

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
 BID EVALUATION FORM
 (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: Public Utilities

CIP Number: 690290-100003

Division: Water

Project Name: 3568 Indianola Ave. Electrical Upgrades

Funding Source: Water Bonds

Bid Opening Date: 7/31/13

Lowest, Best, Most Responsive, Responsible Bid Amount: \$38,060.00

Engineer's Estimate \$40,600.00

Bid Tab Amount: Jess Howard Electric \$38,060.00 Accurate Electric Const \$47,250.00

FACTORS

*(Pgs. 6-7) &
 Form 1 (Pg. 19) - Contract Compliance*

Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)

yes

yes

Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages

Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)

no

no

Negative Factors: 0 0 0

Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations:

Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):

1. Fair Labor Standards Act

no

no

2. Prevailing Wage Laws

no

no

3. Unemployment Compensation Laws

no

no

4. Workers' Compensation Laws

no

no

5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)

no

no

6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N)

yes

yes

7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)

yes

yes

Negative Factors: 0 0 0

Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:

1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N)

yes

yes

2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)

yes

yes

3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)

yes

yes

4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)

yes

yes

5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)

no

no

Negative Factors: -1 -1 0

Form 5 - Debarment

1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)

no

no

Negative Factors: 0 0 0

Form 6 - Local Workforce

1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties

95.0%

see comment

Negative Factors:

Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs

1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)

yes

yes

2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:

ER:32%

ER: 50%

3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)

yes

yes

4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:

ER: 3@100%

EE: 3-max 12%

see comment

Negative Factors: 0 0 0

Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs

1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)

yes

yes

Negative Factors: 0 0 0

Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED

Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)

yes

yes

Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)

yes

see comment

Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED

Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)

see comment

yes

Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)

yes

see comment

		Jess Howard Electric	Accurate Electric Const
Bid Tab Amount:		\$38,060.00	\$47,250.00
Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control			
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	see comment	see comment
Form 12 - Availability			
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes	yes
Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates			
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)	no	no
	License and/or Certificate No:	No City license # given	No City license # given
	Negative Factors:	0	0
	Lowest Bid Dollar Amount	\$38,060.00	
	Percent Over Low Bid:	0%	24%
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('Le., within 10% of low bid)	yes	no
			-100%
			yes
Pg. 37 - Environmental Preference			
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	no	no
	Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	NA	24.15%
	Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	NA	\$9,190.00
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.	no	no
	If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified?	N/A	N/A
			(\$38,060.00)
Pgs. 38-41 - Statements and Affidavits			
Statement 1:	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	yes
Statement 2:	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	yes
Statement 3:	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	yes
Affidavit	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0
Pg. 46 - Addenda Acknlgmt.			
	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)	n/a	n/a
Proposal (Pg. 46) - Proposal Signature			
	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0
Pg. 47 - Proposal Bond			
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0
	Grand Total Negative Factors:	-1	-1
			0
	Division's Recommendation:	Jess Howard Electric Co.	

Additional Evaluation Questions for Non-Responsive Proposals per Section 102.08, not covered above in RED.

1)	Has the bidder submitted more than one proposal under the same name/subsidiary? (Y/N)	no	no
2)	Are the bid prices material unbalanced? (Y/N)	no	no
3)	Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not provided in the bid documents? (Y/N)	no	no
4)	Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all material respects, and does not contain irregularities or deviations? (Y/N)	yes	yes
5)	Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to accept or reject an award?	no	no
6)	Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract item listed? (Y/N)	no	no
7)	Did the bidder fail to submit a lump sum price where required? (Y/N)	no	no
	Negative Factors:	0	0