

CITY OF COLUMBUS BID EVALUATION FORM (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)						
Department: <u>Public Utilities</u>		CIP Number: <u>610990.4</u>				
Division: <u>Storm</u>		Project Name: <u>Leonard Ave and Wildwood Ave SSI</u>				
		Funding Source: <u>Bonds</u>				
		Bid Opening Date: <u>8/21/13</u>				
Lowest, Best, Most Responsive, Responsible Bid Amount: <u>\$439,619.40</u>		Engineer's Estimate: <u>\$545,866.00</u>				
Bid Tab Amount:		<u>Elite Excavting</u>	<u>Conie Construction</u>	<u>John Eramo</u>	<u>Columbus Asphalt</u>	<u>McDaniels Construction</u>
		\$439,619.40	\$444,000.00	\$453,937.50	\$486,339.65	\$503,558.88
<b>FACTORS</b>						
<i>(Pgs. 6-7) &amp; Form 1 (Pg. 19) - Contract Compliance</i>	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
<i>Form 2 - Claims &amp; Liquidated Damages</i>	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no	yes	no	no	no
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>-1</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws &amp; Regulations:</b>						
Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):						
1. Fair Labor Standards Act						
		no	no	no	no	no
2. Prevailing Wage Laws						
		no	no	yes	no	no
3. Unemployment Compensation Laws						
		no	no	no	no	no
4. Workers' Compensation Laws						
		no	no	no	no	no
5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)						
		no	no	no	no	no
6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N)						
		yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)						
		yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>-1</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:</b>						
1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N)						
		yes	no	yes	no	no
2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)						
		yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)						
		yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)						
		yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)						
		no	no	no	no	no
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>-1</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>-1</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Form 5 - Debarment</b>						
1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)						
		no	no	no	no	no
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Form 6 - Local Workforce</b>						
1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties						
		0.0%	43.0%	82.0%	75.0%	76.0%
<b>Negative Factors:</b>						
<b>Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs</b>						
1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)						
		yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:						
		ER: 100%	ER: 90%	ER: 80%	ER: 100%	ER: 75%
3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)						
		yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:						
		ER: 4% EE: max 15%	ER: 3% EE: max 10%	ER: 100%	ER: 100%	ER: 6% EE: max 93%
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs</b>						
1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)						
		yes	no	no	yes	yes
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>-1</b>	<b>-1</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED</b>						
Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)						
		yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)						
		yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
<b>Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED</b>						
Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)						
		yes	yes	no	yes	yes
Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)						
		yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
<b>Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control</b>						
Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)						
		yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
<b>Form 12 - Availability</b>						
Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)						
		yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
<b>Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates</b>						
Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)						
		yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)						
		yes	no	no	no	no
License and/or Certificate No:		No City license # given	SW0035	SW0004	No City license # given	No City license # given
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>-1</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Lowest Bid Dollar Amount</b>		<b>\$439,619.40</b>				
<b>Percent Over Low Bid:</b>		<b>0%</b>	<b>1%</b>	<b>3%</b>	<b>11%</b>	<b>15%</b>
<b>Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid)</b>		<b>yes</b>	<b>yes</b>	<b>yes</b>	<b>no</b>	<b>no</b>
<b>Pg. 36 - Environmental Preference</b>						
Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)						
		no	yes	no	no	yes
Difference versus lowest bidder (%)						
		NA	1.00%	3.26%	10.63%	14.54%
Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)						
		NA	\$4,380.60	\$14,318.10	\$46,720.25	\$63,939.48
Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.						
		yes	yes	no	no	no
<b>Pgs. 38-41 - Statements and Affidavits</b>						

		Elite Excavting	Conie Construction	John Eramo	Columbus Asphalt	McDaniels Construction
<b>Bid Tab Amount:</b>		\$439,619.40	\$444,000.00	\$453,937.50	\$486,339.65	\$503,558.88
<b>Statement 1:</b>	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	no	yes
<b>Statement 2:</b>	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
<b>Statement 3:</b>	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
<b>Affidavit</b>	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>-1</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Pg. 45 - Addenda Ackntem.</b>						
	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
<b>Proposal (Pg. 46) - Proposal Signature</b>						
	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Pg. 47 - Proposal Bond</b>						
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Grand Total Negative Factors:</b>		<b>-1</b>	<b>-2</b>	<b>-4</b>	<b>-1</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Division's Recommendation:</b>		<b>Elite Excavating</b>				

**Additional Evaluation Questions for Non-Responsive Proposals per Section 102.08, not covered above in RED.**

1)	Has the bidder submitted more than one proposal under the same name/subsidiary? (Y/N)	no	no	no	no	no
2)	Are the bid prices material unbalanced? (Y/N)	no	no	no	no	no
3)	Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not provided in the bid documents? (Y/N)	no	no	no	no	no
4)	Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all material respects, and does not contain irregularities or deviations? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
5)	Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to accept or reject an award?	no	no	no	no	no
6)	Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract item listed? (Y/N)	no	no	no	no	no
7)	Did the bidder fail to submit a lump sum price where required? (Y/N)	no	no	no	no	no
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>