

CITY OF COLUMBUS BID EVALUATION FORM (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)						
Department: <u>Public Utilities</u>		CIP Number: <u>690236-100063</u>				
Division: <u>Water</u>		Project Name: <u>West Broad Street 12" W.L. Imp's</u>				
Lowest Bidder: <u>\$166,845.97</u>		Funding Source: <u>Water Works Enlargement Voted Bonds</u>				
Non-Local Lowest Bidder: <u>\$166,845.97</u>		Bid Opening Date: <u>6/27/12</u>				
		Engineer's Estimate: <u>\$202,367.00</u>				
Bid Tab Amount:		<u>Darby Creek</u>	<u>Danbert</u>	<u>Shelly & Sands</u>	<u>Conic</u>	<u>Cols. Asphalt Pav.</u>
Local Company? (Proof s/h included.)		\$166,845.97 no	\$216,680.20 no	\$224,361.50 yes	\$237,600.00 yes	\$294,170.80 yes
NON-RESPONSIVE						
FACTORS						
Tier I - Mandatory Factors						
M-1	Bid is responsive (Y or N)	yes	yes	no	yes	yes
M-2	Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-3	Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-4	Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any go	no	no	no	no	no
M-5	Bidder & subs have requisite licenses (Y or N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-6	Bidder & subs have provided a contract compliance no., or application for one (Y or N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	<i>Proceed to Tier II?</i>	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
Tier II - Creditable Factors						
C-1	Bidder is eligible for local business credit? - (see below for clarification)	no	no	yes	yes	yes
	If lowest bidder's business is local, they do receive local credit, as long as there is a non-local bidder. If the lowest bidder's business					
C-2	Environmental Preference: To receive preference, bidder must include documentation that meets guidelines in bid					
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y or N)	no	yes	no	yes	no
	Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	NA	29.9%	33.5%	41.4%	75.3%
	Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	NA	\$49,834.23	\$55,847.07	\$69,085.57	\$125,656.37
	Does bidder receive environmental preference? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.	no	no	no	no	no
	Total Local Credit	FALSE	FALSE	1.00%	1.00%	1.00%
	Dollar Value of Credits	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$1,668.46	\$1,668.46	\$1,668.46
	Evaluated Bid Total:	\$166,845.97	\$216,680.20	\$222,693.04	\$235,931.54	\$292,502.34
	Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits	\$166,845.97				
	Percent Over Low Bid:	0%	30%	33%	41%	75%
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low b	yes	no	no	no	no
	<i>Proceed to Tier III?</i>	yes	no	yes	yes	yes
Tier III - Employer & History Factors						
E-1	Bidder has local workforce? (Y or N)	yes	no	yes	yes	yes
E-2	Bidder is a quality training contractor? (Y or N)	yes	yes	yes	no	yes
E-3	Bidder has health insurance? (Y or N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
E-4	Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y or N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
HE-1	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs	no	no	no	no	no
HE-2	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs	no	no	no	no	no
HE-3	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds	no	no	no	no	no
HE-4	Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years	no	no	no	no	no
HE-5	Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fra	no	no	no	no	no
HE-6	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with	no	no	no	no	no
	A. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	no	no	no
	B. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no	no	no	no
	C. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	no	no	no
	D. Worker's Compensation Laws	no	no	no	no	no
HE-7	Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov)	no	no	yes	yes	no
HE-8	Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting	yes	yes	yes	yes	no
HE-9	Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EM	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
HE-10	Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	no	no	no	no	no
HE-11	The results of Bidder's references are questionable	no	no	no	no	no
	Total Negative History and Experience Factors:	0	-1	-1	-2	-1
	A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited.					
	Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)		yes	yes	yes	yes
	<i>Proceed to Tier IV?</i>	no	yes	yes	yes	yes
Tier IV - Resource Factors (ves answers desirable)						
Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).						
R-1	Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably comple	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
R-2	Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure com	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
R-3	Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
R-4	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for t	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
R-5	Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on th	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Total Number of "Yes" Answers	5	5	5	5	5
Division's Recommendation:		Darby Creek Excavating, Inc.				