

Department: <u>Public Utilities</u> Division: <u>Water</u>	CIP Number: <u>690236-100044</u> Project Name: <u>Duxberry Avenue</u> Funding Source: <u>Works Enlarg. Voted Bonds</u> Bid Opening Date: <u>12/19/12</u> Engineer's Estimate: <u>\$2,932,187.50</u>
---	---

	<b>Elite Excavating</b>	<b>Eramo &amp; Sons</b>	<b>Conic Constr.</b>	<b>Underground Utility</b>
<b>Bid Tab Amount:</b>	\$2,427,745.10	\$2,471,320.57	\$2,635,600.00	\$2,762,653.30

<b>FACTORS</b>					
<b>Form 1 - Contract Compliance</b>	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
<b>Form 2 - Claims &amp; Liquidated Damages</b>	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	yes	no
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>-1</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws &amp; Regulations:</b>					
Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):					
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	no	no
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	yes	no	no
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	no	no
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no	no	no	no
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>-1</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:</b>					
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	no
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>-1</b>	<b>-1</b>	<b>-1</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Form 5 - Debarment</b>					
	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Form 6 - Local Workforce</b>					
	What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	0.0%	82.00%	62.00%	4.00%
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>-1</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>-1</b>
<b>Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs</b>					
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	2. If yes, what is the percent paid into the plan by Employer / Employee	see comment	80% / 20%	90% / 10%	100%-ER
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	4. If yes, what is the percent paid into the plan by Employer / Employee	see comment	100%-ER	see comment	100%-ER
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs</b>					
	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	yes	no	no	yes
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>-1</b>	<b>-1</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED</b>					
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
<b>Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED</b>					
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	yes	TBD	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
<b>Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control</b>					
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	yes	see comment	yes	no
<b>Form 12 - Availability</b>					
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes

CITY OF COLUMBUS  
 BID EVALUATION FORM

	Elite Excavating	Eramo & Sons	Conie Constr.	Underground Utility
<b>Bid Tab Amount:</b>	\$2,427,745.10	\$2,471,320.57	\$2,635,600.00	\$2,762,653.30
<b>Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates</b>				
Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)	yes	no	no	yes
License and/or Certificate No:	SW0088, G4169	SW # not listed	SW0035	SW0106
<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>-1</b>
<b>Lowest Bid Dollar Amount</b>	<b>\$2,427,745.10</b>			
<b>Percent Over Low Bid:</b>	<b>0%</b>	<b>1.8%</b>	<b>8.6%</b>	<b>13.8%</b>
<b>Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid)</b>	<b>yes</b>	<b>yes</b>	<b>yes</b>	<b>no</b>
<b>Page 30 - Environmental Preference</b>				
Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	yes	no	yes	no
Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	NA	1.79%	8.56%	13.80%
Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	NA	\$43,575.47	\$207,854.90	\$334,908.20
Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.	no	no	no	no
<b>Pgs. 31-34 Statements and Affidavits</b>				
<b>Statement 1:</b> Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
<b>Statement 2:</b> Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
<b>Statement 3:</b> Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
<b>Affidavit</b> Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Page 42 - Addenda Acknlgmt.</b>				
Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
<b>Page 43 - Proposal Signature</b>				
Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Pages 44-45 - Proposal Bond</b>				
Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Grand Total Negative Factors:</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>Division's Recommendation:</b>	<b>Elite Excavating</b>			

Department: Public Utilities

Division: Water

Bid Tab Amount:	Igel & Co.	Cols. Asphalt Pav.	Darby Creek	Shelly & Sands
	\$2,874,663.00	\$2,973,171.30	\$4,620,794.48	\$3,256,268.95

FACTORS					
<b>Form 1 - Contract Compliance</b>	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	yes	no	yes
<b>Form 2 - Claims &amp; Liquidated Damages</b>	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>-1</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws &amp; Regulations</b>					
	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the				
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	no	no
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no	no	no
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	no	no
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no	no	no	no
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	no
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>-1</b>
<b>Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:</b>					
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years ( <b>verify on OSHA.gov</b> ) (Y/N)	yes	no	no	yes
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>-1</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>-1</b>
<b>Form 5 - Debarment</b>					
	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Form 6 - Local Workforce</b>					
	What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	54.00%	75.00%	100.00%	30.00%
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>-1</b>
<b>Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs</b>					
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	2. If yes, what is the percent paid into the plan by Employer / Employee	100%-ER	100%-ER	58% / 42%	100%-ER
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	4. If yes, what is the percent paid into the plan by Employer / Employee	100%-ER	100%-ER	"Varies"	100%-ER
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs</b>					
	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	yes	yes	no	yes
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>-1</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED</b>					
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
<b>Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED</b>					
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	"None"
<b>Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control</b>					
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	no	no	yes	yes
<b>Form 12 - Availability</b>					
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes

CITY OF COLUMBUS  
 BID EVALUATION FORM

		Igel & Co.	Cols. Asphalt Pav.	Darby Creek	Shelly & Sands
<b>Bid Tab Amount:</b>		\$2,874,663.00	\$2,973,171.30	\$4,620,794.48	\$3,256,268.95
<b>Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates</b>					
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
	License and/or Certificate No:	V0067, G3949, D0005	no license # listed	SW0075	SW0059, G5463
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	-1	-1	0	0
<b>Lowest Bid Dollar Amount</b>					
	<b>Percent Over Low Bid:</b>	18.4%	22.5%	90.3%	34.1%
	<b>Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid)</b>	no	no	no	no
<b>Page 30 - Environmental Preference</b>					
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	yes	no	no	no
	Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	18.41%	22.47%	90.33%	34.13%
	Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	\$446,917.90	\$545,426.20	\$2,193,049.38	\$828,523.85
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.	no	no	no	no
<b>Pgs. 31-34 Statements and Affidavits</b>					
<b>Statement 1:</b>	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	no	yes	yes
<b>Statement 2:</b>	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
<b>Statement 3:</b>	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
<b>Affidavit</b>	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	0	-1	0	0
<b>Page 42 - Addenda Acknlgmt.</b>					
	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
<b>Page 43 - Proposal Signature</b>					
	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	0	0	0	0
<b>Pages 44-45 - Proposal Bond</b>					
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	0	0	0	0
	<b>Grand Total Negative Factors:</b>	2	2	2	3
<b>Division's Recommendation:</b>		Co. of Ohio, Inc.			