

Steege, Jerry K.

From: Kelsey, Mark
Sent: Friday, July 15, 2011 2:21 PM
To: Cofield, Alex A.
Cc: Atkinson, Jennifer L.; Austin, Patti A.; Bauman, Max A.; Bell, Timothy A.; Bowman, Randall; Cordetti, Steven R.; Crabill, Melanie J.; Figley, Russ U.; Gallagher, Jennifer L.; Giffin, Benjamin M.; Johnson, Daniel L.; Lewis, William A.; McGuiness, Rory O.; Miller Jr, Richard A.; O'Callaghan, Timothy L.; Poindexter, Kaelyn C.; Roberts, Doug; Robinson, Valuise E.; Rundio, Ted; Steege, Jerry K.; Stephens, Thomas H.; Tilton, Rick C.; Zahran, Hassan Y.
Subject: RE: RECOMMENDATION: Bikeway Development- General Engineering Design

I approve of the recommended consultant for selection

From: Cofield, Alex A.
Sent: Friday, July 15, 2011 10:12 AM
To: Kelsey, Mark
Cc: Atkinson, Jennifer L.; Austin, Patti A.; Bauman, Max A.; Bell, Timothy A.; Bowman, Randall; Cofield, Alex A.; Cordetti, Steven R.; Crabill, Melanie J.; Figley, Russ U.; Gallagher, Jennifer L.; Giffin, Benjamin M.; Johnson, Daniel L.; Lewis, William A.; McGuiness, Rory O.; Miller Jr, Richard A.; O'Callaghan, Timothy L.; Poindexter, Kaelyn C.; Roberts, Doug; Robinson, Valuise E.; Rundio, Ted; Steege, Jerry K.; Stephens, Thomas H.; Tilton, Rick C.; Zahran, Hassan Y.
Subject: RECOMMENDATION: Bikeway Development- General Engineering Design

To: Mark Kelsey, Director
Department of Public Service

From: Alex Cofield, Capital Fiscal Manager

Date: July 15, 2011

Subject: Bikeway Development- General Engineering Design

The Department of Public Service solicited Requests for Proposals for the Bikeway Development- General Engineering Design project. The budget is \$500,000; amount of the contract shall be \$500,000 funded by 2011 bonds.

The intent of this project is to provide the City of Columbus, Division of Mobility Options, additional resources to design and analyze various projects within the Bicentennial Bikeways Plan, as adopted by the City Council on June 2, 2008. These improvements are mostly within the right-of-way, and will consist of projects identified in the Columbus Bicentennial Bikeways Plan such as shared use paths, bike lanes, and shared routes as well as communications and public involvement related to project development. Potential projects include, but are not limited to, Sullivant Avenue Corridor, North Hague Avenue Shared Route and Whitethorne Avenue Bike Boulevard.

The project was formally advertised on the Vendor Services web site from May 24, 2011, to June 23, 2011. The city received eight (8) responses. A proposal from Columbus Engineering Consultants was deemed non-responsive due to not their not meeting all required ODOT pre-qualification categories. Seven proposals were deemed minimally compliant and were fully evaluated when the Evaluation Committee met on July 14, 2011. The responding firms were:

CONSULTANT Sub-consultant	Business Enterprise Status	Contract Compliance Number	Active	% OF WORK	% MAJ. % OTH.
------------------------------	----------------------------------	----------------------------------	--------	--------------	------------------

MICHAEL BAKER JR., INC.	Majority	25-1228638	Y	60%	70% Majority 30% Other
Dynotec, Inc.	MBE	31-1319961	Y	12%	
CTL Engineering, Inc.	AS1	31-0680767	Y	12%	
The EDGE Group	Majority	20-0196969	Y	10%	
Engage Public Affairs	FBE	20-1593274	Y	6%	
E. P. FERRIS & ASSOCIATES	Majority	31-1194974	Y	60%	81% Majority 19% Other
Korda/Nemeth Engineering, Inc.	Majority	31-0922991	Y	15%	
The EDGE Group	Majority	20-0196969	Y	6%	
Lawhon & Associates, Inc.	FBE	31-1153141	Y	5%	
CTL Engineering, Inc.	AS1	31-0680767	Y	9%	
Engage Public Affairs	FBE	20-1593274	Y	5%	
RESOURCE INTERNATIONAL, INC.	FBE	31-0669793	Y	62%	35% Majority 65% FBE
Burgess & Niple	Majority	31-0885550	Y	25%	
Alta Planning + Design	Majority	68-0465555	Y	10%	
Engage Public Affairs	FBE	20-1593274	Y	3%	
STANTEC CONSULTING SERVICES, INC.	Majority	11-2167170	Y	80%	89% Majority 11% Other
Alta Planning + Design	Majority	68-0465555	Y	9%	
Engage Public Affairs	FBE	20-1593274	Y	11%	
ME COMPANIES	Majority	31-1442777	Y	93%	93% Majority 7% Other
ASC Group, Inc.	FBE	31-1167506	Y	5%	
CTL Engineering, Inc.	AS1	31-0680767	Y	2%	
STRAND ASSOCIATES	Majority	39-1020418	Y	50%	90% Majority 10% Other
EMH&T	Majority	31-0685594	Y	40%	
Resource International	FBE	31-0669793	Y	10%	
DYNOTEC, INC.	MBE	31-1319961	Y	Not provided	0% Majority 100% Other

DLZ Ohio	ASN	31-1268980	Y	Not provided	
----------	-----	------------	---	-----------------	--

This RFP Evaluation Committee included three (3) voting members from the Department of Public Service – Hassan Zahran, Patti Austin, and Randall Bowman – a representative from EBOCO was invited to attend, but declined, and Jennifer Gallagher and Jennifer Atkinson were in attendance.

Michael Baker Jr., Inc. received 85.67 points from the Evaluation Committee (out of a possible 100). The next closest firm was E.P. Ferris with 80.67 points.

The following is a list of the results of the Evaluation Committee’s assessment of the seven evaluated proposals for your final selection.

Michael Baker, Jr.	85.67
E.P. Ferris	80.67
Resource Int., Inc.	79.67
Stantec	78.67
M-E Companies	78.33
Strand Associates	75.67
Dynotec	74.67

The Committee would like to submit Michael Baker Jr. for the Director’s review and recommendation. The Committee felt that Michael Baker Jr. submitted the strongest overall proposal for the following reasons:

1. Michael Baker Jr. offered a strong project team and good insight into project understanding.
2. Michael Baker Jr.’s experience with the Metro Parks Sullivant Avenue project will benefit the City with its Sullivant Avenue project.
3. Michael Baker Jr. showed due diligence on their proposal.
4. Michael Baker Jr. was the only firm to mention a parking study.
5. Michael Baker Jr. discussed potential conflicts that may arise.

Per City Code 329.14(h), please provide direction for proceeding on this project by replying to this e-mail. Four options include:

1. Approve of the committee’s recommendation, Michael Baker Jr, Inc.
2. Reject the committee’s recommendations and designate a firm
3. Call for an oral presentation of the three highest scoring firms
4. Other

The Committee recommends emergency legislation.

Alex Cofield

Capital Fiscal Manager
City of Columbus
Department of Public Service
Office of Support Services
109 N. Front St. Ground Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215

(p) 614-645-1557
(f) 614-645-7549
aacofield@columbus.gov

