

**CITY OF COLUMBUS  
 BID EVALUATION FORM  
 (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: Public Utilities  
 Division: Water

Project: 910 Dublin Rd.-Pedestrian Bridge Rehab  
 Funding Source: PUBLIC  
 Bid Opening Date: 10-Aug-05  
 Engineer's Estimate: \$70,350.00

Low Bid at Opening: \$ 109,143.30  
 Non-Local Low Bid at Opening: \$ 109,143.30

|                      | <u>COMPANY NAME</u> |               |
|----------------------|---------------------|---------------|
| Original Bid Amount: | \$ 109,143.30       | \$ 159,495.00 |
| Local Company?       | no                  | yes           |

**FACTORS**

**Tier I - Mandatory Factors**

|            |  |            |            |
|------------|--|------------|------------|
| <b>M-1</b> | Bid is responsive  | yes        | yes        |
| <b>M-2</b> | Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits         | yes        | yes        |
| <b>M-3</b> | Bidder will make financial statements available upon request           | yes        | yes        |
| <b>M-4</b> | Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency | no         | no         |
| <b>M-5</b> | Bidder has requisite licenses  | yes        | yes        |
| <b>M-6</b> | Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one  | yes        | yes        |
|            | <b>Proceed to Tier II?</b>   | <b>yes</b> | <b>yes</b> |

**Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)**

|            |  |                |                |
|------------|--|----------------|----------------|
| <b>C-1</b> | Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)  | no             | yes            |
| <b>C-2</b> | Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit  | yes            | yes            |
| <b>C-3</b> | Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit  | yes            | no             |
| <b>C-4</b> | Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit<br><i>% of insurance provided by company</i>                            | yes<br>100.00% | yes<br>100.00% |
| <b>C-5</b> | Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit<br><i>% of retirement or pension plan provided by company</i> | yes<br>100.00% | yes<br>100.00% |
|            | <b>Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$100,000 in total)</b>   | 4.00%          | 4.00%          |
|            | <b>Dollar Value of Credits</b>   | 4,366          | 4,366          |
|            | <b>Bid Total:</b>  | 104,777.57     | 155,129.27     |

**Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits**

|  |   |            |           |
|--|---|------------|-----------|
|  | \$ <b>104,777.57</b>  |            |           |
|  | <b>Percent Over Low Bid:</b>  | 0.000%     | 48.056%   |
|  | <b>Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)</b> | <b>yes</b> | <b>no</b> |
|  | <b>Proceed to Tier III?</b>   | <b>yes</b> | <b>no</b> |

**Tier III - History Experience Factors**

|              |   |            |  |
|--------------|---|------------|--|
| <b>HE-1</b>  | Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs         | no         |  |
| <b>HE-2</b>  | Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs | no         |  |
| <b>HE-3</b>  | Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds   | no         |  |
| <b>HE-4</b>  | Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years  | no         |  |
| <b>HE-5</b>  | Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.               | no         |  |
| <b>HE-6</b>  | Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years               | no         |  |
| <b>HE-7</b>  | Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:                 |            |  |
|              | A. Fair Labor Standards Act   | no         |  |
|              | B. Prevailing Wage Laws   | no         |  |
|              | C. Unemployment Compensation Laws   | no         |  |
|              | D. Worker's Compensation Laws   | no         |  |
| <b>HE-8</b>  | Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years            | no         |  |
| <b>HE-9</b>  | Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation                      | yes        |  |
| <b>HE-10</b> | Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR                                      | yes        |  |
| <b>HE-11</b> | Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years                                   | no         |  |
| <b>HE12</b>  | The results of Bidder's references are questionable   | no         |  |
|              | <b>Total Negative History and Experience Factors:</b>   | <b>0</b>   |  |
|              | <b>A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited</b>      |            |  |
|              | <b>Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)</b>                        | yes        |  |
|              | <b>Proceed to Tier IV?</b>  | <b>yes</b> |  |

**Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)**

Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).

|            |  |          |
|------------|--|----------|
| <b>R-1</b> | Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment) | yes      |
| <b>R-2</b> | Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project                  | yes      |
| <b>R-3</b> | Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project                          | yes      |
| <b>R-4</b> | Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project                       | yes      |
| <b>R-5</b> | Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project                         | yes      |
|            | <b>Total Number of "Yes" Answers</b>   | <b>5</b> |

Division's Recommendation: AHERN & ASSOCIATES

**CITY OF COLUMBUS  
 BID EVALUATION FORM  
 (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: \_\_\_\_\_  
 Division: \_\_\_\_\_

Project: Betterments  
 Funding Source: Sewer Enterprise  
 Bid Opening Date: 26-Jan-05  
 Engineer's Estimate: \$ 525,000.00

Low Bid at Opening: \$ 500,000.00  
 Non-Local Low Bid at Opening: \$ 490,000.00

|                      |    | COMPANY NAME |               |               |           |           |
|----------------------|----|--------------|---------------|---------------|-----------|-----------|
|                      |    | Company A    | Company B     | Company C     | Company 4 | Company 5 |
| Original Bid Amount: | \$ | 500,000.00   | \$ 490,000.00 | \$ 525,000.00 | \$ -      | \$ -      |
| Local Company?       |    | yes          | no            | yes           | -         | -         |

**FACTORS**

**Tier I - Mandatory Factors**

|  |            |            |            |           |           |
|--|------------|------------|------------|-----------|-----------|
| M-1 Bid is responsive  | yes        | yes        | yes        |           |           |
| M-2 Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits         | yes        | yes        | yes        |           |           |
| M-3 Bidder will make financial statements available upon request           | yes        | yes        | yes        |           |           |
| M-4 Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency | no         | no         | no         |           |           |
| M-5 Bidder has requisite licenses  | yes        | yes        | yes        |           |           |
| M-6 Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one  | yes        | yes        | yes        |           |           |
| <b>Proceed to Tier II?</b>   | <b>yes</b> | <b>yes</b> | <b>yes</b> | <b>no</b> | <b>no</b> |

**Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)**

|  |            |            |            |    |    |
|--|------------|------------|------------|----|----|
| C-1 Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)      | yes        | no         | yes        | no | no |
| C-2 Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit                              | yes        | no         | yes        |    |    |
| C-3 Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit                  | no         | no         | yes        |    |    |
| C-4 Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit                             | yes        | yes        | yes        |    |    |
| <i>% of insurance provided by company</i>                                      | 50.00%     | 50.00%     | 50.00%     |    |    |
| C-5 Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit                   | yes        | yes        | yes        |    |    |
| <i>% of retirement or pension plan provided by company</i>                     |            |            |            |    |    |
| <b>Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$100,000 in total)</b> | 4.00%      | 3.00%      | 4.00%      | NA | NA |
| <b>Dollar Value of Credits</b>   | 19,900     | 15,000     | 19,900     | NA | NA |
| <b>Bid Total:</b>  | 480,100.00 | 475,000.00 | 505,100.00 | NA | NA |

**Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits** \$ 475,000.00

|  |            |            |            |                |                |
|--|------------|------------|------------|----------------|----------------|
| <b>Percent Over Low Bid:</b>   | 1.074%     | 0.000%     | 6.337%     | #VALUE!        | #VALUE!        |
| <b>Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (Le., within 10% of low bid after credits)</b> | <b>yes</b> | <b>yes</b> | <b>yes</b> | <b>#VALUE!</b> | <b>#VALUE!</b> |
| <b>Proceed to Tier III?</b>  | <b>yes</b> | <b>yes</b> | <b>yes</b> | <b>#VALUE!</b> | <b>#VALUE!</b> |

**Tier III - History Experience Factors**

|  |          |           |           |          |          |
|--|----------|-----------|-----------|----------|----------|
| HE-1 Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs         | no       | no        | no        |          |          |
| HE-2 Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs | no       | no        | no        |          |          |
| HE-3 Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds   | no       | no        | no        |          |          |
| HE-4 Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years  | no       | no        | yes       |          |          |
| HE-5 Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.               | no       | no        | no        |          |          |
| HE-6 Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years               | no       | no        | no        |          |          |
| HE-7 Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:                 | no       | yes       | yes       |          |          |
| A. Fair Labor Standards Act  | no       | no        | no        |          |          |
| B. Prevailing Wage Laws  | no       | no        | no        |          |          |
| C. Unemployment Compensation Laws  | no       | no        | no        |          |          |
| D. Worker's Compensation Laws  | no       | no        | no        |          |          |
| HE-8 Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years            | no       | no        | no        |          |          |
| HE-9 Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation                      | yes      | no        | no        |          |          |
| HE-10 Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR                                     | yes      | yes       | no        |          |          |
| HE-11 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years                                  | no       | no        | no        |          |          |
| HE12 The results of Bidder's references are questionable   | no       | no        | no        |          |          |
| <b>Total Negative History and Experience Factors:</b>  | <b>0</b> | <b>-1</b> | <b>-3</b> | <b>0</b> | <b>0</b> |
| <b>A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited</b>           |          |           |           |          |          |
| <b>Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)</b>                             | yes      | yes       | no        |          |          |
| <b>Proceed to Tier IV?</b>   | yes      | yes       | no        | no       | no       |

**Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)**

|   |          |          |          |          |          |
|---|----------|----------|----------|----------|----------|
| Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s). |          |          |          |          |          |
| R1 Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment)   | yes      | yes      |          |          |          |
| R2 Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project  | yes      | yes      |          |          |          |
| R3 Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project  | yes      | yes      |          |          |          |
| R4 Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project   | yes      | yes      |          |          |          |
| R5 Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project   | yes      | yes      |          |          |          |
| <b>Total Number of "Yes" Answers</b>  | <b>5</b> | <b>5</b> | <b>0</b> | <b>0</b> | <b>0</b> |

Division's Recommendation: \_\_\_\_\_

Bidder's management resources have sufficient experience