

Construction Contract Evaluation Spreadsheets per Columbus City Code Section 329

**TAB I: Assessing Responsiveness**

version: September 20, 2016

<b>PROJECT:</b>	<b>Power Line Clearance, Tree Trimming &amp; Removal Svcs.</b>	<b>Bid Date:</b>	<b>January 18, 2017</b>
-----------------	--	------------------	-------------------------

<b>Department/Division:</b>	<b>Public Utilities / Power</b>	<b>Initial Apparent Low Bidder:</b>	<b>Asplundh</b>
<b>Section:</b>		<b>Initial Apparent Low Bid :</b>	<b>\$ 321,107.76</b>

Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:		Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
<b>CIP No.</b>	<b>n/a</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>					
<b>Project Manager:</b>	<b>Chris Vogel</b>	<b>Asplundh</b>	<b>Davey Tree</b>				
<b>Engineer's Estimate:</b>		<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>					
		<b>\$ 321,107.76</b>	<b>\$ 451,090.50</b>				
		<b>40.48%</b>	<b>-100.00%</b>				

PART IA: Responsiveness Criteria, General Provisions (329.20)		INPUT "YES" FOR POSITIVE RESPONSE OR "NO" FOR NEGATIVE RESPONSE (all "yes" answers needed for responsive bid)					
<b>a</b>	The bidder is <b>pre-qualified</b> responsible or prequalified provisionally responsible at time of bid due date. (329.20)(c)	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>				
<b>b</b>	The bid <b>contains</b> the full name of every person or company interested in the same and such other relevant information as the city agency deems appropriate. (329.20)(g) <b>FORM B1</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>				
<b>c</b>	The bidder <b>submitted</b> , with bid, an affidavit stating: (1) That as of the date of bid submission, there have been no changes in the information disclosed in its application for responsibility prequalification; or (2) That changes in the information disclosed in the bidder's application for responsibility prequalification have been reported to director of finance and management or designee and that the bidder is still prequalified responsible or provisionally responsible. (329.20)(d) <b>FORM B9</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>				
<b>d</b>	If applicable, the bidder listed a (sub)contractor(s) with an <b>active water or sewer contractor tappers license (CMS 107.02)</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>				
<b>e</b>	Digital ID on bid is from a person authorized to enter into contract on behalf of the company ("name of person signing contract" on Signature Affidavit must match the name on the Digital ID). <b>Proposal Signature Affidavit</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>				
<b>f</b>	There is <b>no evidence</b> of collusion among the bidders. (329.20)(e)	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>				
<b>BID IS:</b>		<b>RESPONSIVE</b>	<b>RESPONSIVE</b>				

Construction Contract Evaluation Spreadsheets per Columbus City Code Section 329

**TAB I: Assessing Responsiveness**

version: September 20, 2016

<b>PROJECT:</b>	<b>Power Line Clearance, Tree Trimming &amp; Removal Svcs.</b>	<b>Bid Date:</b>	<b>January 18, 2017</b>
-----------------	--	------------------	-------------------------

<b>Department/Division:</b>	<b>Public Utilities / Power</b>	<b>Initial Apparent Low Bidder:</b>	<b>Asplundh</b>
<b>Section:</b>		<b>Initial Apparent Low Bid :</b>	<b>\$ 321,107.76</b>

Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:		Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
<b>CIP No.:</b>	<b>n/a</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>					
<b>Project Manager:</b>	<b>Chris Vogel</b>	<b>Asplundh</b>	<b>Davey Tree</b>				
<b>Engineer's Estimate:</b>		<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>					
		<b>\$ 321,107.76</b>	<b>\$ 451,090.50</b>				

PART IB: Responsiveness Criteria, Subcontractors (329.20)		INPUT "YES" FOR POSITIVE RESPONSE OR "NO" FOR NEGATIVE RESPONSE (all "yes" answers needed for responsive bid)					
<b>a</b>	The bidder <b>provided a list of subcontractors</b> with bid or indicated there were not any subcontracting opportunities. (329.20)(h)(1) <b>FORM B5</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>				
<b>b</b>	If subcontractors are listed, Bidder <b>indicated</b> which subcontractors are licensed construction trade subcontractors. (329.20)(h)(2) <b>FORM B5 (If no licensed trade subcontractors are listed, enter "NA")</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>				
<b>c</b>	If licensed trade subcontractors are listed, the bidder <b>proposed</b> pre-qualified responsible or provisionally responsible licensed trade subcontractors. (329.20)(h) <b>(If no licensed trade subcontractors are listed, enter "NA")</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>				
<b>d</b>	If subcontractors are listed, the bidder listed the division/section of work under which the sub is performing. (329.20)(h)(5) <b>(If no subcontractors are listed, enter "NA") FORM B5</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>				
<b>e</b>	If subcontractors are listed and the bidder listed more than one subcontractor per division/section of work, did the bidder explain why more than one sub is listed for the division/section of work? (329.20)(h)(5) <b>(If no licensed trade subcontractors are listed, enter "NA") FORM B5</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>				
<b>f</b>	Bidder <b>stated, via affidavit</b> , that its proposed licensed construction trade subcontractors are pre-qualified responsible or provisionally responsible. (329.20)(h)(3) <b>Form B9 (If no licensed trade subcontractors are listed, enter "NA")</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>				
<b>g</b>	Bidder <b>did not</b> bid subcontractors who were currently suspended or debarred by the city. (329.20)(h)(4) <b>(see links on Tab 5)</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>				
	<b>BID IS:</b>	<b>RESPONSIVE</b>	<b>RESPONSIVE</b>				

Construction Contract Evaluation Spreadsheets per Columbus City Code Section 329

**TAB I: Assessing Responsiveness**

version: September 20, 2016

<b>PROJECT:</b>	<b>Power Line Clearance, Tree Trimming &amp; Removal Svcs.</b>	<b>Bid Date:</b>	<b>January 18, 2017</b>
-----------------	--	------------------	-------------------------

<b>Department/Division:</b>	<b>Public Utilities / Power</b>	<b>Initial Apparent Low Bidder:</b>	<b>Asplundh</b>
<b>Section:</b>		<b>Initial Apparent Low Bid :</b>	<b>\$ 321,107.76</b>

Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:		Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
<b>CIP No.:</b>	<b>n/a</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>					
<b>Project Manager:</b>	<b>Chris Vogel</b>	<b>Asplundh</b>	<b>Davey Tree</b>				
<b>Engineer's Estimate:</b>		<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>					
		<b>\$ 321,107.76</b>	<b>\$ 451,090.50</b>				

PART IC: Responsiveness Criteria, Bid Specific (329.23)		INPUT "YES" FOR POSITIVE RESPONSE OR "NO" FOR NEGATIVE RESPONSE (all "yes" answers needed for responsive bid)					
<b>a</b>	Bidder <b>did not</b> submit more than one bid for same work. (See referenced code section for full text.) (329.23)(f)(1)(a)	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>				
<b>b</b>	Bidder <b>acknowledged</b> addenda. (329.23)(f)(1)(e)	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>				
<b>c</b>	Bidder <b>complied</b> with technical pre-qualification requirements/specification requirements where applicable. (329.23)(f)(1)(c)	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>				
<b>d</b>	The bid <b>contains</b> no conditions or qualifications not provided in the invitation for bid. (329.23)(f)(1)(d)	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>				
<b>e</b>	Bidder added <b>no</b> provisions reserving right to accept or reject award. (329.23)(f)(1)(f)	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>				
<b>f</b>	Bidder <b>submitted</b> a bid guarantee. (329.23)(f)(1)(i) <b>FORM B2</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>				
<b>g</b>	Bidder <b>did not submit</b> an irregular bid guarantee. (329.23)(f)(1)(i) <b>FORM B2</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>				
<b>h</b>	Bid prices <b>are</b> materially balanced. (329.23)(f)(1)(b) <b>FORM B3</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>				
<b>i</b>	Bid contains <b>no</b> irregularities or deviations from the bid that affect bid amount. (329.23)(f)(1)(j) and (329.23)(f)(1)(e)	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>				
<b>j</b>	Bidder <b>submitted</b> a unit price for each contract item listed, if required. (329.23)(f)(1)(g) <b>FORM B3 (If a unit price is not an option, enter "NA")</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>				
<b>k</b>	Bidder <b>submitted</b> a lump sum price if required. (329.23)(f)(1)(h) <b>FORM B3 (If lump sum is not an option, enter "NA")</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>				
<b>l</b>	Bidder <b>has complied</b> with section 329.20(h) regarding subcontractors. (329.23)(f)(1)(k) <b>FORM B5</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>				
<b>m</b>	Bid <b>does not</b> contain alterations, omissions, errors, such that it <b>does</b> respond to the bid documents. (329.23)(f)(1)(j)	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>				
<b>n</b>	Bid <b>responds</b> to bid documents in all material respects. (329.23)(f)(1)(e)	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>				
<b>o</b>	Bid is complete. (329.23)(f)(1)(e)	<b>NA</b>	<b>YES</b>				
<b>BID IS:</b>		<b>RESPONSIVE</b>	<b>RESPONSIVE</b>				

Construction Contract Evaluation Spreadsheets per Columbus City Code Section 329

**TAB I: Assessing Responsiveness**

version: September 20, 2016

<b>PROJECT:</b>	<b>Power Line Clearance, Tree Trimming &amp; Removal Svcs.</b>	<b>Bid Date:</b>	<b>January 18, 2017</b>
-----------------	--	------------------	-------------------------

<b>Department/Division:</b>	<b>Public Utilities / Power</b>	<b>Initial Apparent Low Bidder:</b>	<b>Asplundh</b>
<b>Section:</b>		<b>Initial Apparent Low Bid :</b>	<b>\$ 321,107.76</b>

Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:		Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
<b>CIP No.</b>	<b>n/a</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>					
<b>Project Manager:</b>	<b>Chris Vogel</b>	<b>Asplundh</b>	<b>Davey Tree</b>				
<b>Engineer's Estimate:</b>		<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>					
		<b>\$ 321,107.76</b>	<b>\$ 451,090.50</b>				

<b>PART ID: Responsiveness Criteria, Contract Compliance</b>		A "no" answer in Part IE will not necessarily render a bid non-responsive. Bidder must have a valid contract compliance no. prior to contract execution.					
<b>a</b>	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has an active contract compliance number at the time of bid.	<b>NO</b>	<b>NO</b>				

<b>Bid Responsiveness, Waiver Considerations:</b>	Bid Responsive, Continue to Part II	Bid Responsive, Continue to Part II	Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office	Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office	Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office	Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office
<b>Proceed to Part II?</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>				

<b>LOWEST RESPONSIVE BID, TAB I</b>	<b>\$ 321,107.76</b>	← <b>Manually Enter Amount</b>
<b>LOWEST RESPONSIVE BIDDER, TAB I</b>	<b>Asplundh</b>	← <b>Manually Enter Information</b>

**TAB II: Assessing Responsibility**

<b>PROJECT:</b>	<b>Power Line Clearance, Tree Trimming &amp; Removal Svcs.</b>	<b>Bid Date:</b>	<b>January 18, 2017</b>
<b>Department/Division:</b>	<b>Public Utilities / Power</b>	<b>Responsive Low Bidder (from Tab I):</b>	<b>Asplundh</b>
<b>Section:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>Responsive Low Bid (from Tab I):</b>	<b>\$ 321,107.76</b>
<b>CIP No.</b>	<b>n/a</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>
<b>Project Manager:</b>	<b>Chris Vogel</b>	<b>Asplundh</b>	<b>Davey Tree</b>
<b>Engineer's Estimate:</b>	<b>\$ -</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>
		<b>\$ 321,107.76</b>	<b>\$ 451,090.50</b>
		<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
		<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>

<b>PART IIA: 329.23 (2) Responsibility Criteria</b>		<b>INPUT "YES" FOR POSITIVE RESPONSE OR "NO" FOR NEGATIVE RESPONSE (1 point for each "yes", 0 for "no")</b>					
<b>a</b>	Based on bid amount (as compared to other bids) no further documentation needed (i.e., bid statistically comparable to others). <b>FORM B3, SPECIFICATIONS</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>NA</b>				
<b>b</b>	The bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and appropriate SPECIALIZED EQUIPMENT for the project. <b>FORM B6, SPECIFICATIONS</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>				
<b>c</b>	The bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and appropriate HUMAN RESOURCES for the project. <b>FORM B6, SPECIFICATIONS</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>				
<b>d</b>	The bidder has actively engaged in the construction industry. <b>FORM B7</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>				
<b>e</b>	The bidder has experience in the area of construction service for which the bid has been submitted. <b>FORM B7</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>				
<b>f</b>	The bidder has a successful record of complying with and meeting completion deadlines. <b>FORM B7</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>YES</b>				
<b>g</b>	The bidder has a successful record of controlling costs on similar construction projects. <b>FORM B7</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>				
<b>h</b>	The bidder has no (substantial) uncompleted work that would hinder the success of the project. <b>FORM B8</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>				
<b>Responsibility Score:</b>		<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Continue to TAB 3?</b>		<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>				

↑  
Manually Enter Information

TAB III. Assessing Local Bidder

<b>PROJECT:</b>	<b>Power Line Clearance, Tree Trimming &amp; Removal Svcs.</b>	<b>Bid Date:</b>	<b>January 18, 2017</b>
-----------------	--	------------------	-------------------------

Department/Division:	<b>Public Utilities / Power</b>	Evaluated Low Bidder (from Tabs I and II):	<b>Asplundh</b>
Section:	<b>0</b>	Evaluated Low Bid (from Tabs I and II) :	<b>\$ 321,107.76</b>

CIP No.	n/a	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	<b>Chris Vogel</b>	Asplundh	Davey Tree	NA	NA	NA	NA
Engineer's Estimate:	<b>\$ -</b>	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount
		<b>\$ 321,107.76</b>	<b>\$ 451,090.50</b>	NA	NA	NA	NA
<b>PART III: 329.(01)(u) and 329.212 Local Bidder</b>							

IS BID LOCAL?	<b>NO</b>	<b>NO</b>					
---------------	-----------	-----------	--	--	--	--	--

To look up if a bidder is local, use the Office of Construction Prequalification's list located at [X:\Construction Prequalification](#)

<b>PART IIIA:</b>	
step 1	<p>IF <b>APPARENT LOW BID IN PART II IS LOCAL STOP</b>. Skip steps 2-5 and enter data in Steps 6 &amp; 7 and continue to TAB IV.</p> <p>IF <b>APPARENT LOW BID IN PART II IS NOT LOCAL, CONTINUE TO TO STEP 2</b> (see above for apparent low bid and bidder information)</p>

<b>Part IIIB:</b>							
step 2	Percentage difference of bid from apparent NON-LOCAL, LOW BID.	<b>0.000%</b>	<b>40.479%</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>
step 3	Is amount in prior step WITHIN ONE PERCENT (1%) OF THE LOW BID?	<b>YES</b>	<b>NO</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>
step 4	If step 3 is "yes", SEE PROCEDURES ON SHAREPOINT SITE. DID AGENCY FOLLOW PROCEDURES FOR BIDDER RELATING TO CITY CODE SECTIONS 329.212 (INDICATE IF NA)?						
step 5	INPUT NEW BID AMOUNT FOR BIDDER, IF APPLICABLE, OR ZERO (\$0)						

<b>Part IIIC:</b>	
step 6	REVISED LOW BID AMOUNT, TAB IIIB: <b>\$ 321,107.76</b>
step 7	REVISED LOW BIDDER, TAB IIIB: <b>Asplundh</b>

Manually Enter Amount

Manually Enter Information

TAB IV. Calculating Environmental Preference

<b>PROJECT:</b>	<b>Power Line Clearance, Tree Trimming &amp; Removal Svcs.</b>	<b>Bid Date:</b>	<b>January 18, 2017</b>
-----------------	--	------------------	-------------------------

Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Power	Evaluated Low Bidder (from Tabs I, II and III):	Asplundh
Section:	0	Evaluated Low Bid (from Tabs I, II and III) :	\$ 321,108

CIP No.	n/a	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	Chris Vogel	Asplundh	Davey Tree	NA	NA	NA	NA
Engineer's Estimate:	\$ -	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount
		\$ 321,107.76	\$ 451,090.50	NA	NA	NA	NA
<b>PART IV: 329.(17) Environmental Preference</b>							
Apparent Low Bid:	\$ 321,107.76	Apparent Low Bidder:	Asplundh				

<b>PART IV: 329.(17) Environmental Preference</b>							
step 1	Did apparent/evaluated low bidder submit "environmentally preferable" bid? Answer "YES" or "NO" for apparent low bidder. For all other bidder's, input "NA"		NO	NA			
step 2	Excluding apparent low bidder, did bidder submit "environmentally preferable" bid?		NA	NO			
step 3	<p><b>STOP.</b> If apparent/evaluated low bidder submitted an environmentally preferable bid, then the apparent/evaluated low bidder is lead bidder for Tab 4. Ignore the data in Steps 4-6, complete Step 7, and proceed to Tab 5.</p> <p>If the apparent/evaluated low bidder did not submit an environmentally preferable bid, proceed to Steps 6 and 7.</p>						
step 4	Calculate environmental preference for each bid. It is up to five percent (5%) of the non-environmental low bid, for a maximum of \$20,000 per bid.		0.000%	40.479%	NA	NA	NA
step 5	Preference amount for each eligible bid (if 0, then no environmental preference was applied).		\$ -	\$ 20,000.00	NA	NA	NA
step 6	Bid amount less environmental preference, except if both claim environmental preference; in that case, both claiming EP cancels it for both		\$ 321,107.76	\$ 431,090.50	NA	NA	NA
step 7	Low Bid Amount:	\$ 321,107.76	Low Bidder:	Asplundh			

Manually Enter Amount

Manually Enter Information

TAB V. Miscellaneous

<b>Apparent Low Bidder/Bid:</b>	<b>Asplundh</b>	<b>\$ 321,107.76</b>
<b>Project:</b>	<b>Power Line Clearance, Tree Trimming &amp; Removal Svcs.</b>	

Other "responsible" requirements 329.23(f)(2)(e)

With respect to a bidder whose bid is determined to be 10% or more below that of the next lowest bidder, [do they have] supplemental details regarding the bid and/or historical information regarding performance and costs on similar contracts to demonstrate the bidder's ability to complete the contract at the price specified.

Bidders	Asplundh	Davey Tree	0	0	0	0
Bid	\$ 321,107.76	\$ 451,090.50	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Percent Difference btwn Bid and Next Highest Bid	40.48%	-100.00%				

Is any bidder 10% or more below the next bidder?

YES

If yes, does the lower bidder's TAB 2 evaluation have 'yes' answers for questions c, d, g, and h?

YES

If yes, low bidder is "responsible" under this provision.

**Bid Guarantee Requirements** Below are the required documents for each bid guarantee type allowed.

Is the guarantee greater than or equal to 10% of the bid?

NO

Did the bidder submit all of the required documents based upon the guarantee submitted?

NO

Bid Bond

Bond on City's bond form

Surety power of attorney

Most recent surety financial statement

Current Ohio Dept. of Insurance Certificate of Compliance

**Contract Compliance** Are all subcontractors contract compliant? Required before the contract can be executed.

N/A

If there are not any subcontractors, choose N/A.

**Foreign/Non-Ohio Corp** Is the corporation foreign or the individual or partnership a non-resident of the State of Ohio?

NO

If yes, business entity shall register with the Ohio Secretary of State's Office for the purpose of accepting service of summons, in any action in law or equity, or both, brought in the State of Ohio.

N/A

This is required before the contract is awarded. "Awarded" means before the Director accepts/approves the bid

<http://www.sos.state.oh.us/>

**Award recommendation:** After evaluation of the bids, I recommend the following contractor be awarded the contract for:

Project Name: **Power Line Clearance, Tree Trimming & Removal Svcs.**

Recommended Bidder: **Asplundh Tree Expert Co.**

Contract Amount: **\$ 321,107.78**

Evaluator's Name: **Missy Smith 645-3776**

Evaluation Completion Date: **2/6/2017**

**TAB VII: Notes**

Asplundh	Davey Tree	PM's comments:
<b>Tab 1, Part 1A-a: Pre-qualification?</b>		
1/30/17: We indicated to Sarah Harrell that the project was bid as a construction project rather than a service project, and she indicated the bidders did not have to be pre-qualified.		
<b>Tab 1, Part 1A-b: names of interested parties</b>		
1/31/17: Asplundh clarified name s/b Keith Confere (manager).		
<b>Tab 1, Part 1A-d: proposal signature affidavit?</b>		
2/3/17: rec'd form		
<b>Tab 1, Part 1C-a: addenda?</b>		
1/31/17: Asplundh clarified they understood the addenda.		
<b>Tab 1, Part 1C-g: Bid bond:</b>		
Not needed. Removed per Addenda #1.		
<b>Tab 2, Part IIA-a: Statistically Comparable to Other Bidders?</b>		
	No; 40.5% higher than Asplundh; marked "NA" to continue evaluation though.	
<b>Tab 2, Part IIA-b: equipment?</b>		
1/31/17: Asplundh clarified the eqpt.		
<b>Tab 2, Part IIA-d thru h: experience, deadlines, costs, etc.:</b>		
# of projects meeting deadlines: 3 out of 3	# of projects meeting deadlines: 3 out of 3	
# of projects meeting costs: 3 out of 3	# of projects meeting costs: 3 out of 3	