

**INTERDIVISIONAL MEMORANDUM**

December 13, 2007

TO: Assistant Administrator Johanson  
Division of Sewerage and Drainage

FROM: Mark Hedrick  
Project Manager

RE: Bid Evaluation for FEM Project No. 1503.2  
HVAC Maintenance Services for Sewerage and Drainage Facilities  
Bid Opening December 12, 2007

Three bids were received and opened on December 12, 2007 for FEM Project No. 1503.2 HVAC Maintenance Services for Sewerage and Drainage Facilities. The bidders were:

1. Cornerstone Maintenance Services Ltd.
2. Kirk Williams Mechanical Services
3. General Temperature Control

I have completed my review; I recommend the contract be awarded to Cornerstone Maintenance Services, Ltd. Cornerstone Maintenance Services' bid appears to be responsive and responsible. All bid documents are complete and correct. Quoted dollar amounts are lower than expected. Cornerstone Maintenance Services had the previous similar contract. Their work was more than satisfactory.

If you would like to look at the original Bidding Documents or if you have any additional questions on this matter please advise me at 645-1682.

Att: As Stated

xc: Paul King, DOSD-R  
Rob Van Evra, DOSD-R  
Troy Branson, DOSD-R  
File: 1503.2-32

(Summary of Bidding information follows)

The following four pages are a summary of the information submitted to the City in the Bidding Documents by the prospective Bidders.

**1. The Bid Tabulation is as follows:**

Cornerstone Maintenance Services Ltd.

<u>Line Item</u>	<u>Total</u>
1. Bond & Insurance	\$1,810.00
2. Annual HVAC Maint. Services for SWWTP	\$6,574.00
3. Annual HVAC Maint. Services for JPWWTP	\$6,574.00
4. Annual HVAC Maint. Services for Compost	\$1,270.00
5. One year Supply of Refrigerant and Filters for SWWTP	\$3,907.85
6. One year Supply of Refrigerant and Filters for JPWWTP	\$12,095.94
7. One year Supply of Refrigerant and Filters for Compost	<u>\$789.74</u>
SUBTOTAL	<b>\$33,021.53</b>
8. Contingency	\$3,302.15
9. Allowance for HVAC Equip. Repl. Services for SWWTP	\$35,000.00
10. Allowance for HVAC Equip. Repl. Services for JPWWTP	\$25,000.00
11. Allowance for HVAC Equip. Repl. Services for Compost	\$20,000.00
12. Allowance for Emergency Repairs for All 3 Sites	\$7,500.00
TOTAL	<b>\$123,823.68</b>
13. Year 2 percentage increase from Year 1	5%
14. Year 3 percentage increase from Year 1	10%
15. Material Markup	10%
16. Rental equipment Markup	10%
17. Subcontractor Markup	10%
18. Normal / Premium Labor Rate - Supervisor/Hr.	\$59.00 / 75.00
19. Normal / Premium Labor Rate - Laborer/Hr.	\$28.00 / 44.00

The Contract documents clearly stated that the percentage increases were from Year 1 prices.

Kirk Williams Mechanical Services

<u>Line Item</u>	<u>Total</u>
1. Bond & Insurance	\$1,987.00
2. Annual HVAC Maint. Services for SWWTP	\$64,680.00
3. Annual HVAC Maint. Services for JPWWTP	\$81,620.00
4. Annual HVAC Maint. Services for Compost	\$7,700.00
5. One year Supply of Refrigerant and Filters for SWWTP	\$26,800.00
6. One year Supply of Refrigerant and Filters for JPWWTP	\$16,806.25
7. One year Supply of Refrigerant and Filters for Compost	<u>\$1,093.75</u>
 SUBTOTAL	 <b>\$200,687.00</b>
8. Contingency	\$20,068.70
9. Allowance for HVAC Equip. Repl. Services for SWWTP	\$35,000.00
10. Allowance for HVAC Equip. Repl. Services for JPWWTP	\$25,000.00
11. Allowance for HVAC Equip. Repl. Services for Compost	\$20,000.00
12. Allowance for Emergency Repairs for All 3 Sites	7,500.00
 TOTAL	 <b>\$308,255.70</b>
13. Year 2 percentage increase from Year 1	3%
14. Year 3 percentage increase from Year 1	6%
15. Material Markup	25%
16. Rental equipment Markup	30%
17. Subcontractor Markup	25%
18. Normal / Premium Labor Rate - Supervisor/Hr.	\$75.00 / 112.00
19. Normal / Premium Labor Rate - Laborer/Hr.	\$68.00 / 102.00

The Contract documents clearly stated that the percentage increases were from Year 1 prices.

General Temperature Control

<u>Line Item</u>	<u>Total</u>
1. Bond & Insurance	\$5,250.00
2. Annual HVAC Maint. Services for SWWTP	\$27,500.00
3. Annual HVAC Maint. Services for JPWWTP	\$32,500.00
4. Annual HVAC Maint. Services for Compost	\$1,750.00
5. One year Supply of Refrigerant and Filters for SWWTP	\$4,000.00
6. One year Supply of Refrigerant and Filters for JPWWTP	\$10,500.00
7. One year Supply of Refrigerant and Filters for Compost	<u>\$1,250.00</u>
SUBTOTAL	<b>\$82,750.00</b>
8. Contingency	\$8,275.00
9. Allowance for HVAC Equip. Repl. Services for SWWTP	\$35,000.00
10. Allowance for HVAC Equip. Repl. Services for JPWWTP	\$25,000.00
11. Allowance for HVAC Equip. Repl. Services for Compost	\$20,000.00
12. Allowance for Emergency Repairs for All 3 Sites	\$7,500.00
TOTAL	<b>\$178,525.00</b>
13. Year 2 percentage increase from Year 1	9.96%
14. Year 3 percentage increase from Year 1	10%
15. Material Markup	25%
16. Rental equipment Markup	15%
17. Subcontractor Markup	15%
18. Normal / Premium Labor Rate - Supervisor/Hr.	\$70.00 / 140.00
19. Normal / Premium Labor Rate - Laborer/Hr.	\$65.00 / 130.00

The Contract documents clearly stated that the percentage increases were from Year 1 prices.

## 2. Responsiveness of the Bidders.

1. Contract Compliance Number?

<b>Cornerstone</b>	<b>Kirk Williams</b>	<b>GTC</b>
Yes	Yes	Yes
010852059	55-0829335	311201266

2. Proposal Guaranty submitted? Yes

<b>Cornerstone</b>	<b>Kirk Williams</b>	<b>GTC</b>
Yes	Yes	Yes
Bid Bond	Bid Bond	Bid Bond

3. Indicate the Full names of all persons interested in the bid.

<b>Cornerstone</b>	<b>Kirk Williams</b>	<b>GTC</b>
James K. Skaggs	James K. Williams	Bob Billings
	Skeeter Lambert	

4. Proposal Signed and dated? Yes

<b>Cornerstone</b>	<b>Kirk Williams</b>	<b>GTC</b>
Yes	Yes	Yes

5. Non-Collusion Affidavit signed and notarized?

<b>Cornerstone</b>	<b>Kirk Williams</b>	<b>GTC</b>
Yes	Yes	Yes

6. Corporation Proposal Affidavit filled out correctly?

<b>Cornerstone</b>	<b>Kirk Williams</b>	<b>GTC</b>
N/A	Yes	Yes

**3. Qualifications and Resources of the Bidders.**

1. References given? / Checked?

<b>Cornerstone</b>	<b>Kirk Williams</b>	<b>GTC</b>
Yes / No	Yes / No	Yes / No

2. Manpower and equipment listed?

<b>Cornerstone</b>	<b>Kirk Williams</b>	<b>GTC</b>
Yes	Yes	Yes

3. Balance sheet attached for last fiscal year?

<b>Cornerstone</b>	<b>Kirk Williams</b>	<b>GTC</b>
No	No	No

4. Has Contractor had a contract canceled or suspended in the last 5 years?

<b>Cornerstone</b>	<b>Kirk Williams</b>	<b>GTC</b>
No	No	No

5. Has Contractor ever been debarred from bidding?

**Cornerstone**  
No

**Kirk Williams**  
No

**GTC**  
No

6. Has any of the firm's principals been convicted of any violations related to contract obligations?

**Cornerstone**  
No

**Kirk Williams**  
No

**GTC**  
No

7. Project Manager listed for this contract with detailed experience or resume attached?

**Cornerstone**  
Yes

**Kirk Williams**  
Yes

**GTC**  
Yes

#### **4.Subcontracting Plan**

1. Has the bidder declared any subcontractors?

**Cornerstone**  
Yes

**Kirk Williams**  
Yes

**GTC**  
No

2. Prime Contractor Affidavit filled out correctly and notarized?

**Cornerstone**  
Yes

**Kirk Williams**  
Yes

**GTC**  
Yes