

Steege, Jerry K.

From: Kelsey, Mark
Sent: Monday, August 09, 2010 10:56 AM
To: Cofield, Alex A.
Cc: Austin, Patti A.; Bauman, Max A; Beaver, Michael E.; Beck, David H. (Transportation); Beckman, Amber M.; Bell, Timothy A.; Blackford, Megan D.; Bowman, Randall; Figley, Russ U.; Giffin, Benjamin M.; Lewis, William A.; McGuinness, Rory O.; Poindexter, Kaelyn C.; Roberts, Doug; Robinson, Valuise E.; Rundio, Ted; Steege, Jerry K.; Stephens, Thomas H.; Tilton, Rick C.; Yates, Frederick J.; Zahran, Hassan Y.
Subject: RE: RECOMMENDATION: Roadway Improvements - 2010-2012 General Engineering Contracts, CIP No. 530161-100083

[I approve of the recommended consultants](#)

From: Cofield, Alex A.
Sent: Monday, August 09, 2010 9:20 AM
To: Kelsey, Mark
Cc: Austin, Patti A.; Bauman, Max A; Beaver, Michael E.; Beck, David H. (Transportation); Beckman, Amber M.; Bell, Timothy A.; Blackford, Megan D.; Bowman, Randall; Cofield, Alex A.; Figley, Russ U.; Giffin, Benjamin M.; Lewis, William A.; McGuinness, Rory O.; Poindexter, Kaelyn C.; Roberts, Doug; Robinson, Valuise E.; Rundio, Ted; Steege, Jerry K.; Stephens, Thomas H.; Tilton, Rick C.; Yates, Frederick J.; Zahran, Hassan Y.
Subject: RECOMMENDATION: Roadway Improvements - 2010-2012 General Engineering Contracts, CIP No. 530161-100083

To: Mark Kelsey, Director, Department of Public Service

From: Alex Cofield, Capital Fiscal Manager

Date: August 9, 2010

Subject: Roadway Improvements - 2010-2012 General Engineering Contracts, CIP No. 530161-100083

The Department of Public Service solicited Requests for Proposals for Roadway Improvements - 2010-2012 General Engineering Contracts. Three contracts will be awarded - \$200,000 - and will be funded from cash.

The intent of this project is to provide the City of Columbus, Department of Public Service, additional resources to perform various engineering and surveying tasks for all divisions in the department: Mobility Options, Planning and Operation, and Design and Construction. The projects developed under this program are typically small to moderate size improvements, and frequently include a significant emphasis on pavement rehabilitation, curb replacement, sidewalks, curb ramps, drainage, minor intersection improvements, bridge repair/rehabilitation, and other minor rehabilitations and aesthetic improvements as requested.

The project was advertised on the Vendor Services web site from June 10, 2010, to July 6, 2010. The City received twelve (12) responses. All were fully evaluated when the Evaluation Committee met on August 3, 2010.

This RFP Evaluation Committee included three (3) voting members from the Department of Public Service – Megan Blackford, Patti Austin, and Hassan Zahran – representatives from EBOCO were invited to attend, but declined, and myself.

CONSULTANT Sub-consultant	CCCN	EXP. DATE	ACTIVE Y/N	% MAJ. % OTH.	MBE/FBE STATUS	% OF WORK
------------------------------	------	--------------	---------------	------------------	-------------------	--------------

Dynotec, Inc.	311319961	5/13/11	Y	5% Maj. 95% Oth.	MBE	92.00%
Gannett Fleming Engineers & Architects, Inc.	232935505	4/30/12	Y		Majority	5.00%
Resource International, Inc.	310669793	6/3/12	Y		FBE	3.00%
W. E. Stillson Consulting Group	311702689	8/28/10	Y	80% Maj. 20% Oth.	Majority	80.00%
Prime Engineering & Architecture, Inc.	311373357	3/31/12	Y		FBE	10.00%
Lawhon & Associates, Inc.	311153141	2/24/12	Y		FBE	5.00%
CTL Engineering, Inc.	310680767	6/17/12	Y		Asian	5.00%
Korda Nemeth Engineering, Inc.	310922991	8/26/11	Y	80% Maj. 20% Oth.	Majority	70.00%
ASC Group	311167506	10/15/11	Y		FBE	10.00%
E. P. Ferris	311194974	10/5/11	Y		Majority	10.00%
CTL Engineering	310680767	6/17/12	Y		Asian	10.00%
DLZ Ohio	311268980	3/10/11	Y	0% Maj. 100% Oth.	Asian	80.00%
Columbus Engineering Consultants, Inc. (CEC)	310716498	4/19/12	Y		Asian	15.00%
Burton Planning Services		Not in system	N		FBE	5.00%
Evans, Mechwart, Hambleton & Tilton	310685594	9/21/11	Y	75% Maj. 25% Oth.	Majority	75.00%
Lee Testing and Engineering, Inc.	412224011 not 270093755	8/13/11	Y		MBE	10.00%
Ribway Engineering Group	311406579	12/3/10	Y		MBE	15.00%
R W Armstrong & Assocs., Inc.	351062227	9/21/11	Y	82% Maj. 18% Oth.	PHC	82.00%
AEC, Inc.	311612308	6/17/12	Y		FBE	5.00%

Lawhon & Associates, Inc.	311153141	2/24/12	Y		FBE	3.00%
TesTech, Inc.	311504947	5/27/11	Y		MBE	10.00%
Columbus Engineering Consultants, Inc. (CEC)	310716498	4/19/12	Y	18% Maj. 82% Oth.	Asian	70.00%
Gannett Fleming Engineers & Architects Inc.	232935505	4/30/12	Y		Majority	8.00%
MSI Design	311310090		N		Majority	5.00%
Ralph & Curl Engineers	311067613	4/8/12	Y		Majority	5.00%
ASC Group, Inc.	311167506	10/15/11	Y		FBE	7.00%
CTL Engineering	310680767	6/17/12	Y		Asian	5.00%
Woolpert, Inc.	201391406	6/29/11	Y	80% MAJ. 20% OTH.	Majority	75%
Barr & Prevost	311347309	5/5/11	Y		Asian	15%
Lee Testing and Engineering	412224011	8/13/11	Y		MBE	5%
BBC&M Engineering, Inc.	311166709	9/30/11	Y		Majority	5%
Crawford, Murphy, & Tilly, Inc.	370844662	12/7/11	Y	75% MAJ. 25% OTH.	Majority	73%
CTL Engineering, Inc.	310680767	6/17/12	Y		Asian	4%
Columbus Engineering Consultants, Inc. (CEC)	310716498	4/19/12	Y		Asian	1%
Dynotec, Inc.	311319961	5/13/11	Y		MBE	20%
Edsall & Associates, LLC	311022019	1/6/12	Y		Majority	2%
Jones-Stuckey, Ltd., Inc.	310723296	1/21/11	Y	*Proposal says percentage of work	Majority	Proposal says TBD

Canter Surveying/GPS Services, Inc.	300161572	6/29/11	Y	Will be determine by services	Majority	Proposal says TBD
CTL Engineering, Inc.	310680767	6/17/12	Y	Required under each task order	Asian	Proposal says TBD
W.E. Stillson Consulting Group	311702689	8/28/10	Y		Majority	Proposal says TBD
ms consultants, inc.	346546916	5/27/12	Y	96% MAJ. 4% OTH.	Majority	93%
Lee Testing and Engineering	412224011	8/13/11	Y		MBE	2%
Hardlines Design Company	311688928	9/25/09	N		FBE	2%
Kinzelman, Kline, Gossman Ltd.	311654496	3/31/11	Y		Majority	3%
Gannett Fleming Engineers & Architects, P.C.	232935505	4/30/12	Y	80% MAJ. 20% OTH.	Majority	77%
Resource International, Inc.	310669793	6/3/12	Y		FBE	10%
Columbus Engineering Consultants, Inc. (CEC)	310716498	4/19/12	Y		Asian	10%
Kinzelman, Kline, Gossman Ltd.	311654496	3/31/11	Y		Majority	3%

The following is a list of the results of the Evaluation Committee's assessment of the twelve evaluated proposals (100 points are possible):

Columbus Engineering Consultants	93
Crawford Murphy & Tilly	91
W.E. Stillson	89
EMH&T	85
Korda Nemeth	84
MS Consultants	84
RW Armstrong	83
DLZ Ohio	81
Woolpert	81
Dynatec	77
Gannett Fleming	77
Jones Stuckey	73

Three contracts shall be awarded from this single procurement effort. The Committee recommends Columbus Engineering Consultants, Crawford Murphy and Tilling, and W.E. Stillson for the following reasons:

Columbus Engineering Consultants:

1. This firm has a solid history of producing a quality product in past GE contracts. They have 7 past GE contracts with the City of Columbus.
2. The PM assigned to this project would be the same PM who successfully administered the past projects.
3. Their scope shows they understand what needs to go into a project that would be awarded through the GE process.

Crawford Murphy and Tiling:

1. Very complete scope encompassing all of the elements needed for a GE contract. They also showed impressive cost containment numbers and that they saved the Indiana DOT \$ 168 million on its Top Project due to value engineering.
2. Very complete statement as to green and sustainable treatments that could be used in the GE projects.

WE Stilson:

1. Their PM has managed the GE contract for the City of Hilliard and many small, urban projects similar to the type that would be awarded in this GE contract.
2. Past experience were projects very similar to the type we may award in a GE contract, this shows they have experience in these types of projects.

Per City Code 329.14(h), please provide direction for proceeding on this project by replying to this e-mail. Four options include:

1. Approve committee's recommendation (Columbus Engineering Consultants, Crawford Murphy and Tilling, and W.E. Stillson)
2. Reject the committee's recommendation and designate a firm
3. Call for an oral presentation of the six highest scoring firms
4. Other

Let me know if you have any questions.

Alex Cofield

Capital Fiscal Manager
Office of Support Services
Department of Public Service
City of Columbus
109 N. Front St. - Ground Floor
Columbus, OH 43215

p - (614) 645-1557

f - (614) 645-7549

aacofield@columbus.gov



please don't print this e-mail unless you really need to do so.