

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
 BID EVALUATION FORM
 (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: Public Utilities

CIP Number: 650259-100001

Division: DPU

Project Name: JPWWTP Corrosion Prevention &
 Protective Coating Systems

Funding Source: Bond Fund, Fund 664

Lowest Bidder: Kenmore Const.

Bid Opening Date: 6/5/13
 Engineer's Estimate: \$3,395,850.36

Bid Tab Amount: Righter Co. \$2,032,470.00 Kenmore Const. \$1,937,100.00 Company Name

FACTORS				
<i>Bid Supp. Forms (Pgs. X, XI & Form 1 (Pgs. X) - Contract Compliance</i>	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	yes	
<i>Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages</i>	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	yes	no	
	Negative Factors:	-1	0	0
<i>Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations:</i>				
	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):			
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no	
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no	no	
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)	no	no	
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N)	yes	no	
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)	yes	yes	
	Negative Factors:	0	-1	0
<i>Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:</i>				
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N)	no	no	
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)	yes	yes	
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	yes	yes	
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	yes	yes	
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
<i>Form 5 - Debarment</i>				
	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
<i>Form 6 - Local Workforce</i>				
	1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	39.0%	80.0%	
	Negative Factors:			
<i>Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs</i>				
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes	yes	
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	100	100	
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	yes	yes	
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	100	100	
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
<i>Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs</i>				
	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	yes	yes	
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0

	Righter Co.	Kenmore Const.	Company Name	
Bid Tab Amount:	\$2,032,470.00	\$1,937,100.00		
Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED				
Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	yes	yes		
Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes		
Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED				
Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	yes	yes		
Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes		
Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control				
Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	yes	yes		
Form 12 - Availability				
Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes	yes		
Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates				
Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	yes		
Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)	no	no		
License and/or Certificate No:				
Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0
Lowest Bid Dollar Amount	\$1,937,100.00			
Percent Over Low Bid:	5%	0%	-100%	
Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid)	yes	yes	yes	
Bid Supp Forms (Pg. X) - Environmental Preference				
Has last sentence regarding local credit been omitted (Y/N)	n/a			
Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	no			
Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	NA	0.00%	-100.00%	
Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	NA	\$0.00	(\$1,937,100.00)	
Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.	yes	yes		
Bid Supp Forms (Pgs. X-X) - Statements and Affidavits				
Statement 1: Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	yes		
Statement 2: Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	yes		
Statement 3: Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	yes		
Affidavit Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	yes	yes		
Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0
Proposal (Pg. X) - Addenda Acknowledgment				
Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)	n/a	n/a		
Proposal (Pg. X) - Proposal Signature				
Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes	yes		
Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0
Bid Supp Forms (Pgs. X-X) - Proposal Bond				
Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	no	yes		
Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes	yes		
Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes	yes		
Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)	yes	yes		
Negative Factors:	-1	0	0	0
Grand Total Negative Factors:	-2	-1	0	0
Division's Recommendation: pe completed by Engineer				

Additional Evaluation Questions for Non-Responsive Proposals per Section 102.08, not covered above in RED.				
1) Has the bidder submitted more than one proposal under the same name/subsidiary? (Y/N)	no	no		
2) Are the bid prices material unbalanced? (Y/N)	no	no		
Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not provided in the bid documents? (Y/N)	no	no		
3) Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all material respects, and does not contain irregularities or deviations? (Y/N)	no	yes		
4) Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to accept or reject an award?	no	no		
5) Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract item listed? (Y/N)	no	no		
6) Did the bidder fail to submit a lump sum price where required? (Y/N)	no	no		
Negative Factors:	-1	0	0	0

Kenmore is the apparent low bidder.

The Righter Company was deemed non-responsive because of failure to provide a bid proposal amount.