

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
BID EVALUATION FORM
(FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department:	Public Utilities	CIP Number:	650726				
Division:	SSES	Project Name:	NW Alum Creek Area Sanitary Wet Weather				
		Funding Source:	RESERVES				
Low Bid at Opening:	\$60,995.40	Bid Opening Date:	3/25/09				
Non-Local Low Bid at Opening:	\$60,995.40	Engineer's Estimate:	\$125,256.00				
	COMPANY NAME						
	Walters Excavating	Rightor Company	Complete General	John Eramo & Sons	McDaniels Construction		
Original Bid Amount:	\$60,995.40	\$143,700.00	\$163,636.80	\$211,565.45	\$226,104.00		
Local Company?	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes		
FACTORS							
Tier I - Mandatory Factors							
M-1	Bid is responsive	no	yes	yes	yes		
M-2	Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits		yes	yes	yes		
M-3	Bidder will make financial statements available upon request		yes	yes	yes		
M-4	Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency		no	no	no		
M-5	Bidder has requisite licenses		yes	yes	yes		
M-6	Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one		yes	yes	yes		
	Proceed to Tier II?	no	yes	yes	yes		
Tier II - Creditable Factors (C1-C5 each yes answer gives 1% credit)							
C-1	Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)	no	yes	yes	yes		
C-2	Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit		yes	yes	yes		
C-3	Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit		yes	yes	yes		
C-4	Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit		yes	yes	yes		
	% of insurance provided by company		100.00%	100.00%	80.00%	75.00%	
C-5	Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit		yes	yes	yes	yes	
	% of retirement or pension plan provided by company		100.00%	100.00%	100.00%	75.00%	
C-6	Bidder is eligible for environmental preference		no	yes	yes	no	
	Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$120,000 in total)	NA	5.00%	10.00%	10.00%	5.00%	
	Dollar Value of Credits	NA	\$3,049.77	\$6,099.54	\$6,099.54	\$3,049.77	
	Bid Total:	NA	\$140,650.23	\$157,537.26	\$205,465.91	\$223,054.23	
	Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits		\$140,650.23				
	Percent Over Low Bid:		#VALUE!	0.000%	12.006%	46.083%	58.588%
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 5% of low bid after credits)		#VALUE!	yes	no	no	no
	Proceed to Tier III?		#VALUE!	yes	no	no	no
Tier III - History Experience Factors							
HE-1	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs		no				
HE-2	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs		no				
HE-3	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds		no				
HE-4	Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years		no				
HE-5	Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.		no				
HE-6	Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years		no				
HE-7	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:						
	A. Fair Labor Standards Act		no				
	B. Prevailing Wage Laws		no				
	C. Unemployment Compensation Laws		no				
	D. Worker's Compensation Laws		no				
HE-8	Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (OSHA.gov)		no				
HE-9	Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation		yes				
HE-10	Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR		yes				
HE-11	Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years		no				
HE-12	The results of Bidder's references are questionable		yes				
	Total Negative History and Experience Factors:	0	-1	0	0	0	
	A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited						
	Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)		yes				
	Proceed to Tier IV?	no	yes	no	no	no	
Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)							
Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).							
R-1	Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment)		yes				
R-2	Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project		yes				
R-3	Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project		yes				
R-4	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project		yes				
R-5	Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project		yes				
	Total Number of "Yes" Answers	0	5	0	0	0	
Division's Recommendation:		Contractor Name					

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
BID EVALUATION FORM
(FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: Public Utilities
Division: Sewerage and Drainage

CIP Number: 610744
Project Name: Parkside Road Stormwater System Imp
Funding Source: Storm Sewer Bond Fund
Bid Opening Date: 08/31/2005
Engineer's Estimate: 1,998,675.00

Low Bid at Opening: \$ 554,187.00
Non-Local Low Bid at Opening: \$ 883,207.20

Original Bid Amount: Local Company?	COMPANY NAME				
	<u>Storts Excavation, Inc.</u>	<u>Double Z Constr Co.</u>	<u>Complete General</u>	<u>Nickolas Savko</u>	<u>Trucco Construction</u>
\$ 554,187.00	\$ 671,967.00	\$ 677,561.40	\$ 869,980.56	\$ 883,207.20	\$ 671,967.00
Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes
					\$ 671,967.00
					Yes
					\$ 671,967.00
					Yes
					\$ 671,967.00
					Yes

FACTORS

Tier I - Mandatory Factors

M-1	Bid is responsive	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-2	Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-3	Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-4	Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
M-5	Bidder has requisite licenses	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-6	Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes

Proceed to Tier II?

Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)

C-1	Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)	yes	yes	yes	yes	no	yes	yes	yes	yes
C-2	Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
C-3	Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit	yes	yes	yes	no	no	yes	yes	yes	yes
C-4	Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit	yes	yes	yes	no	no	yes	yes	yes	yes
	% of insurance provided by company	100.00%	100.00%	100.00%	60.00%	75.00%	100.00%	100.00%	100.00%	100.00%
C-5	Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	% of retirement or pension plan provided by company	3.00%	100.00%	100.00%	100.00%	50.00%	100.00%	100.00%	100.00%	100.00%
C-6	Bidder is eligible for environmental preference	no	yes	no	yes	no	no	no	no	no
	Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$120,000 in total)	5.00%	5.00%	5.00%	4.00%	3.00%	5.00%	5.00%	5.00%	5.00%
	Dollar Value of Credits	31,000	31,000	31,000	25,458	16,626	31,000	31,000	31,000	31,000
	Bid Total:	523,187.45	640,967.45	646,561.85	844,522.88	866,581.59	640,967.45	640,967.45	640,967.45	640,967.45

Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits

\$ 523,187.45

Percent Over Low Bid:

0.000%

22.512%

23.581%

61.419%

65.635%

22.512%

22.512%

22.512%

22.512%

22.512%

22.512%

Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 5% of low bid after credits)

yes

no

no

no

no

no

no

no

no

no

no

no

no

no

no

no

no

no

no

no

no

Tier III - History Experience Factors

HE-1	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
HE-2	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
HE-3	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
HE-4	Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
HE-5	Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
HE-6	Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
HE-7	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:									
	A. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
	B. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
	C. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
	D. Worker's Compensation Laws	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
HE-8	Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
HE-9	Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
HE-10	Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
HE-11	Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
HE-12	The results of Bidder's references are questionable	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
	Total Negative History and Experience Factors:	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
	A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)	yes	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
	Proceed to Tier IV?	yes	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no

Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)

Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).

R-1	Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
R-2	Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
R-3	Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
R-4	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
R-5	Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Total Number of "Yes" Answers	5	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0

Division's Recommendation: Storts Excavation, Inc.