

**BID EVALUATION FORM
(FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department:	<u>Public Utilities</u>	CIP Number:	<u>670608-100002</u>
Division:	<u>Power</u>	Project Name:	<u>Dublin Ave Substation</u>
		Funding Source:	
		Bid Opening Date:	<u>9/25/13</u>
Lowest, Best, Most Responsive, Responsible Bid Tab Amount:	<u>\$2,425,923.10</u>	Engineer's Estimate	<u>\$2,750,000.00</u>

Vendor Name:	<u>Central Electric</u>	<u>PEPCO</u>	<u>Abb</u>	<u>Loeb Electric Co.</u>
Bid Tab Amount:	<u>\$2,425,923.10</u>	<u>\$2,859,150.00</u>	<u>\$2,983,837.50</u>	<u>\$3,041,844.75</u>

FACTORS					
Form 1 (Pg. 9) - Contract Compliance	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	No	No	No	No
	Negative Factors:	-1	0	0	0
Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations					
	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with				
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	No	No	No	No
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	No	No	No	No
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	No	No	No	No
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	No	No	No	No
	governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)	No	No	No	No
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EM	Yes	No	No	Yes
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	Yes	Yes	No	Yes
	Negative Factors:	0	-1	-2	0
Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:					
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov)	No	No	No	No
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	No	No	Yes	No
	Negative Factors:	0	0	-1	-2
Form 5 - Debarment	with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)	No	No	No	No
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0
Form 6 - Local Workforce	1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	0.0%	25.0%	1.0%	1.0%
	Negative Factors:				
Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs					
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	75%	80%	70-90%	60%
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	3.50%	0%	3%	n/a
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	-1
Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	No	No	No	No
	Negative Factors:	-1	-1	-1	-1
Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED					
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	No	Yes	No	No
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	No	Yes	No	No
Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED					
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	No	Yes	No	Yes
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	No	Yes	No	Yes
Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control					
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
Form 12 - Availability					
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates					

ORD#

	Vendor Name:	Central Electric	PEPCO	Abb	Loeb Electric Co.
	Bid Tab Amount:	\$2,425,923.10	\$2,859,150.00	\$2,983,837.50	\$3,041,844.75
Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)		Yes	No	Yes	Yes
Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requi		No	No	Yes	Yes
License and/or Certificate No:					
Negative Factors:		-5	-1	-4	-2
Lowest Bid Dollar of non-environmental preferred bidder		\$2,425,923.10			
Percent Over Low Bid:		0%	18%	23%	25%
Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid)		yes	no	no	no
Pg. 27- Environmental Preference					
Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)		No	No	No	No
Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%)		0.00%	17.86%	23.00%	25.39%
Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (\$)		\$0.00	\$433,226.90	\$557,914.40	\$615,921.65
Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid.		No	No	No	No
If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified?		n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
Pgs. 28-31 - Statements and Affidavits					
Statement 1: Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)		Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Statement 2: Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)		Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Statement 3: Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)		Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Affidavit Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized		Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Negative Factors:		0	0	0	0
Pg. 34 - Addenda Acknlgmt.					
Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)		No	Yes	Yes	No
Proposal (Pg.36) - Proposal Signature					
Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)		Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Negative Factors:		-1	0	0	-1
Pg. 37 - Proposal Bond					
Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (No	Yes	Yes	Yes
Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)		No	Yes	Yes	Yes
Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)		No	Yes	Yes	Yes
Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Co		No	Yes	Yes	Yes
Negative Factors:		-4	0	0	0
Grand Total Negative Factors:		-12	-3	-8	-7
Division's Recommendation:					

Additional Evaluation Questions for Non-Responsive Proposals per Section 102.08, not covered above in RED.

1) Has the bidder submitted more than one proposal under the same name/subsidiary? (Y/N)	No			
2) Are the bid prices material unbalanced? (Y/N)	No			
3) Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not provided in the bid documents? (Y/N)	No			
4) Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all material respects, and does not contain irregularities or deviations? (Y/N)	No			
5) Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to accept or reject an award? (Y/N)	No			
6) Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract item listed? (Y/N)	No			
7) Did the bidder fail to submit a lump sum price where required? (Y/N)	No			
Negative Factors:	-1	0		0

**CITY OF
BID EVALU
(FOR CONTRAC**

Department: Public Utilities

Division: Power

Lowest, Best, Most Responsive, Responsible Bid Tab Amount: \$1,960,298.55

Vendor Name: Central Electric
Bid Tab Amount: \$1,960,298.55

<u>FACTORS</u>		
<u>Form 1 (Pg. 9) - Contract Compliance</u>	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	No
<u>Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages</u>	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	No
	Negative Factors:	-1
<u>Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations</u>		
	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:	
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	No
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	No
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	No
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	No
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs	No
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EM	Yes
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	Yes
	Negative Factors:	0
<u>Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:</u>		
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov)	No
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA	Yes
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	Yes
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	Yes
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	No
	Negative Factors:	0

<u>Form 5 - Debarment</u>	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years	No
	Negative Factors:	0
<u>Form 6 - Local Workforce</u>	1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	0.0%
	Negative Factors:	
<u>Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs</u>		
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	Yes
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	75%
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	Yes
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	3.50%
	Negative Factors:	0
<u>Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs</u>	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	No
	Negative Factors:	-1
<u>Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED</u>		
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	No
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	No
<u>Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED</u>		
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	No
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	No
<u>Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control</u>		
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	No
<u>Form 12 - Availability</u>		
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	Yes
<u>Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates</u>		
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	Yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)	No
	License and/or Certificate No:	
	Negative Factors:	-5
	Lowest Bid Dollar of non-environmental preferred bidder	\$2,425,923.10
	Percent Over Low Bid:	-19%
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid)	yes
<u>Pg. 27- Environmental Preference</u>		
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	No

	Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%)	-19.19%
	Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (\$)	(\$465,624.55)
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid.	No
	If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified?	n/a
<u>Pgs. 28-31 - Statements and Affidavits</u>		
Statement 1:	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	Yes
Statement 2:	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	Yes
Statement 3:	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	Yes
Affidavit	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized	Yes
	Negative Factors:	0
<u>Pg. 34 - Addenda Acknlgmt.</u>		
	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)	No
<u>Proposal (Pg.36) - Proposal Signature</u>		
	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	Yes
	Negative Factors:	-1
<u>Pg. 37 - Proposal Bond</u>		
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	No
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	No
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	No
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Coverage (Y/N)	No
	Negative Factors:	-4
	Grand Total Negative Factors:	-12
	Division's Recommendation:	
Additional Evaluation Questions for Non-Responsive Proposals per Section 102.08, not covered above		
1)	Has the bidder submitted more than one proposal under the same name/subsidiary? (Y/N)	No
2)	Are the bid prices material unbalanced? (Y/N)	No
3)	Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not provided in the bid documents? (Y/N)	No

4)	Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all material respects, and does not contain irregularities or deviations? (Y/N)	No
5)	Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to accept or reject an award? (Y/N)	No
6)	Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract item listed? (Y/N)	No
7)	Did the bidder fail to submit a lump sum price where required? (Y/N)	No
Negative Factors:		-1

**COLUMBUS
 ATION FORM
 TS OVER \$20,000)**

CIP Number:

Project Name:

Funding Source:

Bid Opening Date:

Engineer's Estimate

<u>Myers Controlled Power</u> \$2,133,993.75	<u>PEPCO</u> \$2,738,400.00	<u>Abb</u> \$2,806,639.50
Yes	Yes	Yes
No	No	No
0	0	0
No	No	No
No	No	No
No	No	No
No	No	No
No	No	No
Yes	No	No
Yes	Yes	No
0	-1	-2
No	No	No
Yes	Yes	Yes
Yes	Yes	Yes
Yes	Yes	Yes
No	No	Yes
0	0	-1

No	No	No
0	0	0
0.0%	25.0%	1.0%
Yes	Yes	Yes
55%	80%	70-90%
Yes	Yes	Yes
0%	0%	3%
0	0	0
No	No	No
-1	-1	-1
Yes	Yes	No
Yes	Yes	No
Yes	Yes	No
Yes	Yes	No
Yes	Yes	Yes
Yes	Yes	Yes
Yes	No	Yes
Yes	No	Yes
0	-1	-4
-12%	13%	16%
yes	no	no
No	No	No

-12.03%	12.88%	15.69%
(\$291,929.35)	\$312,476.90	\$380,716.40
No	No	No
n/a	n/a	n/a
Yes	Yes	Yes
Yes	Yes	Yes
Yes	Yes	Yes
Yes	Yes	Yes
0	0	0
No	Yes	Yes
Yes	Yes	Yes
-1	0	0
Yes	Yes	Yes
Yes	Yes	Yes
Yes	Yes	Yes
Yes	Yes	Yes
0	0	0
-2	-3	-8

ove in **RED**.



670608-100002

Dublin Ave Substation
Control/Switchgear

9/25/13

\$2,750,000.00

Loeb Electric Co.

\$2,916,853.80

Yes
No
0
No
No
No
No
No
Yes
Yes
0
No
No
No
Yes
No
-2

No
0
1.0%
Yes
60%
No
n/a
-1
No
-1
No
No
Yes
Yes
Yes
Yes
Yes
-2
20%
no
No

20.24%
\$490,930.70
No
n/a
Yes
Yes
Yes
Yes
0
No
Yes
-1
Yes
Yes
Yes
Yes
0
-7

0