

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
 BID EVALUATION FORM
 (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: Public Utilities
 Division: Sewerage & Drainage

Project: 650353.2 SWWTP Digester Rehabilitation, S66
 Funding Source: WPCLF Loan CS 392277-01
 Bid Opening Date: 21-Sep-05
 Engineer's Estimate: \$ 39,000,000.00

Low Bid at Opening: \$ 32,949,400.00
 Non-Local Low Bid at Opening: \$ 32,949,400.00

	<u>Crace Const. Co.</u>	<u>Kokosing Const. Co.</u>
Original Bid Amount: \$	32,949,400.00	\$ 37,712,400.00
Local Company?	no	yes

COMPANY NAME		
Company 3	Company 4	Company 5
-	-	-
-	-	-

FACTORS

RESPONSES¹

Tier I - Mandatory Factors

M-1 Bid is responsive ²	yes	yes			
M-2 Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits	yes	yes			
M-3 Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	yes	yes			
M-4 Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency	no	no			
M-5 Bidder has requisite licenses	yes	yes			
M-6 Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one	yes	yes			
Proceed to Tier II?	yes	yes	no	no	no

Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)

C-1 Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)	no	yes	no	no	no
C-2 Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit	yes	yes			
C-3 Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit	yes	yes			
C-4 Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit	yes	yes			
<i>% of insurance provided by company</i>	100.00%	100.00%			
C-5 Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit	yes	yes			
<i>% of retirement or pension plan provided by company</i>	100.00%	100.00%			
Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$100,000 in total)	4.00%	5.00%	NA	NA	NA
Dollar Value of Credits	80,000	100,000	NA	NA	NA
Bid Total:	32,869,400.00	37,612,400.00	NA	NA	NA

Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits

\$ 32,869,400.00

Percent Over Low Bid:

0.000% 14.430%

Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)

yes no #VALUE! #VALUE! #VALUE!

Proceed to Tier III?

yes no #VALUE! #VALUE! #VALUE!

Tier III - History Experience Factors

HE-1 Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs	no				
HE-2 Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs	no				
HE-3 Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds	no				
HE-4 Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years	no				
HE-5 Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.	no				
HE-6 Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years	no				
HE-7 Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:					
A. Fair Labor Standards Act	no				
B. Prevailing Wage Laws	no				
C. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no				
D. Worker's Compensation Laws	no				
HE-8 Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years	no				
HE-9 Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation	yes				
HE-10 Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR	yes				
HE-11 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	no				
HE12 The results of Bidder's references are questionable ³	no				
Total Negative History and Experience Factors:	0	0	0	0	0
A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited					
Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)⁴	yes				
Proceed to Tier IV?	yes	no	no	no	no

Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)

Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).

R-1 Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment) ³	yes				
R-2 Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project ³	yes				
R-3 Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project ³	yes				
R-4 Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project	probable				
R-5 Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project ⁵	yes				
Total Number of "Yes" Answers	4	0	0	0	0

Division's Recommendation: Award to Crace Construction Company

Footnotes

- 1 Based solely on the Bidder's Responses as given with the Bid, except as otherwise noted.
- 2 Based solely on the Bidder's Responses, plus the Definition in the Instructions for Tier I.
- 3 Based on the references given by the Bidder, and contacted by the Design Professional.
- 4 No negative score; subsequent investigation not indicated.
- 5 A Bid Bond has been given by a reputable surety.