CITY OF COLUMBUS
BID EVALUATION FORM
(FOR CONTRACTS OVER $20,000)

	Department:	**Public Utilities**		**CIP Number:**	**690395-100000**	
	Division:	**Water**		**Project Name:**	**Main Line Valve Replacements - Part IV**	
				Funding Source:	**Fund 609 - Water Build America Bonds Fund**	
				Bid Opening Date:	**12/9/09**	
	Low Bid at Opening:	**$1,647,382.00**		**Engineer's Estimate**	**$2,100,000.00**	
	Non-Local Low Bid at Opening:	**$1,924,600.15**				
		Bale Contracting	**Danbert Inc.**	**Cols. Asphalt Paving**		
	Original Bid Amount:	$1,647,382.00	$1,924,600.15	$2,272,622.00		
	Local Company?	yes	no	yes		
	FACTORS					
	Tier I - Mandatory Factors					
M-1	Bid is responsive	yes	yes	yes		
M-2	Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits	yes	yes	yes		
M-3	Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	yes	yes	yes		
M-4	Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency	no	no	no		
M-5	Bidder has requisite licenses	yes	yes	yes		
M-6	Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one	yes	yes	yes		
	Proceed to Tier II?	**yes**	**yes**	**yes**		
	Tier II - Creditable Factors (C1-C5 each yes answer gives 1% credit)					
C-1	Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)	**yes**	**no**	**yes**		
C-2	Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit	yes	yes	yes		
C-3	Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit	yes	yes	yes		
C-4	Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit	yes	yes	yes		
	% of insurance provided by company	100.00%	100.00%	100.00%		
C-5	Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit	yes	yes	yes		
	% of retirement or pension plan provided by company	100.00%	100.00%	100.00%		
C-6	Bidder is eligible for environmental preference	yes	yes	yes		
	Total Credits (cannot exceed $20,000 per factor or $120,000 in total)	**10.00%**	**9.00%**	**10.00%**		
	Dollar Value of Credits	**$105,141.28**	**$85,895.28**	**$105,141.28**		
	Bid Total:	**1,542,240.72**	**1,838,704.87**	**2,167,480.72**		
	Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits	**$1,542,240.72**				
	Percent Over Low Bid:	**0.00%**	**19.223%**	**40.541%**		
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 5% of low bid after credits)	**yes**	**no**	**no**		
	Proceed to Tier III?	**yes**	**no**	**no**		
	Tier III - History Experience Factors					
HE-1	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action prog	no				
HE-2	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative actior	no				
HE-3	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds	no				
HE-4	Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years	no				
HE-5	Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.	no				
HE-6	Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years	no				
HE-7	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:	no				
	A. Fair Labor Standards Act	no				
	B. Prevailing Wage Laws	no				
	C. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no				
	D. Worker's Compensation Laws	no				
HE-8	Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (C	no				
HE-9	Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation	yes				
HE-10	Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR	yes				
HE-11	Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	no				
HE-12	The results of Bidder's references are questionable	no				
	Total Negative History and Experience Factors:	**0**	**0**	**0**		
	A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited					
	Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)	yes				
	Proceed to Tier IV?	**yes**	**no**	**no**		
	Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)					
Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined						
through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).						
R-1	Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., ed	yes				
R-2	Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project	yes				
R-3	Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project	yes				
R-4	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project	yes				
R-5	Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project	yes				
	Total Number of "Yes" Answers	**5**	**0**	**0**		
	Division's Recommendation:	**Bale Contracting, Inc.**				