

CITY OF COLUMBUS BID EVALUATION FORM - REVISED (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)					
	Department:	Public Utilities		CIP Number:	690530-100000
	Division:	Water		Project Name:	PAWP Roof Restoration
				Funding Source:	Water Works Enlargement Voted Bonds Fund & Water Permanent Improvements Fund
				Bid Opening Date:	5/23/12
	Lowest Bidder:	\$542,190.00		Engineer's Estimate	\$684,200.00
	Non-Local Lowest Bidder:	\$542,190.00			
		Alumni Roofing	Smith Roofing		
	Bid Tab Amount:	\$542,190.00	\$624,737.30		
	Local Company? (Proof s/b included.)	no	yes		
	FACTORS				
	Tier I - Mandatory Factors				
M-1	Bid is responsive (Y or N)	yes	yes		
M-2	Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits (Y or N)	yes	yes		
M-3	Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y or N)	yes	yes		
M-4	Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency	no	no		
M-5	Bidder & subs have requisite licenses (Y or N)	yes	yes		
M-6	Bidder & subs have provided a contract compliance no., or application for one (Y or N)	yes	yes		
	Proceed to Tier II?	yes	yes		
	Tier II - Creditable Factors				
C-1	Bidder is eligible for local credit? - (see below for clarification)	no	yes		
	If lowest bidder is local, they do receive local credit, as long as there is a non-				
C-2	Environmental Preference: To receive preference, bidder must include				
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y or N)	no	no		
	Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	NA	NA		
	Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	NA	NA		
	Does bidder receive environmental preference? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.	no	no		
	Total Local Credit	FALSE	1.00%		
	Dollar Value of Credits	\$0.00	\$5,421.90		
	Evaluated Bid Total:	\$542,190.00	\$619,315.40		
	Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits	\$542,190.00	\$619,315.40		
	Percent Over Low Bid:	0%	14%		
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)	yes	no		
	Proceed to Tier III?	yes	no		
	Tier III - Employer & History Factors				
E-1	Bidder has local workforce? (Y or N)	no	yes		
E-2	Bidder is a quality training contractor? (Y or N)	no	yes		
E-3	Bidder has health insurance? (Y or N)	yes	yes		
E-4	Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y or N)	yes	yes		
HE-1	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs	no	no		
HE-2	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs	no	no		
HE-3	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds	no	no		
HE-4	Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years	no	no		
HE-5	Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, or other illegal activities	no	no		
HE-6	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:	no	no		
	A. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no		
	B. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no		
	C. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no		
	D. Workers' Compensation Laws	no	no		
HE-7	Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov)	no	yes		
HE-8	Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation	yes	yes		
HE-9	Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR	yes	yes		
HE-10	Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	no	no		
HE-11	The results of Bidder's references are questionable	no	no		
	Total Negative History and Experience Factors:	-2	-1		
	A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited.				
	Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)	yes	yes		
	Proceed to Tier IV?	yes	yes		
	Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)				
R-1	Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., eqpt.)	yes	yes		
R-2	Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project	yes	yes		
R-3	Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project	yes	yes		
R-4	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project	yes	yes		
R-5	Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project	yes	yes		
	Total Number of "Yes" Answers	5	5		
	Division's Recommendation:	ALUMNI ROOFING CO., INC.			