CITY OF COLUMBUS

	RID EV	ALUATION FORM	1		
			CID N		
			CIP Number: Project Name:		
Department:	Public Utilities		•	Works Enlarg. Voted	Ronds
Department.	Tubic Cilities		Bid Opening Date:	12/19/12	Donas
Division:	Water		Engineer's Estimate		
		•	_		
		Elite Excavating	Eramo & Sons	Conie Constr.	Underground Utility
	Bid Tab Amount:	\$2,427,745.10	\$2,471,320.57	\$2,635,600.00	\$2,762,653.30
	FACTORS				
Form 1 -	Dill (0 1) I di C di C li N				
Contract	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)				
Compliance Form 2 -	submitted on-line (1/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
Claims &					
Liquidated	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has				
<u>Damages</u>	paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	yes	no
	Negative Factors:	0	0	-1	(
Form 2 Com	 apliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulat	iona			
Form 3 - Con	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the				
	Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	no	no
	Prevailing Wage Laws	no	yes	no	no
	Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	no	no
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no	no	no	
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental				
	agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation				
	EMR (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (yes	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	-1	0	(
Form 1 - Stat	l e and Federal Health and Safety Laws:				
1 01 m 4 - Stat	Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations				
	within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	no
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current	,	,	,	
	OSHA standards (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y	no	no	no	no
	Negative Factors:	-1	-1	-1	(
Form 5 _	Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business				
Debarment	with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	
<u>Form 6 - </u>	What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus,				
<u>Local</u> Workforce	Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	0.0%	82.00%	62.00%	4.00%
Workjorce	Negative Factors:	-1	0	02.0070	4.00%
	11054417014010150		· ·	· ·	
Form 7 - Hea	lth Care and Pension/Retirement Programs				
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	ye:
	2. If yes, what is the percent paid into the plan by Employer /				
	Employee	see comment	80% / 20%	90% / 10%	100%-EF
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	4. If yes, what is the percent paid into the plan by Employer /				
	Employee	see comment	100%-ER	see comment	100%-EF
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	(
E 0					
Form 8 <u>-</u> Apprenticeship					
Programs	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	yes	no	no	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	-1	-1	(
E 0 E	' C 4 ID NON CRECIALIZED				
Form 9 - Exp	Pridder has adapted qualified sofaty personnel (V(N))	Voc	Noc	VOC	VO.
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N) Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes yes	yes yes	yes yes	ye: ye:
Form 10 - Ex	perience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED	yes	yes	yes	ye
_ U 10 LA	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	yes	TBD	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
Form 11 - De	adlines and Cost Control				
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar				
	construction projects (Y/N)	yes	see comment	yes	no
Form 12 - Av	ailability Pridder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (V/N)				
	I Bridger does not have substantial uncompleted projects (V/N)	TIOC	TIOC.	T TOO	TIO.

ORD# 0168-2013

CITY OF COLUMBUS

ORD# 0168						
1	BID EV	ALUATION FORM		a . a .	** * *******	
		Elite Excavating	Eramo & Sons	Conie Constr.	Underground Utility	
	Bid Tab Amount:	\$2,427,745.10	\$2,471,320.57	\$2,635,600.00	\$2,762,653.30	
Form 13 - Tro	ade Licenses and Certificates					
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing					
	requirements (Y/N)	yes	no	no	yes	
	License and/or Certificate No:	SW0088, G4169	SW # not listed	SW0035	SW0106	
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	-1	
	Lowest Bid Dollar Amount	\$2,427,745.10				
	Percent Over Low Bid:	. , ,	1.00/	0.60/	12.00/	
		0%	1.8%	8.6%	13.8%	
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid)	yes	yes	yes	no	
Page 30 - Env	vironmental Preference					
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book?					
	(Y/N)	yes	no	yes	no	
	Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	NA	1.79%	8.56%	13.80%	
	Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	NA	\$43,575.47	\$207,854.90	\$334,908.20	
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark					
	"Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest					
	bid.	no	no	no	no	
	atements and Affidavits					
Statement 1:	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	
Statement 2:	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	
Statement 3:	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	
Affidavit	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0	
Page 42 -						
<u>Addenda</u>	D: 11					
Acknlgmt.	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N	yes	yes	yes	yes	
Page 43 -						
<u>Proposal</u>						
<u>Signature</u>	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0	
Pages 44-45 -	 Proposal Bond					
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/I	yes	yes	yes	yes	
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	ves	yes	yes	yes	
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	ves	yes	yes	yes	
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of	700	jes	yes	yes	
	Compliance (Y/N)	ves	ves	ves	ves	
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	yes	
	1.0gutive I uctoris.	U	J.	0	0	
	Grand Total Negative Factors:	2	3	3	2	
	Division's Recommendation:				Elite Excavating	

CITY OF COLUMBUS RID EVALUATION FORM

Department:					
Division:	Water				
	Bid Tab Amount:	<u>Igel & Co.</u> \$2,874,663.00	Cols. Asphalt Pav. \$2,973,171.30	<u>Darby Creek</u> \$4,620,794.48	Shelly & Sands \$3,256,268.95
	<u>FACTORS</u>				
Form 1 -					
Contract Compliance	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	yes	no	yes
Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has				
<u>Damages</u>	paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N) Negative Factors:	0	no 0	no -1	no (
Form 3 - Con	ppliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulat Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the				
	Fair Labor Standards Act Prevailing Wage Laws	no no	no no	no no	no no
	The varing wage Laws Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	no	no
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no	no	no	no
	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)	no	no	no	nc
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation				
	EMR (Y/N) 7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (yes yes	yes yes	yes yes	yes no
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	-1
	<u> </u>		-	-	
Form 4 - Stat	e and Federal Health and Safety Laws:				
	Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N)	yes	no	no	yes
	Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)	****	****	*****	***
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	yes yes	yes yes	yes yes	yes yes
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y	no	no	no	no
	Negative Factors:	-1	0	0	-1
Earm 5	Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business				
Form 5 - Debarment	with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	
Form 6					
<u>Form 6 -</u> Local	What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus,				
<u>Workforce</u>	Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	54.00%	75.00%	100.00%	30.00%
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	-1
Form 7 - Hea	lth Care and Pension/Retirement Programs				
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	2. If yes, what is the percent paid into the plan by Employer /		-		-
	Employee	100%-ER	100%-ER	58% / 42%	100%-ER
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	4. If yes, what is the percent paid into the plan by Employer /	1000/ ED	1000/ FD	117.7	1000/ EP
	Employee Negative Factors:	100%-ER 0	100%-ER 0	"Varies"	100%-ER
	Tregative I tresoits	<u> </u>	· ·	· ·	
<u>Form 8 - </u>					
Apprenticeship Programs	Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	yes	yes	no	Val
1 rograms	Negative Factors:	0	0	-1	yes
			-		
Form 9 - Exp	erience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED				
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
Form 10 - F~	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N perience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED	yes	yes	yes	yes
1 01 m 10 - EX	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate project management team (1/14) Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	"None
Form 11 - De	adlines and Cost Control	•	, in the second	-	
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar			T	
Form 12 - Av	construction projects (Y/N)	no	no	yes	yes
1 01 m 12 - AV	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
1	======================================	<i>J</i> C3	JC3	J 03	yc.

ORD# 0168-2013

CITY OF COLUMBUS BID EVALUATION FORM

1	DID EV	Igel & Co.	Cols. Asphalt Pav.	Darby Creek	Shelly & Sands
	Bid Tab Amount:	\$2,874,663.00	\$2,973,171.30	\$4,620,794.48	\$3,256,268.95
Form 13 - Tro	ade Licenses and Certificates				
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing				
	requirements (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
	License and/or Certificate No:	V0067, G3949, D0005	no license # listed	SW0075	SW0059, G5463
	Negative Factors:	-1	-1	0	0
	Lawart Bill Dallan Amarunt				
	Lowest Bid Dollar Amount Percent Over Low Bid:		22.5%	90.3%	34.1%
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid)	10.4 /0 no	no	no	34.1 /0 no
	Tundamentany Equivalent Did (1.c., within 10 /0 of fow Did)	no	по	110	110
Page 30 - En	vironmental Preference				
1	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book?				
	(Y/N)	yes	no	no	no
	Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	18.41%	22.47%	90.33%	34.13%
	Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	\$446,917.90	\$545,426.20	\$2,193,049.38	\$828,523.85
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark				
	"Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest				
	bid.	no	no	no	no
	tatements and Affidavits				
	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	no	yes	yes
Statement 2:	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
Affidavit	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	-1	0	0
Page 42 -					
Addenda					
Acknlgmt.	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N	yes	yes	yes	yes
Page 43 -		J-0	,	J-0	,
Proposal					
Signature	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes	ves	ves	yes
<u>Signature</u>	Negative Factors:	•	0	0	0
Pages 44.45	 Proposal Bond				
- 2,00 11 10	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/	l ves	yes	ves	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	ves	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of	jes	jes	jes	jes
ĺ	Compliance (Y/N)	ves	ves	ves	yes
	Negative Factors:	_	0	0	0
	Grand Total Negative Factors:	2	2	2	3
	Grand Total regaute Factors.		2		
	Division's Recommendation:	g Co. of Ohio, Inc.			