

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
BID EVALUATION FORM
(FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

ORD# 1461-2006

| | | | |
|-------------------------------|---------------------|----------------------|------------------------------------|
| Department: | Public Utilities | Project: | Hague Avenue Drainage Improvements |
| Division: | Sewerage & Drainage | Funding Source: | Storm Bond Fund |
| Low Bid at Opening: | \$ 355,622.52 | Bid Opening Date: | 2-Aug-06 |
| Non-Local Low Bid at Opening: | \$ - | Engineer's Estimate: | |

| | COMPANY NAME | | |
|----------------------|------------------|------------------|-------------------|
| | Complete General | N M Savko & Sons | Storts Excavation |
| Original Bid Amount: | \$ 355,622.52 | \$ 392,217.12 | \$ 395,106.00 |
| Local Company? | Yes | Yes | Yes |

FACTORS

| Tier I - Mandatory Factors | | | |
|----------------------------|--|------------|------------|
| M-1 | Bid is responsive | Yes | Yes |
| M-2 | Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits | Yes | Yes |
| M-3 | Bidder will make financial statements available upon request | Yes | Yes |
| M-4 | Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency | no | no |
| M-5 | Bidder has requisite licenses | Yes | Yes |
| M-6 | Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one | Yes | Yes |
| | Proceed to Tier II? | yes | yes |

| Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit) | | | |
|--|--|------------|------------|
| C-1 | Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid) | yes | yes |
| C-2 | Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit | yes | yes |
| C-3 | Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit | yes | no |
| C-4 | Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit | yes | yes |
| | <i>% of insurance provided by company</i> | 100.00% | 60.00% |
| C-5 | Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit | yes | yes |
| | <i>% of retirement or pension plan provided by company</i> | 100.00% | 100.00% |
| | Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$100,000 in total) | 5.00% | 4.00% |
| | Dollar Value of Credits | 14,225 | 10,669 |
| | Bid Total: | 341,397.62 | 381,548.44 |

| | | | |
|--|---|----------------------|-----------|
| | Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits | \$ 341,397.62 | |
| | Percent Over Low Bid: | 0.000% | 11.761% |
| | Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits) | yes | no |
| | Proceed to Tier III? | yes | no |

| Tier III - History Experience Factors | | | |
|---------------------------------------|---|------------|------------|
| HE-1 | Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs | no | no |
| HE-2 | Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs | no | no |
| HE-3 | Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds | no | no |
| HE-4 | Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years | no | no |
| HE-5 | Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc. | no | no |
| HE-6 | Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years | no | no |
| HE-7 | Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following: | | |
| | A. Fair Labor Standards Act | no | no |
| | B. Prevailing Wage Laws | no | no |
| | C. Unemployment Compensation Laws | no | no |
| | D. Worker's Compensation Laws | no | no |
| HE-8 | Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years | yes | yes |
| HE-9 | Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation | yes | yes |
| HE-10 | Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR | yes | yes |
| HE-11 | Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years | no | yes |
| HE-12 | The results of Bidder's references are questionable | no | no |
| | Total Negative History and Experience Factors: | -1 | -2 |
| | A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited | | |
| | Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input) | yes | yes |
| | Proceed to Tier IV? | yes | yes |

Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)

| | | | |
|---|--|----------|----------|
| Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s). | | | |
| R-1 | Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment) | yes | yes |
| R-2 | Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project | yes | yes |
| R-3 | Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project | yes | yes |
| R-4 | Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project | yes | yes |
| R-5 | Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project | yes | yes |
| | Total Number of "Yes" Answers | 5 | 5 |

Division's Recommendation: Complete General Construction Company

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
 BID EVALUATION FORM
 (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: _____
 Division: _____

Project: Betterments
 Funding Source: Sewer Enterprise
 Bid Opening Date: 26-Jan-05
 Engineer's Estimate: \$ 525,000.00

Low Bid at Opening: \$ 500,000.00
 Non-Local Low Bid at Opening: \$ 490,000.00

| | | COMPANY NAME | | | | |
|----------------------|----|--------------|---------------|---------------|-----------|-----------|
| | | Company A | Company B | Company C | Company 4 | Company 5 |
| Original Bid Amount: | \$ | 500,000.00 | \$ 490,000.00 | \$ 525,000.00 | \$ - | \$ - |
| Local Company? | | yes | no | yes | no | no |

FACTORS

Tier I - Mandatory Factors

| | | | | | | |
|-----|--|------------|------------|------------|-----------|-----------|
| M-1 | Bid is responsive | yes | yes | yes | | |
| M-2 | Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits | yes | yes | yes | | |
| M-3 | Bidder will make financial statements available upon request | yes | yes | yes | | |
| M-4 | Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency | no | no | no | | |
| M-5 | Bidder has requisite licenses | yes | yes | yes | | |
| M-6 | Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one | yes | yes | yes | | |
| | Proceed to Tier II? | yes | yes | yes | no | no |

Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)

| | | | | | | |
|-----|--|------------|------------|------------|----|----|
| C-1 | Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid) | yes | no | yes | no | no |
| C-2 | Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit | yes | no | yes | | |
| C-3 | Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit | no | no | yes | | |
| C-4 | Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit | yes | yes | yes | | |
| | <i>% of insurance provided by company</i> | 50.00% | 50.00% | 50.00% | | |
| C-5 | Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit | yes | yes | yes | | |
| | <i>% of retirement or pension plan provided by company</i> | | | | | |
| | Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$100,000 in total) | 4.00% | 3.00% | 4.00% | NA | NA |
| | Dollar Value of Credits | 19,900 | 15,000 | 19,900 | NA | NA |
| | Bid Total: | 480,100.00 | 475,000.00 | 505,100.00 | NA | NA |

Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits

\$ 475,000.00

Percent Over Low Bid:

1.074% 0.000% 6.337% #VALUE! #VALUE!

Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (Le., within 10% of low bid after credits)

Proceed to Tier III? yes yes yes #VALUE! #VALUE!

Tier III - History Experience Factors

| | | | | | | |
|-------|---|----------|-----------|-----------|----------|----------|
| HE-1 | Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs | no | no | no | | |
| HE-2 | Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs | no | no | no | | |
| HE-3 | Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds | no | no | no | | |
| HE-4 | Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years | no | no | yes | | |
| HE-5 | Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc. | no | no | no | | |
| HE-6 | Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years | no | no | no | | |
| HE-7 | Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following: | no | yes | yes | | |
| | A. Fair Labor Standards Act | no | no | no | | |
| | B. Prevailing Wage Laws | no | no | no | | |
| | C. Unemployment Compensation Laws | no | no | no | | |
| | D. Worker's Compensation Laws | no | no | no | | |
| HE-8 | Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years | no | no | no | | |
| HE-9 | Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation | yes | no | no | | |
| HE-10 | Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR | yes | yes | no | | |
| HE-11 | Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years | no | no | no | | |
| HE-12 | The results of Bidder's references are questionable | no | no | no | | |
| | Total Negative History and Experience Factors: | 0 | -1 | -3 | 0 | 0 |
| | A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited | | | | | |
| | Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input) | yes | yes | no | | |
| | Proceed to Tier IV? | yes | yes | no | no | no |

Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)

| | | | | | | |
|---|--|----------|----------|----------|----------|----------|
| Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s). | | | | | | |
| R1 | Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment) | yes | yes | | | |
| R2 | Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project | yes | yes | | | |
| R3 | Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project | yes | yes | | | |
| R4 | Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project | yes | yes | | | |
| R5 | Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project | yes | yes | | | |
| | Total Number of "Yes" Answers | 5 | 5 | 0 | 0 | 0 |

Division's Recommendation: _____

Bidder's management resources have sufficient experience