

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
 BID EVALUATION FORM
 (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: Public Utilities

CIP Number: 650706-10000

Division: Sanitary

5th Ave Dam Removal and Lower
 Olentangy River Ecosystem Restoration -
 Option A, Alternate 3

Project Name:

Funding Source:

Bid Opening Date:

Engineer's Estimate

OWDA

5/9/12

\$4,576,179.66

Lowest Bidder Amount: \$4,023,223.33
 Non-Local Lowest Bidder Amount: \$4,023,223.33

*Lowest bid should be entered as Bidder 1.		Allard Excavation, LLC	Evans Landscaping, Inc	George J. Igel & Co., Inc.		
	Bid Tab Amount:	\$4,023,223.33	\$5,503,609.66	\$6,259,109.49		
	Local Company? (Proof s/b included.)	No	No	Yes		
FACTORS						
Tier I - Mandatory Factors						
M-1	Bid is responsive (Y or N)	Yes	Yes	Yes		
M-2	Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits (Y or N)	Yes	Yes	Yes		
M-3	Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y or N)	Yes	Yes	Yes		
M-4	Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency (Y or N)	no	no	no		
M-5	Bidder & subs have requisite licenses (Y or N)	Yes	No	Yes		
M-6	Bidder & subs have provided a contract compliance no., or application for one (Y or N)	Yes	Yes	Yes		
	Proceed to Tier II?	yes	no	yes		
Tier II - Creditable Factors						
C-1	Bidder is eligible for local business credit? - (see below for clarification)	no	no	yes		
	If lowest bidder's business is local, they do receive local credit, as long as there is a non-local bidder. If the lowest bidder's business IS NOT local and another bidder's business is local, then the local bidder receives credit. Local credit is 1% of the apparent low, non-local					
C-2	Environmental Preference: To receive preference, bidder must include documentation that meets guidelines in bid book, bid must not exceed 5% of the lowest responsive, responsible, and best bid from any non-preferable bid, and must not exceed \$20,000 of the same.					
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y or N)	Yes	no	Yes		
	Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	NA	0.367960267	0.555744978		
	Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	NA	\$1,480,386.33	\$2,235,886.16		
	Does bidder receive environmental preference? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.	No	no			
	Total Local Credit	FALSE	NA	1.00%		
	Dollar Value of Credits	\$0.00	NA	\$20,000.00		
	Evaluated Bid Total:	\$4,023,223.33	\$5,503,609.66	\$6,259,109.49		
	Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits	\$4,023,223.33				
	Percent Over Low Bid:	0%	37%	56%		
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)	yes	no	no		
	Proceed to Tier III?	yes	no	no		
Tier III - Employer & History Factors						
E-1	Bidder has local workforce? (Y or N)	No				
E-2	Bidder is a quality training contractor? (Y or N)	No				
E-3	Bidder has health insurance? (Y or N)	No				
E-4	Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y or N)	No				
HE-1	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs	no				
HE-2	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs	no				
HE-3	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds	no				
HE-4	Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years	no				
HE-5	Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.	no				
HE-6	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:	no				
	A. Fair Labor Standards Act	no				
	B. Prevailing Wage Laws	no				
	C. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no				
	D. Worker's Compensation Laws	no				
HE-7	Bidder has a record of "willful" or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov)	no				
HE-8	Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation	Yes				
HE-9	Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR	Yes				
HE-10	Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	no				
HE-11	The results of Bidder's references are questionable	no				
	Total Negative History and Experience Factors:	-4	0	0	0	
	A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited.					
	Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)	Yes				
	Proceed to Tier IV?	yes	no	no	no	
Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)						
Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following						
R-1	Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equi	Yes				
R-2	Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project	Yes				
R-3	Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project	Yes				
R-4	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project	Yes				
R-5	Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project	Yes				
	Total Number of "Yes" Answers	5	0	0	0	
Division's Recommendation:		(to be completed by Engineer)				

Department:

Division:

**Lowest Bidder Amount:
Non-Local Lowest Bidder Amount:**

*Lowest bid should be entered as Bidder 1.

**Bid Tab Amount:
Local Company? (Proof s/b included.)**

<u>FACTORS</u>	
<u>Tier I - Mandatory Factors</u>	
M-1	Bid is responsive (Y or N)
M-2	Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits (Y or N)
M-3	Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y or N)
M-4	Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency (Y or N)
M-5	Bidder & subs have requisite licenses (Y or N)
M-6	Bidder & subs have provided a contract compliance no., or application for one (Y or N)
<i>Proceed to Tier II?</i>	
<u>Tier II - Creditable Factors</u>	
C-1	Bidder is eligible for local business credit? - (see below for clarification)
	If lowest bidder's business is local, they do receive local credit, as long as there is a non-local bidder. If the lowest bidder's business IS NOT local and another bidder's business is local, then the local bidder receives credit. Local credit is 1% of the apparent low, non-local
C-2	Environmental Preference: To receive preference, bidder must include documentation that meets guidelines in bid book, bid must not exceed 5% of the lowest responsive, responsible, and best bid from any non-preferable bid, and must not exceed \$20,000 of the same.
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y or N)
	Difference versus lowest bidder (%)
	Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)

	Does bidder receive environmental preference? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.
	Total Local Credit
	Dollar Value of Credits
	Evaluated Bid Total:
	Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits
	Percent Over Low Bid:
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)
	Proceed to Tier III?
	<u>Tier III - Employer & History Factors</u>
E-1	Bidder has local workforce? (Y or N)
E-2	Bidder is a quality training contractor? (Y or N)
E-3	Bidder has health insurance? (Y or N)
E-4	Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y or N)
HE-1	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs
HE-2	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs
HE-3	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds
HE-4	Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years
HE-5	Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.
HE-6	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:
	A. Fair Labor Standards Act
	B. Prevailing Wage Laws
	C. Unemployment Compensation Laws
	D. Worker's Compensation Laws
HE-7	Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov)
HE-8	Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation
HE-9	Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR
HE-10	Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years
HE-11	The results of Bidder's references are questionable
	Total Negative History and Experience Factors:
	A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited.
	Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)
	Proceed to Tier IV?
	<u>Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)</u>
Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following	
R-1	Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equi

R-2	Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project
R-3	Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project
R-4	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project
R-5	Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project
	Total Number of "Yes" Answers
	Division's Recommendation:

Evans Landscaping enter a note for M-5 stating that he was informed by Stantec that a license was not required

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
EVALUATION FORM
(CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Public Utilities

CIP Number: 650706-

5th Ave Dam Ren
Olentangy River Ecos

Sanitary

Project Name: Option B, A

Funding Source: OWI

Bid Opening Date: 5/9/

Engineer's Estimate \$5,594,3

\$4,903,604.71

\$4,903,604.71

	Allard Excavation, LLC	Evans Landscaping, Inc	George J. Igel & Co., Inc.	
	\$4,903,604.71	\$6,916,818.33	\$7,864,630.43	
	No	No	Yes	
	Yes	Yes	Yes	
	Yes	Yes	Yes	
	Yes	Yes	Yes	
	no	no	no	
	Yes	No	Yes	
	Yes	Yes	Yes	
	yes	no	yes	
	no	no	yes	
	Yes	no	Yes	
	NA	0.122359975	0.276430271	
	NA	\$600,004.95	\$1,355,504.78	

Yes			
Yes			
Yes			
Yes			
5		0	0

(to be completed by Engineer)

0	0