

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
BID EVALUATION FORM
(FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: Public Utilities
Division: Sewerage & Drainage

Project: SCB Control Room & Electrical Room HVAC Replacement, PIP-252

EXHIBIT 2 - Both bids shown as non-responsive

Funding Source: Operating Budget

Bid Opening Date: 15-June 05

Engineer's Estimate: \$240,000 with Force Account

Low Bid at Opening: \$ 188,494.00
Non-Local Low Bid at Opening:

	COMPANY NAME		Company 5	Company 6
Original Bid Amount:	\$ 188,494.00	\$ 350,000.00	\$ -	\$ -
Local Company?				

FACTORS

Tier I - Mandatory Factors (must have yes for all for bid to qualify)

M-1 Bid is responsive	no	no				
M-2 Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits	yes	yes				
M-3 Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	yes	yes				
M-4 Bidder not currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency	yes	yes				
M-5 Bidder has requisite licenses	yes	yes				
M-6 Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one	yes	yes				
Proceed to Tier II?	no	no	no	no	no	no

Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)

C-1 Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)	no	no	no		no	no
C-2 Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit	yes	yes				
C-3 Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit	yes	yes				
C-4 Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit	yes	yes				
% of insurance provided by company	100.00%	100.00%				
C-5 Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit	yes	no				
% of retirement or pension plan provided by company	100.00%	0.00%				
Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$100,000 in total)	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Dollar Value of Credits	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Bid Total:	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA

Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits

\$ -

Percent Over Low Bid:

#VALUE!

#VALUE!

#VALUE!

#VALUE!

#VALUE!

#VALUE!

Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)

#VALUE!

#VALUE!

#VALUE!

#VALUE!

#VALUE!

#VALUE!

Proceed to Tier III?

#VALUE!

#VALUE!

#VALUE!

#VALUE!

#VALUE!

#VALUE!

Tier III - History Experience Factors (each yes answer gives 1 point debit)

HE-1 Bidder has not demonstrated a good faith effort to comply with the requirements of the City of Columbus' Equal Business Opportunity Program	no	no				
HE-2 Bidder has not complied with federal, state and local affirmative action programs	no	no				
HE-3 Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds	no	no				
HE-4 Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past five years	no	no				
HE-5 Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.	no	no				
HE-6 Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 5 years	no	no				
HE-7 Bidder has a record, within the past 5 years, of violations with the following:						
A. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no				
B. Prevailing Wqage Laws	no	no				
C. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no				
D. Worker's Compensation Laws	no	no				
HE-8 Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years	no	no				
HE-9 Bidder lacks an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation	no	no				
HE-10 Bidder's OSHA Experience Modification Rating (EMR) is greater than 1.0	no	n/a				
HE-11 Bidder has a record of violations with environmental regulations	no	no				
HE12 The results of Bidder's references are questionable	no	yes				
Total Negative History and Experience Factors:	0	-1			0	0
A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited						
Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome?	yes	no				
Proceed to Tier IV?	yes	no	no	no	no	no

Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answer desirable)

Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).

R1 Bidder has sufficient resources to reasonably complete this project	yes	?				
R2 Bidder's management resources have sufficient experience	yes	?				
R3 Bidder's workforce resources have sufficient experience	yes	?				
R4 Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project	yes	no				
R5 Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project	yes	yes				
Total Number of "Yes" Answers	5	1	0	0	0	0

Division's Recommendation: Johnson Controls