

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
BID EVALUATION FORM
(FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: Public Utilities
Division: Power

CIP Number:
Project Name:
Funding Source:
Bid Opening Date:
Engineer's Estimate

Lowest, Best, Most Responsive, Responsible Bid Tab Amount: \$2,160,620.98

Vendor Name: **Complete General** **Tip-Dan** **Jess Howard** **US Utility**
Bid Tab Amount: \$207,543.70 \$219,026.60 \$251,998.88 \$280,980.75

FACTORS					
(Pgs.6-7) & Form 1 (Pg. 10) - Contract Compliance	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	No	No	No	No
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0
Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regu					
	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with t				
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	No	No	No	No
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	No	No	No	No
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	No	No	No	No
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	No	No	No	No
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs	No	No	No	No
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EM	Yes	No	Yes	Yes
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
	Negative Factors:	0	-1	0	0
Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:					
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov)	No	No	No	No
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSH	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	No	No	No	No
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0
Form 5 - Debarment					
	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years	No	No	No	No
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0
Form 6 - Local Workforce					
	1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	59.0%	80.0%	95.0%	65.0%
	Negative Factors:				
Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs					
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	ER: 100%	90% - 10%	32% - 68%	75% - 25%
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	ER: 100%	ER: 3% match up to 3% of gross wages	ER: 3% match up to 12% of gross wages	ER: 3% match up to 10% of gross wages
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0
Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs					
	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	Yes	No	Yes	Yes
	Negative Factors:	0	-1	0	0
Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED					
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED					
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	Yes	"N/A"	Yes	"N/A"
Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control					
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construc	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Form 12 - Availability					
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates					
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requir	No	No	No	No
	License and/or Certificate No:	Electrical Contractor E2855	None listed	None listed	Electrical Contractor #24800
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0

Vendor Name:		Complete General	Tip-Dan	Jess Howard	US Utility
Bid Tab Amount:		\$207,543.70	\$219,026.60	\$251,998.88	\$280,980.75
Lowest Bid Dollar of non-environmental preferred bidder		\$219,026.60			
Percent Over Low Bid:		-5%	0%	15%	28%
Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid)		yes	yes	no	no
Pg. 28- Environmental Preference					
Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)		Yes	No	No	No
Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%)		-5.24%	0.00%	15.05%	28.29%
Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (\$)		(\$11,482.90)	\$0.00	\$32,972.28	\$61,954.15
Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid.		Yes	No	No	No
If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified?					
Pgs. 29-32 - Statements and Affidavits					
Statement 1: Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)		Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Statement 2: Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)		Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Statement 3: Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)		Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Affidavit Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized		Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Negative Factors:		0	0	0	0
Pg. 45 - Addenda Acknlgmt. Proposal (Pg. 46) - Proposal Signature					
Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)		Yes	No	Yes	Yes
Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)		Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Negative Factors:		0	-1	0	0
Pg. 43 - Proposal Bond					
Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)		Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)		Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)		Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Coverage (Y/N)		Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Negative Factors:		0	0	0	0
Grand Total Negative Factors:		0	-3	0	0
Division's Recommendation:					

Additional Evaluation Questions for Non-Responsive Proposals per Section 102.08, not covered above in RED.

1)	Has the bidder submitted more than one proposal under the same name/subsidiary? (Y/N)				
2)	Are the bid prices material unbalanced? (Y/N)				
3)	Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not provided in the bid documents? (Y/N)				
4)	Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all material respects, and does not contain irregularities or deviations? (Y/N)				
5)	Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to accept or reject an award? (Y/N)				
6)	Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract item listed? (Y/N)				
7)	Did the bidder fail to submit a lump sum price where required? (Y/N)				
Negative Factors:		0	0	0	0

Department:	670774-100000
Division:	SL 3-Wire Conversion
	Power Bonds
	1/22/14
Lowest, Best, Most Responsive, Responsible Bid Tab Amount:	\$131,956.50
Vendor Name:	Perram
Bid Tab Amount:	\$370,258.20

FACTORS		
<u>(Pgs.6-7) & Form 1 (Pg. 10) - Contract Compliance</u>	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	Yes
<u>Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages</u>	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	No
	Negative Factors:	0
Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations		
	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:	
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	No
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	No
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	No
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	No
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs	No
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EM	Yes
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	Yes
	Negative Factors:	0
Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:		
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov)	No
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA	Yes
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	Yes
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	Yes
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	No
	Negative Factors:	0
<u>Form 5 - Debarment</u>	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years	No
	Negative Factors:	0
<u>Form 6 - Local Workforce</u>	1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	0.0%
	Negative Factors:	
Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs		
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	Yes
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	75% - 25%
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	Yes
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	ER: 100%
	Negative Factors:	0
<u>Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs</u>	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	Yes
	Negative Factors:	0
Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED		
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	Yes
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	Yes
Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED		
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	Yes
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	Yes
Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control		
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects	Yes
Form 12 - Availability		
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	Yes
Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates		
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	Yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements	No
	License and/or Certificate No:	Ohio Electrical Contractor Columbus Electrical Contractor
	Negative Factors:	0

	Vendor Name:	Perram
	Bid Tab Amount:	\$370,258.20
	Lowest Bid Dollar of non-environmental preferred bidder	
	Percent Over Low Bid:	69%
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid)	no
<i>Pg. 28- Environmental Preference</i>		
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	No
	Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%)	69.05%
	Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (\$)	\$151,231.60
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid.	No
	If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified?	
<i>Pgs. 29-32 - Statements and Affidavits</i>		
Statement 1:	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	Yes
Statement 2:	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	Yes
Statement 3:	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	Yes
Affidavit	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized	Yes
	Negative Factors:	0
<i>Pg. 45 - Addenda Acknlgmt.</i>		
	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)	Yes
<i>Proposal (Pg. 46) - Proposal Signature</i>		
	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	Yes
	Negative Factors:	0
<i>Pg. 43 - Proposal Bond</i>		
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	Yes
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	Yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	Yes
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Coverage (Y/N)	Yes
	Negative Factors:	0
	Grand Total Negative Factors:	0
	Division's Recommendation:	

Additional Evaluation Questions for Non-Responsive Proposals per Section 1533.02

1)	Has the bidder submitted more than one proposal under the same name/subsidiary? (Y/N)	
2)	Are the bid prices material unbalanced? (Y/N)	
3)	Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not provided in the bid documents? (Y/N)	
4)	Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all material respects, and does not contain irregularities or deviations? (Y/N)	
5)	Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to accept or reject an award? (Y/N)	
6)	Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract item listed? (Y/N)	
7)	Did the bidder fail to submit a lump sum price where required? (Y/N)	
	Negative Factors:	0