CITY OF COLUMBUS
BID EVALUATION FORM
(FOR CONTRACTS OVER $20,000)

	Department:	**Public Utilities**		**CIP Number:**	**690359**	
	Division:	**Water**		**Project Name:**	**South Wellfield Expansion Collector Well 120 Phase 1A Part 1A & Part 2**	
				Funding Source:	**OWDA Loan**	
				Bid Opening Date:	**11/18/09 re-bid**	
	Low Bid at Opening:	**$1,753,285.60**		**Engineer's Estimate**	**$2,012,168.84**	
	Non-Local Low Bid at Opening:	**$1,753,285.60**				
		Kokosing Constr.	**Central Oh Bldg.**	**Righter Co.**		
	Original Bid Amount:	$1,753,285.60	$1,759,340.00	$1,987,700.00		
	Local Company?	yes	yes	yes		
	FACTORS					
	Tier I - Mandatory Factors					
M-1	Bid is responsive	yes	yes	yes		
M-2	Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits	yes	yes	yes		
M-3	Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	yes	yes	yes		
M-4	Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency	no	no	no		
M-5	Bidder has requisite licenses	yes	yes	yes		
M-6	Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one	yes	yes	yes		
	Proceed to Tier II?	**yes**	**yes**	**yes**		
	Tier II - Creditable Factors (C1-C5 each yes answer gives 1% credit)					
C-1	Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)	**yes**	**yes**	**yes**		
C-2	Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit	yes	yes	yes		
C-3	Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit	yes	yes	yes		
C-4	Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit	yes	yes	yes		
	% of insurance provided by company	100%	100%	100%		
C-5	Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit	yes	yes	yes		
	% of retirement or pension plan provided by company	100%	100%	100%		
C-6	Bidder is eligible for environmental preference	**no**	no	yes		
	Total Credits (cannot exceed $20,000 per factor or $120,000 in total)	**5%**	**5%**	**10%**		
	Dollar Value of Credits	**$87,664.28**	**$87,664.28**	**$107,664.28**		
	Bid Total:	**$1,665,621.32**	**$1,671,675.72**	**$1,880,035.72**		
	Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits	**$1,665,621.32**				
	Percent Over Low Bid:	**0%**	**0%**	**13%**		
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 5% of low bid after credits)	**yes**	**yes**	**no**		
	Proceed to Tier III?	**yes**	**yes**	**no**		
	Tier III - History Experience Factors					
HE-1	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action prog	no	no			
HE-2	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative actio	no	no			
HE-3	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds	no	no			
HE-4	Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years	no	no			
HE-5	Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.	no	no			
HE-6	Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years	no	no			
HE-7	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:	no	no			
	A. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no			
	B. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no			
	C. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no			
	D. Worker's Compensation Laws	no	no			
HE-8	Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (C	yes	**yes**			
HE-9	Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation	yes	yes			
HE-10	Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR	yes	yes			
HE-11	Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	no	no			
HE-12	The results of Bidder's references are questionable	no	no			
	Total Negative History and Experience Factors:	**-1**	**-1**	**0**		
	A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited					
	Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)	yes	yes			
	Proceed to Tier IV?	**yes**	**yes**	**no**		
	Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)					
Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).						
R-1	Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., ed	yes	yes			
R-2	Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project	yes	yes			
R-3	Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project	yes	yes			
R-4	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project	yes	yes			
R-5	Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project	yes	yes			
	Total Number of "Yes" Answers	**5**	**5**	**0**		
	Division's Recommendation:					