

CITY OF COLUMBUS BID EVALUATION FORM (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)						
	Department:	Public Utilities		CIP Number:	690331 Hap Cremeen Water Plant Lagoon 3 Sludge Removal Reserves	
	Division:	Water		Project Name:		
				Funding Source:		
				Bid Opening Date:	9/10/08	
				Engineer's Estimate:	\$611,546.00	
	Low Bid at Opening:	\$307,785.00				
	Non-Local Low Bid at Opening:	\$307,785.00				
				Burch Hydro	Synagro Central	
	Original Bid Amount:	\$307,785.00		\$822,108.54		
	Local Company?	no		no		
	FACTORS					
	Tier I - Mandatory Factors					
M-1	Bid is responsive	yes	yes			
M-2	Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits	yes	yes			
M-3	Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	yes	yes			
M-4	Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency	no	no			
M-5	Bidder has requisite licenses	yes	yes			
M-6	Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one	yes	yes			
	Proceed to Tier II?	yes	yes	no	no	no
	Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)					
C-1	Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)	no	no	no	no	no
C-2	Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit	no	yes			
C-3	Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit	no	no			
C-4	Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit	yes	yes			
	% of insurance provided by company	75.00%	70.00%			
C-5	Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit	no	yes			
	% of retirement or pension plan provided by company	0.00%	1-15% if elects			
C-6	Bidder is eligible for environmental preference	no	no			
	Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$120,000 in total)	1.00%	3.00%	NA	NA	NA
	Dollar Value of Credits	\$3,077.85	\$9,233.55	NA	NA	NA
	Bid Total:	\$304,707.15	\$812,874.99	NA	NA	NA
	Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits	\$304,707.15				
	Percent Over Low Bid:	0.000%	166.773%	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ("I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)	yes	no	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!
	Proceed to Tier III?	yes	no	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!
	Tier III - History Experience Factors					
HE-1	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs	no				
HE-2	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs	no				
HE-3	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds	no				
HE-4	Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years	no				
HE-5	Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.	no				
HE-6	Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years	no				
HE-7	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:	no				
	A. Fair Labor Standards Act	no				
	B. Prevailing Wage Laws	no				
	C. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no				
	D. Worker's Compensation Laws	no				
HE-8	Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (OSHA.gov)	no				
HE-9	Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation	yes				
HE-10	Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR	yes				
HE-11	Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	no				
HE-12	The results of Bidder's references are questionable	no				
	Total Negative History and Experience Factors:	0	0	0	0	0
	A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited					
	Bid Investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)					
	Proceed to Tier IV?	no	no	no	no	no
	Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)					
	Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).					
R-1	Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment)	yes				
R-2	Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project	yes				
R-3	Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project	yes				
R-4	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project	yes				
R-5	Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project	yes				
	Total Number of "Yes" Answers	5	0	0	0	0
	Division's Recommendation:	Burch Hydro				

CITY OF COLUMBUS BID EVALUATION FORM (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)											
Department:	Public Utilities		CIP Number:	610744							
Division:	Sewerage and Drainage		Project Name:	Parkside Road Stormwater System Imp							
Low Bid at Opening:	\$ 554,187.00		Funding Source:	Storm Sewer Bond Fund							
Non-Local Low Bid at Opening:	\$ 883,207.20		Bid Opening Date:	08/31/2005							
Original Bid Amount:	\$ 554,187.00		Engineer's Estimate:	\$ 1,998,675.00							
Local Company?	Yes		COMPANY NAME								
	Storts Excavation, Inc.	Double Z Constr Co.	Complete General	Nickolas Savko	Trucco Construction						
	\$ 671,967.00	\$ 677,561.40	\$ 869,980.56	\$ 883,207.20	\$ 671,967.00						
	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes						
FACTORS											
Tier I - Mandatory Factors											
M-1	Bid is responsive										
M-2	Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits										
M-3	Bidder will make financial statements available upon request										
M-4	Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any covt. agency										
M-5	Bidder has requisite licenses										
M-6	Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one										
Proceed to Tier II?	yes										
Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)											
C-1	Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)										
C-2	Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit										
C-3	Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit										
C-4	Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit										
C-5	% of insurance provided by company 100.00% 100.00% 100.00% 60.00% 75.00% 100.00% 100.00% 100.00%										
C-6	Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit 3.00% 100.00% 100.00% 100.00% 50.00% 100.00% 100.00% 100.00%										
C-6	Bidder is eligible for environmental preference										
Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$120,000 in total)	5.00% 10.00% 5.00% 9.00% 3.00% 5.00% 5.00% 5.00%										
Dollar Value of Credits	31,000 51,000 31,000 45,458 16,626 31,000 31,000 31,000										
Bid Total:	\$ 523,187.45 620,967.45 646,561.85 824,522.88 866,581.59 640,967.45 640,967.45 640,967.45										
Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits	\$ 523,187.45										
Percent Over Low Bid:	0.00%										
Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)	18.68% 23.581% 57.596% 65.635% 22.512% 22.512% 22.512%										
Proceed to Tier III?	yes no no no no no no no no										
Tier III - History Experience Factors											
HE-1	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs										
HE-2	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs										
HE-3	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds										
HE-4	Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years										
HE-5	Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.										
HE-6	Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years										
HE-7	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:										
A. Fair Labor Standards Act	no										
B. Prevailing Wage Laws	no										
C. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no										
D. Worker's Compensation Laws	no										
HE-8	Bidder has a record of "willful" or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years										
HE-9	Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation										
HE-10	Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR										
HE-11	Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years										
HE-12	The results of Bidder's references are questionable										
Total Negative History and Experience Factors:	0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0										
A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited	yes										
Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)	yes no no no no no no no no										
Proceed to Tier IV?	no										
Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)											
Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).											
R-1	Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment)										
R-2	Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project										
R-3	Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project										
R-4	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project										
R-5	Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project										
Total Number of "Yes" Answers	5 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0										
Division's Recommendation:	Storts Excavation, Inc.										