CITY OF COLUMBUS BID EVALUATION FORM (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)											
	Department: Division:	Public Utilities		CIP Number:		1784					
	DIVISION:	Power & Water		Project Name: Funding Source:		Relocation Phase II Bond					
				Bid Opening Date:		25,2009					
	Low Bid at Opening:	\$215,919.00		Engineer's Estimate:	\$250,0						
	Non-Local Low Bid at Opening:	\$215,919.00		-							
	Original Bid Amount:	US Utility Contractor	Vaughn Industries								
-	Local Company?	\$215,919.00 no	\$231,473.00 no								
	Local Company:	110	110								
	<u>FACTORS</u>										
	Tier I - Mandatory Factors										
M-1 M-2	Bidd is responsive Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits	yes	yes yes								
M-3	Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	yes yes	no yes								
M-4	Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency	no	no								
M-5	Bidder has requisite licenses	yes	yes								
M-6	Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one	yes	yes			-					
	Proceed to Tier II?	yes	no	no	no						
<u> </u>	Tier II - Creditable Factors (C1-C5 each yes answer gives 1% credit)										
C-1	Bidder is eliqible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)	no	no	no	no						
C-1	Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit	yes	no no	no	no						
C-3	Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit	yes	yes								
C-4	Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit	yes	no								
	% of insurance provided by company	100.00%									
C-5	Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit	yes	no								
	% of retirement or pension plan provided by company	100.00%									
C-6	Bidder is eligible for environmental preference	yes	no								
	Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$120,000 in total) Dollar Value of Credits	4.00% \$8,636.76	NA NA	NA NA	NA NA						
	Bid Total:	\$8,636.76 \$207,282.24	\$231,473.00	NA NA	NA NA						
	Bid Total.	\$201,202.24	\$231,473.00	IVA	NA NA						
	Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits	\$207,282.24									
	Percent Over Low Bid:	0.000%	11.670%	#VALUE!	#VALUE!						
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 5% of low bid after credits)	yes	no	#VALUE!	#VALUE!						
	Proceed to Tier III?	yes	no	#VALUE!	#VALUE!						
	Tion III . History Fymasianaa Fastasa										
HE-1	Tier III - History Experience Factors Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs	no									
	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs	no									
	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds	no									
	Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years	no									
	Prinicipals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.	no									
	Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years	no									
HE-7	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following: A. Fair Labor Standards Act										
-	A. Fair Labor Standards Act B. Prevailing Wage Laws	no no									
	C. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no									
	D. Worker's Compensation Laws	no									
	Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (OSHA.gov)	no									
	Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation	yes									
	Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR	yes									
	Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years The results of Bidder's references are questionable.	no									
пс-12	The results of Bidder's references are questionable Total Negative History and Experience Factors:	no 0		0	0						
	A negative ristory and experience factors: A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited	U		U	U						
	Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)										
	Proceed to Tier IV?	no	no	no	no						
						<u> </u>					
L.	Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)										
	Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field										
through R-1	n application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment)	rollowing which, the City will s	select a contractor (s).								
R-1	Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project										
R-3	Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project										
R-4	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project										
R-5	Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project	<u> </u>									
<u> </u>	Total Number of "Yes" Answers	0	0	0	0						
<u> </u>	Distribute Decrees on declara		S Utility Contractor Co., In								
	Division's Recommendation:										

		CITY OF COLUMBUS BID EVALUATION FORM							
		CONTRACTS OVER \$20,0	00)						
	Department: Division:	Public Utilities Sewerage and Drainage		CIP Number: Project Name: Funding Source:	610744 Parkside Road Storm Storm Sewer	Bond Fund			
	Low Bid at Opening: Non-Local Low Bid at Opening:	\$ 554,187.00 \$ 883,207.20		Bid Opening Date: Engineer's Estimate:	08/31/2	1,998,675.00			
	Non-Local Low Did at Opening.	COMPANY NAME							
				\$ 677,561.40 \$			\$ 671,967.00		
	Local Company? FACTORS	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
	Tier I - Mandatory Factors								
M-1 M-2	Bid is responsive Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits	yes yes	yes yes	yes ves	yes ves	yes ves	yes ves	yes yes	yes yes
M-3	Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-4	Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency Bidder has requisite licenses	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
M-5 M-6	Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one	yes yes	ves	yes yes	yes yes	yes yes	yes yes	ves ves	yes yes
" "	Proceed to Tier II?	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)								
C-1 C-2	Bidder is eliqible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid) Bidder is eliqible for local workforce credit	yes ves	yes ves	yes ves	yes ves	no ves	ves ves	yes ves	yes
C-2	Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit	yes ves	yes ves	yes	yes no	yes no	yes yes	yes	yes ves
C-4	Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
C-5	% of insurance provided by company Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit	100.00% ves	100.00% ves	100.00% ves	60.00% ves	75.00% ves	100.00% ves	100.00% ves	100.00% ves
	% of retirement or pension plan provided by company	3.00%	100.00%	100.00%	100.00%	50.00%	100.00%	100.00%	100.00%
C-6	Bidder is eligible for environmental preference Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$120,000 in total)	no 5.00%	yes 5.00%	5.00%	yes 4.00%	no 3.00%	5.00%	5.00%	5.00%
	Dollar Value of Credits	31,000	31,000	31,000	25,458	16,626	31,000	31,000	31,000
	Bid Total:	523,187.45	640,967.45	646,561.85	844,522.88	866,581.59	640,967.45	640,967.45	640,967.45
		\$ 523,187.45							
	Percent Over Low Bid: Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 5% of low bid after credits)	0.000%	22.512% no	23.581% no	61.419% no	65.635% no	22.512% no	22.512% no	22.512% no
	Proceed to Tier III?	yes yes	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
	Tier III - History Experience Factors								
HE-1	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs	no							
HE-2	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs	no							
HE-3 HE-4	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years	no no							
HE-5	Prinicipals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.	no							
	Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:	no							
/112-7	A. Fair Labor Standards Act	no							
	B. Prevailing Wage Laws C. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no no							
	D. Worker's Compensation Laws	no no							
	Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years	no							
	Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR	yes yes							
HE-11	Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	no							
HE12	The results of Bidder's references are questionable Total Negative History and Experience Factors:	no 0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
	A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited	_	•	·	v	·	·	•	Ĭ
	Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input) Proceed to Tier IV?	yes yes	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
		you							
Note:	<u>Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)</u> Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The	e field of eligible bidders will b	ne determined						
throug	h application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be condu	icted, following which, the Ci							
R-1 R-2	Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment) Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project	yes yes							
R-3	Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project	yes							
R-4 R-5	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project	yes yes							
n-9	Total Number of "Yes" Answers	yes 5	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
	Division's Recommendation:		Storts Ecavation, Inc.						
	Division's Recommendation:		Otoris Ecavation, inc.						