

From: [Davies, Tracie R.](#)
To: [Crawford, Thomas L.](#)
Cc: [Austin, Patti A.](#); [Bell, Timothy A.](#); [Bowman, Randall](#); [Cordetti, Steven R.](#); [Crabill, Melanie J.](#); [Figley, Russ U.](#); [Giffin, Benjamin M.](#); [Johnson, Daniel L.](#); [Miller Jr, Richard A.](#); [O'Callaghan, Timothy L.](#); [Palmer, Tierra L.](#); [Parks, Duane M.](#); [Roberts, Doug](#); [Stephens, Thomas H.](#); [Tilton, Rick C.](#); [Wentzel, Steve J.](#); [Zahran, Hassan Y.](#); [Cofield, Alex A.](#); [Dussault, Kathleen E.](#); [Mackey, David B.](#); [Moran, Alan P.](#); [Gallagher, Jennifer L.](#); [Bauman, Max A.](#); [Sexton, Michael E.](#); [Stargell, Reynaldo A.](#); [Wasosky, Steven S.](#); [Hines, Jud M.](#)
Subject: RE: RECOMMENDATION: Arterial Street Rehabilitation - Polaris Parkway project
Date: Monday, February 23, 2015 4:33:09 PM

Tom, I approve of the committee's recommendation, Carpenter Marty Transportation.

Thanks,

Tracie

From: Crawford, Thomas L.
Sent: Monday, February 23, 2015 3:24 PM
To: Davies, Tracie R.
Cc: Austin, Patti A.; Bell, Timothy A.; Bowman, Randall; Cordetti, Steven R.; Crabill, Melanie J.; Figley, Russ U.; Giffin, Benjamin M.; Johnson, Daniel L.; Miller Jr, Richard A.; O'Callaghan, Timothy L.; Palmer, Tierra L.; Parks, Duane M.; Roberts, Doug; Stephens, Thomas H.; Tilton, Rick C.; Wentzel, Steve J.; Zahran, Hassan Y.; Cofield, Alex A.; Dussault, Kathleen E.; Mackey, David B.; Moran, Alan P.; Gallagher, Jennifer L.; Bauman, Max A.; Sexton, Michael E.; Stargell, Reynaldo A.; Wasosky, Steven S.; Hines, Jud M.
Subject: RECOMMENDATION: Arterial Street Rehabilitation - Polaris Parkway project

To: Tracie Davies, Director
Department of Public Service

From: Tom Crawford
Capital Fiscal Manager

Date: February 23, 2015

Subject: Arterial Street Rehabilitation – Polaris Parkway

The Department of Public Service solicited Requests for Proposals for the Arterial Street Rehabilitation – Polaris Parkway project. The recommendation is to award Carpenter Marty Transportation, the consultant that was scored the highest by the selection committee. Details concerning the recommendation are below. Please respond to this e-mail either approving the recommended consultant or approving another consultant. If you approve another consultant please provide an explanation.

TC

This project, also known as DEL-CR615-0.000 (PID Number 95549), includes completion of the Project Development Process (PDP) for improvements including widening Polaris Parkway to provide a third eastbound through lane from I-71 to Olde Worthington Road and a third westbound through lane from Orion Place to Olde Worthington Road. This project also includes the installation of a shared use path along the east side of Orion Place and the south side of Polaris Parkway beginning at the existing shared use path at the intersection of Polaris Parkway and Olde Worthington Road. Funding for this project has been appropriated in the 2015 C.I.B. Right-of-way acquisition and construction will be partially funded by the Mid-Ohio Regional Planning Commission (MORPC) in fiscal years 2017 and 2018, respectively. Those funds will be managed by the Ohio Department of Transportation.

The project was formally advertised on the Vendor Services web site from January 23, 2015, to February 12, 2015. The city received nine (9) responses. Of those, seven (7) proposals were deemed responsive and were fully evaluated when the Evaluation Committee met on February 23, 2015. The responding firms were:

CONSULTANT Sub-consultant	Business Enterprise Status	Contract Compliance Number	Active	% OF WORK	% MAJ. % OTH.
COLUMBUS ENGINEERING CONSULTANTS, INC.	ASN	31-0718498	Y	54%	0% MAJ 74% OTH 26% PHC
Parsons Brinckerhoff, Inc.	PHC	11-1531569	Y	15%	
ARCADIS U.S., Inc.	PHC	57-0373224	Y	11%	
Advanced Engineering Consultants (AEC)	FBE	31-1612308	Y	8	
CTL Engineering, Inc.	ASN	31-0680767	Y	6%	
ASC Group, Inc.	FBE	31-1167506	Y	6%	
CRAWFORD, MURPHY & TILLY, INC.	MAJ	37-0844662	Y	51%	76% MAJ 14% OTH 10% PHC
URS Corporation – Ohio	MAJ	34-0939859	Y	25%	
TranSystems Corporation	PHC	43-0839859	Y	10%	
Resource					

International, Inc.	FBE	31-0669793	Y	8%	
DHDC Engineering Consulting Services	ASN	32-0376762	Y	3%	
Lawhon & Associates, Inc.	FBE	31-1153141	Y	2%	
Edsall & Associates LLC	FBE	31-1022019	Y	1%	
PRIME AE GROUP, INC.	ASN	26-0546656	Y	50-60%	15-25% MAJ 75-85% OTH
ms consultants, inc.	MAJ	34-6546916	Y	15-25%	
Lawhon & Associates, Inc.	FBE	31-1153141	Y	10-15%	
DHDC Engineering Consulting Services	ASN	32-0376762	Y	5-10%	
CARPENTER MARTY TRANSPORTATION INC.	MAJ	46-0918246	Y	50%	75-80% MAJ 20-25% OTH
Columbus Engineering Consultants, Inc.	ASN	31-0718498	Y	10%	
DHDC Engineering Consulting Services	ASN	32-0376762	Y	5%	
The EDGE Group, Inc.	MAJ	20-8054208	Y	2-5%	
E.L. Robinson Engineering of Ohio	MAJ	31-1725058	Y	20%	
Lawhon & Associates, Inc.	FBE	31-1153141	Y	5-10%	
IBI GROUP	MAJ	31-1442777	Y	64%	90% MAJ 10% OTH
Evans, Mechwart, Hambleton & Tilton (EMH&T)	MAJ	31-0685594	Y	25%	
DLZ Ohio Inc.	MBR	31-1268980	Y	5%	

Lawhon & Associates, Inc.	FBE	31-1153141	Y	5%	
Surveying and Mapping, LLC	MAJ	74-2704974	Y	1%	
OHM ADVISORS	MAJ	38-1691323	Y	55%	80% MAJ 20% OTH
Resource International, Inc.	FBE	31-0669793	Y	10%	
E.P. Ferris & Associates, Inc.	MAJ	31-1194974	Y	25%	
Lawhon & Associates, Inc.	FBE	31-1153141	Y	10%	
STRAND ASSOCIATES, INC.	MAJ	39-1020418	Y	49%	69% MAJ 31% OTH
CHA Consulting, Inc.	MAJ	16-0966259	Y	17%	
Dynotec, Inc.	MBE	31-1319961	Y	16%	
ASC Group, Inc.	FBE	31-1167506	Y	8%	
Resource International, Inc.	FBE	31-0669793	Y	5%	
S&ME, Inc.	MAJ	56-0791580	Y	3%	
Murphy Epson, Inc.	FBE	31-1263605	Y	2%	

This RFP Evaluation Committee included three (3) voting members from the Department of Public Service, Randall Bowman, Hassan Zahran, and Patti Austin. Non-voting members, but attendees, included Tierra Palmer. A representative from EBOCO was invited but did not attend.

Carpenter Marty Transportation received 87.00 points from the Evaluation Committee (out of a possible 100). The next closest firm was IBI Group with 80.67 points.

The following is a list of the results of the Evaluation Committee's assessment of the seven evaluated proposals for your final selection.

Carpenter Marty Transportation	87.00
IBI Group	80.67
Columbus Engineering Consultants	79.33
Strand Associates	78.33
Crawford, Murphy & Tilly	77.67
OHM Advisors	77.67
PRIME AE Group	77.33

The Committee would like to submit Carpenter Marty Transportation for the Director's review and recommendation. The Committee felt that Carpenter Marty Transportation submitted the strongest overall proposal for the following reasons:

1. Their proposed team will be led by a very strong project manager who is familiar with the ODOT and PDP processes.
2. Carpenter Marty Transportation had the highest ODOT CES score of the offerors being considered for this project.
3. Carpenter Marty Transportation spoke to the idea of accelerating the project timeline by consolidating stages 2 and 3 of the project in its proposal.
4. Their firm is highly familiar with the area, having performed a substantial amount of preliminary work within the project limits.
5. Carpenter Marty Transportation also has the existing topo and CAD drawings for the area.
6. Carpenter Marty Transportation also discussed the impact to development in the surrounding area, including plans to open a new IKEA store.

Per City Code 329.14(h), please provide direction for proceeding on this project by replying to this e-mail. Four options include:

1. Approve of the committee's recommendation, Carpenter Marty Transportation
2. Reject the committee's recommendations and designate a firm
3. Call for an oral presentation of the three highest scoring firms
4. Other

Tom Crawford
Fiscal Manager



DEPARTMENT OF
PUBLIC SERVICE

50 W. Gay Street, 5th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215

Direct: 614.645.1687

Fax: 614.645.7549

www.columbus.gov