

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
BID EVALUATION FORM
(FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: Public Utilities CIP Number: 690411-100005
 Division: Water Project Name: Watershed Misc. Improvements - Energy Efficient Lighting
 Funding Source: Water Bonds
 Bid Opening Date: 12/11/13
 Engineer's Estimate: \$198,754.00

Lowest, Best, Most Responsive, Responsible Bid Tab Amount: \$124,906.20

Vendor Name: Energy Efficient Equip Capital City Electric
 Bid Tab Amount: \$124,906.20 \$163,976.27

FACTORS				
<i>(Pgs.8-9) & Form 1 (Pg. 20) - Contract Compliance</i>	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	
<i>Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages</i>	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	No	No	
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations				
	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with			
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	No	No	
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	No	No	
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	No	No	
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	No	No	
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs	No	No	
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EN	No	Yes	
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	Yes	Yes	
	Negative Factors:	-1	0	0
Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:				
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov)	No	No	
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSH	Yes	Yes	
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	No	No	
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
Form 5 - Debarment				
	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years	No	No	
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
Form 6 - Local Workforce				
	1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	100.0%	100.0%	
	Negative Factors:			
Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs				
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	No	Yes	
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:		ER: 100%	
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	No	Yes	
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:		ER: 100%	
	Negative Factors:	-2	0	0
Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs				
	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED				
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	Yes	(blank)	
Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED				
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	(blank)	(blank)	
Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control				
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	see comment	see comment	
Form 12 - Availability				
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	Yes	see comment	

		Vendor Name:	Energy Efficient Equip	Capital City Electric		
		Bid Tab Amount:	\$124,906.20	\$163,976.27		
Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates						
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)		Yes	Yes		
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requir		Yes	No		
	License and/or Certificate No:		General Contractor - G5302	E1914 (Electrical)		
	Negative Factors:		0	0	0	0
	Lowest Bid Dollar of non-environmental preferred bidder		\$124,906.20	\$124,906.20		
	Percent Over Low Bid:		0%	31%	-100%	-100%
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid)		yes	no	yes	yes
Pg. 38 - Environmental Preference						
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)		no	no		
	Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferable bidder (%)		0.00%	31.28%	-100.00%	-100.00%
	Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferable bidder (\$)		\$0.00	\$39,070.07	(\$124,906.20)	(\$124,906.20)
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid.		no	no		
	If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified?		n/a	n/a		
Pgs. 39-42 - Statements and Affidavits						
	Statement 1: Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)		Yes	Yes		
	Statement 2: Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)		Yes	Yes		
	Statement 3: Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)		Yes	Yes		
	Affidavit Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized		Yes	Yes		
	Negative Factors:		0	0	0	0
Pg. 46 - Addenda Acknlgmt.						
	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)		Yes	Yes		
Proposal (Pg. 47) - Proposal Signature						
	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)		Yes	Yes		
	Negative Factors:		0	0	0	0
Pg. 48 - Proposal Bond						
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Yes	Yes		
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)		Yes	Yes		
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)		Yes	Yes		
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Co		Yes	Yes		
	Negative Factors:		0	0	0	0
	Grand Total Negative Factors:		-3	0	0	0
	Division's Recommendation:	Energy Efficient Equipment, Inc.				

Additional Evaluation Questions for Non-Responsive Proposals per Section 102.08, not covered above in RED.						
1)	Has the bidder submitted more than one proposal under the same name/subsidiary? (Y/N)		no	no		
2)	Are the bid prices material unbalanced? (Y/N)		no	no		
3)	Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not provided in the bid documents? (Y/N)		no	no		
4)	Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all material respects, and does not contain irregularities or deviations? (Y/N)		yes	yes		
5)	Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to accept or reject an award? (Y/N)		no	no		
6)	Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract item listed? (Y/N)		no	no		
7)	Did the bidder fail to submit a lump sum price where required? (Y/N)		no	no		
	Negative Factors:		0	0	0	0