

From: [Davies, Tracie R.](#)
To: [Crawford, Thomas L.](#)
Cc: [Austin, Patti A.](#); [Bell, Timothy A.](#); [Bowman, Randall](#); [Cordetti, Steven R.](#); [Crabill, Melanie J.](#); [Figley, Russ U.](#); [Giffin, Benjamin M.](#); [Johnson, Daniel L.](#); [Lewis, William A.](#); [Miller Jr, Richard A.](#); [O'Callaghan, Timothy L.](#); [Palmer, Tierra L.](#); [Parks, Duane M.](#); [Roberts, Doug](#); [Stephens, Thomas H.](#); [Tilton, Rick C.](#); [Wentzel, Steve J.](#); [Zahran, Hassan Y.](#); [Bauman, Max A.](#); [Cofield, Alex A.](#); [Gallagher, Jennifer L.](#); [Dussault, Kathleen E.](#); [Moran, Alan P.](#); [Mackey, David B.](#); [Sexton, Michael E.](#); [Popa, Nicholas J.](#)
Subject: RE: RECOMMENDATION: Roadway Improvements - Multimodal Transportation Plan
Date: Wednesday, April 30, 2014 1:56:16 PM

I Approve of the committee's recommendation, Nelson\Nygaard.

Thanks, Tracie

From: Crawford, Thomas L.
Sent: Wednesday, April 30, 2014 12:24 PM
To: Davies, Tracie R.
Cc: Austin, Patti A.; Bell, Timothy A.; Bowman, Randall; Cordetti, Steven R.; Crabill, Melanie J.; Figley, Russ U.; Giffin, Benjamin M.; Johnson, Daniel L.; Lewis, William A.; Miller Jr, Richard A.; O'Callaghan, Timothy L.; Palmer, Tierra L.; Parks, Duane M.; Roberts, Doug; Stephens, Thomas H.; Tilton, Rick C.; Wentzel, Steve J.; Zahran, Hassan Y.; Bauman, Max A.; Cofield, Alex A.; Gallagher, Jennifer L.; Dussault, Kathleen E.; Moran, Alan P.; Mackey, David B.; Sexton, Michael E.; Popa, Nicholas J.
Subject: RECOMMENDATION: Roadway Improvements - Multimodal Transportation Plan

To: Tracie Davies, Director
Department of Public Service

From: Tom Crawford, Capital Fiscal Manager

Date: April 30, 2014

Subject: Roadway Improvements - Multimodal Transportation Plan

The Department of Public Service solicited Requests for Proposals for the Roadway Improvements - Multimodal Transportation Plan project. The recommendation is to award Nelson\Nygaard, the consultant that was scored the highest by the selection committee and that was recommended by the selection committee after oral interviews. Details concerning the recommendation are below. Please respond to this e-mail either approving the recommended consultant or approving another consultant. If you approve another consultant please provide an explanation.

TC

The Department of Public Service is initiating a procurement effort that will result in the award and execution of a professional services contract related to the development of a comprehensive city-wide multimodal transportation master plan. The purpose of that comprehensive planning document, referred to as the Columbus Multimodal Transportation Plan (CMTP), is to clearly explain City transportation planning and design policy and standards and to establish multimodal priorities for roadways in the City of Columbus. The contract shall be funded from DPS' 2014 CIB.

The project was formally advertised on the Vendor Services web site from March 13, 2014, to April 15, 2014. The city received five (5) responses. All proposals were deemed responsive and were fully evaluated when the Evaluation Committee met on April 18, 2014. The responding firms were:

CONSULTANT Sub-consultant	Business Enterprise Status	Contract Compliance Number	Active	% OF WORK	% MAJ. % OTH.
Nelson\Nygaard	MAJ	34- 6546916	Y	60%	88% MAJ 12% OTH
MKSK, LLC	MAJ	45- 3413259	Y	8%	
EMH&T	MAJ	31- 0685594	Y	5%	
Michael Baker Jr., Inc.	MAJ	25- 1228638	Y	15%	
Griffin Communications	FBE	31- 1749824	Y	7%	
LPrice & Associates	MBE	86- 1106765	Y	5%	
Parsons Brinckerhoff	MAJ	38- 2498712	No matching record found	63%	82% MAJ 18% OTH
Isaac Wiles	MAJ	46- 2503333	Not registered	2%	
Lawhon & Associates, Inc.	FBE	31- 1153141	Y	13%	
MKSK, LLC	MAJ	45- 3413259	Y	3%	
PolicyWorks	MBE	30- 0193496	Y	5%	
Sprinkle Consulting	MAJ	59- 2200597	Not registered	10%	
T & M Associates	MAJ	22- 1806708	Y	4%	
Stantec Consulting Services Inc.	MAJ	11- 2157170	No matching record found	40%	89% MAJ 5% PHC 6% OTH
ms consultants	MAJ	34- 6546916	Y	10%	
HDR Engineering Inc.	PHC	47- 0680568	Y	5%	
Resource International, Inc.	FBE	31- 0669793	Y	6%	

Alta Planning + Design	MAJ	68-0465555	Y	6%	
planning NEXT	MAJ	27-4000525	Y	5%	
Miller Public Relations, LLC	MAJ	N/A	Not registered	5%	1
Project for Public Spaces (PPS)	MAJ	N/A	Not registered	3%	
Kostelec Planning, LLC	MAJ	N/A	Not registered	4%	
Mofatt & Nichol	MAJ	N/A	Not registered	3%	
Suzann Rhodes, LLC	MAJ	N/A	Not registered	5%	
Urban3, LLC	MAJ	N/A	Not registered	3%	
Strong Towns	MAJ	N/A	Not registered	3%	
Fahlgren Mortine	MAJ	55-0736802	Y	2%	
TEC Engineering, Inc.	MAJ	31-1679658	Y	60%	100% MAJ
MKSK, LLC	MAJ	45-3413259	Y	40%	
TranSystems Corporation of Ohio	PHC	43-0839725	Y	60%	60% PHC 25% MAJ 15% OTH
DLZ Ohio, Inc.	MBR	31-1268980	Y	15%	
CDM Smith Inc.	MAJ	04-2473650	Y	10%	
OHM Advisors	MAJ	38-1691323	Y	10%	
Aimpoint Research, LLC	MAJ	46-1879075	Y	3%	
Alta Planning + Design	MAJ	68-0465555	Y	2%	

This RFP Evaluation Committee included three (3) voting members from the Department of Public Service, Jennifer Gallagher, Randy Bowman, and Patti Austin. Non-voting members, but attendees, included Tierra Palmer. A representative of EBOCO was invited but did not attend.

The following is a list of the results of the Evaluation Committee's initial assessment of the five evaluated proposals for selection.

Nelson\Nygaard	84.00
Stantec	82.00
Parsons Brinckerhoff	77.33
TranSystems	74.00
TEC Engineering	55.33

The three (3) highest-scoring offerors—Nelson\Nygaard, Stantec, and Parsons Brinckerhoff—were invited to participate in oral interviews with the Evaluation Committee on April 28, 2014.

Following those presentations, the Committee would like to submit Nelson\Nygaard for the Director's review and recommendation for the following reasons:

1. Their presentation of approach on considering access management in this effort was well-received.
2. The Committee also liked their discussion of the trade-offs of modes in the planning effort (i.e., the notion that not every mode can or should be accommodated on every street).
3. Their team seemed familiar with the planning efforts being conducted by COTA and DPU (e.g., Project Blueprint) because both items were mentioned during their presentation.
4. Nelson\Nygaard responded well to questioning about outreach to minorities and ESL populations.
5. They put forth the best presentation relative to community engagement and public involvement.
6. Their presentation and approach spoke to the need to effect culture change more so than the other presentations.

Per City Code 329.14(h), please provide direction for proceeding on this project by replying to this e-mail. Four options include:

1. Approve of the committee's recommendation, Nelson\Nygaard
2. Reject the committee's recommendations and designate a firm
3. Call for an oral presentation of the three highest scoring firms
4. Other

Tom Crawford
Fiscal Manager



DEPARTMENT OF
PUBLIC SERVICE

50 W. Gay Street, 5th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
Direct: 614.645.1687
Fax: 614.645.7549
www.columbus.gov