

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
BID EVALUATION FORM
(FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department:		Public Utilities	FEM Number:	1301.3
Division:		Sewerage & Drainage	Project Name:	Refractory and Thermal Systems Maintenance Services
Lowest Bidder:		\$476,654.00	Funding Source:	Operating Fund
Non-Local Lowest Bidder:		\$0.00	Bid Opening Date:	9/7/11
			Engineer's Estimate	\$500,000.00
		Bidder 1 - Adrian L. Wallick Co.		
Bid Amount:		\$476,654.00		
Local Company? (Proof s/b included.)		Y		
FACTORS				
Tier I - Mandatory Factors				
M-1	Bid is responsive (Y or N)	Y	Yes, see page 2 for responsiveness evaluation.	
M-2	Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits (Y or N)	Y		
M-3	Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y or N)	Y		
M-4	Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency (Y or N)	N		
M-5	Bidder has requisite licenses (Y or N)	N/A		
M-6	Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one (Y or N)	Y		
	Proceed to Tier II?	Yes		
Tier II - Creditable Factors				
C-1	Bidder is eligible for local credit? - (see below for clarification)	Yes		
	If lowest bidder is local, they do receive local credit, as long as there is a non-local bidder. If the lowest bidder IS NOT local and another bidder is local, then the local bidder receives credit. Local credit is 1% of the apparent low, non-local bidder.	N/A - only one bidder		
C-2	Environmental Preference: To receive preference, bidder must include documentation that meets guidelines in bid book, bid must not exceed 5% of the lowest responsive, responsible, and best bid from any non-preferable bid, and must not exceed \$20,000 of the same.	N/A - only one bidder		
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y or N)	No		
	Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	NA		
	Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	NA		
	Does bidder receive environmental preference? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.	NO		
	Total Credits	1.00%		
	Dollar Value of Credits	\$0.00		
	Bid Total:	\$476,654.00		
	Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits	\$476,654.00		
	Percent Over Low Bid:	0%		
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)	yes		
	Proceed to Tier III?	yes		
Tier III - Employer & History Factors				
E-1	Bidder has local workforce? (Y or N)	Y		
E-2	Bidder is a quality training contractor? (Y or N)	Y		
E-3	Bidder has health insurance? (Y or N)	Y		
E-4	Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y or N)	Y		
HE-1	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs	N		
HE-2	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs	N		
HE-3	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds	N		
HE-4	Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years	N		
HE-5	Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.	N		
HE-6	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:			
	A. Fair Labor Standards Act	N		
	B. Prevailing Wage Laws	N		
	C. Unemployment Compensation Laws	N		
	D. Worker's Compensation Laws	N		
HE-7	Bidder has a record of "willful or serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov)	N		
HE-8	Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation	Y		
HE-9	Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR	Y	Bidder did not check either box(yes or no) but did supply the BWC EMR rating.	
HE-10	Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	N		
HE-11	The results of Bidder's references are questionable	N		
	Total Negative History and Experience Factors:	0		
	A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited.			
	Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)	Yes		
	Proceed to Tier IV?	Yes		
Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)				
Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will				
R-1	Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment)	Y		
R-2	Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project	Y		
R-3	Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project	Y		
R-4	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project	Y		
R-5	Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project	Y		
	Total Number of "Yes" Answers	5		
Division's Recommendation:		Award to Adrian L. Wallick		

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
 BID EVALUATION FORM
 (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department:	Public Utilities	FEM Number:	1301.3
Division:	Sewerage & Drainage	Project Name:	Refractory and Thermal Systems Maintenance Services
Lowest Bidder:	\$476,654.00	Funding Source:	Operating Fund
Non-Local Lowest Bidder:	\$0.00	Bid Opening Date:	9/7/11
		Engineer's Estimate	\$500,000.00
	Bidder 1 - Adrian L. Wallick Co.		
Bid Amount:	\$476,654.00		
Local Company? (Proof s/b included.)	Y		

BID TAB

Pay Item No.	Description	Qty.	Unit	Adrian L. Wallick Co.				Pay Item	Comments
				Labor \$	Material \$	Unit Price \$	Total Price		
1	Bonds and Specialized Insurance	1	LS	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$8,200.00	
2	Annual Inspection of Incinerator #1 at JPWWTP	1	LS	1,540.00	195	\$1,735	\$1,735.00	\$1,735.00	
3	Annual Inspection of Incinerator #2 at JPWWTP	1	LS	1,540.00	195	\$1,735	\$1,735.00	\$1,735.00	
4	Annual Inspection of Incinerator #3 at SSWTP	1	LS	1,540.00	195	\$1,735	\$1,735.00	\$1,735.00	
5	Annual Inspection of Incinerator #4 at SSWTP	1	LS	1,540.00	195	\$1,735	\$1,735.00	\$1,735.00	
	Bidder's Total Base Bid: Pay Items 1 through 5							\$15,140.00	
6	CONTINGENCY (10% of Pay Items 1-5)	1	LS					\$1,514.00	
7	Allowance for Refractory and Thermal Systems for JPWWTP	1	LS					\$230,000.00	
8	Allowance for Refractory and Thermal Systems for JPWWTP	1	LS					\$230,000.00	
	SUM OF PAY ITEMS 1 THROUGH 10							\$476,654.00	
9	YEAR 2 CONTRACT PRICE INCREASE - PAY ITEMS 1 THROUGH 5	1	%				5%	\$15,897.00	
10	YEAR 3 CONTRACT PRICE INCREASE - PAY ITEMS 1 THROUGH 5	1	%				10%	\$16,654.00	
11	YEAR 4 CONTRACT PRICE INCREASE - PAY ITEMS 1 THROUGH 5	1	%				15%	\$17,411.00	
12	Material Markup	1	%				30%		
13	Rental Equipment Markup	1	%				15%		
14	Subcontractor Markup	1	%				10%		

Bidder has provided a contract compliance no. (Page 4)	Yes
Bidders CCCN	314425505 - From Performance, number good until 9/01/2013
Proposal Guaranty indicated (Page 5)	Yes - Proposal Bond supplied
Bidder submitted full names/addresses of persons interested in Bid (Page 6)	Yes
Addendum Acknowledgement Completed (Page 7)	Yes
Proposal Signature (Page 7)	Yes
Non-Collusion Affidavit Completed/Notorized (Page 8)	Yes
Corporate Proposal Affidavit Completed/Notorized (Page 9)	Yes
Prime Contractor Affidavit Completed/Notorized (Page 36)	Yes
Proposal Bond Completed/ Notorized (Page 37)	Yes
Proposal Bond Amount	\$47,665.00
Bonding Company	Ohio Farmers Insurance Company
Proposal Bond Amount Required	10% of bid - 10% of \$476,654.00
BID IS RESPONSIVE?	YES