

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
 BID EVALUATION FORM
 (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: Public Utilities

CIP Number: 670608.3

Division: Power

Dublin Ave Substation

Project Name: Building Demo

Funding Source: Bonds

Bid Opening Date: 1/29/13

Engineer's Estimate: \$295,205.00

Lowest, Best, Most Responsive, Responsible Bid Amount: \$92,598.00

| | | | |
|-----------------|--------------------------|------------------------|--------------------------|
| | <u>Maiher Demolition</u> | <u>Ours Excavating</u> | <u>Dore & Assoc.</u> |
| Bid Tab Amount: | \$92,598.00 | \$98,900.00 | \$114,310.00 |

| FACTORS | | | |
|---|---|-----------|----------------|
| <u>(Pgs. 2-3) & Form 1 (Pg. 5) - Contract Compliance</u> | Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N) | yes | no |
| <u>Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages</u> | Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N) | no | no |
| | Negative Factors: | 0 | -1 |
| Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations: | | | |
| | Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N): | | |
| | 1. Fair Labor Standards Act | no | no |
| | 2. Prevailing Wage Laws | no | no |
| | 3. Unemployment Compensation Laws | no | no |
| | 4. Workers' Compensation Laws | no | no |
| | 5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N) | no | no |
| | 6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N) | yes | no |
| | 7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N) | yes | yes |
| | Negative Factors: | 0 | -1 |
| Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws: | | | |
| | 1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N) | no | yes |
| | 2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N) | yes | yes |
| | 3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N) | yes | yes |
| | 4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N) | yes | yes |
| | 5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N) | no | no |
| | Negative Factors: | 0 | -1 |
| Form 5 - Debarment | | | |
| | 1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N) | no | no |
| | Negative Factors: | 0 | 0 |
| Form 6 - Local Workforce | | | |
| | 1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties | 100.0% | 0.0% |
| | Negative Factors: | | TBD |
| Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs | | | |
| | 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) | yes | no |
| | 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: | ER:100% | n/a |
| | 3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) | no | not answered |
| | 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: | n/a | ER: 6% EE: 94% |
| | Negative Factors: | -1 | -2 |
| Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs | | | |
| | 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) | no | no |
| | Negative Factors: | -1 | -1 |
| Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED | | | |
| | Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N) | yes | yes |
| | Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N) | yes | yes |
| Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED | | | |
| | Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N) | yes | yes |
| | Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N) | yes | yes |
| Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control | | | |
| | Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N) | yes | yes |

| | | Maiher Demolition | Ours Excavating | Dore & Assoc. |
|--|---|--------------------------|------------------------|--------------------------|
| Bid Tab Amount: | | \$92,598.00 | \$98,900.00 | \$114,310.00 |
| Form 12 - Availability | | | | |
| | Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N) | yes | yes | yes |
| Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates | | | | |
| | Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N) | yes | yes | yes |
| | Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N) | yes | no | no |
| | License and/or Certificate No: | D0143 | 311 756 267 | AC1010 W0000150 |
| Negative Factors: | | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Lowest Bid Dollar Amount | | \$92,598.00 | | |
| Percent Over Low Bid: | | 0% | 7% | 23% |
| Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid) | | yes | yes | no |
| Pg. 23 - Environmental Preference | | | | |
| | Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N) | yes | yes | yes |
| | Difference versus lowest bidder (%) | NA | 6.81% | 23.45% |
| | Difference versus lowest bidder (\$) | NA | \$6,302.00 | \$21,712.00 |
| | Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid. | yes | no | no |
| Pgs. 24-27 - Statements and Affidavits | | | | |
| Statement 1: | Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N) | yes | yes | yes |
| Statement 2: | Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N) | yes | yes | yes |
| Statement 3: | Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N) | yes | yes | yes |
| Affidavit | Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N) | yes | yes | yes |
| Negative Factors: | | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Pg. 7 - Addenda Ackngmt. | | | | |
| | Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N) | yes | yes | yes |
| Proposal (Pg. 8) - Proposal Signature | | | | |
| | Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N) | yes | yes | yes |
| Negative Factors: | | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Pg. 47 - Proposal Bond | | | | |
| | Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N) | yes | yes | yes |
| | Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N) | yes | yes | yes |
| | Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N) | yes | yes | yes |
| | Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N) | yes | yes | yes |
| Negative Factors: | | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Grand Total Negative Factors: | | -2 | -6 | -4 |
| Division's Recommendation: | | | | |

Additional Evaluation Questions for Non-Responsive Proposals per Section 102.08, not covered above in RED.

| | | | | |
|--------------------------|---|----------|----------|----------|
| 1) | Has the bidder submitted more than one proposal under the same name/subsidiary? (Y/N) | | | |
| 2) | Are the bid prices material unbalanced? (Y/N) | | | |
| 3) | Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not provided in the bid documents? (Y/N) | | | |
| 4) | Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all material respects, and does not contain irregularities or deviations? (Y/N) | | | |
| 5) | Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to accept or reject an award? | | | |
| 6) | Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract item listed? (Y/N) | | | |
| 7) | Did the bidder fail to submit a lump sum price where required? (Y/N) | | | |
| Negative Factors: | | 0 | 0 | 0 |