

**CITY OF COLUMBUS  
BID EVALUATION FORM  
(FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: <u>Public Utilities</u> Division: <u>Water</u>	CIP Number: <u>690236-100030</u> Project Name: <u>Sylvan Avenue Area W.L. Imp's</u> Funding Source: <u>Water Works Enlargement Voted Bonds</u> Bid Opening Date: <u>11/9/11</u> Engineer's Estimate: <u>\$1,798,955.25</u>
Lowest Bidder: <u>\$2,030,919.00</u> Non-Local Lowest Bidder: <u>\$2,072,741.00</u>	

	Conic	Underground Ut.	Eramo	Darby Creek	Danbert	Igel	Fields
<b>Bid Tab Amount:</b>	\$2,030,919.00	\$2,072,741.00	\$2,087,519.83	\$2,094,071.05	\$2,152,560.19	\$2,316,622.22	\$2,696,339.36
<b>Local Company? (Proof s/b included.)</b>	yes	no	yes	no	no	yes	no

<b>FACTORS</b>							
<b>Tier I - Mandatory Factors</b>							
M-1	Bid is responsive (Y or N)	yes	no	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-2	Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-3	Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-4	Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any gov't agency	no	no	no	no	no	no
M-5	Bidder & subs have requisite licenses (Y or N)	yes	no	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-6	Bidder & subs have provided a contract compliance no., or application for one (Y or N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	<b>Proceed to Tier II?</b>	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
<b>Tier II - Creditable Factors</b>							
C-1	Bidder is eligible for local business credit? - (see below for clarification)	yes	no	yes	no	no	yes
C-2	If lowest bidder's business is local, they do receive local credit, as long as there is a non-local bidder. If the lowest bidder's business must include documentation that meets guidelines in bid book, bid must not exceed 5% of the lowest responsive. Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y or N)	no	no	no	no	yes	yes
	Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	NA	3.1%	2.8%	4.1%	7.0%	14.2%
	Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	NA	\$61,822.00	\$56,600.83	\$83,152.05	\$141,641.19	\$285,703.22
	"Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.	no	no	no	no	no	no
	<b>Total Local Credit</b>	1.00%	FALSE	1.00%	FALSE	FALSE	1.00%
	<b>Dollar Value of Credits</b>	\$20,000.00	\$0.00	\$20,000.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$20,000.00
	<b>Evaluated Bid Total:</b>	\$2,010,919.00	\$2,072,741.00	\$2,067,519.83	\$2,094,071.05	\$2,152,560.19	\$2,296,622.22
	<b>Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits</b>	\$2,010,919.00					
	<b>Percent Over Low Bid:</b>	0%	3%	3%	4%	7%	14%
	<b>Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (Le., within 10% of low bid)</b>	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	no
	<b>Proceed to Tier III?</b>	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	no
<b>Tier III - Employer &amp; History Factors</b>							
E-1	Bidder has local workforce? (Y or N)	yes	no	yes	yes	yes	yes
E-2	Bidder is a quality training contractor? (Y or N)	no	no	no	yes	yes	(blank)
E-3	Bidder has health insurance? (Y or N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
E-4	Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y or N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
HE-1	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs	no	no	no	no	no	no
HE-2	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs	no	no	no	no	no	no
HE-3	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds	no	no	no	no	no	no
HE-4	Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years	no	no	no	no	no	no
HE-5	Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud	no	no	no	no	no	no
HE-6	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:						
	A. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	no	no	no	no
	B. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no	yes	no	no	no
	C. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	no	no	no	no
	D. Worker's Compensation Laws	no	no	no	no	no	no
HE-7	Bidder has a record of "willful or serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov)	yes	yes	yes	no	yes	yes
HE-8	Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
HE-9	Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EM	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
HE-10	Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	no	no	no	no	no	no
HE-11	The results of Bidder's references are questionable	no	no	no	no	no	no
	<b>Total Negative History and Experience Factors:</b>	-2	-3	-3	0	-1	-1
	<b>A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited.</b>						
	<b>Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires use of bid book)</b>	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	<b>Proceed to Tier IV?</b>	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
<b>Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)</b>							
R-1	Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete project	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
R-2	Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
R-3	Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
R-4	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for project	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
R-5	Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	<b>Total Number of "Yes" Answers</b>	5	5	5	5	5	5
<b>Division's Recommendation:</b>							
(to be filled in by engineer)							

Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders will be conducted.