

RFP EVALUATION: Security Guard Services

Evaluator: Steve Sammons

Company: ~~ANDY FRAIN SERVICES~~

Final Score: 90

1. Does the bidder have experience and proper training in this service (20 Points)

Score: 20

Comments: Vendor has been in business for over 80 years and in that time has amassed high marks and credentials from a diverse array of security monitored environments.

2. Does the bidder have experience that includes other governmental agencies (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: The Ohio Department of Transportation satisfies this requirement. In addition their resume includes Federal Express, Norwegian Cruise Lines, the Memphis Grizzlies and Chicago Bears and the University of Mississippi, just to mention a few.

3. Does the bidder have the personnel with proper ability, training & experience to perform (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: The bigger you are, the more money you can invest in the training and expectations of your employees. This is a massive company with many resources of support to funnel into the training of their people.

4. Did the bidder submit information adequately to document experience, ability, training and personnel (15 Points)

Score: 15

Comments: Above and beyond expectations

5. Does the bidder have a mechanism to ensure personnel receive background checks, no drug and alcohol policies, on-going training requirements, etc. (15 Points)

Score: 15

Comments: Quite extensive both in the required expectations of and pre-screening of prospective candidates for hire.

6. Did the bidder submit a complete bid package including the required submission information (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: They state that the SUPERVISOR is N/A, since Supervision is provided from a Regional Supervisor. They do mention an alternative statement, which at best is more of a self-disclosure than anything we specifically asked for.

7. Does the bidder have a favorable history in similar services (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: The commentary is excellent with regards to the bidder and the service they provide.

8. Is the pricing within the City of Columbus Living Wage Requirement (\$12.38/hour) (10 Points)

Score: 0

Comments: They bid a rate of \$17.77 as the amount they would charge the CITY OF COLUMBUS, however, to satisfy our request for compliance with the City of Columbus Living Wage Requirements, they stated that their wage rate was \$10.00 per hour, plus \$2.39 for medical benefits. Essentially what that says is that their security guards are paid \$10.00 per hour as a wage rate and \$2.39 is paid to cover their medical expenses. This amount is inclusive in the stated \$17.77 which means the rest is profit. The only problem is that the \$10.00 per hour wage rate IS BELOW our Living Wage Requirement which essentially disqualifies them as a bidder.

Since none of the other bidders offered the breakdown in their bids, it must be assumed that they are in agreement with and furthermore bound to the specification demanding that our living wage rate of \$12.38/hour PLUS medical benefits be adhered to. This might also be a subject of discussion to raise amongst the other bidders to be sure that they have bid in accordance with the specifications or did they just not disclose, like this bidder did, the actual costs that their bid price is comprised of.

Are there any additional comments you may have to assist in the overall evaluation of this company?

From the standpoint of what our particular application is, SCREENING GUESTS/EMPLOYEES ENTERING THE GATES AT 910 DUBLIN ROAD, this vendor is impressively qualified and specifically trained to perform the task, however, the LIVING WAGE RATE DISQUALIFIES THEM, because it doesn't meet the very basic tenants of the city requirements.

RFP EVALUATION: Security Guard Services

Evaluator: Steve Sammons

Company: API SECURITY SERVICES & INVESTIGATIONS INC.

Final Score: 17

1. Does the bidder have experience and proper training in this service (20 Points)

Score: 0

Comments: There is nothing on the company profile, so we don't know how long they have been in business, nor how long the VP of Security Services, who prepared this bid has been with them; we do know they have 19 employees Columbus of the 19 total in the company. While his experience is diverse enough, there is no information about his progression, his specific involvement with security related professions and absolutely nothing about the employees.

2. Does the bidder have experience that includes other governmental agencies (10 Points)

Score: 4

Comments: Of the six references he offers, he lists the Columbus Metropolitan Library, which may be the closest entity to this type of application, however, there is no indication of how long, whether or not it is still current and/or what else they are involved with. It would appear that his current clients are primarily offices/warehouses after hours or in a limited role (15,000 + hours annually doesn't seem like much for 19 employees).

3. Does the bidder have the personnel with proper ability, training & experience to perform (10 Points)

Score: 0

Comments: There is nothing in this bid to define what the training or experience of their employees is or is expected to be. He just did not define or detail either.

4. Did the bidder submit information adequately to document experience, ability, training and personnel (15 Points)

Score: 0

Comments: There are no supportive documents indicating the prerequisites, hiring practices, pre-screening, training and development of the employees for this company.

5. Does the bidder have a mechanism to ensure personnel receive background checks, no drug and alcohol policies, on-going training requirements, etc. (15 Points)

Score: 0

Comments: Again, this is undefined. The bidder did not address this very important issue at all, other than in his blanket statement in the cover letter that they have "agreed to meet all requirements and conditions in this proposal."

6. Did the bidder submit a complete bid package including the required submission information (10 Points)

Score: 4

Comments: The basic provisions were given. He gave names and numbers to at least five (5) Security references; he provided proof of insurance and proof that they are licensed in the State of Ohio; he gave a brief resume of the Account Manager (himself) and did provide pricing for the Security Guard and the Supervisor (which are identical making one wonder if they are the same person). He signed his bid.

His EWC Certificate expired on 2/29/08. His Notary signed the signature affidavit with a date of March 17, 2007 and he did not include any training and screening policies or procedures. As much as it is incomplete, this bid is just not acceptable as presented.

7. Does the bidder have a favorable history in similar services (10 Points)

Score: 4

Comments: The only measure is the references he lists which are limited in annual hours.

8. Is the pricing within the City of Columbus Living Wage Requirement (\$12.38/hour) (10 Points)

Score: 5

Comments: He lists both the SECURITY GUARD and the SUPERVISOR with the same rate of \$16.50 each, which would indicate that they are one in the same or full-time/part-time. There is no changes in the pay rate, which suggests a limited involvement by the latter.

Are the any additional comments you may have to assist in the overall evaluation of this company?

This is an incomplete, unsupported bid document, which the averages will attest to.

RFP EVALUATION: Security Guard Services

Evaluator: Steve Sammons

Company: DUN-WELL SECURITY SERVICES, INC.

Final Score: 98

1. Does the bidder have experience and proper training in this service (20 Points)

Score: 20

Comments: Company profile and references validate that bidder has both the experience and ongoing training to handle this service. The only drawback, is that none of the experience is from references in OHIO, as this is a Michigan based company with references from ILL, MD, MI, NC and CA.

2. Does the bidder have experience that includes other governmental agencies (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: The references for the bidder indicate a strong influence with governmental agencies, such as: Corp of Engineers in Michigan, Federal Aviation Administration in Illinois, National Archives & Records Administration in MD, Department of Veterans Affairs in MI and Environmental Protection Agency in NC. All of this correlates with the bid specifications as written, however, the lack of a local bidder brings up many potential drawbacks.

3. Does the bidder have the personnel with proper ability, training & experience to perform (10 Points)

Score: 8

Comments: There are 98 employees in the company but none of the personnel are local. It would appear that the expertise and experience is well suited for this type of environment, but, since none of the employees currently reside in OHIO, administration of this job would be on a temporary residential or transfer basis and conversely, the resources for follow up and upper level response would be significantly challenged. The bid proposal shows the Supervisor with almost 3 times more time than the Security Guard, which accounts for a majority of the bill. That indicates that the majority of work in this assignment will be handled by a Supervisor which may seemingly take out the presence of a Central Dispatch unit, instead, acting as a resource to himself.

4. Did the bidder submit information adequately to document experience, ability, training and personnel (15 Points)

Score: 15

Comments: The bidder did an excellent job detailing their responsiveness to the bid requirements with regard to experience, ability, training and personnel.

5. Does the bidder have a mechanism to ensure personnel receive background checks, no drug and alcohol policies, on-going training requirements, etc. (15 Points)

Score: 15

Comments: These items are specifically addressed in the documentation provided.

6. Did the bidder submit a complete bid package including the required submission information (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: Everything was submitted in its entirety as specified.

7. Does the bidder have a favorable history in similar services (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: The summary for job experiences is quite exhaustive and very much in accordance with the specifications.

8. Is the pricing within the City of Columbus Living Wage Requirement (\$12.38/hour) (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: He lists only the SECURITY GUARD at \$23.50/hour and SUPERVISOR rates at \$24.50/hour each. The hours attributed to each is 753 and 2008 respectively which would indicate that the SUPERVISOR is going to be the primary assignee on this job. While this assures the highest level of experience, it also comes at the loss of a reporting chain of command, except for calling their corporate offices OUT OF STATE. It should be noted also, that even though our objective is not as much comparison between vendors as it is compliance to the specification on an individual basis, it is of note that these pay rates are on the average \$4.00 higher than the next closest competitor for an out-of-state bidder.... perhaps, we are paying for relocation and/or travel expenses in that salary.

Are there any additional comments you may have to assist in the overall evaluation of this company?

My only hit on this bidder is the complete removal of a local support staff, pretty much isolating whoever is assigned to manage this contract to us alone, save whomever else is with him, maybe no more than two (2) company representatives all together. I think that is something to be mindful of.

RFP EVALUATION: Security Guard Services

Evaluator: Steve Sammons

Company: INVESTIGATION & PROTECTION AGENCY, INC. dba SPECIAL DUTY TASK FORCE

Final Score: 93

1. Does the bidder have experience and proper training in this service (20 Points)

Score: 15

Comments: There is nothing on the company profile, so we don't know how long they have been in business, although, Donald Collison's resume states he has been with the company since 2002, so it is at least six (6) years old; we do know they have 12 employees Columbus of the 26 total in the company. Mr. Collison has been involved in Security type vocations since 1996. The resumes of his supervisory staff indicates much of the same, with experience and concentration in the Security discipline.

2. Does the bidder have experience that includes other governmental agencies (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: Currently servicing Fleet Management in a temporary assignment at their new facility on Groves Road. Most of their experience (current and former) has been in the Vocational and Industrial fields, with a evenly split distinction of armed and unarmed assignments.

3. Does the bidder have the personnel with proper ability, training & experience to perform (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: Mr. Collison's personal background and that of his supervisors, plus the Policies, Procedures and Training disclosure he provided indicates his strong recognition of the need for highly trained personnel, with an emphasis on quality over quantity... he seems to be making the most with a relatively small, highly specialized staff.

4. Did the bidder submit information adequately to document experience, ability, training and personnel (15 Points)

Score: 15

Comments: The Policies, Procedures & Training disclosure provided in this bid indicates a specific regimented approach to hiring and maintaining a specific type of employee for the job this company performs.

5. Does the bidder have a mechanism to ensure personnel receive background checks, no drug and alcohol policies, on-going training requirements, etc. (15 Points)

Score: 15

Comments: These items are specifically addressed in the disclosure provided.

6. Did the bidder submit a complete bid package including the required submission information (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: He addresses the basic tenants requested in the bid proposal, nothing more, nothing less.

7. Does the bidder have a favorable history in similar services (10 Points)

Score: 8

Comments: The only measure is the references he lists which currently are limited in number only. His former clientele indicates cyclical opportunities will keep this company experiencing growth in this industry.

8. Is the pricing within the City of Columbus Living Wage Requirement (\$12.38/hour) (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: He lists only the SECURITY GUARD rate of \$17.50/hour, noting that the Supervisor expense is included in their hourly rate.

Are there any additional comments you may have to assist in the overall evaluation of this company?

While this seems to be a young company on the move within the Security Services ranks, they seem to be jacks of all trades, specializing in a wide array of security endeavors. That might just be enough in an application that will basically require them to monitor a gated parking lot from a guard station situated right by that gate.

RFP EVALUATION: Security Guard Services

Evaluator: Steve Sammons

Company: NATIONAL PREMIER PROTECTIVE SERVICES, LLC, dba PREMIER SECURITY

Final Score: 92

1. Does the bidder have experience and proper training in this service (20 Points)

Score: 20

Comments: Company profile and exhaustive references validate that bidder has both the experience and ongoing training to handle this service.

2. Does the bidder have experience that includes other governmental agencies (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: The bidder lists a qualitative summary of references, primarily vested in the vocational and commercial disciplines, with clients such as: East Cleveland School District, Cleveland Cuyahoga County Port Authority, Holiday Inn Columbus, Polaris Mall and Franklin County Auto Title. Their application at the Cleveland Cuyahoga Port Authority may most closely resemble our own tasks here, as they are involved with screening, homeland security, checking vehicles, and monitoring ID badges and traffic flow. All of this correlates with the bid specifications as written.

3. Does the bidder have the personnel with proper ability, training & experience to perform (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: The Company Profile, provided with the bid, lists the flow chart hierarchy of this organization which more than sufficiently meets the criteria posed in the specifications. There are 120 employees in the company, 35 of which are in Columbus. The DPU assignment would call for one one site supervisor to manage the operation during the times posted/required in the bid. The profile also assures there is a network of support for the persons that would be responsible for the execution of this contract.

4. Did the bidder submit information adequately to document experience, ability, training and personnel (15 Points)

Score: 15

Comments: The bidder did a good job detailing their responsiveness to the bid requirements with regard to experience, ability, training and personnel.

5. Does the bidder have a mechanism to ensure personnel receive background checks, no drug and alcohol policies, on-going training requirements, etc. (15 Points)

Score: 15

Comments: These items are specifically addressed in the documentation provided.

6. Did the bidder submit a complete bid package including the required submission information (10 Points)

Score: 2

Comments: Technical omissions in this area of the bid preparation. The BWC Certificate submitted is not current, having expired 2/28/08. The Affiant on the Contract Signature Affidavit is the same as the signer of the contract (Neal Alexander signed both). The Checklist was enclosed but not completed.

7. Does the bidder have a favorable history in similar services (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: The summary for job experiences is quite exhaustive and very much in accordance with the specifications.

8. Is the pricing within the City of Columbus Living Wage Requirement (\$12.38/hour) (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: He lists only the SECURITY GUARD and SUPERVISOR rates at \$17.62/hour each, noting later that the Utilities Complex would be maintained by a SITE SUPERVISOR, which indicates that this person is one in the same, as bid.

Are the any additional comments you may have to assist in the overall evaluation of this company?

The bid is very complete with regard to the background information and supportive details on overall experience and training... however, Mr. Alexander's oversights in three basic bid preparation areas, might disqualify an otherwise worthy candidate. 1) The BWC Certificate submitted is not current, having expired 2/28/08. 2) The Affiant on the Contract Signature Affidavit is the same as the signer of the contract (Neal Alexander signed both). 3) The Checklist was enclosed but not completed.

RFP EVALUATION: Security Guard Services

Evaluator: Steve Sammons

Company: ST. MORITZ SECURITY SERVICES, INC.

Final Score: 98

1. Does the bidder have experience and proper training in this service (20 Points)

Score: 20

Comments: Company was established 26 years ago as a regional provider in Pittsburgh, and have grown to a full service security provider, licensed in 23 states and the District of Columbia.

2. Does the bidder have experience that includes other governmental agencies (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: With the exception of Scioto Downs, all of the references given are governmental entities that cover a full gammet of responsibility levels, most notably an extensive background in monitoring of activity in hearing settings or settings which involve some level of emotional reaction. This is a measure of their ability to perform in any setting where human interaction is a factor.

3. Does the bidder have the personnel with proper ability, training & experience to perform (10 Points)

Score: 8

Comments: I was impressed with the extensive screening process both before and after hire. It is apparent that this is as important to them as it should be to us. The Site Supervisor that is being groomed for our facility is a newer employee of St. Moritz, with limited Security experience, but, a diverse background in other disciplines. He has obviously gained the trust and support of his organization. The location of the Central Dispatch Center is in Pittsburgh, but, it would appear the local office maintains close connection with their guards and vice versa.

4. Did the bidder submit information adequately to document experience, ability, training and personnel (15 Points)

Score: 15

Comments: The reporting and responsibility component of this portion of the bid is quite extensive with St. Moritz, perhaps a product of the level of experience possessed by Mr. Sadlak, the proposed contract manager.

5. Does the bidder have a mechanism to ensure personnel receive background checks, no drug and alcohol policies, on-going training requirements, etc. (15 Points)

Score: 15

Comments: Quite extensive and on-going. It would appear that St. Moritz has a high standard and keeps it in check.

6. Did the bidder submit a complete bid package including the required submission information (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: They gave exactly what was requested.

7. Does the bidder have a favorable history in similar services (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: There is nothing to indicate that have been perceived unfavorably from what has been submitted. Contract extensions indicate that the opposite is true in this case.

8. Is the pricing within the City of Columbus Living Wage Requirement (\$12.38/hour) (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: Their security guards make \$17.41/hour. Supervisors are provided at no additional cost to the City. The local Supervisory contact for Columbus and specifically for this contract is Jayson Mullins, a fairly new to St. Moritz, but with a wealth of experience in a broad spectrum of activities and training.

Are there any additional comments you may have to assist in the overall evaluation of this company?

I was quite impressed with the amount of emphasis this company puts on their PRE-EMPLOYMENT SCREENING and POST-EMPLOYMENT TRAINING. It is apparent that they want highly reputable, highly trained personnel working for them just as we want the same working for us.

My only reservation is that their 2477365 Dispatch Station is in Pittsburgh, but, they have a high concentration of involvement from their Columbus Office and are equipped with cell phones specifically intended to keeping closely connected to their contacts.

RFP EVALUATION: Security Guard Services

Evaluator: Steve Sammons

Company: UNITED SECURITY MANAGEMENT SERVICES, INC.

Final Score: 96

1. Does the bidder have experience and proper training in this service (20 Points)

Score: 20

Comments: The presentation of documents is impeccable and the detailed specification response is impressive. After review of this submission, it would appear that this bidder prides itself on it's experience, higher standards for employees and expectations therein, which they have spent 37 years developing.

2. Does the bidder have experience that includes other governmental agencies (10 Points)

Score: 8

Comments: Extensive but just a bit ominous. They list the Columbus Department of Health and 3 branch offices of CBRE (which I was able to determine from other sources is CB Richard Ellis, a real estate services firm) and Jones Lang LaSalle in the Rhodes Tower. Only one of these is governmental, and there is no tenure listed for any of them, so we have no clue how long they were or have been employed at that location.

3. Does the bidder have the personnel with proper ability, training & experience to perform (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: I don't think there is much chance IF you make it through this process that you would not be trained or qualified. They put you through the proverbial ringer and keep you there.

4. Did the bidder submit information adequately to document experience, ability, training and personnel (15 Points)

Score: 15

Comments: Above and beyond expectations.

5. Does the bidder have a mechanism to ensure personnel receive background checks, no drug and alcohol policies, on-going training requirements, etc. (15 Points)

Score: 15

Comments: One of the most impressive/extensive lists of employee expectations I have ever seen.

6. Did the bidder submit a complete bid package including the required submission information (10 Points)

Score: 8

Comments: Not sure. On the proposal page, the bidder lists a rate of \$19.22/hour for the Security Guards with an estimated quantity of 49 (not sure what that means either). They also listed a rate of \$19.53/hour for the Supervisor with no extension on the proposal and no total bid, which either means, they have the cost built in or they aren't planning on providing supervision, both of which need clarification to properly determine the TOTAL BID in \$\$.

7. Does the bidder have a favorable history in similar services (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: It would appear that all of the references given are pleased with the work performance of this vendor.

8. Is the pricing within the City of Columbus Living Wage Requirement (\$12.38/hour) (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: Rate given meets this standard; while supervisor rate qualifies as well, there is no indication that it is even to be considered a component of the bid.

Are the any additional comments you may have to assist in the overall evaluation of this company?

Great presentation but, it's almost too much bang for the buck. There is no question we would get a highly trained, highly experienced guard... but, how would that impact us in the long run. The gadgets that monitor the guards whereabouts and satellites that track the movement of his vehicle are awesome technological advances... but, we need someone to check ID's and monitor security.. I think we're looking at a ROLLS ROYCE to perform a Honda Civic function.

RFP EVALUATION: Security Guard Services

Evaluator: Steve Sammons

Company: U.S. SECURITY ASSOCIATES, INC.

Final Score: 98

1. Does the bidder have experience and proper training in this service (20 Points)

Score: 20

Comments: Another proposal submitted without reservations on expense. There is no question that this vendor has established an impact reputation in its 53 years of existence, now employing more than 24,000 in 45 states. This is one of the premier security companies.

2. Does the bidder have experience that includes other governmental agencies (10 Points)

Score: 9

Comments: This is a moot point, but, one that I am going to address. There is no question that U.S. Securities has an extensive array of clients that utilize their services from every imaginable industry... but, for the purposes of argument, there are little to none listed in the proposal herein, which can be deemed "governmental agency". I think most of their clientele is of the large commercial, industrial and high-security governmental variety. We are little league in comparison.

3. Does the bidder have the personnel with proper ability, training & experience to perform (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: The bigger you are, the more money you can invest in the training and expectations from your employees. This is a massive company with many resources of support to funnel into the training of their people.

4. Did the bidder submit information adequately to document experience, ability, training and personnel (15 Points)

Score: 15

Comments: Above and beyond expectations.

5. Does the bidder have a mechanism to ensure personnel receive background checks, no drug and alcohol policies, on-going training requirements, etc. (15 Points)

Score: 15

Comments: Extensive and dramatic.

6. Did the bidder submit a complete bid package including the required submission information (10 Points)

Score: 9

Comments: Not sure. On the proposal page, the bidder lists a rate of \$17.32/hour for the Security Guards with an estimated quantity of 2650 (not sure what that means either). They do not list a rate for the Supervisor with no extension on the proposal and no total bid, which either means, they have the cost built in or they aren't planning of providing supervision, both of which need clarification to properly determine the TOTAL BID in \$\$\$. We need to determine what role the Supervisor is going to play in this bid proposal, if any... and, if they are involved with it, then those who did not bid a rate might be on the short end of the stick.

7. Does the bidder have a favorable history in similar services (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: The commentary is excellent with regards to the bidder and the service they provide.

8. Is the pricing within the City of Columbus Living Wage Requirement (\$12.38/hour) (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: Rate given meets this standard; while supervisor rate appears to be a component of this bid, several bidders, U.S. Security included, do not consider it to be an important component of the bid and did not disclose pricing for it.

Are there any additional comments you may have to assist in the overall evaluation of this company?

My concern with this company is with regard to its ability to size down to meet the very basic needs of our purposes. We don't need much more than a Gate Patrol and the basic tenants of these types of security professionals are for high visibility, intense monitoring services... not much of that can you get patrolling vehicles in and out of a gated parking lot.

RFP EVALUATION: Security Guard Services

Evaluator: Steve Sammons

Company: WILLO SECURITY

Final Score: 83

1. Does the bidder have experience and proper training in this service (20 Points)

Score: 15

Comments: Company was established 14 years ago. They have served Franklin County for 9 years and have approximately 80 security professionals in Columbus Office and a 24/7/365 Dispatch Office in Groveport.

2. Does the bidder have experience that includes other governmental agencies (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: Of the five references, 3 are governmental agencies and all of them at least five years with multiple contract awards. Obviously they are doing a good enough job to merit contract extensions.

3. Does the bidder have the personnel with proper ability, training & experience to perform (10 Points)

Score: 8

Comments: While it is apparent there is an extensive applicant process in place from the point they inquire with Willo, there is nothing to indicate they have any prerequisites for appointment other than successful completion of this phase.

4. Did the bidder submit information adequately to document experience, ability, training and personnel (15 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: Again, there is no prerequisites identified... they just have to pass the Willo process to make it in.

5. Does the bidder have a mechanism to ensure personnel receive background checks, no drug and alcohol policies, on-going training requirements, etc. (15 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: They mention that they do a Drug Test & thorough Background check, that they make the officers available to prospective clients for an interview and that Supervisors frequently do location checks... but, there is no indication that there is on-going training, other than what they gain on the job.

6. Did the bidder submit a complete bid package including the required submission information (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: They gave exactly what was requested... no more, no less.

7. Does the bidder have a favorable history in similar services (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: There is nothing to indicate that have been perceived unfavorably from what has been submitted. Contract extensions indicate that the opposite is true in this case.

8. Is the pricing within the City of Columbus Living Wage Requirement (\$12.38/hour) (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: Their security guards make \$19.85 hourly and the Supervisors make \$22.85 per hour.

Are there any additional comments you may have to assist in the overall evaluation of this company?

This is a relatively new company in a heavily saturated market and they have done well in their 14 years. My only hesitation is with regard to their screen process of prospective employees PRIOR to affiliation with Willco.

RFP EVALUATION: Security Guard Services

Evaluator: James D. Bond

Company: U.S. Security Associates

Final Score: 89

1. Does the bidder have experience and proper training in this service (20 Points)

Score: 19

Comments: RFP indicates that the company was founded in 1955 as Advance Security Engineering in Atlanta, Georgia. In 1996 the name changed to U.S. Security Associates and is now the countries 4th largest security firm.

2. Does the bidder have experience that includes other governmental agencies (10 Points)

Score: 6

Comments: This bidder is the current security guard firm serving this location. I was unable to document any other governmental agencies within the RFP.

3. Does the bidder have the personnel with proper ability, training & experience to perform (10 Points)

Score: 9

Comments: Before being given an assignment, all of their security guards must attend and graduate from the USA Security Academy. All training programs meet or exceed state-mandated training requirements.

4. Did the bidder submit information adequately to document experience, ability, training and personnel (15 Points)

Score: 14

Comments: Yes, adequate documentation is attached.

5. Does the bidder have a mechanism to ensure personnel receive background checks, no drug and alcohol policies, on-going training requirements, etc. (15 Points)

Score: 14

Comments: Company states in RFP that they conduct a rigorous screening process and this is back by a \$100,000 guarantee. At the core of the employment process is the Past-Positive Applicant Background Verification System. A powerful search system that provides unlimited capacity to screen employment candidates in any location throughout the nation. The company also conducts pre-employment/pre-assignment drug testing and drug testing for cause.

6. Did the bidder submit a complete bid package including the required submission information (10 Points)

Score: 9

Comments: Yes, all required information appears to be contained within the RFP.

7. Does the bidder have a favorable history in similar services (10 Points)

Score: 8

Comments: Yes, the bidder has a history of providing similar service in the U.S.

8. Is the pricing within the City of Columbus Living Wage Requirement (\$12.38/hour) (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: Yes, the wages exceed the Living Wage Requirement.

Are there any additional comments you may have to assist in the overall evaluation of this company?

No.

RFP EVALUATION: Security Guard Services

Evaluator: James D. Bond

Company: St. Moritz Security Services, Inc.

Final Score: 91

1. Does the bidder have experience and proper training in this service (20 Points)

Score: 17

Comments: RFP indicates that the company was founded in 1982 as a regional security guard provider in Pittsburgh, PA. Today the company is licensed in 23 states and the District of Columbia. The company has offices in Columbus, Cleveland, Toledo, and Youngstown. The company provides both pre-training and continuing training to all security guards on staff.

2. Does the bidder have experience that includes other governmental agencies (10 Points)

Score: 9

Comments: Yes, Ohio Bureau of Workers Compensation (BWC), Ohio Industrial Commission (OIC), Franklin County Children's Services (FCCS), and the Ohio Dept of Mental Health.

3. Does the bidder have the personnel with proper ability, training & experience to perform (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: Yes, the proposed contract manager is Jeffrey Sadlak-Director, Federal Contracting Division. He has extensive experience in the field of security and over 20 years of experience in the FBI as a special agent.

4. Did the bidder submit information adequately to document experience, ability, training and personnel (15 Points)

Score: 14

Comments: Yes, bidder submitted evidence of a training module containing type and length of training.

5. Does the bidder have a mechanism to ensure personnel receive background checks, no drug and alcohol policies, on-going training requirements, etc. (15 Points)

Score: 13

Comments: Bidder indicates in RFP that background checks, drug screening are handled during the pre-employment process. On-going training is handled through training modules that each employee will have completed prior to assuming duties at our work site.

6. Did the bidder submit a complete bid package including the required submission information (10 Points)

Score: 9

Comments: Yes, all documentation appears to be in order.

7. Does the bidder have a favorable history in similar services (10 Points)

Score: 9

Comments: Yes, history documented at BWC, OIC, FCCS, and the Ohio Dept of Mental Health.

8. Is the pricing within the City of Columbus Living Wage Requirement (\$12.38/hour) (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: Yes, it appears that the bidder meets the Living Wage Requirements.

Are there any additional comments you may have to assist in the overall evaluation of this company?

No.

RFP EVALUATION: Security Guard Services

Evaluator: James D. Bond

Company: Premier Protective Services

Final Score: 84

1. Does the bidder have experience and proper training in this service (20 Points)

Score: 14

Comments: Premier Security is a full service security firm providing security services. This company has been in business since 2003 and is based in Ohio. The management team is lead by Noel Alexander who has over 25 years of experience in the security industry.

2. Does the bidder have experience that includes other governmental agencies (10 Points)

Score: 7

Comments: Yes, the company has experience providing security to East Cleveland School District and Cleveland Cuyahoga County Port Authority.

3. Does the bidder have the personnel with proper ability, training & experience to perform (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: Yes, all employees that report to our facility will complete a 60-hour training program. The program extensively covers the many facets of the security industry including, but not limited to: Legal Aspects of Security, Customer Relations, Dealing with Difficult Persons, and Responding to Emergencies.

4. Did the bidder submit information adequately to document experience, ability, training and personnel (15 Points)

Score: 12

Comments: Yes, adequate documentation is attached.

5. Does the bidder have a mechanism to ensure personnel receive background checks, no drug and alcohol policies, on-going training requirements, etc. (15 Points)

Score: 13

Comments: Yes, as outlined in the proposal.

6. Did the bidder submit a complete bid package including the required submission information (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: Yes, a complete bid package was submitted.

7. Does the bidder have a favorable history in similar services (10 Points)

Score: 8

Comments: Yes, the bidder has a history of providing similar service in and around Columbus and Cleveland.

8. Is the pricing within the City of Columbus Living Wage Requirement (\$12.38/hour) (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: Yes, this bidder specifically states that they will comply with section 8.3 of the RFP.

Are there any additional comments you may have to assist in the overall evaluation of this company?

No.

RFP EVALUATION: Security Guard Services

Evaluator: James D. Bond

Company: Investigation & Protection Agency, Inc.

Final Score: 67

1. Does the bidder have experience and proper training in this service (20 Points)

Score: 13

Comments: History regarding company not included within the RFP. Training upon hiring appears to be in line with industry standards.

2. Does the bidder have experience that includes other governmental agencies (10 Points)

Score: 6

Comments: Government experience listed in proposal limited to temporary assignment at City of Columbus, Fleet Management.

3. Does the bidder have the personnel with proper ability, training & experience to perform (10 Points)

Score: 8

Comments: Yes, personnel have experience for the task at hand.

4. Did the bidder submit information adequately to document experience, ability, training and personnel (15 Points)

Score: 7

Comments: There appears to be an error in the experience of Donald Collison. The resume lists experience as a security officer with Investigation & Protection Agency from 05/2002 to present. The experience at Ohio Support Services and Allied Security is at corresponding time intervals.

5. Does the bidder have a mechanism to ensure personnel receive background checks, no drug and alcohol policies, on-going training requirements, etc. (15 Points)

Score: 8

Comments: Unable to locate in RFP evidence that the bidder provides training on drug and alcohol policies. Also unable to locate in the RFP documentation of on-going training in the field of security.

6. Did the bidder submit a complete bid package including the required submission information (10 Points)

Score: 9

Comments: Yes

7. Does the bidder have a favorable history in similar services (10 Points)

Score: 6

Comments: Limited history of providing security services to government agencies.

8. Is the pricing within the City of Columbus Living Wage Requirement (\$12.38/hour) (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: Yes, the wages exceed the Living Wage Requirement

Are there any additional comments you may have to assist in the overall evaluation of this company?

No.

RFP EVALUATION: Security Guard Services

Evaluator: James D. Bond

Company: Dun-Well Security Services, Inc.

Final Score: 84

1. Does the bidder have experience and proper training in this service (20 Points)

Score: 16

Comments: The proposal indicates that the company was founded in 1991 and has been providing protective services for the private and public sector.

2. Does the bidder have experience that includes other governmental agencies (10 Points)

Score: 9

Comments: Experience indicated with EPA, FAA, Corps of Engineers, National Archives, GSA, and Veterans Affairs.

3. Does the bidder have the personnel with proper ability, training & experience to perform (10 Points)

Score: 8

Comments: Personnel listed have prior experience working for security agencies. FBI and state background checks are performed. Drug screening are conducted to ensure a drug free workplace. 70% of staff have a law enforcement and/or military background.

4. Did the bidder submit information adequately to document experience, ability, training and personnel (15 Points)

Score: 8

Comments: Information submitted in proposal for Mr. Baker and Mr. Wallis was limited in detail. Specifics regarding work history would have assisted with properly documenting experience.

5. Does the bidder have a mechanism to ensure personnel receive background checks, no drug and alcohol policies, on-going training requirements, etc. (15 Points)

Score: 14

Comments: RFP submitted contains all requirements.

6. Did the bidder submit a complete bid package including the required submission information (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: Yes

7. Does the bidder have a favorable history in similar services (10 Points)

Score: 9

Comments: Yes, history with various types of government agencies appear to be extensive.

8. Is the pricing within the City of Columbus Living Wage Requirement (\$12.38/hour) (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: Yes, wages submitted exceed the Living Wage Requirement.

Are there any additional comments you may have to assist in the overall evaluation of this company?

No.

RFP EVALUATION: Security Guard Services

Evaluator: James D. Bond

Company: API Security Services & Investigations, Inc.

Final Score: 59

1. Does the bidder have experience and proper training in this service (20 Points)

Score: 13

Comments: History of company not in RFP. However client references were provided for 6 companies that the company serves in the Central Ohio Area.

2. Does the bidder have experience that includes other governmental agencies (10 Points)

Score: 0

Comments: No listing of experience that includes other governmental agencies.

3. Does the bidder have the personnel with proper ability, training & experience to perform (10 Points)

Score: 6

Comments: No specific training outlined within the RFP. Experience of the Account Manager is attached. Mr. Freshour has been licensed with API since June 2001 as a Private Investigator and Security Guard Supervisor.

4. Did the bidder submit information adequately to document experience, ability, training and personnel (15 Points)

Score: 7

Comments: Limited information submitted to document experience, ability, training and personnel.

5. Does the bidder have a mechanism to ensure personnel receive background checks, no drug and alcohol policies, on-going training requirements, etc. (15 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: Cover sheet attached states that requirements and conditions contained in this proposal are met.

6. Did the bidder submit a complete bid package including the required submission information (10 Points)

Score: 5

Comments: No, unable to locate any information training and screening policies.

7. Does the bidder have a favorable history in similar services (10 Points)

Score: 8

Comments: Yes

8. Is the pricing within the City of Columbus Living Wage Requirement (\$12.38/hour) (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: Yes, it appears that the bidder meets the Living Wage Requirements.

Are there any additional comments you may have to assist in the overall evaluation of this company?

No.

RFP EVALUATION: Security Guard Services

Evaluator: James D. Bond

Company: Andy Frain Services, Inc.

Final Score: 72

1. Does the bidder have experience and proper training in this service (20 Points)

Score: 20

Comments: Letter dated March 07, 2008 indicates that the company was founded in 1924 and has been providing support services nationally for 80 years. Experience and training documentation appear appropriate for the task at hand. Offeror has a good understanding of the scope, objectives, and anticipated outcome of the service requested.

2. Does the bidder have experience that includes other governmental agencies (10 Points)

Score: 9

Comments: Experience indicated with government facilities and public schools. References include the Ohio Department of Transportation, University of Indiana, and the University of Mississippi.

3. Does the bidder have the personnel with proper ability, training & experience to perform (10 Points)

Score: 9

Comments: Yes, the vendor has provided ample documentation of ability, training, & experience to perform the task requested. A copy of the training and development program was provided in the proposal. The training program provides extensive training of company policies and procedures.

4. Did the bidder submit information adequately to document experience, ability, training and personnel (15 Points)

Score: 9

Comments: Yes, adequate documentation is attached. Jim Ott is the companies Eastern regional sales manager. A copy of the managers background and experience is in the proposal and adequately documents the skills required for this task.

5. Does the bidder have a mechanism to ensure personnel receive background checks, no drug and alcohol policies, on-going training requirements, etc. (15 Points)

Score: 12

Comments: Yes, it appears that the vendor has the ability to ensure personnel receive background checks, drug and alcohol policies, and training. Documentation is attached to support this finding.

6. Did the bidder submit a complete bid package including the required submission information (10 Points)

Score: 5

Comments: All requirements appear to be included within the proposal with the exception of the Worker's Compensation Certificate.

7. Does the bidder have a favorable history in similar services (10 Points)

Score: 8

Comments: Yes, documentation is attached.

8. Is the pricing within the City of Columbus Living Wage Requirement (\$12.38/hour) (10 Points)

Score: 0

Comments: No, the pricing does not comply with CCC 329. The proposal requested a responsible wage equal to or better than \$12.38 per hour. In addition we requested the bidder to provide a health insurance benefit. Bidder stated a pay rate of \$10.00 per hour and medical benefit of \$2.39 per hour.

Are there any additional comments you may have to assist in the overall evaluation of this company?

No.

RFP EVALUATION: Security Guard Services

Evaluator: James D. Bond

Company: Willo Security, Inc.

Final Score: 83

1. Does the bidder have experience and proper training in this service (20 Points)

Score: 15

Comments: Yes, RFP states that the company was established in 1994, providing service in Akron, Canton, and Columbus. The company has a current workforce of over 250 security professionals.

2. Does the bidder have experience that includes other governmental agencies (10 Points)

Score: 8

Comments: Yes, RFP states that they currently provide service to the Columbus Municipal Building and the Columbus Metropolitan Housing Authority.

3. Does the bidder have the personnel with proper ability, training & experience to perform (10 Points)

Score: 8

Comments: Yes, the resume of Steve Allen was provided in the RFP. He is the regional manager with an extensive background in security.

4. Did the bidder submit information adequately to document experience, ability, training and personnel (15 Points)

Score: 13

Comments: Yes, specific information has been submitted by Willo Security regarding ability, training, and experience. The training program requires all employees to complete a 55 hour training program.

5. Does the bidder have a mechanism to ensure personnel receive background checks, no drug and alcohol policies, on-going training requirements, etc. (15 Points)

Score: 11

Comments: Yes, screening policies have been included with information regarding background and drug screening. I was unable to locate in the RFP that Willo Security provides on-going training once the initial hiring process is complete.

6. Did the bidder submit a complete bid package including the required submission information (10 Points)

Score: 9

Comments: Yes

7. Does the bidder have a favorable history in similar services (10 Points)

Score: 9

Comments: Yes, a letter of recommendation was included in the RFP from Franklin County, Public Facilities Management. It states that the company has provided exemptnary sercive.

8. Is the pricing within the City of Columbus Living Wage Requirement (\$12.38/hour) (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: Yes, Willio Security has stated that the wage exceeds the requirement of the section of the Columbus City Code that addresses the Living Wage Requirement.

Are the any additional comments you may have to assist in the overall evaluation of this company?

No.

RFP EVALUATION: Security Guard Services

Evaluator: James D. Bond

Company: United Security Management Services, Inc.

Final Score: 86

1. Does the bidder have experience and proper training in this service (20 Points)

Score: 18

Comments: Yes, RFP states that the company has been in the security business since 1971 providing security to state government office buildings, county buildings, and the City of Columbus, Health Department.

2. Does the bidder have experience that includes other governmental agencies (10 Points)

Score: 9

Comments: Yes, currently holding the contract with the City of Columbus, Health Department.

3. Does the bidder have the personnel with proper ability, training & experience to perform (10 Points)

Score: 9

Comments: Yes, training philosophy, pre-assignment training, site specific training, and professional training for all security officers. Resume of key employees is included in RFP.

4. Did the bidder submit information adequately to document experience, ability, training and personnel (15 Points)

Score: 13

Comments: Yes, resume of key personnel indicate an extensive background in the security industry.

5. Does the bidder have a mechanism to ensure personnel receive background checks, no drug and alcohol policies, on-going training requirements, etc. (15 Points)

Score: 9

Comments: Yes, screening process flow chart detailing hiring process is attached.

6. Did the bidder submit a complete bid package including the required submission information (10 Points)

Score: 9

Comments: Yes

7. Does the bidder have a favorable history in similar services (10 Points)

Score: 9

Comments: Yes, Health Department contract has been in place for three consecutive (3 year each) terms.

8. Is the pricing within the City of Columbus Living Wage Requirement (\$12.38/hour) (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: Yes, U.S. Security has stated that the wage exceeds the requirement of the section of the Columbus City Code that addresses the Living Wage Requirement.

Are there any additional comments you may have to assist in the overall evaluation of this company?

No.

RFP EVALUATION: Security Guard Services

Evaluator: Teri Wilkinson

Company: U.S. Security Associates

Final Score: 98

1. Does the bidder have experience and proper training in this service (20 Points)

Score: 20

Comments: According to the overview included with the proposal, Advance Security Engineering was established in 1955, later changing the name to U.S Security, becoming the fourth largest security company in the United States. They serve a variety and diverse group of clients and large industries including Walmart, JP Morgan, PepsiCo, among others. The bid package contained comments from U.S. Security's clients attesting to the satisfaction with this company and it's professionalism. According to his resume, the branch manager, Tim Kennedy, has an extensive background in security service and police dispatching. He was a police lieutenant for four years and holds a number of certifications relating to security and law enforcement..

2. Does the bidder have experience that includes other governmental agencies (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: Currently U.S. Security obtained the current contract for guard services at 910 Dublin Road. No specific mention of other governmental agencies was included in the bid.

3. Does the bidder have the personnel with proper ability, training & experience to perform (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments:

4. Did the bidder submit information adequately to document experience, ability, training and personnel (15 Points)

Score: 15

Comments: Hiring practices include a set of qualifications including the following: Minimum of 21 years of age, background checks, strict policy on alcohol and drug use. Training procedures were explained in depth.

5. Does the bidder have a mechanism to ensure personnel receive background checks, no drug and alcohol policies, on-going training requirements, etc. (15 Points)

Score: 15

Comments: U. S. Security has a search system in place to verify all information on applicants pertaining to hiring requirements.

6. Did the bidder submit a complete bid package including the required submission information (10 Points)

Score: 8

Comments: All documents in order, with the exception of the Worker's Compensation Certificate, which was not included.

7. Does the bidder have a favorable history in similar services (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments:

8. Is the pricing within the City of Columbus Living Wage Requirement (\$12.38/hour) (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments:

Are there any additional comments you may have to assist in the overall evaluation of this company?

This is a nationally recognized company, numbering 17,800 employees. The submitted proposal contained more than adequate information and was professionally prepared.

RFP EVALUATION: Security Guard Services

Evaluator: Teri Wilkinson

Company: Dun-Well Security Services, Inc

Final Score: 96

1. Does the bidder have experience and proper training in this service (20 Points)

Score: 20

Comments: The bid package included the resume of the project manager, Glenn Wallis. According to the resume, Mr. Wallis has been involved with security services since 1977.

2. Does the bidder have experience that includes other governmental agencies (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: Two federal contacts were included in the references that were provided, one each in Michigan and Illinois.

3. Does the bidder have the personnel with proper ability, training & experience to perform (10 Points)

Score: 8

Comments: This company employs 98 employees, none of them in the Columbus area.

4. Did the bidder submit information adequately to document experience, ability, training and personnel (15 Points)

Score: 15

Comments: DunWell has been in business since 1991, consists of a staff of 175 employees, 70% of which have law enforcement and/or military background. The company states that the basic initial guard training program consists of 40 hours and meets requirements of all security licensing authorities.

5. Does the bidder have a mechanism to ensure personnel receive background checks, no drug and alcohol policies, on-going training requirements, etc. (15 Points)

Score: 15

Comments: The company states that annual training involves re-certification and training on renewable skills. Candidate screening includes FBI and state background checks, criminal history checks, physical examination and drug screening.

6. Did the bidder submit a complete bid package including the required submission information (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments:

7. Does the bidder have a favorable history in similar services (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: Although there were no letters of recommendation provided, they are currently serving clients and have 4 and 5 year contracts in place. They have serviced two notable clients for 9 and 10 years respectively.

8. Is the pricing within the City of Columbus Living Wage Requirement (\$12.38/hour) (10 Points)

Score: 8

Comments: The company submitted hourly rates, but estimated the bid on usage of 2761 hours, 753 for Security guard, and 2008 for Supervisor. RFP contained an estimate of 2550 hours per year..

Are there any additional comments you may have to assist in the overall evaluation of this company?

A copy of the company policies and procedures was included in the bid package, and I found it to be quite comprehensive and extensive, covering all qualifications that were put forth in the standards of performance in the RFP. Adversely, this is not a local company.

RFP EVALUATION: Security Guard Services

Evaluator: Teri Wilkinson

Company: United Security Management Services, Inc.

Final Score: 96

1. Does the bidder have experience and proper training in this service (20 Points)

Score: 20

Comments: Information in bid package states that United Security is a privately owned company since 1971, with some client relationships lasting 35 years or more. Local vice president has over 30 years in experience. In addition he was employed by the Cleveland Police Department and served in the Military Police of the U.S. Army.

2. Does the bidder have experience that includes other governmental agencies (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: According to the company overview, clients consist of state and county office buildings as well as Department of Defense Contractors.

3. Does the bidder have the personnel with proper ability, training & experience to perform (10 Points)

Score: 8

Comments: Columbus office presently consists of only 9 employees.

4. Did the bidder submit information adequately to document experience, ability, training and personnel (15 Points)

Score: 15

Comments: Details of extensive training program was included. Screening and hiring of employees was described in full, and covered all criteria named in the RFP.

5. Does the bidder have a mechanism to ensure personnel receive background checks, no drug and alcohol policies, on-going training requirements, etc. (15 Points)

Score: 15

Comments: All of these requirements were covered in the Employment Process section of the bid package.

6. Did the bidder submit a complete bid package including the required submission information (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments:

7. Does the bidder have a favorable history in similar services (10 Points)

Score: 8

Comments: Five local references were provided, but lacked information on the duration of service or whether these were current or former clients.

8. Is the pricing within the City of Columbus Living Wage Requirement (\$12.38/hour) (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments:

Are there any additional comments you may have to assist in the overall evaluation of this company?

Considering all aspects, I thought this was a professional and impressive bid package.

RFP EVALUATION: Security Guard Services

Evaluator: Teri Wilkinson

Company: St. Moritz Security Services, Inc.

Final Score: 95

1. Does the bidder have experience and proper training in this service (20 Points)

Score: 18

Comments: Contract manager, Jeffrey Sadlack, has an ample government background, including working as an FBI agent for 20 years. Negatively, regional and local manager, Jayson Mullins, is new to the company with no previous experience in security services.

2. Does the bidder have experience that includes other governmental agencies (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments:

3. Does the bidder have the personnel with proper ability, training & experience to perform (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: High school diploma or GED is verified. Guards must have proper license with the State of Ohio. Company states that they have a 25% reserve of officers to insure coverage at all posts.

4. Did the bidder submit information adequately to document experience, ability, training and personnel (15 Points)

Score: 14

Comments: . Positive elements include. Physical exams including drug testing, no personal cellphone usage by guards unless emergency, uncheduled site visits by supervisor, cohesive training curriculum including site-specific training, as well as interaction with government personnel. No mention of appearance requirements.

5. Does the bidder have a mechanism to ensure personnel receive background checks, no drug and alcohol policies, on-going training requirements, etc. (15 Points)

Score: 15

Comments: Excellent pre-employment screening. Background checks will be submitted to the City within seven days of award of contract. Annual police checks, quarterly reviews and ongoing training is a part of curriculum.

6. Did the bidder submit a complete bid package including the required submission information (10 Points)

Score: 8

Comments: Worker's Compensation Certificate not included.

7. Does the bidder have a favorable history in similar services (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments:

8. Is the pricing within the City of Columbus Living Wage Requirement (\$12.38/hour) (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments:

Are there any additional comments you may have to assist in the overall evaluation of this company?

This company has provided guard service for prominent customers, including governmental agencies for five years plus, although no letters of recommendation were provided.

RFP EVALUATION: Security Guard Services

Evaluator: Teri Wilkinson

Company: Premier Protective Services, LLC

Final Score: 94

1. Does the bidder have experience and proper training in this service (20 Points)

Score: 19

Comments: This is a relatively new company, established in 2003. The proposal notes that Shelby Blaine is the regional manager with over 20 years of experience in the security field, and will be directly responsible for start up and overseeing the City of Columbus project

2. Does the bidder have experience that includes other governmental agencies (10 Points)

Score: 9

Comments: Clients include Franklin County Auto Title and East Cleveland City Schools.

3. Does the bidder have the personnel with proper ability, training & experience to perform (10 Points)

Score: 9

Comments: At present the company has 35 employees in the Columbus area. Premier anticipates a 14 day lead time to allow for proper hiring and screening. Premier plans to staff the position with the City of Columbus with their current guard force, with the balance of the officer staff comprised of new hires or current employees moved to this account.

4. Did the bidder submit information adequately to document experience, ability, training and personnel (15 Points)

Score: 15

Comments: Requirements for security officers include the following: minimum of 19 years of age, one year previous security experience, physically and mentally capable, fluent in English, high school diploma or equivalent and adherence to strict dress code. Premier schedules a 60 hour training program for potential new hires, with a written proficiency exam and a passing score required for eligibility for employment.

5. Does the bidder have a mechanism to ensure personnel receive background checks, no drug and alcohol policies, on-going training requirements, etc. (15 Points)

Score: 15

Comments: Initial drug and alcohol screening is required, and guards will be subject to annual, random testing. Screening practices include: background and police checks, investigations of applicant's employment record for the prior 10 years, or beginning at age 19. Company policy denotes that evaluation of security officers is performed every 90 days, with monthly training part of the curriculum.

6. Did the bidder submit a complete bid package including the required submission information (10 Points)

Score: 9

Comments: Actual resume of account manager was not included.

7. Does the bidder have a favorable history in similar services (10 Points)

Score: 8

Comments: No letters of recommendation were included in the bid package.

8. Is the pricing within the City of Columbus Living Wage Requirement (\$12.38/hour) (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments:

Are there any additional comments you may have to assist in the overall evaluation of this company?

RFP EVALUATION: Security Guard Services

Evaluator: Teri Wilkinson

Company: Willo Security Inc

Final Score: 89

1. Does the bidder have experience and proper training in this service (20 Points)

Score: 19

Comments: The company has been in business since 1994, and has served the Columbus area since 1999. They offer not only guard service but a variety of security needs as well. According to his resume, the regional manager has experience in security services since 1995 and has been in his current position for 5 years.

2. Does the bidder have experience that includes other governmental agencies (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: Willo has provided a client list including a Franklin County contract, serving this agency for 6 years with a total of 62,400 hours per year. They also provide guard services for Columbus Municipal Building and the Columbus Metropolitan Housing Authority

3. Does the bidder have the personnel with proper ability, training & experience to perform (10 Points)

Score: 8

Comments:

4. Did the bidder submit information adequately to document experience, ability, training and personnel (15 Points)

Score: 12

Comments: There was no mention of the capabilities or experience of their personnel, beyond the training that was provided. More emphasis was put on appearance and uniforms, and projection of a professional image.

5. Does the bidder have a mechanism to ensure personnel receive background checks, no drug and alcohol policies, on-going training requirements, etc. (15 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: Drug tests and background tests are performed as well as interviews with the Chief of Operations. Willo states that the training consists of a 56 hour program, covering a variety of subjects, although nothing specifically for government contracts. Beyond the initial drug screening, background check, and training, the proposal did not cover any policies that were in place for ongoing training, subsequent drug or alcohol screening, or physical exams.

6. Did the bidder submit a complete bid package including the required submission information (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments:

7. Does the bidder have a favorable history in similar services (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: The proposal included letters of recommendation from two clients, one of which was a governmental agency.

8. Is the pricing within the City of Columbus Living Wage Requirement (\$12.38/hour) (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments:

Are there any additional comments you may have to assist in the overall evaluation of this company?

Although the proposal was complete, I found it less professional than some of the others that I reviewed, as well as an inadequate mention of the guards, their abilities and experience. On the positive side, this company maintains a 24 hour Central Dispatch Center, that guarantees a live person with whom to speak, should any problems arise.

RFP EVALUATION: Security Guard Services

Evaluator: Teri Wilkinson

Company: Andy Frain Services

Final Score: 86

1. Does the bidder have experience and proper training in this service (20 Points)

Score: 20

Comments: This company has been in service for 83 years, with numerous accounts in 16 states, serving various types of clients, with Fed Ex Express most notably in the Columbus area. The district manager, Richard Ott, submitted an impressive resume, with extensive security experience in a supervisory capacity, particularly in airport venues.

2. Does the bidder have experience that includes other governmental agencies (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: This company services the Ohio Department of Transportation, Lima Ohio district, although no governmental agencies were named in the Columbus area.

3. Does the bidder have the personnel with proper ability, training & experience to perform (10 Points)

Score: 9

Comments: This company has 22 employees in the Columbus area. Since the references listed only one account in this area, this number may be sufficient to maintain the services as stated in the RFP.

4. Did the bidder submit information adequately to document experience, ability, training and personnel (15 Points)

Score: 15

Comments: A comprehensive training and development schedule was included in the packet, including recurrent training sessions.

5. Does the bidder have a mechanism to ensure personnel receive background checks, no drug and alcohol policies, on-going training requirements, etc. (15 Points)

Score: 14

Comments: A list of company policies states that Andy Frain is a Drug and Alcohol Free Workplace. Five year background checks, DMV reports, criminal background checks are in place before hiring.

6. Did the bidder submit a complete bid package including the required submission information (10 Points)

Score: 8

Comments: Worker's Compensation Certificate not included in bid package.

7. Does the bidder have a favorable history in similar services (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: In a letter to Joe Lombardi from the vice-president of Business Development, the City was urged to contact refernces to verify their history of strong support services and customer service. A total of eighteen references were supplied..

8. Is the pricing within the City of Columbus Living Wage Requirement (\$12.38/hour) (10 Points)

Score: 0

Comments: The wage rate is a little ambiguous. The stated rate for guards is 10.00 per hr. and a benefit of 2.39 for medical insurance. (Collectively, this would meet our standards of 12.38 per hour.)

Are the any additional comments you may have to assist in the overall evaluation of this company?

This bid package was professional and organized. In particular, I was impressed by a section on their new hire standards of uniform and appearance The company addressed such issues as grooming, hair, uniform cleaning and upkeep, eating and drinking on duty etc. ,establishing a very professional appearance and attitude..

RFP EVALUATION: Security Guard Services

Evaluator: Teri Wilkinson

Company: Investigation and Protection Agency

Final Score: 74

1. Does the bidder have experience and proper training in this service (20 Points)

Score: 16

Comments: According to his resume, Donald Collison, president of this company, has experience in the security field since 1996, but just recently completed Peace Officer training in January of 2008. Former and current client lists were provided for references, but dates of service were not included, nor were letters of recommendation.

2. Does the bidder have experience that includes other governmental agencies (10 Points)

Score: 8

Comments: A current client list was provided, noting that the company has a temporary assignment with the City of Columbus, Fleet Management. There is no other mention of additional former or current government contracts..

3. Does the bidder have the personnel with proper ability, training & experience to perform (10 Points)

Score: 7

Comments: This company employs 12 people in the Columbus office. This number seems to be very minimal and could be an issue for keeping a post adequately maintained. No reference was made to any reserve percentage of guards.

4. Did the bidder submit information adequately to document experience, ability, training and personnel (15 Points)

Score: 8

Comments: Attention and documentation relating to the criteria in the detailed specs and performance standards was not evident in the bid.. Items that were not addressed are as follows: certification or training from a state institute, drug and alcohol testing and policies, physical examinations, professional appearance and uniforms, ability to communicate effectively, literacy in the English language. Training consists of 8 hours of in-house training. No provisions were stated for ongoing training, quarterly reviews, staff meetings, or on site inspections

5. Does the bidder have a mechanism to ensure personnel receive background checks, no drug and alcohol policies, on-going training requirements, etc. (15 Points)

Score: 8

Comments: Minimal background checks are performed before hiring, as well as electronic fingerprints. In addition, see comments in Question # 4

6. Did the bidder submit a complete bid package including the required submission information (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments:

7. Does the bidder have a favorable history in similar services (10 Points)

Score: 7

Comments: There was nothing included in the bid package on which to base previous history and work performance.

8. Is the pricing within the City of Columbus Living Wage Requirement (\$12.38/hour) (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments:

Are there any additional comments you may have to assist in the overall evaluation of this company?

My personal opinion after reviewing this bid, is that this company may be inadequate considering the limited experience, minimal training of guards and number of personnel.

RFP EVALUATION: Security Guard Services

Evaluator: Teri Wilkinson

Company: API Security Services and Investigations Inc.

Final Score: 49

1. Does the bidder have experience and proper training in this service (20 Points)

Score: 15

Comments: The bid package did not include any information about the company, the references did not include dates or length of service. The contact person / secretary included a short resume that did not denote prior experience in security other than the fact that he had been a licensed investigator and security supervisor with this company since 2001.

2. Does the bidder have experience that includes other governmental agencies (10 Points)

Score: 0

Comments: This company does have the Columbus Metropolitan Library as a client.

3. Does the bidder have the personnel with proper ability, training & experience to perform (10 Points)

Score: 4

Comments: The only reference made as far as personnel is that the company employs 19 people.

4. Did the bidder submit information adequately to document experience, ability, training and personnel (15 Points)

Score: 8

Comments: Bid package did not include training and screening policies and procedures.

5. Does the bidder have a mechanism to ensure personnel receive background checks, no drug and alcohol policies, on-going training requirements, etc. (15 Points)

Score: 0

Comments: Bid totally lacking any information on the security guards that they employ.

6. Did the bidder submit a complete bid package including the required submission information (10 Points)

Score: 7

Comments: See question #5 comment section.

7. Does the bidder have a favorable history in similar services (10 Points)

Score: 5

Comments: The company client list includes noteworthy accounts, but no dates of service, nor letters of recommendation.

8. Is the pricing within the City of Columbus Living Wage Requirement (\$12.38/hour) (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments:

Are there any additional comments you may have to assist in the overall evaluation of this company?

RFP EVALUATION: Security Guard Services

Evaluator: David Newcomer

Company: Andy Frain Services

Final Score: 85

1. Does the bidder have experience and proper training in this service (20 Points)

Score: 20

Comments: 1924

2. Does the bidder have experience that includes other governmental agencies (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments:

3. Does the bidder have the personnel with proper ability, training & experience to perform (10 Points)

Score: 9

Comments:

4. Did the bidder submit information adequately to document experience, ability, training and personnel (15 Points)

Score: 13

Comments:

5. Does the bidder have a mechanism to ensure personnel receive background checks, no drug and alcohol policies, on-going training requirements, etc. (15 Points)

Score: 13

Comments:

6. Did the bidder submit a complete bid package including the required submission information (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments:

7. Does the bidder have a favorable history in similar services (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments:

8. Is the pricing within the City of Columbus Living Wage Requirement (\$12.38/hour) (10 Points)

Score: 0

Comments: Proposal show \$17.77 but pay rate is stated to be \$10 with \$2.39 as medical benefit.

Are there any additional comments you may have to assist in the overall evaluation of this company?

FID NOT ON PERFORMANCE TO DATE (03/27/2008)

RFP EVALUATION: Security Guard Services

Evaluator: David Newcomer

Company: Investigation & Protection Agency, Inc.

Final Score: 70

1. Does the bidder have experience and proper training in this service (20 Points)

Score: 12

Comments: Fairly new, President received PEace Officer Training in January 2008, workded in industry since 2002.

2. Does the bidder have experience that includes other governmental agencies (10 Points)

Score: 7

Comments: Shows Columbus Fleet Management as a current client.

3. Does the bidder have the personnel with proper ability, training & experience to perform (10 Points)

Score: 6

Comments: Does not give the officers in the proposal . Just the three business people.

4. Did the bidder submit information adequately to document experience, ability, training and personnel (15 Points)

Score: 7

Comments:

5. Does the bidder have a mechanism to ensure personnel receive background checks, no drug and alcohol policies, on-going training requirements, etc. (15 Points)

Score: 12

Comments:

6. Did the bidder submit a complete bid package including the required submission information (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments:

7. Does the bidder have a favorable history in similar services (10 Points)

Score: 6

Comments:

8. Is the pricing within the City of Columbus Living Wage Requirement (\$12.38/hour) (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments:

Are there any additional comments you may have to assist in the overall evaluation of this company?

FID 311796938 not contract compliant on 03/27/2008

RFP EVALUATION: Security Guard Services

Evaluator: David Newcomer

Company: API Security Services & Investigations, Inc.

Final Score: 72

1. Does the bidder have experience and proper training in this service (20 Points)

Score: 12

Comments: 2001

2. Does the bidder have experience that includes other governmental agencies (10 Points)

Score: 8

Comments: Columbus Metropolitan Library,

3. Does the bidder have the personnel with proper ability, training & experience to perform (10 Points)

Score: 7

Comments:

4. Did the bidder submit information adequately to document experience, ability, training and personnel (15 Points)

Score: 8

Comments:

5. Does the bidder have a mechanism to ensure personnel receive background checks, no drug and alcohol policies, on-going training requirements, etc. (15 Points)

Score: 9

Comments:

6. Did the bidder submit a complete bid package including the required submission information (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments:

7. Does the bidder have a favorable history in similar services (10 Points)

Score: 8

Comments:

8. Is the pricing within the City of Columbus Living Wage Requirement (\$12.38/hour) (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: \$16.50

Are there any additional comments you may have to assist in the overall evaluation of this company?

FID 352158980

RFP EVALUATION: Security Guard Services

Evaluator: David Newcomer

Company: U.S. Security Associates

Final Score: / 00

1. Does the bidder have experience and proper training in this service (20 Points)

Score: 20

Comments:

2. Does the bidder have experience that includes other governmental agencies (10 Points)

Score:

10

Comments:

3. Does the bidder have the personnel with proper ability, training & experience to perform (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: Training plan seems very good

4. Did the bidder submit information adequately to document experience, ability, training and personnel (15 Points)

Score: 15

Comments:

5. Does the bidder have a mechanism to ensure personnel receive background checks, no drug and alcohol policies, on-going training requirements, etc. (15 Points)

Score: 15

Comments:

6. Did the bidder submit a complete bid package including the required submission information (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments:

7. Does the bidder have a favorable history in similar services (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments:

8. Is the pricing within the City of Columbus Living Wage Requirement (\$12.38/hour) (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: \$17.32_

Are there any additional comments you may have to assist in the overall evaluation of this company?

223262806

RFP EVALUATION: Security Guard Services

Evaluator: David Newcomer

Company: WILLO SECURITY, INC.

Final Score: 95

1. Does the bidder have experience and proper training in this service (20 Points)

Score: 20

Comments: 1994

2. Does the bidder have experience that includes other governmental agencies (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: Various County contracts

3. Does the bidder have the personnel with proper ability, training & experience to perform (10 Points)

Score: 9

Comments:

4. Did the bidder submit information adequately to document experience, ability, training and personnel (15 Points)

Score: 14

Comments:

5. Does the bidder have a mechanism to ensure personnel receive background checks, no drug and alcohol policies, on-going training requirements, etc. (15 Points)

Score: 14

Comments:

6. Did the bidder submit a complete bid package including the required submission information (10 Points)

Score: 9

Comments:

7. Does the bidder have a favorable history in similar services (10 Points)

Score: 9

Comments:

8. Is the pricing within the City of Columbus Living Wage Requirement (\$12.38/hour) (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: \$19.85 and \$22.85

Are there any additional comments you may have to assist in the overall evaluation of this company?

FID 341808997 Compliant

RFP EVALUATION: Security Guard Services

Evaluator: David Newcomer

Company: St. Moritz Security Services, Inc.

Final Score: 100

1. Does the bidder have experience and proper training in this service (20 Points)

Score: 20

Comments: 1982

2. Does the bidder have experience that includes other governmental agencies (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments:

3. Does the bidder have the personnel with proper ability, training & experience to perform (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: Training plan seems good

4. Did the bidder submit information adequately to document experience, ability, training and personnel (15 Points)

Score: 15

Comments:

5. Does the bidder have a mechanism to ensure personnel receive background checks, no drug and alcohol policies, on-going training requirements, etc. (15 Points)

Score: 15

Comments:

6. Did the bidder submit a complete bid package including the required submission information (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments:

7. Does the bidder have a favorable history in similar services (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments:

8. Is the pricing within the City of Columbus Living Wage Requirement (\$12.38/hour) (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: \$17.41

St. Moritz will provide supervision of security officers at no charge to the City.

Are there any additional comments you may have to assist in the overall evaluation of this company?

25-1419674

RFP EVALUATION: Security Guard Services

Evaluator: David Newcomer

Company: United Security Mangement Services, Inc.

Final Score: 97

1. Does the bidder have experience and proper training in this service (20 Points)

Score: 20

Comments: 1971

2. Does the bidder have experience that includes other governmental agencies (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: Columbus Health Department.

3. Does the bidder have the personnel with proper ability, training & experience to perform (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments:

4. Did the bidder submit information adequately to document experience, ability, training and personnel (15 Points)

Score: 14

Comments:

5. Does the bidder have a mechanism to ensure personnel receive background checks, no drug and alcohol policies, on-going training requirements, etc. (15 Points)

Score: 14

Comments:

6. Did the bidder submit a complete bid package including the required submission information (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments:

7. Does the bidder have a favorable history in similar services (10 Points)

Score: 9

Comments:

8. Is the pricing within the City of Columbus Living Wage Requirement (\$12.38/hour) (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: \$19.22 and 19.53.

Are there any additional comments you may have to assist in the overall evaluation of this company?

FID 352158980.

COPY RIGHT CLAIMS ON A PROPOSAL CONFIDENTIALITY STATEMENT. SAYS NO COPIES. IT DOES CONTAIN FREEDOM OF INFORMATION ACT STATEMENT.

RFP EVALUATION: Security Guard Services

Evaluator: David Newcomer

Company: Dun-Well Security Services, Inc.

Final Score: 95

1. Does the bidder have experience and proper training in this service (20 Points)

Score: 20

Comments: 1991,

2. Does the bidder have experience that includes other governmental agencies (10 Points)

Score: 9

Comments: Nothing local

3. Does the bidder have the personnel with proper ability, training & experience to perform (10 Points)

Score: 8

Comments:

4. Did the bidder submit information adequately to document experience, ability, training and personnel (15 Points)

Score: 15

Comments: Very good

5. Does the bidder have a mechanism to ensure personnel receive background checks, no drug and alcohol policies, on-going training requirements, etc. (15 Points)

Score: 15

Comments: Impressive

6. Did the bidder submit a complete bid package including the required submission information (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments:

7. Does the bidder have a favorable history in similar services (10 Points)

Score: 8

Comments:

8. Is the pricing within the City of Columbus Living Wage Requirement (\$12.38/hour) (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments:

Are there any additional comments you may have to assist in the overall evaluation of this company?

Pricey

RFP EVALUATION: Security Guard Services

Evaluator: David Newcomer

Company: National Premier Protective Services

Final Score: 100

1. Does the bidder have experience and proper training in this service (20 Points)

Score: 20

Comments: 2003

2. Does the bidder have experience that includes other governmental agencies (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: Nice list of references

3. Does the bidder have the personnel with proper ability, training & experience to perform (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments: Provides an organizational chart with various Company officers

4. Did the bidder submit information adequately to document experience, ability, training and personnel (15 Points)

Score: 15

Comments: Very good

5. Does the bidder have a mechanism to ensure personnel receive background checks, no drug and alcohol policies, on-going training requirements, etc. (15 Points)

Score: 15

Comments: Impressive

6. Did the bidder submit a complete bid package including the required submission information (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments:

7. Does the bidder have a favorable history in similar services (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments:

8. Is the pricing within the City of Columbus Living Wage Requirement (\$12.38/hour) (10 Points)

Score: 10

Comments:

Are there any additional comments you may have to assist in the overall evaluation of this company?

Pricey \$17.62 both officers and supervisor rate. The FID lists dba, but Neal Alexander is the first name