

CITY OF COLUMBUS  
 BID EVALUATION FORM

	<b>Department:</b>	<b>Public Utilities</b>				<b>CIP Number:</b>	<b>690331-100002</b>	
	<b>Division:</b>	<b>Water</b>				<b>Project Name:</b>	<b>HCWP Lagoon No. 3 Sludge Removal &amp; Abandonment</b>	
						<b>Funding Source:</b>	<b>Water Bonds</b>	
						<b>Bid Opening Date:</b>	<b>2/22/12</b>	
	<b>Lowest Bidder:</b>	<b>\$2,777,198.75</b>				<b>Engineer's Estimate</b>	<b>\$3,245,730.29</b>	
	<b>Non-Local Lowest Bidder:</b>	<b>\$2,777,198.75</b>						
		<b>Allard</b>	<b>Burch Hydro</b>	<b>Trucco</b>	<b>George J. Igel</b>	<b>Prolime</b>	<b>Savko</b>	<b>Kokosing</b>
	<b>Bid Tab Amount:</b>	<b>\$2,777,198.75</b>	<b>\$2,792,820.90</b>	<b>\$3,489,835.47</b>	<b>\$3,526,397.60</b>	<b>\$3,530,420.40</b>	<b>\$3,623,081.55</b>	<b>\$3,733,898.58</b>
	<b>Local Company? (Proof s/b included.)</b>	<b>no</b>	<b>no</b>	<b>no</b>	<b>yes</b>	<b>no</b>	<b>yes</b>	<b>yes</b>
<b>FACTORS</b>								
<b>Tier I - Mandatory Factors</b>								
<b>M-1</b>	Bid is responsive (Y or N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
<b>M-2</b>	Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits (Y or N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
<b>M-3</b>	Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y or N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
<b>M-4</b>	Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency (Y or N)	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
<b>M-5</b>	Bidder & subs have requisite licenses (Y or N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
<b>M-6</b>	Bidder & subs have provided a contract compliance #, or application (Y or N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	<b>Proceed to Tier II?</b>	<b>yes</b>	<b>yes</b>	<b>yes</b>	<b>yes</b>	<b>yes</b>	<b>yes</b>	<b>yes</b>
<b>Tier II - Creditable Factors</b>								
<b>C-1</b>	Bidder is eligible for local credit? - (see below for clarification)	no	no	no	yes	no	yes	yes
<b>C-2</b>	If lowest bidder is local, they do receive local credit, as long as there is a non-local bidder. If Environmental Preference: To receive preference, bidder must include documentation that							
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y or N)	no	yes	no	yes	no	yes	yes
	Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	0.0%	0.6%	25.7%	26.3%	27.1%	29.7%	33.7%
	Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	\$0.00	\$15,622.15	\$712,636.72	\$729,198.85	\$753,221.65	\$825,882.80	\$936,699.83
	Does bidder receive environmental preference? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.	no	yes	no	no	no	no	no
	<b>Total Local Credit</b>	<b>FALSE</b>	<b>FALSE</b>	<b>FALSE</b>	<b>1.00%</b>	<b>FALSE</b>	<b>1.00%</b>	<b>1.00%</b>
	<b>Dollar Value of Credits</b>	<b>\$0.00</b>	<b>\$0.00</b>	<b>\$0.00</b>	<b>\$20,000.00</b>	<b>\$0.00</b>	<b>\$20,000.00</b>	<b>\$20,000.00</b>
	<b>Evaluated Bid Total:</b>	<b>\$2,777,198.75</b>	<b>\$2,792,820.90</b>	<b>\$3,489,835.47</b>	<b>\$3,506,397.60</b>	<b>\$3,530,420.40</b>	<b>\$3,603,081.55</b>	<b>\$3,713,898.58</b>
	<b>Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits</b>	<b>\$2,777,198.75</b>	<b>\$2,792,820.90</b>	<b>\$3,489,835.47</b>	<b>\$3,506,397.60</b>	<b>\$3,530,420.40</b>	<b>\$3,603,081.55</b>	<b>\$3,713,898.58</b>
	<b>Percent Over Low Bid:</b>	<b>0%</b>	<b>1%</b>	<b>26%</b>	<b>26%</b>	<b>27.1%</b>	<b>29.7%</b>	<b>33.7%</b>
	<b>Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (Le., within 10% of low bid after credits)</b>	<b>yes</b>	<b>yes</b>	<b>no</b>	<b>no</b>	<b>no</b>	<b>no</b>	<b>no</b>
	<b>Proceed to Tier III?</b>	<b>yes</b>	<b>yes</b>	<b>no</b>	<b>no</b>	<b>no</b>	<b>no</b>	<b>no</b>
<b>Tier III - Employer &amp; History Factors</b>								
<b>E-1</b>	Bidder has local workforce? (Y or N)	no	no	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
<b>E-2</b>	Bidder is a quality training contractor? (Y or N)	no	no	no	yes	no	yes	yes
<b>E-3</b>	Bidder has health insurance? (Y or N)	no	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
<b>E-4</b>	Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y or N)	no	yes	yes	yes	no	yes	yes
<b>HE-1</b>	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
<b>HE-2</b>	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
<b>HE-3</b>	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
<b>HE-4</b>	Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years	no	no	no	no	no	no	yes
<b>HE-5</b>	Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
<b>HE-6</b>	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
	A. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
	B. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no	no	no	no	no	no

**CITY OF COLUMBUS  
BID EVALUATION FORM**

	<b>Department:</b>	<b>Public Utilities</b>				<b>CIP Number:</b>	<b>690331-100002</b>		
	<b>Division:</b>	<b>Water</b>				<b>Project Name:</b>	<b>HCWP Lagoon No. 3 Sludge Removal &amp; Abandonment</b>		
						<b>Funding Source:</b>	<b>Water Bonds</b>		
						<b>Bid Opening Date:</b>	<b>2/22/12</b>		
	<b>Lowest Bidder:</b>	<b>\$2,777,198.75</b>				<b>Engineer's Estimate</b>	<b>\$3,245,730.29</b>		
	<b>Non-Local Lowest Bidder:</b>	<b>\$2,777,198.75</b>							
		<b>Allard</b>	<b>Burch Hydro</b>	<b>Trucco</b>	<b>George J. Igel</b>	<b>Prolime</b>	<b>Savko</b>	<b>Kokosing</b>	
	<b>Bid Tab Amount:</b>	<b>\$2,777,198.75</b>	<b>\$2,792,820.90</b>	<b>\$3,489,835.47</b>	<b>\$3,526,397.60</b>	<b>\$3,530,420.40</b>	<b>\$3,623,081.55</b>	<b>\$3,733,898.58</b>	
	<b>Local Company? (Proof s/b included.)</b>	<b>no</b>	<b>no</b>	<b>no</b>	<b>yes</b>	<b>no</b>	<b>yes</b>	<b>yes</b>	
	<b>FACTORS</b>								
	C. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
	D. Worker's Compensation Laws	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
	Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years <b>HE-7 (verify on OSHA.gov)</b>	no	no	yes	yes	no	no	yes	yes
	<b>HE-8</b> Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	<b>HE-9</b> Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	<b>HE-10</b> Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
	<b>HE-11</b> The results of Bidder's references are questionable	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
	<b>Total Negative History and Experience Factors:</b>	<b>-4</b>	<b>-2</b>	<b>-2</b>	<b>-1</b>	<b>-2</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>-2</b>	
	<b>A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited.</b>								
	<b>Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)</b>	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	<b>Proceed to Tier IV?</b>	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	<b>Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)</b>								
	Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid								
	<b>R-1</b> Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., eqpt.)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	<b>R-2</b> Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	<b>R-3</b> Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	<b>R-4</b> Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	<b>R-5</b> Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	<b>Total Number of "Yes" Answers</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>
	<b>Division's Recommendation:</b>	<b>Burch Hydro, Inc.</b>							