

CITY OF COLUMBUS  
BID EVALUATION FORM  
(FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)

Department: Public Utilities  
Division: Electricity

Project: St. Ltg. Impr's. for Indep. Vill. CIP  
Funding Source: Funds 553 &580, OCA 670605  
Bid Opening Date: 30-Nov-05

Low Bid at Opening: \$ 249,495.23  
Non-Local Low Bid at Opening: \$ 278,625.43

|                      |                           |                             |                              |                        |
|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|------------------------------|------------------------|
| Company Name:        | <u>Comp Gen Constr Co</u> | <u>US Utility Contr. Co</u> | <u>Jess Howard Electr Co</u> | <u>MP Dory Company</u> |
| Original Bid Amount: | \$ 249,495.23             | \$ 278,625.43               | \$ 306,885.39                | \$ 408,192.50          |
| Local Company?       | yes                       | no                          | yes                          | yes                    |

**FACTORS**

**Tier I - Mandatory Factors (must have yes for all for bid to qualify)**

|                            |                                                                                                                 |     |     |     |     |    |    |
|----------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|-----|-----|-----|----|----|
| M-1                        | Bid is responsive and meets technical requirements met; affidavit signed (yes needed)                           | yes | yes | yes | yes |    |    |
| M-2                        | Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits (yes needed)                                     | yes | yes | yes | yes |    |    |
| M-3                        | Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (yes needed)                                       | yes | yes | yes | yes |    |    |
| M-4                        | Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with a govt. contracting agency (no needed)                    | no  | no  | no  | no  |    |    |
| M-5                        | Bidder and proposed subcontractors hold valid and applicable licenses and certifications (yes needed)           | yes | yes | yes | yes |    |    |
| M-6                        | Bidder and proposed subcontractors have a valid contract compliance no. or application is attached (yes needed) | yes | yes | yes | yes |    |    |
| <b>Proceed to Tier II?</b> |                                                                                                                 | yes | yes | yes | yes | no | no |

**Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)**

|                                                                                |                                                                              |               |               |               |               |       |       |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------|---------------|---------------|---------------|-------|-------|
| C-1                                                                            | Bidder is eligible for local business credit (yes gives credit)              | yes           | no            | yes           | yes           |       |       |
| C-2                                                                            | Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit (yes gives credit)             | yes           | yes           | yes           | yes           |       |       |
| C-3                                                                            | Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit (yes gives credit) | yes           | yes           | yes           | no            |       |       |
| C-4                                                                            | Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit (yes gives credit)            | yes           | yes           | yes           | yes           |       |       |
| C-5                                                                            | Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit (yes gives credit)  | yes           | yes           | yes           | yes           |       |       |
| <b>Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$100,000 in total)</b> |                                                                              | 5.00%         | 4.00%         | 5.00%         | 4.00%         | 0.00% | 0.00% |
| <b>Dollar Value of Credits</b>                                                 |                                                                              | 12,766        | 9,980         | 12,766        | 10,271        | -     | -     |
| <b>Bid Total:</b>                                                              |                                                                              | \$ 236,729.17 | \$ 268,645.62 | \$ 294,119.33 | \$ 397,921.39 | \$ -  | \$ -  |

**Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits**

|                      |    |            |    |            |    |            |
|----------------------|----|------------|----|------------|----|------------|
| <b>\$ 236,729.17</b> | \$ | 268,645.62 | \$ | 294,113.33 | \$ | 397,921.39 |
|----------------------|----|------------|----|------------|----|------------|

**Percent Over Low Bid:**

|                                                                                 |        |         |         |         |           |           |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------|---------|---------|---------|-----------|-----------|
|                                                                                 | 0.000% | 13.482% | 24.243% | 68.091% | -100.000% | -100.000% |
| <b>Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)</b> | yes    | no      | no      | no      | yes       | yes       |
| <b>Proceed to Tier III?</b>                                                     | yes    | no      | no      | no      | yes       | yes       |

**Tier III - History Experience Factors**

|                                                                                            |                                                                                                                      |     |    |    |    |    |    |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|----|----|----|----|----|
| HE-1                                                                                       | Bidder has a record of non-compliance with the requirements of the City's affirmative action programs (yes gives d   | no  |    |    |    |    |    |
| HE-2                                                                                       | Bidder has a record of non-compliance with all federal, state and local affirmative action programs (yes gives debit | no  |    |    |    |    |    |
| HE-3                                                                                       | Bidder has a record of successful claims against performance bonds (yes gives debit)                                 | no  |    |    |    |    |    |
| HE-4                                                                                       | Bidder has a record of liquidated damages paid within the last 3 years (yes gives debit)                             | no  |    |    |    |    |    |
| HE-5                                                                                       | Bidders principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc. (yes gives debit)          | no  |    |    |    |    |    |
| HE-6                                                                                       | Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years (yes gives debit)                  | no  |    |    |    |    |    |
| HE-7                                                                                       | Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:                                      |     |    |    |    |    |    |
| A.                                                                                         | Fair Labor Standards Act (yes gives debit)                                                                           | no  |    |    |    |    |    |
| B.                                                                                         | Prevailing Wage Laws (yes gives debit)                                                                               | no  |    |    |    |    |    |
| C.                                                                                         | Unemployment Compensation Laws (yes gives debit)                                                                     | no  |    |    |    |    |    |
| D.                                                                                         | Worker's Compensation Laws (yes gives debit)                                                                         | no  |    |    |    |    |    |
| HE-8                                                                                       | Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (yes gives debit)               | yes |    |    |    |    |    |
| HE-9                                                                                       | Bidder has a health and safety plan that is compliant with current OSHA standards (no gives debit)                   | yes |    |    |    |    |    |
| HE-10                                                                                      | Bidder qualifies for a Bureau of Workers Compensation Experience Modification Rating (no gives debit)                | yes |    |    |    |    |    |
| HE-11                                                                                      | Bidder has a record of Environmental Protection Agency violations (yes gives debit)                                  | no  |    |    |    |    |    |
| HE-12                                                                                      | Bidder has supplied satisfactory information on last three completed projects (no gives debit)                       | yes |    |    |    |    |    |
| <b>Total Negative History and Experience Factors:</b>                                      |                                                                                                                      | -1  | 0  | 0  | 0  | 0  | 0  |
| <b>A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited</b> |                                                                                                                      |     |    |    |    |    |    |
| <b>Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome?</b>                                         |                                                                                                                      |     |    |    |    |    |    |
| <b>Proceed to Tier IV?</b>                                                                 |                                                                                                                      | no  | no | no | no | no | no |

**Tier IV - Resource Factors**

Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).

|                                      |                                                                                                                      |   |   |   |   |   |   |
|--------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| R1                                   | Bidder has identified adequate equipment for this project (yes gives one point credit)                               |   |   |   |   |   |   |
| R2                                   | Bidder has identified an adequately experienced management for this project (yes gives one point credit)             |   |   |   |   |   |   |
| R3                                   | Bidder has identified an adequately experienced workforce for this project (yes gives one point credit)              |   |   |   |   |   |   |
| R4                                   | Bidder has indetified safety personnel for this project (yes gives one point credit)                                 |   |   |   |   |   |   |
| R5                                   | Bidder has identified top five current public or private projects currently in progress (yes gives one point credit) |   |   |   |   |   |   |
| <b>Total Number of "Yes" Answers</b> |                                                                                                                      | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |

Division's Recommendation: Complete Gen Constr Co