

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
 BID EVALUATION FORM
 (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department:	<u>Public Utilities</u>	CIP Number:	<u>650260-102004</u>
Division:	<u>DOSD</u>	Project Name:	<u>JPWWTP ACA/ACB Steam Heating Contract SCP 02JP</u>
		Funding Source:	<u>Sanitary Sewer General Obligation Bond Fund</u>
		Bid Opening Date:	<u>1/8/14</u>
Lowest, Best, Most Responsive, Responsible Bid Tab Amount:	<u>\$332,253.00</u>	Engineer's Estimate:	<u>\$678,100.50</u>

Vendor Name:	<u>C.G. Egli, Inc.</u>	<u>The C.D. Whitfield CO., LLC</u>	<u>Kirk Williams Company</u>	<u>General Temperature Control Inc.</u>	<u>Fox Mechanical Co.</u>	<u>Ulliman Schutte Construction, LLC</u>
Bid Tab Amount:	<u>\$107,800.00</u>	<u>\$332,253.00</u>	<u>\$381,700.00</u>	<u>\$440,000.00</u>	<u>\$451,000.00</u>	<u>\$478,940.00</u>
	WITHDRAWN					

FACTORS

<u>(Pgs. X-X) & Form 1 (Pg. X) - Contract Compliance</u>	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	<u>N</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>
--	---	----------	----------	----------	----------	----------	----------

<u>Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages</u>	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0	0	0

Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations:

	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):						
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N)	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0	0	0

Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:

	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N)	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0	0	0

<u>Form 5 - Debarment</u>	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0	0	0

<u>Form 6 - Local Workforce</u>	1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	<u>0.0%</u>	<u>0.0%</u>	<u>80.0%</u>	<u>81.0%</u>	<u>20.0%</u>	<u>0.0%</u>
	Negative Factors:						

Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs

	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	<u>N</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:		<u>100.0%</u>	<u>100%</u>	<u>100%</u>	<u>100%</u>	<u>75%</u>
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	<u>N</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:		<u>100.0%</u>	<u>100%</u>	<u>100%</u>	<u>100%</u>	<u>4%</u>
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0	0	0

<u>Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs</u>	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	<u>N</u>	<u>N</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>N</u>
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0	0	0

Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED

	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	<u>N</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>

Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED

	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>	<u>Y</u>
--	---	----------	----------	----------	----------	----------	----------

ORD#	Vendor Name:	C.G. Egli, Inc.	The C.D. Whitfiled CO., LLC	Kirk Williams Company	General Temperature Control Inc.	Fox Mechanical Co.	Ulliman Schutte Construction, LLC
	Bid Tab Amount:	\$107,800.00	\$332,253.00	\$381,700.00	\$440,000.00	\$451,000.00	\$478,940.00
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	N	N	Y	Y	Y	Y
Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control							
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Form 12 - Availability							
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	?	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates							
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)	N	N	Y	N	Y	N
	License and/or Certificate No:	Hydronic/Boiler/Welding	Hydronic/Boiler/Welding/Hau	Hydronic/Boiler/Welding/HVAC	Hydronic/Plum/Gen Trades/HVAC	HVAC	HVAC/Piping
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0	0	0
	Lowest Bid Dollar of non-environmental preferred bidder	\$332,253.00	\$332,253.00	\$332,253.00	\$332,253.00	\$332,253.00	\$332,253.00
	Percent Over Low Bid:	-68%	0%	15%	32%	36%	44%
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid)	yes	yes	no	no	no	no
Pg. X - Environmental Preference							
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	N	N	Y	Y	N	N
	Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferable bidder (%)	-67.55%	0.00%	14.88%	32.43%	35.74%	44.15%
	Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferable bidder (\$)	(\$224,453.00)	\$0.00	\$49,447.00	\$107,747.00	\$118,747.00	\$146,687.00
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid.	N	N	N	N	N	N
	If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified?	NA	NA	Y	Y	NA	NA
Pgs. X-X - Statements and Affidavits							
Statement 1:	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Statement 2:	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Statement 3:	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Affidavit	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0	0	0
Pg. X - Addenda Acknlgmt.							
	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Proposal (Pg. X) - Signature							
	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0	0	0
Pg. X - Proposal Bond							
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0	0	0
	Grand Total Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0	0	0
	Division's Recommendation:						
Additional Evaluation Questions for Non-Responsive Proposals per Section 102.08, not covered above in RED.							
1)	Has the bidder submitted more than one proposal under the same name/subsidiary? (Y/N)						
2)	Are the bid prices material unbalanced? (Y/N)						
3)	Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not provided in the bid documents? (Y/N)						
4)	Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all material respects, and does not contain irregularities or deviations? (Y/N)						
5)	Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to accept or reject an award? (Y/N)						
6)	Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract item listed? (Y/N)						
7)	Did the bidder fail to submit a lump sum price where required? (Y/N)						
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0	0	0