

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
 BID EVALUATION FORM
 (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: Public Utilities CIP Number: 650260-104001
 Division: Sewerage & Drainage Project Name: Southwest Compost Facility
 Funding Source: Sewerage System Operating Fund
 Bid Opening Date: 10/16/13
 Lowest Bidder: Cyrus Concrete Construction Engineer's Estimate: \$181,371.00

Bid Tab Amount: Cyrus Concrete Construction Legg & Davis McDaniel Construction The Richter Co., Inc. Company Name Company Name
\$196,568.00 \$201,190.00 \$201,234.00 \$237,490.00

FACTORS						
<i>Bid Supp. Forms (Pgs. X-X) & Form 1 (Pg. X) - Contract Compliance</i>	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	
<i>Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages</i>	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	No	No	No	Yes	
	Negative Factors:	-1	0	0	-1	0
<i>Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations:</i>						
	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):					
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	No	No	No	No	
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	No	No	No	No	
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	No	No	No	No	
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	No	No	No	No	
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)	No	No	No	No	
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N)	YES	No	Yes	Yes	
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)	YES	No	No	Yes	
	Negative Factors:	0	-2	-1	0	0
<i>Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:</i>						
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N)	No	No	No	No	
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)	No	No	No	No	
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0	0
<i>Form 5 - Debarment</i>	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)	No	No	No	No	
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0	0
<i>Form 6 - Local Workforce</i>	1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	99.0%	75.0%	75.0%	37.5%	
	Negative Factors:					
<i>Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs</i>						
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	50	100	75	100	
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	No	No	Yes	Yes	
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	na	na	75	100	
	Negative Factors:	-1	-1	0	0	0
<i>Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs</i>	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	No	No	Yes	Yes	
	Negative Factors:	-1	-1	0	0	0
<i>Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED</i>						
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
<i>Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED</i>						
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
<i>Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control</i>						
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	

	<u>Cyrus Concrete Construction</u>	<u>Legg & Davis</u>	<u>McDaniel Construction</u>	<u>The Righter Co., Inc.</u>	<u>Company Name</u>	<u>Company Name</u>
Bid Tab Amount:	\$196,568.00	\$201,190.00	\$201,234.00	\$237,490.00		
Form 12 - Availability						
Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes		
Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates						
Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes		
Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)	na	na	na	na		
License and/or Certificate No:						
Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0	0	0
Lowest Bid Dollar of non-environmental preferred bidder	\$196,568.00	\$201,190.00	\$201,234.00			
Percent Over Low Bid:	0%	2%	2%	21%	-100%	-100%
Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('Le., within 10% of low bid)	yes	yes	yes	no	yes	yes
Bid Supp Forms (Pg. X) - Environmental Preference						
Has last sentence regarding local credit been omitted (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes			
Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	No	No	Yes			
Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferable bidder (%)	NA	2.35%	2.37%	20.82%	-100.00%	-100.00%
Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferable bidder (\$)	NA	\$4,622.00	\$4,666.00	\$40,922.00	(\$196,568.00)	(\$196,568.00)
Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid.	No	No	Yes			
Bid Supp Forms (Pg. X-X) - Statements and Affidavits						
Statement 1: Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes			
Statement 2: Non-Collusion has been initiated/dated (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes			
Statement 3: Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes			
Affidavit: Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes			
Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0	0	0
Proposal (Pg. X) - Addenda Ackntent						
Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes			
Proposal (Pg. X) - Proposal Signature						
Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes			
Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0	0	0
Bid Supp Forms (Pg. X-X) - Proposal Bond						
Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes			
Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes			
Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes			
Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes			
Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0	0	0
Grand Total Negative Factors:	-3	-4	-1	-1	0	0
Division's Recommendation: pe completed by Engineer)						