

**CITY OF COLUMBUS  
 BID EVALUATION FORM  
 (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: Public Utilities  
 Division: Sewers & Drains

Project: Clinton No. 2 Aerial Sewer Support Rehab.  
 Funding Source: \_\_\_\_\_  
 Bid Opening Date: 27-Oct-04  
 Engineer's Estimate: \$500,500.00

\_\_\_\_\_   
 \$ 278,575.00

	<u>Western Waterproofing</u>	<u>Concrete Restoration Specialist, LLC</u>	<u>Company 4</u>	<u>Company 5</u>
--	------------------------------	---	------------------	------------------

Original Bid Amount:	\$ 278,575.00	\$ 334,400.00		
Local Company?	Yes	No		

**FACTORS**

**Tier I - Mandatory Factors (must have yes for all for bid to qualify)**

M-1 Bid is responsive	No	Yes
M-2 Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one	Yes	Yes
M-3 Bidder has requisite licenses	Yes	Yes
M-4 Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	Yes	Yes
M-5 Bidder <b>not</b> currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency	Yes	Yes
M-6 Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits	Yes	Yes
<b>Proceed to Tier II?</b>	no	yes

**Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)**

C-1 Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)	yes	No
C-2 Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit	yes	No
C-3 Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit	yes	No
C-4 Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit	yes	yes
<i>% of insurance provided by company</i>	Not Stated	100%
C-5 Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit	yes	yes
<i>% of retirement or pension plan provided by company</i>	Not Stated	100%
<b>Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$100,000 in total)</b>	3.00%	2.00%
<b>Dollar Value of Credits</b>	8,375	6,688
<b>Bid Total:</b>	270,199.75	327,712.00

**Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits**

	\$ 270,199.75	\$ 327,712.00
--	---------------	---------------

**Percent Over Low Bid:**

	0.000%	21.285%
--	--------	---------

**Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)**

	yes	No
--	-----	----

**Proceed to Tier III?**

	yes	No
--	-----	----

**Tier III - History Experience Factors (each yes answer gives 1 point debit)**

HE-1 Bidder has not demonstrated a good faith effort to comply with the requirements of the City of Columbus' Equal Business Opportunity Program	No	No
HE-2 Bidder has not complied with federal, state and local affirmative action programs	No	No
HE-3 Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds	No	No
HE-4 Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past five years	No	No
HE-5 Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.	No	No
HE-6 Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 5 years (3 yrs)	No	No
HE-7 Bidder has a record, within the past 5 years, of violations with the following: (3 yrs)	No	No
A. Fair Labor Standards Act		No
B. Prevailing Wage Laws		No
C. Unemployment Compensation Laws		No
D. Worker's Compensation Laws		No
HE-8 Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years	Yes	No
HE-9 Bidder lacks an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation	No	No
HE-10 Bidder's OSHA Experience Modification Rating (EMR) is greater than 1.0	No	Yes
HE-11 Bidder has a record of violations with environmental regulations	No	No
HE-12 The results of Bidder's references are questionable	No	No

**Total Negative History and Experience Factors:**

	-1	0
--	----	---

**A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited**

**Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome?**

	no	Yes
--	----	-----

**NON-RESPONSIVE BID**

**Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answer desirable)**

R1 Bidder has sufficient resources to reasonably complete this project	Yes	Yes
R2 Bidder's management resources have sufficient experience	Yes	Yes
R3 Bidder's workforce resources have sufficient experience	Yes	Yes
R4 Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project	Yes	Yes
R5 Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project	Yes	No

<b>Total Number of "Yes" Answers</b>	5	4
--------------------------------------	---	---

Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).

Division's Recommendation:



