

**CITY OF COLUMBUS  
 BID EVALUATION FORM  
 (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: Public Utilities

CIP Number: 610761 / 690236

Division: DOSD/DOPW

Project Name: Safford/Union Improvements

Funding Source: Bond Funds

Bid Opening Date: 12/21/11

Lowest Bidder: \$1,649,999.99

Engineer's Estimate: \$2,520,394.10

Non-Local Lowest Bidder: \$1,649,999.99

\*Lowest bid should be entered as Bidder 1.

	Beheler Excavating	Underground Utilitie	Elite Excavating	John Eramo	Nickolas Savko
<b>Bid Tab Amount:</b>	\$1,649,999.99	\$1,833,434.67	\$1,868,848.96	\$2,030,298.90	\$2,130,612.76
<b>Local Company? (Proof s/b included.)</b>	No	No	No	Yes	Yes

<b>FACTORS</b>						
<b>Tier I - Mandatory Factors</b>						
M-1	Bid is responsive (Y or N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
M-2	Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits (Y or N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
M-3	Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y or N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
M-4	Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency (Y or N)	No	no	no	no	no
M-5	Bidder & subs have requisite licenses (Y or N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
M-6	Bidder & subs have provided a contract compliance no., or application for one (Y or N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
	<b>Proceed to Tier II?</b>	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
<b>Tier II - Creditable Factors</b>						
C-1	Bidder is eligible for local business credit? - (see below for clarification)	no	no	no	yes	yes
	If lowest bidder's business is local, they do receive local credit, as long as there is a non-local bidder. If the lowest bidder's business IS NOT local and another bidder's business is local, then the local bidder receives credit. Local credit is 1% of the apparent low, non-local					
C-2	Environmental Preference: To receive preference, bidder must include documentation that meets guidelines in bid book, bid must not exceed 5% of the lowest responsive, responsible, and best bid from any non-preferable bid, and must not exceed \$20,000 of the same.					
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y or N)	No	No	Yes	no	yes
	Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	NA	11.12%	13.26%	22.05%	28.13%
	Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	NA	\$183,434.68	\$218,848.97	\$363,798.91	\$464,112.77
	Does bidder receive environmental preference? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.	No	no	no	no	no
	<b>Total Local Credit</b>	FALSE	FALSE	FALSE	1.00%	1.00%
	<b>Dollar Value of Credits</b>	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$16,500.00	\$16,500.00
	<b>Evaluated Bid Total:</b>	<b>\$1,649,999.99</b>	<b>\$1,833,434.67</b>	<b>\$1,868,848.96</b>	<b>\$2,013,798.90</b>	<b>\$2,114,112.76</b>
	<b>Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits</b>	<b>\$1,649,999.99</b>	<b>\$1,833,434.67</b>	<b>\$1,868,848.96</b>	<b>\$1,997,298.90</b>	<b>\$2,097,612.76</b>
	<b>Percent Over Low Bid:</b>	0%	11%	13%	22%	28%
	<b>Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)</b>	yes	no	no	no	no
	<b>Proceed to Tier III?</b>	yes	no	no	no	no
<b>Tier III - Employer &amp; History Factors</b>						
E-1	Bidder has local workforce? (Y or N)	No				
E-2	Bidder is a quality training contractor? (Y or N)	Yes				
E-3	Bidder has health insurance? (Y or N)	Yes				
E-4	Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y or N)	Yes				
HE-1	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs	no				
HE-2	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs	no				
HE-3	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds	no				
HE-4	Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years	no				
HE-5	Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.	no				
HE-6	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:					
	A. Fair Labor Standards Act	no				
	B. Prevailing Wage Laws	no				
	C. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no				
	D. Worker's Compensation Laws	no				
HE-7	Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov)	Yes				
HE-8	Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation	Yes				
HE-9	Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR	no				
HE-10	Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	no				
HE-11	The results of Bidder's references are questionable	no				
	<b>Total Negative History and Experience Factors:</b>	-3	0	0	0	0
	<b>A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited.</b>					
	<b>Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)</b>	Yes				
	<b>Proceed to Tier IV?</b>	yes	no	no	no	no
<b>Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)</b>						
Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following						
R-1	Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment)	yes				
R-2	Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project	yes				
R-3	Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project	yes				
R-4	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project	yes				
R-5	Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project	yes				
	<b>Total Number of "Yes" Answers</b>	5	0	0	0	0
<b>Division's Recommendation:</b>			<b>(to be completed by Engineer)</b>			