CITY OF COLUMBUS BID EVALUATION FORM (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20

			(
Department	: Public Utilities	CIP Number:	690236-100056
Division	: Water	Project Name:	Florence Avenue Area WL Imp's
		Funding Source:	Water Bonds
Lo	owest, Best, Most Responsive, Responsible Bid Tab Amount:	Bid Opening Date:	10/15/14
	\$2,322,765.52	Engineer's Estimate:	\$2,389,154.33

	<u>Vendor Name:</u>	Elite Excavating	Beheler Excavating	Shelly & Sands
	Bid Tab Amount:	\$2,322,765.52	\$2,499,998.79	\$2,526,493.88
	<u>FACTORS</u>			
ıbs &				
orm 1 <u>-</u>	Dill (0 1) 1 d d (C 1 V			
	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or			
	submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	yes	у
<u>orm 2 -</u>				
laims & quidated	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or			
	has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	200		
umuges	Negative Factors:	no 0	no 0	<u> </u>
	Negative Factors:	U	U	
orm 3 Com	pliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws &			
	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with			
	the following (Y/N):			
	Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	1
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no	
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	1
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no	no	1
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any			
	governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs			
	(Y/N)	no	no	1
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers' Compensation	110	110	
	EMR (Y/N)			
		yes	no	У
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon			
	request (Y/N)	yes	yes	у
	Negative Factors:	0	-1	
	and Federal Health and Safety Laws:			
	Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA			
	violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov)	no	yes	y
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current			
	OSHA standards (Y/N)	yes	yes	у
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan	yes	yes	у
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.)			
	(Y/N)	yes	yes	у
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	·		•
	(Y/N)	no	no	1
	Negative Factors:	0	-1	
	Tregutive Luctors:	v	-	
	1.17 1:11 1 11 1/ 1.16 1: 1 :			
	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business			
	with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years			
<u>ebarment</u>	(Y/N)	no	no	1
	Negative Factors:	0	0	
<u>orm 6 -</u>	1 What was a Chilled and a chilled a control of the			
	1. What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from	0.004	0.004	52 0
orkforce_	Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	0.0%	0.0%	52.0
	Negative Factors:			
7 77 7	A. Command Donate of Decision of D			
	th Care and Pension/Retirement Programs			
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes	yes	ye
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	see comment	ER: 100%	ER: 100
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	yes	yes	у
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:		ER: 100%	ER: 100

1

		Tille Tille et		G1 11 0 G 1
	Vendor Name:	Elite Excavating	Beheler Excavating	Shelly & Sands
	Bid Tab Amount:	\$2,322,765.52 0	\$2,499,998.79	\$2,526,493.88 0
	Negative Factors:	U	U	U
<u>Form 8 - </u>				
<u>Apprenticeship</u>				
<u>Programs</u>	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	yes	no	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	-1	0
Form 0 Fun	erience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED			
rorm 9 - Exp	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	yes	yes	VAC
	Bidder has adequate quantied safety personner (1717) Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project	yes	yes	yes
	(Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Form 10 - Ex	perience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED	jes	jes	jes
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	"N/A"	yes
Form 11 - Dec	adlines and Cost Control	·		•
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar			
	construction projects (Y/N)	see comment	see comment	see comment
Form 12 - Ave				
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Form 13 - Tra	ade Licenses and Certificates			
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing			
	requirements (Y/N)	yes CA160	no	yes (Citalian Mariana)
	License and/or Certificate No:	SW0088, G4169	SW0196	no City license # listed
	Negative Factors:	0	0	V
	Lowest Bid Dollar of non-environmental preferred bidder	\$2,499,998.79		
	Percent Over Low Bid:	-7.1%	0.0%	1.1%
F	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid)	yes	yes	yes
	and and the state of the state	jes	jes	jes
Environmenta	al Preference			
Environmenta	al Preference			
<u>Environmento</u>	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid			
Environmento	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	yes	no	nc
Environmento	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable		-	
Environmento	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%)	yes -7.09%	no 0.00%	1.06%
Environmento	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable	-7.09%	0.00%	1.06%
Environmento	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (\$)		-	
Environmento	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (\$) Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark	-7.09%	0.00%	1.06%
Environmento	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (\$) Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the	-7.09% (\$177,233.28)	0.00% \$0.00	1.06% \$26,495.09
Environmento	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (\$) Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid.	-7.09%	0.00%	1.06% \$26,495.09
Environmento	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (\$) Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid. If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita	-7.09% (\$177,233.28) no; already lowest bidder	0.00% \$0.00	1.06% \$26,495.09
Environmento	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (\$) Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid.	-7.09% (\$177,233.28)	0.00% \$0.00	1.06% \$26,495.09
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (\$) Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid. If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified?	-7.09% (\$177,233.28) no; already lowest bidder	0.00% \$0.00	1.06% \$26,495.09
Statements an	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (\$) Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid. If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified?	-7.09% (\$177,233.28) no; already lowest bidder n/a	0.00% \$0.00	1.06% \$26,495.09
Statements an Statement 1:	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (\$) Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid. If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified? d Affidavits Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	-7.09% (\$177,233.28) no; already lowest bidder n/a	0.00% \$0.00 no	1.06% \$26,495.09 no
Statements an Statement 1: Statement 2:	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (\$) Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid. If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified? d Affidavits Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N) Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	-7.09% (\$177,233.28) no; already lowest bidder n/a yes	0.00% \$0.00 no yes	1.06% \$26,495.09 no
Statements an Statement 1: Statement 2:	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (\$) Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid. If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified? d Affidavits Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N) Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N) Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	-7.09% (\$177,233.28) no; already lowest bidder n/a	0.00% \$0.00 no	1.06% \$26,495.09 no
Statements an Statement 1: Statement 2:	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (\$) Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid. If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified? d Affidavits Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N) Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	-7.09% (\$177,233.28) no; already lowest bidder n/a yes	0.00% \$0.00 no yes	1.06% \$26,495.09 no
Statements an Statement 1: Statement 2: Statement 3:	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (\$) Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid. If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified? d Affidavits Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N) Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N) Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N) Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	-7.09% (\$177,233.28) no; already lowest bidder n/a yes yes yes	0.00% \$0.00 no yes yes yes	1.06% \$26,495.09 no yes yes
Statements an Statement 1: Statement 2: Statement 3:	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (\$) Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid. If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified? d Affidavits Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N) Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N) Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N) Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N) Negative Factors:	-7.09% (\$177,233.28) no; already lowest bidder n/a yes yes yes yes	yes yes yes	1.06% \$26,495.09 no yes yes
Statements an Statement 1: Statement 2: Statement 3:	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (\$) Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid. If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified? d Affidavits Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N) Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N) Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N) Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	-7.09% (\$177,233.28) no; already lowest bidder n/a yes yes yes yes	yes yes yes	1.06% \$26,495.09 no yes yes
Statements an Statement 1: Statement 2: Statement 3: Affidavit	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (\$) Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid. If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified? d Affidavits Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N) Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N) Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N) Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N) Negative Factors:	-7.09% (\$177,233.28) no; already lowest bidder n/a yes yes yes yes	yes yes yes	1.06% \$26,495.09 no yes yes
Statements an Statement 1: Statement 3: Affidavit Addenda Acknlgmt. Proposal	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (\$) Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid. If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified? d Affidavits Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N) Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N) Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N) Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N) Negative Factors: Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)	-7.09% (\$177,233.28) no; already lowest bidder n/a yes yes yes yes n/a	9.00% \$0.00 no yes yes yes yes n/a	1.06% \$26,495.09 no yes yes yes o
Statements an Statement 1: Statement 2: Statement 3: Affidavit	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (\$) Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid. If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified? d Affidavits Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N) Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N) Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N) Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N) Negative Factors: Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N) Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	-7.09% (\$177,233.28) no; already lowest bidder n/a yes yes yes yes no	9.00% \$0.00 no yes yes yes yes yes yes yes	yes yes yes yes yes
Statements an Statement 1: Statement 3: Affidavit Addenda Acknlgmt. Proposal	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (\$) Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid. If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified? d Affidavits Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N) Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N) Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N) Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N) Negative Factors: Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)	-7.09% (\$177,233.28) no; already lowest bidder n/a yes yes yes yes n/a	9.00% \$0.00 no yes yes yes yes n/a	1.06% \$26,495.09 no yes yes yes o
Statements an Statement 1: Statement 3: Affidavit Addenda Acknlgmt. Proposal Signature	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (\$) Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid. If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified? d Affidavits Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N) Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N) Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N) Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N) Negative Factors: Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N) Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N) Negative Factors:	-7.09% (\$177,233.28) no; already lowest bidder n/a yes yes yes yes no	9.00% \$0.00 no yes yes yes yes yes yes yes	1.06% \$26,495.09 no yes yes yes o
Statements an Statement 1: Statement 3: Affidavit Addenda Acknlgmt. Proposal	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (\$) Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid. If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified? d Affidavits Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N) Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N) Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N) Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N) Negative Factors: Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N) Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N) Negative Factors:	-7.09% (\$177,233.28) no; already lowest bidder n/a yes yes yes yes no	9.00% \$0.00 no yes yes yes yes yes yes yes	1.06% \$26,495.09 no yes yes yes o
Statements an Statement 1: Statement 3: Affidavit Addenda Acknlgmt. Proposal Signature	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (\$) Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid. If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified? d Affidavits Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N) Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N) Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N) Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N) Negative Factors: Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N) Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N) Negative Factors:	-7.09% (\$177,233.28) no; already lowest bidder n/a yes yes yes yes 0 n/a yes 0	0.00% \$0.00 no yes yes yes o n/a yes 0	1.06% \$26,495.09 no yes yes yes yes 0 n/a yes
Statements an Statement 1: Statement 3: Affidavit Addenda Acknlgmt. Proposal Signature	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (\$) Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid. If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified? d Affidavits Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N) Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N) Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N) Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N) Negative Factors: Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N) Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N) Negative Factors:	-7.09% (\$177,233.28) no; already lowest bidder n/a yes yes yes yes 0 n/a yes yes	0.00% \$0.00 no yes yes yes yes 0 n/a yes 0	1.06% \$26,495.09 no yes yes yes o n/a yes 0
Statements an Statement 1: Statement 2: Statement 3: Affidavit Addenda Acknlgmt. Proposal Signature	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (\$) Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid. If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified? d Affidavits Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N) Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N) Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N) Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N) Negative Factors: Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N) Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N) Negative Factors: d Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N) Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	-7.09% (\$177,233.28) no; already lowest bidder n/a yes yes yes yes 0 n/a yes yes yes	0.00% \$0.00 no yes yes yes yes 0 n/a yes 0 yes yes	1.06% \$26,495.09 no yes yes yes yes 0 n/a yes 0
Statements an Statement 1: Statement 3: Affidavit Addenda Acknlgmt. Proposal Signature	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (\$) Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid. If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified? d Affidavits Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N) Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N) Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N) Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N) Negative Factors: Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N) Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N) Negative Factors:	-7.09% (\$177,233.28) no; already lowest bidder n/a yes yes yes yes 0 n/a yes yes	0.00% \$0.00 no yes yes yes yes 0 n/a yes 0	1.06% \$26,495.09 no yes yes yes o n/a yes 0

	Vendor Name:	Elite Excavating	Beheler Excavating	Shelly & Sands
	Bid Tab Amount:	\$2,322,765.52	\$2,499,998.79	\$2,526,493.88
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
	Grand Total Negative Factors:	0	-3	-1
	Division's Recommendation:	ELITE I	EXCAVATING CO. OF (OHIO, INC.
Addition	nal Evaluation Questions for Non-Responsive Proposals per Section	n 102.08, not covered ab	ove in RED.	
	Has the bidder submitted more than one proposal under			
1)	the same name/subsidiary? (Y/N)	no	no	no
2)	Are the bid prices material unbalanced? (Y/N)	no	no	no
	Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not			
3)	provided in the bid documents? (Y/N)	no	no	no
	Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all			
	material respects, and does not contain irregularities or			
4)	deviations? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to	•	•	
5)	accept or reject an award? (Y/N)	no	no	no
	Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract			
6)	item listed? (Y/N)	no	no	no
	Did the bidder fail to submit a lump sum price where			
7)	required? (Y/N)	no	no	no
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0

1	
	000

Department:	Public Utilities
Division:	Water

Lowest, Best, Most Responsive, Responsible Bid Tab Amount: \$2,322,765.52

	Vendor Name:	Fields Excavating	John Eramo	Cols. Asphalt Paving
	Bid Tab Amount:	\$2,596,250.93	\$2,770,408.77	\$2,808,862.29
	<u>FACTORS</u>			
ubs &				
<u>orm 1 -</u>	Dillo (8 od Nicolay Control Constitution N			
ontract_	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or			
ompliance	submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	yes	У
orm 2 <u>-</u> laims &				
quidated	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or			
amages	has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	
	Negative Factors:	0	0	
orm 3 - Ca	ompliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws &			
	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with			
	the following (Y/N):			
	Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no	
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no	no	
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any			
	governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs			
	(Y/N)	no	no	
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers' Compensation			
	EMR (Y/N)	yes	yes	y
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon		_	
	request (Y/N)	yes	yes	У
	Negative Factors:	0	0	
orm 4 - Sto	ate and Federal Health and Safety Laws:			
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA			
	violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov)	no	no	
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current			
	OSHA standards (Y/N)	yes	yes)
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan	yes	yes)
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.)			
	(Y/N)	yes	yes	<u> </u>
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years			
	(Y/N)	no	no	
	Negative Factors:	0	0	
	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business			
<u>orm 5 -</u>	with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years			
<u>ebarment</u>	(Y/N)	no	no	
	Negative Factors:	0	0	
orm 6 -				
ocal	1. What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from			
orkforce	Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	0.0%	82.0%	50.0
	Negative Factors:			
	H.G. ID I G			
orm 7 - He	ealth Care and Pension/Retirement Programs			
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes	yes PE 2004	ye
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	ER: 100%	ER: 80% - EE: 20%	ER: 100
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	yes	yes	
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	ER: 100%	ER: 100%	ER: 100

ORD# 2461				~
	Vendor Name:	Fields Excavating	John Eramo	Cols. Asphalt Paving
	Bid Tab Amount:	\$2,596,250.93	\$2,770,408.77	\$2,808,862.29
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
Form 8 -				
Apprenticeship				
<u>Programs</u>	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	yes	no	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	-1	0
Е 0 Б	' C . I D NOW ORDOW LIZED			
Form 9 - Exp	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	VOC.	NOC	VO.
	Bidder has adequate quantied safety personner (1714) Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project	yes	yes	yes
	(Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Form 10 - Ex	perience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED	yes	yes	you
10/11/10 124	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	TBD	"TBD"	yes
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	N/A	yes	yes
Form 11 - De	adlines and Cost Control		,	
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar			
	construction projects (Y/N)	see comment	see comment	see comment
Form 12 - Av	<u>ailability</u>			
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Form 13 - Tre	ade Licenses and Certificates			
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing			
	requirements (Y/N)	no	no	yes
	License and/or Certificate No:	SW0013	SW0004	SW0079
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
	T DID II O DID			
	Lowest Bid Dollar of non-environmental preferred bidder	2.00/	10.00/	12.40/
	Percent Over Low Bid:	3.9%	10.8%	12.4%
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid)	yes	no	no
Environment	al Profession			
Lavaoamena				
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid	did not evaluate since not		
	book? (Y/N)	within \$20k	no	no
	Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable	για		
	bidder (%)	3.85%	10.82%	12.35%
	Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable			
	bidder (\$)	\$96,252.13	\$270,409.98	\$308,863.50
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark			
	"Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the			
	lowest non-environmentally preferred bid.	no	no	no
	If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita			
	Musser been notified?			
Statements ar				
	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	initialed, not dated	initialed but not dated
	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	initialed, not dated	initialed but not dated
Statement 3:	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	initialed, not dated	initialed but not dated
A 60° J 4	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized			
Affidavit	(Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0	
Adda: 1-	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project			
<u>Addenda</u> Acknlgmt.	(Y/N)	n/a	n/a	n/a
	(1/11)	11/4	11/α	11/0
Proposal			yes	yes
<u>Proposal</u> <u>Signature</u>	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes	yes	
	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N) Negative Factors:	yes 0	0	0
<u>Signature</u>	Negative Factors:	•	•	
	Negative Factors:	•	•	
<u>Signature</u>	Negative Factors: d Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name	•	•	(
<u>Signature</u>	Negative Factors: d Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	yes	•	yes
<u>Signature</u>	Megative Factors: d Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N) Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	0	0	yes yes
<u>Signature</u>	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N) Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N) Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
<u>Signature</u>	Megative Factors: d Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N) Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes yes	yes yes	•

OKDII 2	101-2014			
	Vendor Name:	Fields Excavating	<u>John Eramo</u>	Cols. Asphalt Paving
	Bid Tab Amount:	\$2,596,250.93	\$2,770,408.77	\$2,808,862.29
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
	Grand Total Negative Factors:	0	-1	0
	Division's Recommendation:	ELITE E	XCAVATING CO. OF C	OHIO, INC.
Additiona	al Evaluation Questions for Non-Responsive Proposals per Section			
	Has the bidder submitted more than one proposal under			
1)	the same name/subsidiary? (Y/N)	no	no	no
2)	Are the bid prices material unbalanced? (Y/N)	no	no	no
	Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not			
3)	provided in the bid documents? (Y/N)	no	no	no
	Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all			
	material respects, and does not contain irregularities or			
4)	deviations? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to			
5)	accept or reject an award? (Y/N)	no	no	no
	Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract			
6)	item listed? (Y/N)	no	no	no
	Did the bidder fail to submit a lump sum price where			
7)	required? (Y/N)	no	no	no
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0

Department:	Public Utilities
Division:	Water
Lo	west, Best, Most Responsive, Responsible Bid Tab Amount
	\$2,322,765.52

			WITHDREW BID
	Vendor Name:	Complete Gen'l	<u>Conie</u>
	Bid Tab Amount:	\$2,969,573.47	\$1,967,650.00
	<u>FACTORS</u>		
Subs &			
<u> Form 1 - </u>			
Contract	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or		
<u>Compliance</u>	submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	no
<u>Form 2 -</u>			
Claims & Liquidated	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or		
Damages	has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no	yes
Dumuges	Negative Factors:	0	
	regulite lactors.	v	-
Form 3 - Co	ompliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws &		
1011110 00	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with		
	the following (Y/N):		
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws		no
		no	no
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no	no
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any		
	governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs		
	(Y/N)	no	no
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers' Compensation		
	EMR (Y/N)	yes	yes
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon		·
	request (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0
Form 4 - Sta	ate and Federal Health and Safety Laws:		
	Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA		
	violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov)	yes	no
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current	•	
	OSHA standards (Y/N)	yes	yes
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan	yes	yes
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.)	jes	jes
	(Y/N)	yes	yes
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	jes	yes
	(Y/N)	no	no
	Negative Factors:	-1	0
	regative ractors.	-1	
	1.77 1:11 1 11 1/ 1.16 1: 1 :		
	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business		
<u>Form 5 - </u>	with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years		
<u>Debarment</u>	(Y/N)	no	no
	Negative Factors:	0	0
Г (
<u>Form 6 - </u>	1. What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from		
<u>Local</u> Workforce	Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	59.0%	53.0%
<u> тогкјогсе</u>	Negative Factors:	39.0%	33.070
	Negauve ractors:		
Form 7 II.	ealth Care and Pension/Retirement Programs		
<u>r orm / - 116</u>	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	••••	
		yes ED: 100%	yes ED: 100%
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	ER: 100%	ER: 100%
	Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) If yes, percentage paid into plan:	yes ER: 100%	yes
			see comment

OKD# 2461	Vendor Name:	Complete Gen'l	Conie
	Bid Tab Amount:	\$2,969,573.47	\$1,967,650.00
	Negative Factors:	0	\$1,907,030.00 0
	riegarie Lactors.		
<u>Form 8 - </u>			
Apprenticeship Programs	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	VAC	no
110grums	Negative Factors:	yes 0	-1
	regative ractors.	U	-1
Form 9 - Exp	erience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED		
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project		
	(Y/N)	yes	yes
<u>Form 10 - Ex</u>	perience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED		
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	yes	yes
Form 11 Da	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N) adlines and Cost Control	"None needed"	yes
<u> F 0 rm 11 - De</u>	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar		
	construction projects (Y/N)	see comment	see comment
Form 12 - Av		see comment	See comment
12	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes	yes
Form 13 - Tro	ade Licenses and Certificates	<u> </u>	<u> </u>
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing		
	requirements (Y/N)	no	no
	License and/or Certificate No:	SW00146	SW0035
	Negative Factors:	0	0
	T (DID II 6) (1 6 1111		
	Lowest Bid Dollar of non-environmental preferred bidder Percent Over Low Bid:	18.8%	-21.3%
1	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid)	18.8% no	-21.5% yes
-	Linear Equivalent Bit (1.0., within 10 /0 of 10 w bit)	110	yes
Environment	al Preference		
		did not evaluate since	
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid	not within 5% or	
	book? (Y/N)	\$20k	yes
	Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable		
	bidder (%)	18.78%	-21.29%
	Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable	h460 == 4 60	(h=a= a 40 =0)
	bidder (\$)	\$469,574.68	(\$532,348.79)
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the		no; Conie is
	lowest non-environmentally preferred bid.	no	
	If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita	no	withdrawing their bid
	Musser been notified?		
Statements an	l nd Affidavits		
Statement 1:	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	marked "is not"	yes
	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	yes
Statement 3:	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized		
Affidavit	(Y/N)	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0
	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project		
Addenda Acknlgmt.	(Y/N)	n/a	n/a
Proposal	(1/1)	II/a	II/a
<u>Signature</u>	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0
_	<u>L</u>		
Proposal Bon			
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name		
	(Y/N) Didden has attached Surety Douge of Attampty (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N) Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of	yes	yes
	Compliance (Y/N)	yes	yes
I		yes	yes

$OKD\pi$	2401-2014		
	Vendor Name:	Complete Gen'l	<u>Conie</u>
	Bid Tab Amount:	\$2,969,573.47	\$1,967,650.00
	Negative Factors:	0	0
	Grand Total Negative Factors:	-1	-3
	Division's Recommendation:	ELITE EXCAVAT	TING CO. OF OHIO
Addition	nal Evaluation Questions for Non-Responsive Proposals per Secti		
	Has the bidder submitted more than one proposal under		
1)	the same name/subsidiary? (Y/N)	no	no
2)	Are the bid prices material unbalanced? (Y/N)	no	yes
	Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not		
3)	provided in the bid documents? (Y/N)	no	no
		No; marked "is not:"	
	Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all	current on City taxes,	
	material respects, and does not contain irregularities or	but could be they don't	
4)	deviations? (Y/N)	owe any.	???
	Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to		
5)	accept or reject an award? (Y/N)	no	no
	Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract		
6)	item listed? (Y/N)	no	no
	Did the bidder fail to submit a lump sum price where		
7)	required? (Y/N)	n	no
	Negative Factors:	0	-1