

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
 BID EVALUATION FORM
 (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

| Department: Public Utilities | | Division: Water | | CIP Number: 690236-100038 | | Project Name: Near East Area Water Line Imp's | | Funding Source: Water Build America Bonds Fund | | Bid Opening Date: 3/16/11 | | Engineer's Estimate: \$2,059,970.00 | |
|--|---|---|-----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------|---|-----------------------|--|-----------------------|---------------------------|------------|-------------------------------------|--|
| Lowest Bidder: \$1,499,656.13 | | Non-Local Lowest Bidder: \$1,499,656.13 | | Beheler | Darby Creek | Conie | Danbert | Eramo | Igel | Cols. Asp. Pay. | McDaniel's | Underground | |
| Bid Tab Amount: | | \$1,499,656.13 | \$1,688,655.01 | \$1,755,619.14 | \$1,872,458.50 | \$2,008,142.40 | \$2,050,343.30 | \$2,119,260.94 | \$2,387,353.21 | \$2,624,649.61 | | | |
| Local Company? (Proof s/b included.) | | No | no | yes | no | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | no | |
| FACTORS | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Tier I - Mandatory Factors | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| M-1 | Bid is responsive (Y or N) | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | |
| M-2 | Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits (Y or N) | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | |
| M-3 | Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y or N) | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | |
| M-4 | Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency (Y or N) | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | |
| M-5 | Bidder & subs have requisite licenses (Y or N) | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | |
| M-6 | Bidder & subs have provided a contract compliance no., or application for one (Y or N) | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | |
| | Proceed to Tier II? | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | |
| Tier II - Creditable Factors | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| C-1 | Bidder is eligible for local credit? - (see below for clarification) | no | no | yes | no | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | no | |
| | If lowest bidder is local, they do receive local credit, as long as there is a non-local bidder. If the lowest bidder IS NOT local and another bidder is local, then the local bidder receives credit. Local credit is 1% of the apparent low, non-local bidder. | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| C-2 | Environmental Preference: To receive preference, bidder must include documentation that meets guidelines in bid book, bid must not exceed 5% of the lowest responsive, responsible, and best bid from any non-preferable bid, and must not exceed \$20,000 of the same. | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y or N) | no | no | no | yes | no | yes | yes | yes | no | no | no | |
| | Difference versus lowest bidder (%) | NA | 12.60% | 17.07% | 24.86% | 33.91% | 36.72% | 41.32% | 59.19% | 75.02% | | | |
| | Difference versus lowest bidder (\$) | NA | \$188,998.88 | \$255,963.01 | \$372,802.37 | \$508,486.27 | \$550,687.17 | \$619,604.81 | \$887,697.08 | \$1,124,993.48 | | | |
| | Does bidder receive environmental preference? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid. | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | |
| | Total Local Credit | FALSE | FALSE | 1.00% | FALSE | 1.00% | 1.00% | 1.00% | 1.00% | 1.00% | FALSE | FALSE | |
| | Dollar Value of Credits | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$14,996.56 | \$0.00 | \$14,996.56 | \$14,996.56 | \$14,996.56 | \$14,996.56 | \$14,996.56 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | |
| | Evaluated Bid Total: | \$1,499,656.13 | \$1,688,655.01 | \$1,740,622.58 | \$1,872,458.50 | \$1,993,145.84 | \$2,035,346.74 | \$2,104,264.38 | \$2,372,356.65 | \$2,624,649.61 | | | |
| | Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits | \$1,499,656.13 | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | Percent Over Low Bid: | 0% | 13% | 16% | 25% | 33% | 36% | 40% | 58% | 75% | | | |
| | Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('Le., within 10% of low bid after credits) | yes | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | |
| | Proceed to Tier III? | yes | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | |
| Tier III - Employer & History Factors | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| E-1 | Bidder has local workforce? (Y or N) | no | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | no | |
| E-2 | Bidder is a quality training contractor? (Y or N) | no | yes | no | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | no | |
| E-3 | Bidder has health insurance? (Y or N) | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | |
| E-4 | Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y or N) | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | |
| HE-1 | Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | |
| HE-2 | Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | |
| HE-3 | Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | |
| HE-4 | Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | |
| HE-5 | Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc. | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | |
| HE-6 | Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following: | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | |
| | A. Fair Labor Standards Act | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | |
| | B. Prevailing Wage Laws | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | |
| | C. Unemployment Compensation Laws | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | |
| | D. Worker's Compensation Laws | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | |
| HE-7 | Bidder has a record of "willful or serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) | yes | no | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | no | no | no | yes | |
| HE-8 | Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | |
| HE-9 | Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers' Compensation EMR | no | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | |
| HE-10 | Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | |
| HE-11 | The results of Bidder's references are questionable. | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | |
| | Total Negative History and Experience Factors: | -4 | 0 | -2 | -1 | -1 | -1 | 0 | 0 | -3 | | | |
| | A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited. | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input) | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | |
| | Proceed to Tier IV? | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | |
| Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable) | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| R-1 | Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment) | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | |
| R-2 | Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project | yes | yes | yes | yes | "TBD" | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | |
| R-3 | Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | |
| R-4 | Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | |
| R-5 | Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | |
| | Total Number of "Yes" Answers | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | |
| Division's Recommendation: | | | | | | Beheler Excavating, Inc. | | | | | | | |