

ORD#

**CITY OF COLUMBUS  
 BID EVALUATION FORM  
 (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: Public Utilities  
 Division: Water

CIP Number: 690425  
 Project Name: Hines Rd. 2MG Storage Tank  
 Funding Source: Water Works Enlargement Voted Bonds  
 Bid Opening Date: 11/30/11  
 Engineer's Estimate: \$5,363,270.00

Lowest Bidder: \$4,352,700.00  
 Non-Local Lowest Bidder: \$4,352,700.00

Bid Tab Amount: CB&I Constructors Caldwell Tanks  
\$4,352,700.00 \$5,244,800.00  
 Local Company? (Proof/s/b included.) no no

FACTORS					
<b>Tier I - Mandatory Factors</b>					
M-1	Bid is responsive (Y or N)	yes	yes		
M-2	Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits (Y or N)	yes	yes		
M-3	Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y or N)	yes	yes		
M-4	Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency (Y or N)	no	no		
M-5	Bidder & subs have requisite licenses (Y or N)	yes	???		
M-6	Bidder & subs have provided a contract compliance no., or application for one (Y or N)	yes	yes		
	<b>Proceed to Tier II?</b>	yes	yes		
<b>Tier II - Creditable Factors</b>					
C-1	Bidder is eligible for local business credit? - (see below for clarification)	no	no		
	If lowest bidder's business is local, they do receive local credit, as long as there is a non-local bidder. If the lowest bidder's business IS NOT local and another bidder's				
C-2	Environmental Preference: To receive preference, bidder must include documentation that meets guidelines in bid book, bid must not exceed 5% of				
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y or N)	no	no		
	Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	NA	20.5%		
	Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	NA	\$892,100.00		
	Does bidder receive environmental preference? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.	no	no		
	<b>Total Local Credit</b>	FALSE	FALSE		
	<b>Dollar Value of Credits</b>	\$0.00	\$0.00		
	<b>Evaluated Bid Total:</b>	<b>\$4,352,700.00</b>	<b>\$5,244,800.00</b>		
	<b>Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits</b>	<b>\$4,352,700.00</b>			
	<b>Percent Over Low Bid:</b>	<b>0.0%</b>	<b>20.5%</b>		
	<b>Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (Le., within 10% of low bid after credits)</b>	yes	no		
	<b>Proceed to Tier III?</b>	yes	no		
<b>Tier III - Employer &amp; History Factors</b>					
E-1	Bidder has local workforce? (Y or N)	no	no		
E-2	Bidder is a quality training contractor? (Y or N)	no	yes		
E-3	Bidder has health insurance? (Y or N)	yes	yes		
E-4	Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y or N)	yes	yes		
HE-1	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs	no	no		
HE-2	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs	no	no		
HE-3	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds	no	no		
HE-4	Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years	yes	yes		
HE-5	Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.	no	no		
HE-6	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:	no	no		
	A. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no		
	B. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no		
	C. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no		
	D. Worker's Compensation Laws	no	no		
HE-7	Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov)	yes	no		
HE-8	Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation	yes	yes		
HE-9	Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR	yes	yes		
HE-10	Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	no	no		
HE-11	The results of Bidder's references are questionable	no	no		
	<b>Total Negative History and Experience Factors:</b>	<b>-4</b>	<b>-2</b>		
	<b>A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited.</b>				
	<b>Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)</b>	yes	yes		
	<b>Proceed to Tier IV?</b>	yes	yes		
<b>Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)</b>					
R-1	Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g.	yes	yes		
R-2	Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project	yes	yes		
R-3	Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project	yes	yes		
R-4	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project	yes	yes		
R-5	Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project	yes	yes		
	<b>Total Number of "Yes" Answers</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>		
	<b>Division's Recommendation:</b>				

Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review