

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
BID EVALUATION FORM
(FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: Public Utilities Project: Scioto & Darby Creek Road 24" Water Main - Part 2
 Division: Water Funding Source: Contract No. 1021, Project No.
 Bid Opening Date: April 12, 2006
 Engineer's Estimate: \$ 966,829.50

Low Bid at Opening: \$ 659,278.61
 Non-Local Low Bid at Opening: \$ 659,278.61

	COMPANY NAME									
	Underground Utilities, Inc.	John Eramo & Sons, Inc.	Fields Excavating, Inc.	Nicholas Savko & Sons, Inc.	Complete General Construction Co.	Darby Creek Excavating	Trucco Construction Co., Inc.	Tata Excavating, Inc.	Loveland Excavating of Columbus, Inc.	McDaniel's Construction Corp., Inc.
Original Bid Amount:	\$ 577,943.86	\$ 654,460.44	\$ 659,278.61	\$ 679,565.98	\$ 754,359.65	\$ 770,910.00	\$ 771,485.39	\$ 805,926.75	\$ 814,238.26	\$ 1,089,201.89
Local Company?	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	No	Yes

FACTORS

Tier I - Mandatory Factors

M-1	Bid is responsive	no	no	yes	no	no	yes	no	no	yes
M-2	Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-3	Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-4	Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
M-5	Bidder has requisite licenses	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-6	Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one	yes	no	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	<i>Proceed to Tier II?</i>	no	no	yes	no	no	yes	no	no	yes

Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)

C-1	Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)		no			no				yes
C-2	Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit		no			yes				yes
C-3	Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit		yes			no				yes
C-4	Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit		yes			yes				yes
	<i>% of insurance provided by company</i>			100.00%		58.00%				75.00%
C-5	Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit		yes			yes				yes
	<i>% of retirement or pension plan provided by company</i>			100.00%		Not Provided				75.00%
	Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$100,000 in total)			3.00%		3.00%				5.00%
	Dollar Value of Credits			\$19,778.36		\$19,778.36				\$32,963.93
	Bid Total:			\$639,500.25		\$751,131.64				\$1,056,237.96
	Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits			\$ 639,500.25						
	Percent Over Low Bid:			0.000%		17.456%				65.166%
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)			yes		no				no
	Proceed to Tier III?			yes		no				no

Tier III - History Experience Factors

HE-1	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs			no						
HE-2	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs			no						
HE-3	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds			no						
HE-4	Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years			no						
HE-5	Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.			no						
HE-6	Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years			no						
HE-7	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:			no						
	A. Fair Labor Standards Act			no						
	B. Prevailing Wage Laws			no						
	C. Unemployment Compensation Laws			no						
	D. Worker's Compensation Laws			no						
HE-8	Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years			yes						
HE-9	Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation			yes						
HE-10	Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR			yes						
HE-11	Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years			no						
HE-12	The results of Bidder's references are questionable			no						
	Total Negative History and Experience Factors:			-1						
	A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited			yes						yes
	Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)			yes						yes
	Proceed to Tier IV?			yes						yes

Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)

Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).

R-1	Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment)			yes						
R-2	Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project			yes						
R-3	Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project			yes						
R-4	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project			yes						
R-5	Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project			yes						
	Total Number of "Yes" Answers			5						

Division's Recommendation: Fields Excavating, Inc.

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
 BID EVALUATION FORM
 (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: _____
 Division: _____

Project: Betterments
 Funding Source: Sewer Enterprise
 Bid Opening Date: 26-Jan-05
 Engineer's Estimate: \$ 525,000.00

Low Bid at Opening: \$ 500,000.00
 Non-Local Low Bid at Opening: \$ 490,000.00

	<u>COMPANY NAME</u>				
	<u>Company A</u>	<u>Company B</u>	<u>Company C</u>	<u>Company 4</u>	<u>Company 5</u>
Original Bid Amount: \$	\$ 500,000.00	\$ 490,000.00	\$ 525,000.00	\$ -	\$ -
Local Company?	yes	no	yes	\$ -	\$ -

FACTORS

Tier I - Mandatory Factors

M-1 Bid is responsive	yes	yes	yes		
M-2 Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits	yes	yes	yes		
M-3 Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	yes	yes	yes		
M-4 Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency	no	no	no		
M-5 Bidder has requisite licenses	yes	yes	yes		
M-6 Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one	yes	yes	yes		
<i>Proceed to Tier II?</i>	yes	yes	yes	no	no

Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)

C-1 Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)	yes	no	yes		
C-2 Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit	yes	no	yes	no	no
C-3 Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit	no	yes	no		
C-4 Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit	yes	yes	yes		
<i>% of insurance provided by company</i>	50.00%	50.00%	50.00%		
C-5 Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit	yes	yes	yes		
<i>% of retirement or pension plan provided by company</i>					
<i>Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$100,000 in total)</i>	4.00%	3.00%	4.00%	NA	NA
<i>Dollar Value of Credits</i>	19,900	15,000	19,900	NA	NA
<i>Bid Total:</i>	480,100.00	475,000.00	505,100.00	NA	NA

Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits

\$ 475,000.00

Percent Over Low Bid:

1.074%

Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (i.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)

yes

0.000%

6.3377%

#VALUE!

#VALUE!

Proceed to Tier III?

yes

yes

yes

#VALUE!

#VALUE!

Tier III - History Experience Factors

HE-1 Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs	no	no	no		
HE-2 Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs	no	no	no		
HE-3 Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds	no	no	no		
HE-4 Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years	no	no	yes		
HE-5 Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.	no	no	no		
HE-6 Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years	no	no	no		
HE-7 Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:	no	yes	yes		
A. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	no		
B. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no	no		
C. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	no		
D. Worker's Compensation Laws	no	no	no		
HE-8 Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years	no	no	no		
HE-9 Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation	yes	no	no		
HE-10 Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR	yes	yes	no		
HE-11 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	no	no	no		
HE-12 The results of Bidder's references are questionable	no	no	no		
<i>Total Negative History and Experience Factors:</i>	0	-1	-3	0	0
<i>A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited</i>					
<i>Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)</i>	yes	yes	no		
<i>Proceed to Tier IV?</i>	yes	yes	no	no	no

Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)

Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).

R1 Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment)	yes	yes			
R2 Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project	yes	yes			
R3 Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project	yes	yes			
R4 Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project	yes	yes			
R5 Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project	yes	yes			
Total Number of "Yes" Answers	5	5	0	0	0

Division's Recommendation: _____