

**Department:**

**Division:**

**Lowest, Best, Most Responsive, Responsible Bid Tab Amount:**

**Vendor Name:**

**Bid Tab Amount:**

<b><u>FACTORS</u></b>	
<b><u>(Pgs. X-X) &amp; Form 1 (Pg. X) - Contract Compliance</u></b>	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)
<b><u>Form 2 - Claims &amp; Liquidated Damages</u></b>	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>
<b><u>Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws &amp; Regulations:</u></b>	
	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N)
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>
<b><u>Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:</u></b>	
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years ( <b>verify on OSHA.gov</b> ) (Y/N)
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>

<b><u>Form 5 - Debarment</u></b>	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>
<b><u>Form 6 - Local Workforce</u></b>	1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>
<b><u>Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs</u></b>	
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>
<b><u>Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs</u></b>	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>
<b><u>Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED</u></b>	
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)
<b><u>Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED</u></b>	
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)
<b><u>Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control</u></b>	
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)
<b><u>Form 12 - Availability</u></b>	
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)
<b><u>Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates</u></b>	
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)
	License and/or Certificate No:
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>
	<b>Lowest Bid Dollar of non-environmental preferred bidder</b>
	<b>Percent Over Low Bid:</b>
	<b>Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid)</b>
<b><u>Pg. X - Environmental Preference</u></b>	
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)
	Difference versus lowest <b>non-environmental preferable</b> bidder (%)
	Difference versus lowest <b>non-environmental preferable</b> bidder (\$)

	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest <b>non-environmentally preferred</b> bid.
	If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified?
<b><u>Pgs. X-X - Statements and Affidavits</u></b>	
<b>Statement 1:</b>	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)
<b>Statement 2:</b>	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)
<b>Statement 3:</b>	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)
<b>Affidavit</b>	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>
<b><u>Pg. X - Addenda Acknlgmt.</u></b>	<b>Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)</b>
<b><u>Proposal (Pg. X) - Proposal Signature</u></b>	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>
<b><u>Pg. X - Proposal Bond</u></b>	
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>
	<b>Grand Total Negative Factors:</b>
	<b>Division's Recommendation:</b>
<b>Additional Evaluation Questions for Non-Responsive Proposals per Section 102.08, not covered a</b>	
<b>1)</b>	<b>Has the bidder submitted more than one proposal under the same name/subsidiary? (Y/N)</b>
<b>2)</b>	<b>Are the bid prices material unbalanced? (Y/N)</b>
<b>3)</b>	<b>Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not provided in the bid documents? (Y/N)</b>
<b>4)</b>	<b>Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all material respects, and does not contain irregularities or deviations? (Y/N)</b>
<b>5)</b>	<b>Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to accept or reject an award? (Y/N)</b>
<b>6)</b>	<b>Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract item listed? (Y/N)</b>
<b>7)</b>	<b>Did the bidder fail to submit a lump sum price where required? (Y/N)</b>
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>

## **Apparent low bidder is Kenmore Construction**

**CITY OF COLUMBUS  
 BID EVALUATION FORM  
 (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

<u>Public Utilities</u>	CIP Number:	
<u>Sewerage and Drainage</u>	Project Name:	<u>SWWTP Corrosion P</u>
	Funding Source:	<u>Sanitary Sewer</u>
	Bid Opening Date:	
	Engineer's Estimate	

\$2,676,300.00

Kenmore Construction  
 \$2,676,300.00

The Rightr Company  
 \$3,267,000.00

	Yes	Yes
	No	Yes
	0	-1
		0
	No	No
	No	No
	No	No
	No	No
	No	No
	No	No
	No	Yes
	Yes	Yes
	-1	0
		0
	No	No
	Yes	Yes
	Yes	Yes
	Yes	Yes
	No	No
	0	0
		0

No	No	
0		0
80.0%	39.0%	
Yes	Yes	
100	100	
Yes	Yes	
100	100	
0	0	0
Yes	Yes	
0	0	0
Yes	Yes	
Yes	Yes	
Yes	Yes	
Yes	Yes	
Yes	Yes	
Yes	Yes	
Yes	Yes	
No	No	
P1879; SW0230		
0	0	0
\$2,676,300.00	\$3,267,000.00	
0%	22%	-100%
yes	no	yes
Yes		
0.00%	22.07%	-100.00%
\$0.00	\$590,700.00	(\$2,676,300.00)









**650368-100003**

**Prevention and Protective Coating Systems Phase 3**

**General Obligation Bond Fund, Fund 664**

**7/30/14**

**\$3,516,000.00**

--

--

--

<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
----------	----------

--

--

--

--

--

--

--

--

--

--

<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
----------	----------

--

--

--

--

--

--

--

<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
----------	----------

--

0	0
0	0
0	0
0	0
-100%	-100%
yes	yes
-100.00%	-100.00%
(\$2,676,300.00)	(\$2,676,300.00)


0	0
---	---


0	0
---	---


0	0
---	---

0	0
---	---

--	--

--	--

--	--


0	0
---	---