

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
 BID EVALUATION FORM
 (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: Public Utilities
 Division: Water

CIP Number:
 Project Name:
 Funding Source:
 Bid Opening Date:
 Engineer's Estimate

Lowest, Best, Most Responsible Bid Amount: \$502,430.50

	K&W Roofing	BK Contracting	Re-Construction Ind.
Bid Tab Amount:	\$502,430.50	\$506,000.00	\$541,481.60

FACTORS				
<u>(Pgs. 9-10) & Form 1 (Pg. 21) - Contract Compliance</u>	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	yes	no
<u>Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages</u>	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no
	Negative Factors:	0	0	-1
<u>Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations:</u>				
	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):			
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	no
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no	no
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	no
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no	no	no
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)	no	no	no
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N)	no	yes	yes
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)	yes	yes	no
	Negative Factors:	-1	0	-1
<u>Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:</u>				
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N)	no	no	form missing
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)	yes	yes	
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	yes	yes	
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	yes	yes	
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
<u>Form 5 - Debarment</u>	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
<u>Form 6 - Local Workforce</u>	1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	100.0%	10.0%	95.0%
<u>Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs</u>				
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes	no	yes
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	50% / 50%	0%	50% / 50%
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	yes	no	no
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	EE: 100%	0%	(blank)
	Negative Factors:	0	-2	-1
<u>Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs</u>	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	no	no	no
	Negative Factors:	-1	-1	-1

		K&W Roofing	BK Contracting	Re-Construction Ind.
Bid Tab Amount:		\$502,430.50	\$506,000.00	\$541,481.60
Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED				
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes	(blank)
Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED				
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	(blank)	yes	(blank)
Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control				
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	yes	(PM to evaluate)	(blank)
Form 12 - Availability				
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	(blank)	yes	yes
Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates				
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)	no	yes	yes
	License and/or Certificate No:	G3948	No City License #	No City License #
Negative Factors:		0	0	0
Lowest Bid Dollar Amount		\$502,430.50		
Percent Over Low Bid:		0%	1%	8%
Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid)		yes	yes	yes
Pg. 39 - Environmental Preference				
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	no	no	no
	Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	NA	0.71%	7.77%
	Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	NA	\$3,569.50	\$39,051.10
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.	no	no	no
	If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified?	n/a	n/a	n/a
Pgs. 40-43 - Statements and Affidavits				
Statement 1:	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Statement 2:	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Statement 3:	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Affidavit	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Negative Factors:		0	0	0
Pg. 47 - Addenda Acknlgmt.				
	Bidder has acknowledged all addendums issued on project (Y/N)	yes	no	yes
Proposal (Pg. 48) - Proposal Signature				
	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Negative Factors:		0	-1	0
Pgs. 49 - Proposal Bond				
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	no	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Negative Factors:		-1	0	0
Grand Total Negative Factors:		-3	-4	-4
Division's Recommendation:		K & W Roofing (bid waive		

Department: <u>690500</u>					
Division: <u>HCWP Roof Restoration - 2013</u>					
<u>Water Bonds</u>					
<u>6/26/13</u>					
Lowest, Best, Most Responsible Bid Amount: <u>\$696,300.00</u>					
Bid Tab Amount:	<table border="1" style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="background-color: #e0f0ff;"><u>Team Roofing</u></td> <td style="background-color: #fff2cc;"><u>Smith Roofing</u></td> </tr> <tr> <td>\$553,047.00</td> <td>\$580,313.80</td> </tr> </table>	<u>Team Roofing</u>	<u>Smith Roofing</u>	\$553,047.00	\$580,313.80
<u>Team Roofing</u>	<u>Smith Roofing</u>				
\$553,047.00	\$580,313.80				

FACTORS			
<u>(Pgs. 9-10) & Form 1 (Pg. 21) - Contract Compliance</u>	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	no	yes
<u>Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages</u>	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no	no
Negative Factors:		-1	0
<u>Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations:</u>			
Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):			
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no	no
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)	no	no
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N)	yes	yes
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)	yes	yes
Negative Factors:		0	0
<u>Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:</u>			
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N)	yes	no
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)	yes	no
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	yes	yes
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	yes	yes
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no
Negative Factors:		-1	-1
<u>Form 5 - Debarment</u>	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no
Negative Factors:		0	0
<u>Form 6 - Local Workforce</u>	1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	<1%	50.0%
<u>Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs</u>			
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes	yes
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	58.13% / 27.21%	20% / 80%
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	yes	yes
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	N/A	20% / 80%
Negative Factors:		0	0
<u>Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs</u>	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	no	no
Negative Factors:		-1	-1

		Team Roofing	Smith Roofing
Bid Tab Amount:		\$553,047.00	\$580,313.80
<u>Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED</u>			
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	(blank)	yes
<u>Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED</u>			
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	(blank)	yes
<u>Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control</u>			
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	yes	(PM to evaluate)
<u>Form 12 - Availability</u>			
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes	yes
<u>Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates</u>			
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)	yes	yes
	License and/or Certificate No:	No City License #	No City License #
Negative Factors:		0	0
Lowest Bid Dollar Amount			
Percent Over Low Bid:		10%	16%
Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid)		no	no
<u>Pg. 39 - Environmental Preference</u>			
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	no	see comment
	Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	10.07%	15.50%
	Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	\$50,616.50	\$77,883.30
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.	no	no
	If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified?	n/a	n/a
<u>Pgs. 40-43 - Statements and Affidavits</u>			
Statement 1:	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	yes
Statement 2:	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	yes
Statement 3:	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	yes
Affidavit	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	yes	yes
Negative Factors:		0	0
<u>Pg. 47 - Addenda Acknlgmt.</u>			
	Bidder has acknowledged all addendums issued on project (Y/N)	yes	yes
<u>Proposal (Pg. 48) - Proposal Signature</u>			
	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes	yes
Negative Factors:		0	0
<u>Pgs. 49 - Proposal Bond</u>			
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)	no	yes
Negative Factors:		-1	0
Grand Total Negative Factors:		-4	-2
Division's Recommendation:		er will be required to award)	

Department: Division:		
Lowest, Best, Most Responsible Bid Amount:		
Bid Tab Amount:		Kalkreuth \$666,875.00 ???
FACTORS		
<u>(Pgs. 9-10) & Form 1 (Pg. 21) - Contract Compliance</u>	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	no
<u>Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages</u>	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no
Negative Factors:		-1
Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations:		
Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):		
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	no
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	no
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)	no
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N)	yes
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)	yes
Negative Factors:		0
Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:		
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N)	yes
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)	yes
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	yes
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	yes
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no
Negative Factors:		-1
<u>Form 5 - Debarment</u>	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no
Negative Factors:		0
<u>Form 6 - Local Workforce</u>	1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	100.0%
Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs		
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	ER: 100%
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	yes
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	ER: 100%
Negative Factors:		0
<u>Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs</u>	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	yes
Negative Factors:		0

		Kalkreuth
Bid Tab Amount:		\$666,875.00 ???
<u>Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED</u>		
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	yes
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes
<u>Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED</u>		
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	yes
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes
<u>Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control</u>		
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	(PM to evaluate)
<u>Form 12 - Availability</u>		
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes
<u>Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates</u>		
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)	yes
	License and/or Certificate No:	No City License #
Negative Factors:		0
Lowest Bid Dollar Amount		
Percent Over Low Bid:		33%
Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid)		no
<u>Pg. 39 - Environmental Preference</u>		
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	no
	Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	32.73%
	Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	\$164,444.50
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.	no
	If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified?	n/a
<u>Pgs. 40-43 - Statements and Affidavits</u>		
Statement 1:	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes
Statement 2:	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes
Statement 3:	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes
Affidavit	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	yes
Negative Factors:		0
<u>Pg. 47 - Addenda Acknlgmt.</u>		
	Bidder has acknowledged all addendums issued on project (Y/N)	yes
<u>Proposal (Pg. 48) - Proposal Signature</u>		
	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes
Negative Factors:		0
<u>Pgs. 49 - Proposal Bond</u>		
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)	yes
Negative Factors:		0
Grand Total Negative Factors:		-2
Division's Recommendation:		