstrong	91
CT Consultants	87
American Structurepoint, Inc.	81
EMH&T	81
DLZ, Ohio	77
McCormick Taylor	77

Resource International, Inc.	77
Columbus Engineering Consultants	75
Jones Stuckey	72
Strand Associates, Inc.	71

The estimated cost for this contract is \$200,000, funded by carryover cash.

The Committee recommends R. W. Armstrong's because their approach to the project was very straight forward and demonstrated innovation in their problem solving ability and also in public involvement. R.W. Armstrong demonstrated that they are a very strong structural consulting firm as evidenced by the experience and abilities of their project team and that their bridge engineer has a vast amount of experience with similar projects.

Per City Code 329.14 please provide direction for proceeding on this project by replying to this e-mail. Four options include:

1. Approve committee's recommendation (R. W. Armstrong)
2. Reject the committee's recommendation and designate a firm
3. Call for an oral presentation
4. Other

Let me know if you have any question

**Alex Cofield**

Capital Fiscal Manager  
Office of Support Services  
Department of Public Service  
City of Columbus  
109 N. Front St. - Ground Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215

p - (614) 645-1557

f - (614) 645-7549

[aacofield@columbus.gov](mailto:aacofield@columbus.gov)

please don't print this e-mail unless you really need to do so.